

TERMINAL EVALUATION REPORT

Project Number - IND/S16

Project Title - Strengthening the law enforcement response in India against trafficking in persons through training and capacity building

Thematic Area – Anti Human Trafficking

Country - India

Report of the Evaluation team

Dr. Sarala Gopalan, Indian Administrative Service (Retired as Secretary to Government of India, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of Women and Child)

Ms. Laura Livingston (Global Issues Consultant and Retired Foreign Service Officer, United States Department of State)

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
CONTENTS	
LIST OF ACRONYMS	
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	
I. INTRODUCTION	4
1.1. Background and Context	4
1.2. Purpose and Objective of the Evaluation	5
1.3. Executing Modality / Management Arrangements	5
1.4. Scope of the Evaluation	8
1.5. Evaluation Methodology	8
2. ANALYSIS AND MAJOR FINDINGS	9
2.1. Overall performance assessment (Appropriateness, Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency)	9
2.2. Attainment of Objectives	9
2.3. Achievement of Programme/ Project Results and outputs	9
2.4. Implementation (Operational Plan, Monitoring and Backstopping)	9
2.5. Institutional and Management Arrangements	10
3. OUTCOMES, IMPACTS and SUSTAINABILITY	10
3.1. Outcomes	11
3.2. Impact	15
3.3. Sustainability	18
4. LESSONS LEARNED AND BEST PRACTICES	18
4.1. Lessons Learned	18

4.2. Best Practices	19
4.3. Constraints	23
5. RECOMMENDATIONS	23
5.1. Issues resolved during evaluation	24
5.2. Actions/decisions recommended	24
6. OVERALL CONCLUSIONS	25
 Annexes	
1. Terms of reference	33
2. Summary of Training Programmes	40
3. NGO in the AHT Activities in the Project	41
4. Questionnaire for Evaluation	46
5. Questionnaire for the officials attending training	50
6. List of persons met/ interviewed during evaluation	51
7. National Anti Human Trafficking Mission	54
8. List of Master Trainers/ Resource Persons	56
9. Total number of law enforcement officials trained during September 2006 – April 2008	64
10. Acronyms	65

I. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background and Context

1.1.1. India is a signatory to the United Nations Convention on Trans-national Organized Crime as well as the three related Protocols on human trafficking, migrants and firearms. Trafficking in human beings, especially women and children within India and along the international borders with Nepal and Bangladesh is a major concern for the Government of India. India has 4097 kilometres border with Bangladesh and 1751 kilometres long border with Nepal offering a large scope for migration from these countries. Some of the migrants, especially women and children, are trafficked for commercial sexual exploitation, forced labour, forced marriage, organ transplant etc. Some children have been used in Middle Eastern countries as camel jockeys. Precise number of women and children trafficked in India are not available as it is a clandestine activity. Intra-country trafficking seems to be the principal mode, estimated to account for over 90 per cent of the total volume of trafficking. From the human trafficking perspective, India is a source, transit and destination country. Research shows that in-country trafficking, especially, inter-state trafficking is much more than trans-border trafficking.

1.1.2. Consequent on illegal sex trade, the incidence and spread of HIV/AIDS became significant. Most of the trafficked girls died very young (the average life span is estimated to be only 30 years) mainly from HIV/AIDS, apart from malnutrition, abuse, neglect and sexually transmitted diseases.

1.1.3. UNODC's global experience in technical assistance on human trafficking issues with the technical resources available through its Global Programme against Trafficking in Human Beings, (which manages a series of technical cooperation projects in selected countries), was found relevant to combat the situation in India. UNODC undertook this project IND/S16 in association with the Government of India and State Governments on capacity building of law enforcement agencies and strengthening response systems to prevent and combat the problem of human trafficking in India, especially trafficking in women and children.

1.1.4. The Project was started in India in April 2006 for a period of two years and covered the States of Andhra Pradesh, Maharashtra, Goa, and West Bengal and after the approval of the Project Steering Committee, Bihar was included in August 2006. The total budget of the UNODC is US \$2.58 million supplemented by contribution in kind from the Government of India and State Governments. In May 2008, the PSC had approved the No – Cost Extension of the project up till December 2008.

1.2 Purpose and Objective of the Evaluation

1.2.1. The Project document had mandated External Evaluation to measure achievements, outcomes, impacts as well as constraints. The evaluation was envisaged to enable drawing lessons from the project implementation for instituting improvements to the existing and future project planning, design and management. Accordingly, a team of two evaluators have been given the task of evaluation, to be completed by end May 2008.

1.3. Executing Modality / Management Arrangements

1.3.1 This is the largest AHT Project of UNODC. It is being run with a skeletal staff comprising a Project Coordinator and three other members as detailed below:

Dr. P.M Nair, IPS, Project Coordinator

Dr. Geeta Sekhon, Project Officer

Ms. Swasti Rana, Consultant

Mr. Varghese John, Administrative/ Finance Assistant

Dr. P.M Nair is an officer of the Indian Police Service (IPS) and is on secondment with the UNODC for running the project. He has a Masters Degree in Sociology, a degree in Law and a Doctorate in Victimology and is also a graduate of the FBI National Academy, Quantico, USA. Dr. Geeta Sekhon, a University teacher in Law, holds a Doctorate in law on Child Sexual Abuse. Ms. Swasti Rana holds a Masters Degree in International Relations and another Masters in Human Rights from the London School of Economics. Mr. Varghese John is a graduate in Commerce with a Diploma in Mechanical Engineering and Diploma in Business Administration.

1.3.2 The efficiency of this small team deserves to be commended. Their dedication and ability to deliver the services promptly and inspire partners has contributed to the success of this project.

1.3.3 The major achievement in the design of this Project has been the harmonious combination of Government and non-government agencies as partners for implementation of this project. NGOs have been selected on the basis of their experience and competence to work with the training institutions of the police and prosecutors, and in consultation with them. The Training Needs Analysis was the first step carried out in all states which brought out the requirements with respect to the 4 activities in the project as also the existing gaps. Accordingly the training curriculum, methodology, location of AHTUs, NGO partners required to be co-opted in training and AHTU, geographical influence of the partners, core capability of the partners, and integrity of the partners was carefully looked into and accordingly acted upon. The training programmes were carried out in almost all the states by developing a consortium of the NGOs and law enforcement agencies, utilizing their core potential to address the specific issue of their core competence.

1.3.4 Nodal Training Cells were set up in the States so as to institutionalize the training process and curriculum. The selection of the NTC and their location as well as configuration has been meticulously worked out by the Project Coordinator. The synergy between the government and NGO in setting up AHTU has been brought into existence through a protocol which is available in a published format.

1.3.5 The SOPs and other Tools were developed by wide consultation. Whereas the project document did not specify the list of tools, the Project team carried out wide consultations with end users and thereupon listed out the tools to be prepared. The list of tools and the contents have undergone several revisions depending on the feedback from the end users.

1.3.6 During the mid period of the project additional tools were required to be developed in the form of documentary films. This has also been accomplished. The film 'One Life, No Price' has received international recognition as an effective tool in training and generating public awareness. The participation of top Bollywood film personalities like Mr. Amitabh Bachchan, Ms. Preity Zinta, Mr. John Abraham, has enhanced the value, appreciation and acceptability of the films developed in the project. We are happy to note that the Project Coordinator has been singularly instrumental in enlisting the support of these celebrities. Further efforts by him, by working with an internationally renowned film producer, Mr. Firoz Nadiadwala, to integrate the film into a commercial film, titled 'Welcome' has paid rich dividends. These initiatives and out of the box approach are indeed commendable.

1.3.7 Towards the second half of the project it was felt that a few more tools were required to be developed. These tools address specific issues on the response to human trafficking and are critical despite their late induction. A list of the tools which have been developed and are in process of printing are placed in Annexure.

1.3.8 The Project is functioning according to the annual work plan developed in the beginning of the year. The activities have progressed according to schedule. The expenditure is also according to budget allocation. Despite the project being commissioned only during late April 2006, the entire expenditure earmarked for the year 2006 has been utilized on time. A study of the budget shows that more than 85% has been spent on field activities such as training, AHTU, etc. and only a small percentage has been spent on salaries etc. The prompt and targeted utilization of the funds is a commendable achievement, considering that the project has worked on a skeletal staff.

1.3.9 Project has seen the ownership of GOI since its inception. The project document is a Tripartite Agreement with UNODC, MHA and US Government as signatories. The revised document, including Bihar has also been signed by the 3 partners. The project has seen a close supervision by the Project Steering Committee (PSC). Chairperson of the PSC is Director General of Bureau of Police Research and Development, the premier federal agency for imparting research and development for law enforcement agencies in India. Members of the PSC are senior government officials (Joint Secretary) of Ministry of Home Affairs (MHA), Ministry of Women and Child Development (MWCD), and that

of US Government. The list of invitees in the PSC includes government representatives from all project states and UNODC officials. The PSC reviews the progress, takes decisions on policy matters and advises on course of action required. Major challenges, if any, have also been looked into by the PSC. The last PSC was held on 08 May 2008 wherein the participants had appreciated the achievements and outputs of the project in a short span of time.

1.3.10 As a part of the management strategy, the Project Coordinator ensured that the Head of the Training/Criminal Investigation Department of the state police was fully involved in the various activities in the state and kept a constant watch to ensure smooth progress of work and effective utilization of funds. Surprise visits by senior officials were also encouraged where training was being provided in the field areas. Similarly, NGO partners were encouraged to give feedback on the performance of the government agencies/ trainees/ resource persons. This system of mutual feedback facilitated better co-ordination and contributed to further value addition in the implementation activities.

1.3.11 The mandate of the project officials was to run the project. They were not required to participate as resource persons. Yet, it is commendable that the project officials have taken interest in working as resource persons in all Training of Trainers (TOT) programmes and a large number of training programmes. The Project Coordinator has participated in a total of 194 training programmes as resource person for topics such as 'Clarifying Concepts', 'Strength of the law and how to use it', 'Investigation Techniques in Human Trafficking Crimes', etc. This has made a tremendous impact and has been very well appreciated with profuse commendations and appreciation from different participants. The Project Officer has taken several sessions on laws relating to human trafficking and conceptual clarity.

1.3.12 As a part of the management strategy to upscale the activities, the project Coordinator has been regularly functioning as members of several important bodies, like (a) Central Advisory Committee on Anti Trafficking of Ministry of Women and Child Development, (b) the conclave of the Nodal Officers of the States on Anti Human Trafficking organized by Ministry of Home Affairs. UNODC has also partnered with the Central Bureau of Investigation (CBI) Training Academy in four training programmes of Investigators and Prosecutors of CBI and Investigators from other states. Similarly training programmes of Nodal Officers of all the states have been carried out by UNODC in the National Institute of Criminology and Forensic Sciences.

1.3.13 The expertise available in the project has been appreciated by the UNODC HQs in several ways. We have learnt that UNODC HQs is developing a UN Manual for Law Enforcement Agencies in Combating Human Trafficking. The Project Coordinator is a member of the International Expert Group and the document has now been developed through three rounds of meetings of these experts. This up scaling of the professional expertise in the project is indeed commendable.

1.3.14 The Global Initiative to Fight Human Trafficking (GIFT) held in Vienna during February 2008 has been benefited by several contributions from this project, especially in

the form of participation of the Project Coordinator as a panelist in the plenary sessions, as well as the international display and presentation of film, tools and posters developed in the project, which have been widely acclaimed.

1.3.15 The evaluators place on record their appreciation for the dedicated service rendered by Dr. P M Nair, IPS, as Project Coordinator in UNODC and the team comprising Dr. Geeta Sekhon, Project Officer, Ms. Swasti Rana, Consultant and Mr. Varghese John, Admin/ Finance Assistant. The leadership, guidance and orientation by Mr. Gary Lewis, Representative, UNODC, Regional Office for South Asia, have been of significant value in rendering this project possible and in its success.. This project has projected UNODC in glowing colours in its war on human trafficking.

1.4 SCOPE OF THE EVALUATION

The scope of the evaluation is mentioned in detail in the Terms of Reference, placed at Annexure 1.

1.5. Evaluation Methodology

1.5.1. Discussions with the main stakeholders, namely the national and state counterparts in the government, primarily the Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of Women and Child Development and the Bureau of Police Research and Development (BPR&D) and other stakeholders including law enforcement agencies, such as the police and prosecutors, the police training academies, the Directorates of Prosecution, NGOs and service providers in the field of combating human trafficking was an important part of the methodology for the evaluation.

1.5.2. The evaluation was conducted at representative sites in the five project states, Bihar, West Bengal, Andhra Pradesh, Goa and Maharashtra, during May 2008. The field sites included were AHTUs, Nodal Training Cells (NTCs), Shelter Homes, Group discussions of NGOs, Police and Prosecutors, at the AHTU and NTCs, and individual discussions with Master Trainers in the field, trained prosecutors, Investigating Officers and Supporting Officers, Directors of Training Institutions, Senior Police functionaries, survivors of trafficking.

1.5.3 The tools produced by the project were studied. They are of very high quality and utility and are of international standards. They are user friendly and address specific issues in a focused manner. Diligent, perseverant and sustained efforts put in by the Project Coordinator and the Project Officer to prepare these tools, giving value addition through several rounds of reviews, discussions and re-visits have paid dividends. The film 'One Life, No Price' is indeed a great tool in awareness generation and training.

1.5.4. We held discussions at the UNODC office with the partner NGOs located in Delhi, who were involved in developing the resource material and training tools. All of them appreciated the partnership and synergy as well as the process undertaken not only in

developing the tools but also in enriching the same. They also appreciated the impact that these tools have made in empowering the stake holders.

1.5.5. A Questionnaire to guide all the discussions and interviews was used. The Questionnaire is placed at Annexure 5. The list of NGOs and other persons interviewed by us during the field visits and at Delhi are in Annexure 6.

2. ANALYSIS AND MAJOR FINDINGS

2.1. Overall performance assessment (Appropriateness, Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency)

This initiative of the UNODC was most appropriate, relevant and timely to prevent and combat human trafficking. It has been carried out with diligence and efficiency. The outputs have been effective and well appreciated by the law enforcement agencies, NGOs and the Project Steering Committee members.

2.2. Attainment of Objectives

The project has attained all the four objectives mandated in the project document, the details of which are described in the ensuing sections.

2.3. Achievement of Programme/ Project Results and outputs

This has been dealt with in detail in the ensuing paragraphs. Suffice to say that the programme and the project results have been achieved in full and the outputs are outstanding.

- Through a total number of 316 trainings, 10,910 law enforcement personnel have been trained.
- 9 AHTUs have been set up in the four project states.
- Networking between law enforcement agencies and NGOs has been effectively established.
- 8 Nodal Training Cells have been set up.
- All the mandated tools have been completed.
- During the period January 2007 – March 2008, the trained police officials have registered 896 crimes in 369 operations, rescuing 1583 persons, including 257 minors, arrested 1908 traffickers and 801 customers leading to conviction of 30 traffickers and closing down of 33 places of exploitation.

2.4. Implementation (Operational Plan, Monitoring and Backstopping)

Operational plans and work plans have been developed in the beginning of the year and have been well executed. Monitoring has been done by the project officials, the Project Steering Committee and several officials from the US Government who had been visiting UNODC offices.

The Project has supported the initiatives of the Government of India and state governments in addressing not only human trafficking but crimes and violations against women and children, addressing issues of missing children, providing good governance and improving the overall police public relationship. The project activities have given a positive orientation to the AHT activities by institutionalizing the synergy of all stakeholders and creating a national awareness and momentum against human trafficking.

2.5. Institutional and Management Arrangements

The same has been discussed in detail in section 1.3 above.

#3 OUTCOMES, IMPACTS AND SUSTAINABILITY

GENERAL COMMENTS:

“Old barriers between police, prosecutors and judges have been broken [because of the training].” (Delhi)

“The project has created an amazing networking synergy among trainees, both police and non-police.” (Delhi)

“UNODC brought together NGOs that had not previously cooperated and used their core strengths.” (West Bengal)

“We have developed training plans for the foreseeable future.” (West Bengal)

“Focused training has facilitated self enhancement of the person as a change maker”. (West Bengal)

“The synergy among the stakeholders in addressing human trafficking has been institutionalized by AHTU”. (Andhra Pradesh)

“What started out as a programme (training) has become a positive movement on its own.” (Bihar)

“Relationships between NGOs and the police have become amazing; they’re actually close.” (Bihar)

“The trained police officers developed so much faith in the NGOs that they used to call up NGOs at odd hours seeking guidance and support”. (SAKHI, Bihar)

“Training has created an interdependence between NGOs and the police.” (Bihar)

“Police now recognize the positive effects of rehabilitation on the ability of the victim to assist in the investigation and give effective court testimony.” (Maharashtra)

“The police have learned to be caring to women and children.” (Goa)

“I feel I missed a lot by not knowing about trafficking laws before.” (Andhra Pradesh)

“The AHTUs have systemized all other rescue components, especially from the Government of Andhra Pradesh.” (Andhra Pradesh)

3.1 OUTCOMES

Trainings done and AHTUs established

The project carried out a vast amount of training in the five project states, one of which, Bihar was added to the project at the end of the first year. In all, 30 NGOs participated in the project as trainers and curricula consultants/designers. As of the evaluation date, the project carried out 316 training sessions, training 10,910 officials and established nine Anti-Human Trafficking Units (AHTUs). At the time of evaluation, about 75% of the districts in the target states had been covered. The project will continue to develop and implement training until December 2008. Detailed Statement in Annexure 9.

Partnership of Government

Another major project outcome has been the active involvement of the GOI in a substantive, partnering sense. The GOI's and the states' contributions, particularly on the service and commodity side, were considerable, including providing facilities, transportation and per diem funding for trainees. The central and state governments provided assistance and liaison staff, arranged for VIP/high-level participation in training activities, logistical arrangements, distribution of resource materials and documentation and program follow-up. The project staff estimates the central/state government contribution to date as approximately \$252,835 (Rs. 1,01,13,400/-).

Multiple Responders Trained

A wide variety of officials, including police officials, such as Inspectors General of Police, Superintendents of Police, Inspectors, Sub-Inspectors, Assistant Sub Inspectors, Constables, 'Writer Constable', Border Security Forces, Railway and Tourist Police, Prosecutors, Executive Magistrates, Judicial Magistrates, Sub-divisional Magistrates, Judges, District Collectors were trained in both legal and psycho-social aspects pertaining to trafficking in persons, and practical steps in prevention/ protection/ prosecution. The project trained both newly-inducted officers and older, longer-serving officers, ensuring that there was a wide variety of experience among those trained. AP has trained all Prosecutors and all Dy SPs and 60-70% of the Station House Police Officers and investigating personnel. The remaining officers will be covered in the next year.

Integrating UNODC Curriculum

One of the achievements in the project is that the Curriculum prepared by UNODC in the project, which has been revised and fine-tuned several times over the 2- year period, has been accepted as the curriculum for AHT training in the police training institutes and prosecutors training in the project states. The Bureau of Police Research and Development (BPRD) has circulated this curriculum to all states for their use. It is heartening to learn that some of the non-project states have also started using the same. Investigators and supporting officials have different curriculums. Though the curriculum is for 3 days, considering the non-availability of officers in the field for more than 2 days,

the curriculum has been kept flexible. This curriculum also speaks about the methodology to be used for the various topics, the resource materials to be covered and issues to be focused in each session. The curriculum is user friendly.

Corps of Master Trainers set-up

The project also trained police, prosecutors and NGO members as trainers, so that the project's training could be duplicated and expanded. This has given the project a strong corps of experts with core competencies covering the full range of trafficking issues and greatly increasing their cooperation with each other. The list of master trainers/ resource persons includes judges, law enforcement officials, lawyers, NGOs, counselors, psycho-social professionals, forensic experts, activists using theatre techniques and, wherever appropriate, empowered survivors. Including medical forensic trainers and forensic science laboratory personnel highlighted the technical aspects of evidence-gathering needed to secure convictions. The list of master trainers/ resource persons is enclosed in Annexure 8.

Capacity Building and Enhancement

The information that trainees learned about laws and court decisions relating to trafficking cases, including applicable sections of the IPC, the ITPA, the JJA, Labour Laws, applicable state laws and the seizing/freezing of trafficking-related assets was, in most instances, almost completely unknown to them before. Informal pre-and post-test questionnaires indicated a huge improvement in their knowledge of the legal aspects relating to anti-TIP policing. Additionally, these officers learned how to implement the laws and court decisions relating to trafficking to arrest and convict traffickers successfully and to seize and freeze their assets. Trainees also studied and gained a better understanding of the organized nature of trafficking and the most effective investigational tools to combat trafficking.

NGO Partnership in Imparting Training

The inclusion of NGO experts as trainers in Police Training Institutions was a path-breaking measure. Not only did this sharpen insights into the problem, it also helped better networking between NGO and Police. It enhanced the 'help seeking behaviour' of the police and 'help rendering behaviour' of the NGOs, thereby facilitating appropriate and timely action in the field.

Resource Materials and Tools Developed

The project, in collaboration with government and private sector experts, developed several SOPs and activity checklists to provide police, investigators and prosecutors with a comprehensive framework within which they could most effectively rescue victims, investigate trafficking cases, develop cases for prosecution and gain convictions. Such SOPs and checklists are also important in developing a standardized approach to law enforcement anti-trafficking efforts. The documents include comprehensive, cultural and

gender-sensitive training manuals, SOPs, Handbooks, Manuals, Protocols, Resource books, Posters, Calendars, Documentary Films, Ready Reckoners, etc. The manuals also provided basic models for working agreements between police and NGOs and for drafting FIRs for rescued victims of sexual exploitation. A handbook covering trafficking of children for forced labor, which will contain SOPs and checklists for police and NGOs, is in the process of being printed. The end users in the field have expressed immense satisfaction about the quality and utility of these tools and have praised them extensively. These tools have been integrated into the training institutions and operational activities of the law enforcement agencies.

Paradigm Shift in Attitude

There has been a major shift in police attitudes towards trafficking victims. Prior to the training, police and prosecutors thought women and children forced into prostitution were guilty of the crime of prostitution; post training, they are perceived of as innocent trafficking victims who deserve to be rescued, rehabilitated and, as witnesses, to participate in the conviction of the criminals who deprived them of their rights. Law Enforcement officials were emphatic that no victim would ever be charged under ITPA Section 8, which was previously used to punish them with prostitution charges.

Improvement in Understanding the Dimensions of Trafficking and its Responses

Trained police and prosecutors have significantly greater understanding of the economic, social, cultural and psychological underpinnings that make trafficking victims vulnerable and lead to their exploitation. They also learned that trafficking in persons includes a wide variety of subsets, including trafficking in children and adults for forced/bonded labor, trafficking for adoption, for bogus “marriages,” for organ transplants and that the scope of trafficking encompassed both rural and urban areas, including many areas not traditionally thought of as “red light” or trafficking areas. Trained officials greatly improved their understanding of both the government and NGO social services available to them that they can use to help rehabilitate rescued TIP victims.

Prioritization of Anti Human Trafficking

The project greatly increased state and central government interest in and enthusiasm for combating trafficking. Based on the project’s success, MHA has formulated its own anti-TIP strategy, which will incorporate the evaluation’s recommendations. MHA developed a close working relationship with UNODC, as did MWCD. The project successfully influenced state officials to become more sensitive to TIP issues and far more enthusiastic in implementing solutions to the problem, so that combating trafficking has now become a priority in the states with UNODC - trained officials.

Enhanced Professionalism and Synergy in Response

Trained police, prosecutors and judges were noticeably more pro-active in dealing with TIP issues. They developed a strong bond of trust and professionalism with anti-TIP

NGOs and, in turn, the NGOs overcame years of distrust to develop an equally positive view of police officials. Because of the mutual trust between NGOs and Police engendered by the project, NGOs and Police have worked together closely in all five project states to develop successful operations and projects to arrest traffickers, investigate trafficking operations, provide shelter, counseling and rehabilitative assistance to victims, prepare strong legal cases against the perpetrators and secure convictions. NGOs have provided helpful, actionable information that Police have used to arrest traffickers. Consequently, governmental and non-governmental responders developed mutual checks and balances, thus ensuring better response.

Understanding Challenges

NGO participants felt an important project output was their understanding of the infrastructural constraints under which the Police labor, including a shortage of officers, particularly women officers, officers detailed often at the last moment for security and VIP operations, lack of physical facilities such as, women's toilets and lack of quiet spaces in which interviews could be conducted.

Multi Stakeholder Involvement

ATSEC (Action Against Trafficking and Sexual Exploitation in Women and Children) is a nation-wide association of NGOs working on AHT. The Bihar Chapter of ATSEC has initiated an Inter Religious Priests Forum (IRPF) made up of representatives of all major religions in Bihar, to sensitize them to the trafficking problem, to encourage them to inform their members about trafficking and to be alert to trafficking attempts. The services of IRPF were utilized in the empowerment process in Bihar. ATSEC Bihar produced excellent training materials for this group in English, Hindi and Urdu. ATSEC also organized a conference of parliamentarians and legislators, with the support of UNODC and brought about enhanced political commitment.

Mapping of Vulnerable Areas

In Andhra Pradesh (AP), the training enabled police to identify 300 *taluks* as vulnerable to trafficking and to target them at the village and *panchayat* level. The Government of AP is now working with the National Institute for Rural Development and the International Organization for Migration, both located in Hyderabad, to map distressed areas and to identify Gulf-related trafficking. NIRD has also begun to train women police officers and NGO members in victim counseling. The research study on 'Trafficking in Lamanis in Goa' initiated by the UNODC project, has helped map the trafficking of Lamanis between Karnataka and Goa. Similar efforts for mapping the source-transit-destination points are under development in West Bengal and Bihar too.

3.2 IMPACT

Statistics Speak

The trainings' greatest impact can be seen in the number of cases filed, arrests and convictions that ensued directly pursuant to the project training. While the available statistics are not disaggregated section wise (ITPA Sections), upon which a statistical comparison could be based, the project team, evaluators, consultants, NGOs and most important, trainee/ participants agree that the sheer increase in arrests/ convictions of traffickers and offenders in such a short time is simply unprecedented and entirely due to the effects of the training. Up to the evaluation date, trained project state law enforcement officials have registered 896 cases pursuant to conducting 369 operations that rescued 1,583 victims, including 257 minors. Some 850 rescued victims are currently in rehabilitation. The operations resulted in the arrest of 1,908 offenders, including 801 customers. To date, 30 offenders have been convicted and 33 places of exploitation closed down.

Larger Utility of the Tools

The police, prosecutor and TOT training manuals developed by the project, as well as the Handbook which has already been translated into Hindi, Bengali and Telugu, provide an outstanding anti-TIP law enforcement resource for other Indian states as well as an exceptionally effective model for any nation seeking to address the trafficking issue.

MHA Initiatives

Based on the project's success, the MHA has committed to training 6,894 "Master Trainers" across the country and to establishing 297 AHTUs throughout the country targeted to source, transit and destination areas. This will permit the project's successful record of rescue, rehabilitation and conviction to be expanded throughout the country and will significantly decrease the numbers of those trafficked while increasing the numbers of those arrested and convicted for trafficking crimes.

NGO Participation

The Project has synergized NGO-law enforcement relationship in all activities of prevention, protection and prosecution. This synergy has been put to the best use in making a difference to the lives of rescued victims. Further, because of the project's inter-agency coordination with the Department of Women and Child Development in the project states, the liaison between this department and police department as well as the NGOs have been institutionalized, which has significantly enhanced victim rehabilitation. Moreover, NGOs now participate in the management of government homes sheltering trafficked victims. Accordingly, the homes have become better-run, more humane and more effective as a result of this cooperation.

Enhanced Professionalism

As a result of the training, police use more sophisticated investigational methods, such as decoy/sting operations, marked currency and targeted surveillance to increase arrests and convictions for trafficking. Police have also learned to gather evidence and use NGO witnesses more effectively. Using these techniques has also enabled the police to interact more effectively in anti-trafficking operations with other state police. The trained police officers have started investigating crimes from an ‘organized crime perspective’. Instances of Inter- district and inter - state operations have become remarkably high. The training has also provided a strong sense of professionalism for police, particularly at the lower levels and strongly contributed to their sense of professional accomplishment.

Convicting Offenders

Certain **fast track mechanisms** have been established for speedy trial. There are instances where the project organized joint colloquiums of judges, police officers and prosecutors, resulting in initiatives to earmark specific dates for speedy disposal of cases under trial. Also, because of the project training, police now conduct better investigations. They work with NGOs, prosecutors and other government agencies to provide the type of **victim/witness support** that substantiates their cases, resulting in increased convictions and considerably longer sentences for convicted traffickers, now averaging between seven to ten years. ‘Mock Trials’ carried out by the trained NGO-police partners has been instrumental in empowering the victims to face judicial proceedings and give evidence.

UNODC as a Change - Maker

The persons who were interviewed and the participants in the Focused Group Discussion during the evaluators’ field visits praised UNODC’s role as a neutral, respected broker in helping to change state and GOI anti-trafficking policies to make them more sensitive and user-friendly and to increase the amount of communication and cooperation among and between state, central government, law enforcement agencies and NGOs. Participants unanimously praised the project’s leader and his staff as professional, well-organized, open to communication, flexible and extremely enthusiastic, citing their enthusiasm as a major factor in the project’s success.

Expanding into the Non Traditional Arena

By being flexible enough to expand training to non-traditional policing organizations / responders, such as the Government Railway Police (GRP), Border Security Force (BSF), Sashastra Seema Bal (SSB), Railway Protection Force (RPF), Tourism Police of Goa etc, the project has enabled officers of these organizations to recognize and interdict trafficking almost instantly, as has happened in Bihar, where 25 children in transit to forced labor were rescued at midnight at a railway platform by a trained police officer of Bihar .

Ensuring Victims Rights by the Police

The training emphasized the need to build trust among the victim, police and NGO. Victim statements are recorded along a continuum, with the final statement not submitted until the victim is completely satisfied as to the truth of the statement. Assisting the victim to return to her former residence to collect her property has had the additional impact of allowing her to identify perpetrators, provide information on the location of hiding places, evidence and help locate other victims in the same locality. Police officers now conduct verification of family and guardian bona fides to ensure that children are not returned to those who would re-traffic them.

Inter- state impact of training / AHTU

Project participants in Goa pointed to a significant decrease in trafficking victims from Andhra Pradesh (AP) as a result of the project's AHTUs in AP and training in AP leading to arrest of traffickers in AP. Closer cooperation between Goa and AP police as a result of the UNODC project has also contributed to this.

Outstanding Achievements in the Empowerment Process

Many participants said that, despite that several decades of experience in law enforcement, they were unaware of the specific provisions of the ITPA which mandated stringent action against traffickers, including closing down places of exploitation. They paid tributes to their training process in empowering them with the provisions of the law which they are now putting into effective use. The Director of Prosecution of Goa, with 30 years of experience is one such person, who has now trained all of Goa's prosecutors and sub-divisional magistrates. She also examines cases initially, to ensure cases contain the correct and most effective grounds for charging traffickers. Four of her trained prosecutors have now become judges, effectively expanding the training's influence. Working with the police, she personally oversees the preparation of charge-sheets in all anti-trafficking cases to ensure that they are investigated properly and they contain all the elements for a successful conviction. Six trafficking cases are now under prosecution which would, in all likelihood, never have been prosecuted prior to project training.

Profiling Criminal Networks and Convicting Traffickers

The training has taught police better investigative and criminal analysis methods, which have been highly effective in ensuring that all members involved in a trafficking network, not just the few initially arrested, are tracked down and charged. For example, in Andhra Pradesh, the police have developed an extensive study and mapping of state and intra-state trafficking networks, which helped them to be more alert for trafficking victims and to increase rescues. As well, police have followed investigational leads they would not otherwise have exploited to demolish entire trafficking networks. In one case, for example, of inter- state trafficking, they rescued 27 victims and arrested 22 traffickers connected to the case. The training has been so effective in Andhra Pradesh that there are already ten cases that have resulted in the conviction of 32 traffickers for ten year

sentences each, a significant improvement in both the number of convictions and the length of their sentences and above all, speedy disposal of cases in court. The trained police officers and Sub Divisional Magistrates have together closed down eight hotels/lodges where trafficked women and girls had long been commercially exploited.

Containing ‘Demand’

Another major impact is in the arrest of customers of prostitution. Prior to this training, customers were virtually never arrested and at best, were being treated as ‘witnesses’. The fact that, after training, over 800 customers were arrested and charged with many sections of the ITPA, IPC etc as offenders, is a clear sign that trainees received the message that the ‘customer’ is also an exploiter and must be arrested. It is indeed a positive step in addressing ‘demand’.

3.3 SUSTAINABILITY

Resolve to continue

Participants, both within government and the NGO sector, were so enthused with and impressed by the UNODC training that they have resolved to continue training and to expand it, regardless of the project’s ultimate fate. Nonetheless, they all enthusiastically supported the extension and expansion of the project into other states and districts within the initial five states that did not receive training.

Institutionalization by the Government

The GOI’s decision to create 297 new AHTUs is a key sign of the project’s sustainability and critical to sustaining the project’s many accomplishments. It will institutionalize and expand the project’s achievements and provide police, prosecutors and others who work on trafficking issues in the most important source, transit and destination areas with the training necessary to investigate trafficking cases, rescue victims and prosecute traffickers successfully on a national basis. No doubt a stronger, more coordinated approach to the organized crime element of trafficking will be one key impact of the GOI’s commitment.

#4 LESSONS LEARNED AND BEST PRACTICES

4.1 LESSONS LEARNT

Persistence, patience and persuasion are crucial to successful training. The Project Coordinator, a high-ranking and well-respected Police professional, was instrumental on both a personal and professional level in ensuring that state Police and Prosecution authorities approved and took part in the training.

However, there were some states where Police leadership was less committed to the proposed training. Several participants commented that successful training depends upon

the commitment secured from the top down, although they believed that lack of such commitment should not be used as an excuse to curtail or delay training. They praised the Project Coordinator for his diplomatic tenacity in ferreting out officials who were enthusiastic about training and capable of arranging the participation of significant numbers of officials. Moreover, the Project Coordinator made it a point to involve the top most political leadership in the AHT activities and this facilitated speedy progress.

While it is important to train a wide variety of Police officials on trafficking issues, many participants felt that often, not enough scrutiny went into trainee nomination, especially in the first lap of training. Several people commented that some officials had been trained twice; that some, who were retiring, would reap little benefit from the training and that others seem to have been chosen for training as a “perk.” Based on this input received during the feedback sessions, the project officials carried out remedial measures and the suitability of trained officers improved markedly thereafter.

While interdiction of cross-border trafficking has improved and trafficking victims from other countries are more sensitively and humanely treated, SOPs for cross-border cooperation on matters of investigation, interdiction and return of trafficked victims should be developed.

Participants cited the disruptive effect of pro-prostitution organizations in carrying out rescues in some states, in particular, organizations supporting legalized prostitution. Such disruptions not only truncate the rescue, but confuse the police, who are told that their activities “violate human rights.”

All participants felt that leaving judges out of the training project design was a major gap. Trainees noted that even the most effective prosecutor would find it very difficult to overcome a judge’s lack of understanding of trafficking or prejudices against victims, thus seriously jeopardizing justice delivery process. Nevertheless, despite the lack of formal inclusion of judges’ training, it is heartening to note that the Project Coordinator has made efforts to involve judges, including High Court judges, both as participants and as subject experts, in several states especially in the training process. In certain places High Court judges were inevitably invited for inauguration/valediction, thereby strengthening their association in the process.

4.2 BEST PRACTICES

Drawing on NGO expertise

One of the most effective “best practices” of the training modules was the choice of participating NGOs. About 30 well-known NGOs, with collective centuries of expertise in trafficking issues, helped design the curriculum, methodology, implement training, serve as resource persons and evaluate the training process. NGO partners also made themselves available at all times to answer police/prosecutor questions and provide other assistance, even at odd hours. The project also incorporated the assistance of several well-known research institutions, such as the prestigious Institute of Social Sciences

(which conducted the National Human Rights Commission's landmark anti-trafficking study between 2002-2004), India's premier law schools like, the National Law School University of India in Bangalore and National University of Juridical Sciences, Kolkata.

Dynamic Training Process

Trainees uniformly praised the training because it was well-organized, had useful, comprehensive and interesting curricula and was conducted by experts in police work, prosecution and the NGO sector. Rather than “reinvent the wheel,” manuals were developed based on already-existing material. The training needs assessments conducted in each area prior to the training programs and the division of training into two “laps,” the second building upon “lessons learned” in the first lap, were unique and highly effective training organizational and management tools, without which the project would likely have had far less impact.

Dynamic Curriculum

The project staff listened closely to input from all partners and revised its training extensively and continuously, with some 17 iterations of training manuals prior to the release of the final products. The project staff also “localized” training, so that the last hour of training could be devoted to discussing locally applicable trafficking problems, i.e., adoption in Andhra Pradesh and border issues in West Bengal and Bihar. Training was always kept relevant and flexible.

Door-Step Training

The fact that training was carried out in the field, often in rural, isolated areas, rather than having trainees come to an urban area, made training feel more realistic and garnered local support for the training, as well as more direct interaction between the police, panchayats and NGOs.

Innovative Training Methodology

Trainees felt that the training methodology, which included teaching games, such as the “circle protection” game, role-plays, theatre, group discussions, shelter home visits and constant interactions, was particularly effective in helping them absorb the material and become more sensitive to the plight of victims.

Enriched Local Resource Materials

The Maharashtra NGO STCI provided prosecutor trainees with a handbook compiling and briefly analyzing landmark Supreme Court and High Court decisions so that prosecutors could move beyond simply evidence-based prosecution. Based on the request of the prosecutors, UNODC procured the “All Maharashtra Criminal Cases Topical Referencer”, a very useful reference book for prosecutors and supplied it to all the prosecutors.

Synergy at the Grass Roots

Virtually all states and participants stressed the need for collective action to fight trafficking, from the village to the city, from law enforcement, to the judiciary, to social welfare inputs to economic assistance. Many NGOs and state Police officials involved Panchayat leaders and members, Members of Legislative Assemblies (MLA) and women's self-help groups to establish village or district committees to promote alertness to trafficking, to provide the Police information on traffickers and possible trafficked victims and to help re-integrate trafficking victims into their home towns. Even when (or if) a trafficking victim is returned to her home and family, in many states, the NGO and a village monitoring team watches to make sure that she is accepted and not re-trafficked.

Interim Relief to Victims

The project, through AHTUs, provided a small amount of money to Police to provide for the victim's immediate medical, personal and investigational needs, i.e., clothing, personal items and transport of victims and their families. Police stated this money was absolutely essential to the sensitive treatment of victim/witnesses in the immediate rescue aftermath. Some state governments had a provision for interim relief of Rs. 10,000/- to the rescued victim immediately so that she can take care of her personal needs as well.

Resource Material Appreciation

In Maharashtra, the trainers of Prosecutors sent trainees their manuals prior to the training, so they could become more familiar and comfortable with the material and thus more ready to learn it. The training curriculum has the first session exclusively dedicated for 'course material appreciation'. This helped the trainees to understand and effectively use the materials provided to them.

NGO Prevention Initiatives

The Maharashtra NGO Prerana offers two trafficking prevention programs to help deter future prostitution by children of prostitutes. In its night shelter and day crèche, Prerana offers women in prostitution a safe place to keep their children, where they will be fed, receive medical care, sent to school and provided with social services. Because mothers have easy access to their children and their children receive important health and social services, these women see that their children can have a bright future that does not include criminality. Prerana also helps women in prostitution to make wills so that, in case of their death, their children receive their mothers' belongings and they can determine the child's future custody. Otherwise, children would likely become brothel "property," and forced into prostitution, pimping and other illegal activities upon their mothers' deaths.

The Goa NGO ARZ also has innovative programs aimed at preventing prostitution and trafficking. It has three drop-in centers for children, ranging from nursery to teenage

children, in the Baina Beach slum area, which was one of Goa's major red-light areas. These centers act as crèches for babies and young children, provide after-school activities and tutoring for school-going children and a safe place for older, working children, who might otherwise be drawn into illicit activities. Similar efforts have been undertaken by several NGOs like Prajwala, Sanlaap, Ankuram, Sthree, Prayas Bharti Trust, Shakti Vardhini, Sakhi, Adithi, Rescue Foundation, Jabala, Apne Aap Women Worldwide, etc.

Working with the NGOs, the trained police officers have also taken several steps to prevent human trafficking in the source, transit and destination areas.

Rehabilitative Services

NGOs offered an amazing variety of rehabilitative services to victims, apart from counseling. The Rescue Foundation in Mumbai, supported by UNODC, offers 14 kinds of rehabilitative services, for example. An innovative survivor project by ARZ Goa in the form of a launderette, named SWIFT WASH, has provided sustained livelihood options for 70 persons. In addition to rescued victims, SWIFT WASH also includes dependents of women in prostitution and rehabilitated victim/traffickers. Another example is that of Prajwala, training survivors as masons and motor mechanics. Taking into account that many of these children/ women were barely, if at all, literate, NGOs provide them with basic literacy, but also provide them with training in work that is remunerative, skilled, in-demand and which requires little literacy, including: food catering; planting and selling medicinal plants and vegetables; block-printing; computer data entry; book-binding and document production; masonry; beauty services, laundry services, welding, co-operative fish farming, auto-rickshaw driving, fashion designing and agriculture.

Section 8 of ITPA Being Used Against Real Offenders

In Goa, police and prosecutors have cleverly and successfully turned Section 8 of the ITPA on its head. Rather than use it to arrest women and children in prostitution for "soliciting," as had been widely done in the past, Goa is arresting and prosecuting pimps, procurers, brothel owners and others under Section 8 for soliciting on behalf of the victim, thus strengthening the prosecution's case.

Combined Stakeholder Training

Considering the fact that the various wings of the criminal justice system have to work in synergy, the Director of Prosecution in Goa has initiated a combined training programme for prosecutors, police officers, judicial officers, Executive Magistrates and NGOs. This has tremendous impact in the justice delivery process and the response to human trafficking by all stakeholders. Training in Bihar is also done in with combined classes of police and prosecutors, based on the recommendations of the stakeholders during the Training Needs Analysis (TNA).

4.3 CONSTRAINTS

The existing system of crime data collection and compilation is not disaggregated with respect to different sections of law under ITPA. More over, comprehensive data relating to rescue and rehabilitation is also not available. Lack of effective crime and trafficking records system at both the state and national levels, needs to be addressed. On a positive note, however, that the National Crime Records Bureau has added a chapter on trafficking in its latest publication, Crime in India Reports.

Although trafficking arrest rates have soared and even convictions have increased, the rate of conviction increase has lagged significantly behind the arrest rate. Drawn-out trials and lagging judicial processes, a by-product of over-crowded court dockets and defendant delay, deprive both victims and law enforcement officials of the satisfaction of case closure and lengthen victims' recovery time.

NGOs expressed their frustration at receiving funds from the schemes, like Swadhar Scheme. Without these funds to maintain their facilities and programs, NGOs are hampered in delivering services to trafficking victims. Many NGOs also expressed frustration with the procedures involved in processing applications for Ujjwala funds for anti-trafficking rehabilitation homes. Rural NGOs felt particularly disadvantaged as they did not have the visibility or the access to receive funds in a timely manner.

Under Section 13, ITPA, a person is notified as a Special Police Officer. An NGO pointed out that the additional notification of officers at lower levels (Sub Inspector of Police) would be more effective, as the higher officials usually notified as Special Police Officers are sometimes too busy with other work to investigate trafficking in a timely manner. No doubt, these officials need to be specifically trained, before they are put on the job.

Both police and NGOs spoke about the busy schedule of the police officers at the field level, especially in the police stations, which, at times, hampered training efforts and limited the effectiveness of the training, when officers who might otherwise be able to investigate TIP are pulled away for VIP, public safety or other work.

Many participants cited a lack of political support for anti-trafficking work. They felt that MLAs and Members of Parliament (MPs) need to be sensitized to trafficking issues and urged that they be offered training, so that they would understand the importance of trafficking and allot funds for rescues, prosecution and rehabilitation accordingly.

5 RECOMMENDATIONS

SUMMARY:

- A. The evaluators whole-heartedly and without reservation endorse the outstanding efforts by the UNODC Anti-Human Trafficking project team and the Government

of India, state governments and NGO partners that have made this process so successful. Although we believe that the project has set in motion an irreversible movement towards combating and preventing trafficking at all government levels and in the NGO sector, it is imperative that the project be extended for at least another three more years; preferably, by another five years, in coordination with the Government of India and as a transition to full GOI ownership of the project so that the results can be expanded to all major source/destination/transit states and so that procedures, training and policies can be permanently institutionalized nation-wide.

- B. We urge the GOI to establish a “National Human Trafficking Coordinating Office or Mission” in MHA, with links to all concerned national ministries, offices and agencies to oversee the project, led by a suitably qualified and sensitized person as its National Coordinator. The National Coordinator should be a person with an impressive law enforcement background, significant anti-trafficking and project management expertise, excellent communication skills and an effective personnel manager. The annex contains a detailed description of this recommendation. MHA may work with UNODC and donors and draw their expertise/resources for enriching the National Mission.
- C. The GOI may also wish to establish a National Nodal Training Agency with enough infrastructure to train both Indian “Master Trainers,” who would then pass their training on to the states and districts from which they come and for foreign (especially SAARC countries’) officials. Such a facility should be centrally located, easily reachable, have enough space to expand its facilities as needed and a top-notch training staff.
- D. The government agencies should make provisions for providing interim relief funds to the police to use in the immediate rescue aftermath for the rescued person’s emergency needs and also for providing adequate funds to the rehabilitative agencies. This should be given without any delay. As a supplement to the government efforts, UNODC may also consider giving financial support to the NGOs across the country so as to undertake rehabilitation activities on priority.
- E. The proposed MHA scheme on anti human trafficking (setting up AHTUs and training) should be put in place urgently.
- F. UNODC may consider providing for a Consultant as ‘Bridge Assistance’ to facilitate the launching and execution of the new Scheme of the MHA.
- G. The additional recommendations below be incorporated in the establishment of the new/ extended project design and into future GOI policies regarding trafficking in persons. **END SUMMARY**

5.1 Issues resolved during evaluation ... see points below

5.2 Actions/ decisions recommended ... see points below

6 OVERALL CONCLUSIONS

1. The GOI and states should expand the UNODC training to all relevant districts and personnel, particularly: magistrates and judges at all levels; police and prosecutors, especially in targeted districts where no police or prosecutors have been trained; CISF and immigration officials working at the airports; BSF/ SSB/ ITBP/ Assam Rifles, etc. at the borders; other specialized police agencies, like GRP, RPF, Tourism Police; *anganwadi* workers and *panchayat* leaders; CWC members; officials of central and state government Ministries or offices of WCD, Labor, Health, NACO, PIO Affairs and Education; major training institutions, including state police training academies; the National Police Academy; state judicial training academies, District Collectors and the National Academy of Administration, National Judicial Academy, Indian Institute of Mass Communications, etc.
2. New training materials, where ever necessary, should be developed, targeted at audiences not previously trained. Sensitivities to training vary by group, particularly at the judicial level, so trainers should incorporate the “culture” of those to be trained into their training approach. It emerged in discussions with the judge of the High Court, Mumbai that it would be useful for the judges to have a “Framework” for the procedure to handle trafficking cases.
3. State and central government police and officials should also conduct anti-trafficking informational workshops and offer training to MPs, MLAs, Members of Legislative Council (MLCs), elected representatives of civil bodies including Panchayats, so that they can be more effective advocates for the victims in their constituencies and so that they can advocate more successfully for funding to investigate and prosecute trafficking crimes and rehabilitate victims.
4. The GOI should develop or acquire user-friendly software to track crimes from initial arrest to final judicial disposition at both the state and central government levels. Such a system should be sufficiently flexible to permit input of case information which would be useful to criminal case analysts. Andhra Pradesh has already produced excellent analyses of trafficking routes in and through the state. Other states should follow suit and all states should highlight trafficking problems unique or specific to their states, develop expertise in investigating them and share that expertise with other states. The Central Advisory Committee of MWCD has shown initiative in developing a Management of Information System (MIS) in partnership with UNODC.
5. The state and central governments and NGOs should explore the possibility of using corporate assistance to print a wide variety of posters on TIP, including those developed during the project, audio or visual anti-trafficking aids and others as may be appropriate that can be used in police stations, prosecutors’ offices, school, colleges, government offices and other public places. Corporate assistance should also be sought for other key inputs, such as: guidance on establishing effective, remunerative, skilled and industry-necessary rehabilitative training, followed by

corporate tie-ups; counsel on NGO management and “in kind” assistance to NGO shelter homes among others. The UNODC project has initiated setting up Kolkata Core Group on Anti Human Trafficking, involving Law Enforcement Officials, Corporates and NGOs, which is an excellent and unique initiative. As well, we urge UNODC to solicit donor assistance from both the current project donor and other potentially interested donor countries and international organizations.

6. Building on the highly effective training manuals, SOPs and other tools developed by the project, the project should continue to develop resource materials, like model First Information Reports (FIRs) for special crimes of trafficking like adoption, child labor, forced/bonded labor, organ-trafficking, etc. As well, all materials produced by the project should be translated into local languages to provide resource material for police and prosecutors throughout the country.
7. The police and MHA should develop a program to recognize outstanding officials, including police, prosecutors, forensic experts, etc. and NGOs who have made outstanding contribution the field of anti human trafficking, including those who have successfully investigated anti-trafficking cases or rescued victims and whose performance has led to convictions of offenders and effective rehabilitation of victims. UNODC and NGOs may also wish to institute their own awards for such officers.
8. The Competent Authority of the Ministry of Finance provides specialized training for confiscation and forfeiture of assets borne out of crime. The services of this agency could be utilized for empowering the police officers, especially in the specialized wings of the police, like CBI, CID, etc. so that they could also utilize the advanced provisions and protocols in seizing and freezing the illegal assets of human traffickers.
9. Trainees recommended that a higher priority, especially at the station-house level, be put on investigating missing persons’ reports, particularly for children and women, since trafficking victims are often reported as missing by their families, but little importance has been attached to such cases, except in the five project states.
10. Many participants urged that more emphasis be given to forensic and medical aspects of case development. Lack of understanding of the importance of medical, forensic and psychiatric evidence can jeopardize effective prosecution; however, effectively used, such evidence can be a powerful impetus to conviction.
11. Although some states have begun to use video conferencing to conduct trials when the victim is not in the court’s physical jurisdiction, participants urged that more emphasis be given to using such technology. Investigation, development of the case for prosecution and the trial itself are often very time-consuming. Retaining a victim in a shelter during this time solely for the purposes of testimony, when the victim is otherwise able to be re-integrated into his/her home state or family can set back rehabilitation. Likewise, compelling a victim/witness to return to the

jurisdiction of her rescue after having begun the rehabilitation process at home is also disruptive. Establishing victim/witness video conferencing participation guidelines and capabilities in all states is not only cost-effective and humane, but, project participants believed, very technically feasible.

12. Police and prosecutor participants felt that training needed to be reinforced. Many of them thought a one-day “refresher” course six months to a year after training would be extremely helpful in refining participants’ knowledge, enabling them to share their experiences, providing them with newly-developed information and resolving any questions or problems regarding investigation or prosecution procedures. Additionally, they felt that a national conference of “master trainers” and AHTU participants would be equally helpful to accomplish the same goals. (We are happy to note that the Work Plan for 2008 of the UNODC project envisages these two activities).
13. Trafficking is increasingly global and Indian citizens have been trafficked to many parts of the world, with the most significant trafficking taking place to Middle Eastern countries. As other countries become increasingly aware of the menace of trafficking, there will be more rescues of trafficking victims outside India. Indian diplomats need training to understand the dimensions and causes of trafficking and to understand their role to play in the rescue and repatriation of Indian citizens trafficked abroad. We recommend that the Ministry of External Affairs (MEA) provide such training for Indian Foreign Service Officers, particularly Consular Officers, at all levels. Similarly, immigration officials at the ports/ airports/ borders need to be trained at the earliest.
14. The success of anti human trafficking depends on preventing re-trafficking and providing rehabilitation in a sustainable manner. This requires provision of interim relief to all rescued persons (Andhra Pradesh model) and short term financial assistance to the shelter homes which look after the rescued victims to prepare them to reintegrate into the mainstream society, as well as funds for long-term sustainable rehabilitation programmes. The institutions undertaking this role require core funding to maintain their infrastructure, as well as human resources with the right expertise. The difficulties that these agencies are facing today, especially due to funding delays, access to trained personnel and adequate space for rescued victims need to be addressed immediately. UNODC should consider providing appropriate financial support, including core funds to selected NGOs across the country for establishing quality shelter homes and extending appropriate rehabilitation programmes. This assistance can be given on a basis which will allow the GOI and states to regularize and phase in their own assistance.
15. The proposed MHA scheme on anti human trafficking (setting up AHTUs and training) should be put in place urgently; both to sustain the activities initiated in the five UNODC project states and take them to their logical conclusion of training and re-training the entire law enforcement machinery, and to immediately bring in the states adjoining these, to prevent spill – over and shift of trafficking activities.

Subsequently, it should be extended to all the other states with the capacity building programme for preparing the Master Trainers from all the states. Another reason for urgency is to maintain the intensity of efforts on anti trafficking without any dilution.

16. The new MHA scheme of setting up AHTUs and trainings of trainers at the national level has to be carried out with the same tempo and spirit with which the UNODC project was executed in the five states. Considering the expertise and experience developed by UNODC in this aspect, it is appropriate that UNODC provides 'Bridge Assistance' for placing an appropriate person as a Consultant with MHA to prepare the ground for launching the new scheme when it is ready, without any delay for preparatory activities. This Consultant may continue to work as the Core Technical Person/ Nodal National Coordinator in executing the MHA Scheme. A National Anti Human Trafficking Mission should be established in the Ministry of Home Affairs to take up this massive task (refer Annexure 7). The Mission could create a domino effect in the country by intensifying the sensitization process of the law enforcement machinery through training and capacity building.
17. We recommend that the Government of India and state governments develop a faster, more effective method of disbursing funds to NGOs working in the anti-trafficking field, especially for shelter homes and rehabilitation activities. NGOs suggested that government could identify effective NGOs, have them post a bond as surety and then provide them with a fixed amount for the rescue/rehabilitation of each victim. Half could be disbursed at the time of the initial rescue and in the first few months, with the rest being kept in trust for him/her during and post-rehabilitation. The NGOs would document each case and provide expenditure records to the government. Alternatively, the central government could make a block grant for anti-trafficking rehabilitation to each state, which would then determine which NGOs would receive funding, based on the above suggestion.
18. Additionally, the Ministry of Women and Child Development and its state counterparts should brainstorm to develop an extensive list of benefits to rescued trafficking victims, including, as a starting point, reservations in training institutes and polytechnics, hostel accommodations, victim compensation, "soft" loans and business assistance.
19. Most NGOs and some police felt that the lack of policy coordination between government offices and NGOs involved in HIV/AIDS prevention and those involved in anti-trafficking issues was confusing and potentially deleterious to anti-trafficking activities. We urge the GOI's National Aids Control Office, the Ministries of Women and Child Development, Health and Home Affairs to establish a policy that takes cognizance of the importance of both issues and establish guidelines for government agencies and NGOs working in the two fields so that they do not disrupt each other's work.

20. *Panchayats*, women's self-help groups and village councils, working with teachers, the police and *anganwadi* workers, should ensure on a periodical basis, that all children within their purview are accounted for and that missing persons, especially children, are promptly reported to the police. Photographs of all children, updated at regular intervals, should be kept in a safe place for reference and easy identification in case children are missing. The *Panchayat* leaders need to be sensitized on the dimensions of human trafficking and their cooperation elicited in preventing human trafficking, which should include cooperation with the Ministry of *Panchayat Raj*.
21. Mobile vans for community training systems should be established to go into rural areas and do awareness programmes for the community including Station House Officers and Investigators, who are not able to attend regular training programmes owing to their pre-occupation with their responsibilities.
22. Enlighten students and teachers to prevent human trafficking and do the sensitization through the curriculum by including the subject in the school and college syllabus/ curriculum.
23. All participants felt there was a serious lack of shelter homes for rescued sex trafficking victims. The small number of shelter spaces available, including both government homes and NGO facilities, significantly complicates rescue planning and, in Andhra Pradesh and Maharashtra, police felt that it impinged upon their ability to conduct all the rescues of which they were capable. We urge central and state governments to provide funding to government as well as NGO for the construction of shelter homes in the most affected cities and states as quickly as possible.
24. Fast-track mechanisms for providing funds to the NGOs are essential so that they could address the requirements of the rescued persons without delay. This includes interim relief, short term funds for trauma counseling and long term funds for rehabilitation. Considering the synergy that the law enforcement agencies have developed with the NGOs, we felt that the government could consider recommendations from the law enforcement agency and act upon them for providing funds to the NGOs. Perhaps this could be an alternative mechanism for speedy delivery of funds.
25. Age verification of the rescued victims is extremely important to determining under which grounds a trafficker will be charged. However, not all doctors who examine trafficking victims understand bone density tests or the purpose of age verification and its importance to indictment. Doctors should receive training on age verification procedures and their importance to the victim, police and prosecutor.
26. We urge all involved in anti-trafficking activities, especially state and central government ministries and agencies to use their websites to publicize their training, activities and successes. Such websites should also include links to NGOs, to

international organization sites, such as UNODC, UNIFEM and WHO, as well as cross-reference Government of India and state government websites dealing with trafficking. The websites of MHA, MWCD, BPRD and related agencies should upload all the resource materials and documents produced by UNODC.

27. Participants cited the need to develop stronger victim/witness protection programs. Intimidated victim/witnesses will be reluctant to provide convincing testimony. We understand the GOI is working to develop such a program. In the meantime, there are two steps that can help increase victim/witness security; denial of bail to arrested traffickers and, when feasible, repatriation of the victim to his/her own state.
28. Although trafficking in children for forced/bonded labor was an important part of the training, in practice, there have been fewer arrests/rescues of trafficked children for labor than there have been of rescued trafficking victims of sexual exploitation. Trafficking for child labor is as serious a problem nation-wide, and internationally, as is trafficking for sexual exploitation, but it receives less attention because it is so pervasive at all levels of society, with children, both visible and invisible, working as private servants, in closed and outdoor factories, in hotels, restaurants, roadside stands, selling on street corners . . . the list is endless. We urge law enforcement agencies, working with the appropriate ministries and NGOs to move investigation and interdiction of child trafficking to a higher priority.
29. Apart from concentrating on red light areas for raids/rescues, decentralized sex trafficking activities should be recognized, such as: massage parlours, escort services, cyber pornography, home based exploitation, etc. and appropriate anti human trafficking action should be instituted.
30. Many NGO participants agreed that recovering victims could find the opportunity to become “peer counselors” to incoming shelter residents empowering and that their assistance, as part of a team with a trained social worker or counselor, would be invaluable to helping newly-arrived victims feel safer and more comfortable. NGOs should consider developing peer counselor programs for victims who indicate an interest and have the skills, using the successful peer counseling models developed by drug abuse rehabilitation NGOs. Recovering victim/witnesses who are well-counseled and prepared may also be excellent resources for training.
31. To ensure that all victim/witnesses receive equal treatment and benefits, we urge the Government of India and/ or state governments to develop basic “standards of service” to define the basic activities and services that shelter homes must possess to receive government funding. Some states and cities have already provided effective models, which other states may want to study.
32. Parents and family of victim/witnesses are often forgotten in the counseling process, yet their understanding of their children’s trauma and the role they play in their children’s rehabilitation and successful reintegration is the key to the victim’s

recovery. Specific family counseling guidelines should be developed and all service providers should include family counseling as a part of recovery services. However, one should take into consideration that at times even parents can be traffickers and in such situations the response systems will naturally be different.

33. Brief anti-TIP PSA “trailers” of a few minutes should be developed for use in cinemas prior to film showings and for television to raise public awareness. In this context we are happy to note that the Kolkata Core Group set up by this project has got the documentary film ‘One Life. No Price’ translated into Bengali and has made arrangements to screen it in all theaters.
34. Some state police have successfully used paralegal (AP) or legal advisors (Maharashtra) to help them prepare anti-TIP cases and to liaise with prosecutors. Other states may wish to consider replicating this practice.
35. Though judicial training was not part of the project mandate, we are happy to note that efforts were made in several places to involve judicial officers in project activities, including undertaking joint training programmes with police and prosecutors. A course curriculum has been specifically developed for this purpose. However, it would be advisable that appropriate tools, which could include a Framework, is prepared for judicial officers and utilized in their training.
36. As a part of the public awareness programme against human trafficking, it would be advisable that simple materials including posters be developed for use by Self Help Groups.
37. Law enforcement agencies and NGOs should focus on prevention in source areas with vulnerable populations.
38. Trafficking of boys and girls for sex tourism has been reported from several places. This needs to be responded to urgently. Among the project states, only Goa has a state Tourism Police. Tourists not only visit coastal areas, but also other places for business interests, pilgrimages, family visits, place of pilgrimage etc. therefore there is a need to set up a special task force at all places and also empower them specially. The central and state governments’ Ministries and Departments of Tourism should be involved in this process. Protocols should be developed for safe and child-friendly tourism.
39. Considering the tremendous impact that the project has made in the short span of two years, the MHA should facilitate visits by nodal officers and other AHT officials to project states to help replicate the project’s successes.
40. In order to buttress the efforts already put in place in the five project states, extension of training to cover the entire law enforcement machinery should be urgently undertaken. The neighbouring states like Karnataka, Tamil Nadu, Uttar Pradesh, Punjab, Haryana, North East states and Delhi should be immediately

selected for establishing the Anti Human Trafficking Units and conducting training of law enforcement officials.

41. There should be a strong contingent of women prosecutors to pursue cases under the Immoral Traffic (Prevention) Act, 1956.
42. **Master Trainers:** The UNODC project has brought out a list of master trainers (refer Annexure 8) on the various topics/ subjects to be covered in the training/ capacity building process for police officers, prosecutors, judicial officers, NGOs, government officials, Executive Magistrates, etc. This list has been prepared based on the competence, capability, professional caliber which has been demonstrated and put to test in the various training programmes organized in the project. It is recommended that MHA and BPRD circulate this list to all training institutions and ensure that all training programmes in futures utilize the services of these resource persons for TOT and where ever possible for the training programmes.

ANNEXURE 1



UNITED NATIONS
Office on Drugs and Crime

UNITED NATIONS OFFICE ON DRUGS AND CRIME TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR PROJECT EVALUATION

Project Number and Title	IND/S16 – Strengthening the law enforcement response in India against trafficking in persons through training and capacity building
Duration of the Project	2 years (2006-2008)
Thematic Area of the Project	Human Trafficking
Location	Andhra Pradesh, Bihar, Goa, Maharashtra and West Bengal and such other States as may be decided by Project Steering Committee
Lead Government Agency	Ministry of Home Affairs, BPR&D, New Delhi
Other Counterpart Government Agencies	State Police, State Police Training Institutions, National Police Academy and such other reputed institutions as may be decided by Project Steering Committee
Executing Agency and Partner	UN Office on Drugs and Crime
UNODC Total Budget	\$2.58 million (Donor: US Government 100%). Additional cost-shared inputs from Government of India (in kind) to be determined. Inputs in kind may also come from State Governments.

I. BACKGROUND OF THE PROJECT

Brief Description

This project is a joint initiative of the UNODC and the Government of India, Ministry of Home Affairs. Through a series of training programmes, the project will, over a two-year period, raise the awareness of law enforcement officers, (i.e., police and prosecutors) on the problem of human trafficking and further build up their capacity to better investigate and prosecute offenders perpetrating this crime. The states selected for the training represent source, destination and transit areas for human trafficking of differing types

(e.g., trafficking in women and children for commercial sexual exploitation, child labour, bonded labour, etc.)

Background

The issue of trafficking in human beings, especially women and children, is causing increasing concern in India. Precise estimates of the number of women and children currently trafficked in India are not available as it is a clandestine activity. Intra-country trafficking is the principal mode and is estimated to account for over 90 per cent of the total volume. The movement of trafficked persons from states like West Bengal, Andhra Pradesh, Karnataka and Tamil Nadu is reportedly high with the major destinations points being Kolkata, Mumbai, Delhi and Goa. India also has 4097 kilometres border with Bangladesh and 1751 kilometres long border with Nepal. There is a good deal of migration from these countries into India and some of them, especially women and children, end up being trafficked and falling prey to commercial sexual exploitation. In addition to sexual exploitation, trafficked persons are used in forced labour, forced into marriages, organ trade, etc. Another result of this illegal sex trade is the spread of HIV/AIDS. Several trafficked girls die very young (the average life span is estimated to be only 30 years) mainly from HIV/AIDS, but also from malnutrition, abuse, neglect and sexually transmitted diseases. India is a signatory to the United Nations Convention on Transnational Organized Crime as well as the three related Protocols on human trafficking, migrants and firearms.

In the above background this project was taken up for further sensitizing and training of police personnel on combating the problem of human trafficking in India, especially trafficking in women and children. The project of UNDOC is being run in partnership with Government of India.

II. PURPOSE OF THE EVALUATION

This external evaluation initiated by the UNODC is a part of the project evaluation as mandated by the project document. The purpose of this evaluation is to measure achievements, outcomes and impacts. The overall purpose of the evaluation of this project is to learn from the project implementation so that lessons can be drawn that form the basis for instituting improvements to the existing and future project planning, design and management.

The main stakeholders are the national counterparts in the government, primarily the Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of Women and Child Development and the Bureau of Police Research and Development (BPR&D). The other stakeholders include law enforcement agencies, such as the police and prosecutors, the police training academies, the Directorates of Prosecution, NGOs and service providers in the field of combating human trafficking.

III. SCOPE OF THE EVALUATION

The evaluation is proposed to be conducted at representative sites in the five project states, Bihar, West Bengal, Andhra Pradesh, Goa and Maharashtra, during April – May 2008 and the entire activity including preparation of the evaluation report is to be completed in a period of 30 days.

The evaluator(s) should focus on crucial and strategic issues during project design and implementation. While the major emphasis shall be to on measuring outcomes and impact. The evaluation will also analyse project concept and design, and project implementation.

The evaluator(s) also shall assess whether the desired results have been achieved, and if not, whether there has been some progress made towards their achievement, whether the programme addresses the identified needs/problem (relevance), whether the programme/project contributes to a priority area or comparative advantage for UNODC in the country or region.

The evaluator(s) will ensure that lessons learnt from the project will be recorded and recommendations on possible follow-up activities will be made as appropriate. The evaluation will also assess the spin-offs, if any, as well as any achievements, beyond the project mandate. While analyzing the challenges in implementation, the efforts made to address the challenges will also be evaluated. Efforts made to sustain the activities will also be looked into.

Project concept and design:

The evaluator(s) shall assess project strategy, approaches, design and fund flow mechanisms with special reference to:

- a. The adequacy of the analysis and identification of the problem to be addressed;
- b. The relevance of the long-term objective to the ‘Strengthening the law enforcement response in India against trafficking in persons through training and capacity building’;
- c. The clarity, logic and coherence of the original project design as well as the revised project documents;
- d. The manner in which the project addressed the problem and the strategy in terms of appropriateness and obtain ability of objectives (both immediate and long-term) and attainability of planned outputs and activities within the time frame/appointment of personnel and inputs provided in the original project document.
- e. The executing modality and managerial arrangements and the agreed prerequisites by the project partners and government counterparts;
- f. The appropriateness of the immediate objectives to achieve the long-term objective of the project (as compared to alternate approaches to accomplishing the same objectives) and

- g. The relevance of the outputs to achieving the objectives.

Project Implementation:

The evaluator(s) shall assess:

- a. Whether the project strategy has been implemented as planned in the project document or it has been revised (and for what reason) during the course of the project implementation;
- b. The executing and implementing modalities and managerial arrangements and its impact on program delivery issues;
- c. The inputs, outputs, implementation methodologies and therefore the appropriateness of agreed prerequisites for project implementation;
- d. The terms of reference, efficiency and effectiveness of project management in carrying out the activities to achieve each of the outputs;
- e. The work plans and planned duration of the project as well as the decisions reached in the Project Advisory Committee meeting, the work plans proposed therein;
- f. The adequacy of inputs in the documents cited in (a) above in relation to the planned and outputs and activities and the adequacy of the inputs in relation to the work plan.
- g. The administrative monitoring and backstopping of the project by UNODC Headquarters, UNODC ROSA and the Government counterparts;
- h. The efficiency and effectiveness of other partner agencies;
- i. The planned duration of the project as well as the ability of the project to meet with the emerging needs / changing trends of the problem;
- j. The obstacles and challenges encountered and measures taken to overcome them;
- k. The fulfilment of agreed prerequisites by the project parties and its impact on the project deliverables; and
- l. Indicators utilized to verify achievements of objectives.

Project Outputs, Outcome, Impact and Sustainability:

The evaluator(s) shall assess the quality and quantity of outputs produced and of outputs likely to be produced, outcomes and impact achieved or expected to be achieved by the project. This should encompass an assessment of the achievement of the immediate objectives and the contribution to attaining the project objectives. The evaluator(s) should, in particular, assess:

- a. The ability of the project to train a selected number of law enforcement officers (police and prosecutors) in target states to address the problem of human trafficking.
- b. The ability of the project to develop Standard Operating Procedures and Protocols to govern practices relating to operational aspects of anti-trafficking in project areas.

- c. The ability of the project to set-up (in target areas currently without them)/ strengthen (those already existing in project areas) Anti Human Trafficking Units (AHTUs).
- d. The ability of the project to achieve improved liaison between law enforcement and civil society in respect of prevention, detection, prosecution and rehabilitation.

Findings, Lessons learned and Recommendations

As Project IND/S16 is one of the first national projects on matters relating to anti- human trafficking with special emphasis on law enforcement responses, the evaluator(s) shall make recommendations, as appropriate. Recommendations may also be made in respect of issues related to the planning, execution and implementation of the project. They should constitute ideas and proposals for concrete action, which could be taken in future to improve and rectify undesired outcomes and could be included in the design of future national/ regional projects.

The evaluator(s) should record lessons learned from the project, which are valid beyond the project itself. The evaluation shall also record the difference this project has made to the beneficiaries and their willingness to sustain the activities.

IV. EVALUATION METHODS

The evaluator(s) shall follow the guiding principles for evaluations at UNODC (attached).

The original project document and revision documents, agreements reached with national counterparts and donor agencies, financing agreements, and reports submitted to review meetings and minutes of review meetings shall be the basic documents for review. The semi-annual and annual reports, mission reports, reports of trainings and workshops, toolkits and publications produced by the project and the internal evaluation of the training programmes conducted in the project shall also be taken into consideration.

The evaluator(s) will study the relevant documents and publications by the project. These documents will be sent to the evaluator(s) prior to the commencement of the missions. In addition, any other documents that may be requested by the evaluator(s) will be made available during a briefing in Delhi by UNODC. The evaluation should include participation of partners and stakeholders. The evaluator(s) will interview the representatives from the competent authorities of as many of the project states as feasible, visit all the project states where project activities were conducted and interview some of the participants of the training programmes. Effort should be made to interview beneficiaries of this project. The evaluator(s) may use questionnaires, observation and other participatory techniques such as focus group discussions, etc.

The evaluator(s) should not have been involved directly in the design, appraisal or implementation of the project. Furthermore, s/he will not act as representative of any party, but should use an independent judgement.

V. EVALUATION TEAM

The evaluation will be done by a team of two Consultants, one National (Annexure I) and one International (Annexure II), the former being the Coordinator. UNODC will award individual contracts to the Consultants for matters of payment etc. The Consultants will work together as a team and undertake their own division of responsibilities if required. They will be appointed on the basis of experience in project evaluation, monitoring, implementation and exposure in working on issues related to Law Enforcement or Human Trafficking would be preferable. The evaluation team, if required, can avail the services of one Support Staff. The Support Staff shall be identified in consultation with UNODC and can be employed after the required contract is issued by UNODC.

VI. PLANNING AND IMPLEMENTATION ARRANGEMENTS

The Project Coordinator and the project team will brief the evaluator(s). The evaluator(s) will also consult the Representative of UNODC, Regional Office for South Asia, New Delhi and the competent authorities of as many beneficiary project states and any others persons/agencies as s/he deems appropriate. The evaluator(s) will be provided with the mission plans and the project team will facilitate interviews and discussions in the project states. In each of the 5 project states the team will spend a maximum of two days and nights excluding the time spent in transit and travel. The evaluator(s) will present the findings in a concise but comprehensive report.

The timetable of the missions and the allocated budget (as per the UN guidelines) shall be shared with the selected evaluator(s).

VII. EVALUATION REPORT AND FOLLOW-UP

The evaluator(s) should submit the evaluation report in the standard format. Copies of the UNODC standard format and guidelines for project evaluation report, evaluation assessment, questionnaire and guiding principles for evaluations at UNODC are attached. Evaluator(s) should follow these prescribed formats while preparing his report. The evaluation draft report should contain the findings, lessons learned, results, briefing minutes or presentations and workshops. Before the submission of the final evaluation report to UNODC, the evaluator(s) will prepare and discuss the draft evaluation report with the Project Team of UNODC.

Evaluation Report outline:

1. Executive Summary (maximum 4 pages)
2. Introduction
3. Background (Project description)
4. Evaluation purpose and objective
5. Evaluation Methodology
6. Major Findings
7. Lessons learned (from both positive and negative experiences)
8. Constraints, if any, that impacted programme delivery
9. Recommendations
10. Overall conclusions

Annexes:

1. Terms of Reference
2. Organisations and places visited and persons met
3. Summary assessment questionnaire (if any)
4. Relevant Materials

Although the evaluator(s) should take the views expressed by the concerned parties into account, s/he should use her/his independent judgment in preparing the evaluation report. The evaluator(s) will also complete the summary assessment questionnaire. Within two weeks of the completion of the evaluation mission, the evaluators will send to Regional Office for South Asia electronically (in Word and PDF format) the Evaluation Report, the Evaluation Summary and the Questionnaire. The evaluator(s) would be available to answer any further queries from UNODC with regard to the evaluation

Annexes to the Evaluation Report may be kept to the minimum. Only those annexes that save to demonstrate or clarify an issue related to a major finding should be included. Existing documents should be referenced but not necessarily annexed. Maximum number of pages for annexes = 15.

TIME – LINE

Those interested are requested to mail their Resume with a Letter of Interest at pm.nair@unodc.org, with a copy to geeta.sekhon@unodc.org and swasti.rana@unodc.org by the close of business on 15 April 2008.

ANNEXURE 2

SUMMARY OF TRAINING PROGRAMMES - SEPT 2006 – APRIL 2008

DETAILS	TRAINING PROGRAMMES					Total
	Andhra Pradesh	Bihar	Goa	Maharashtra	West Bengal	
No. of phases in which training was held	2	2	2	2	2	Average 2
No. of training programmes held	47	39	28	71	122	316
No. trained	2911	1588	614	2348	3236	10910
% of districts / Units covered	100 %	45 %	100 %	60%	70 %	75 % apprx
Approx. average % of Investigators trained in each district / unit	70 %	50%	95%	60%	50%	65 %
AHT Crimes registered						896
No. of rescue operations						369
No. of persons rescued						1583
No. of minors rescued						257
No. of offenders arrested						1908
No. of customers arrested						801
No. of persons convicted						30
No. of places of exploitation closed						33
No. of rescued persons for whom the process of rehab has been initiated						850
No of NGOs associated	7	9	6	7	6	30
Names of NGOs associated in AHT work	Prajwala, Ankuram, HELP, STHREE, REDS, CRS,KGNT	ATSEC, Prayas Bharti Trust, Jan Jagran Sansthan, Adithi, Sakhi, Shaktivardhini, Prayas, CNI, Apne Aap	ARZ, WISE, CRG, Bailancho Saad, Childline Foundation, TERI	Prerana, Rescue Foundation, STCI, Apne Aap, CNI, WISE, Prayog	Sanlaap, Jabala, Apne Aap, Womens Coordinating Council, SLARTC, ATSEC	

ANNEXURE 3

NGOS IN THE AHT ACTIVITIES IN THE PROJECT ON ANTI HUMAN TRAFFICKING

S. NO	STATE	NAME OF NGO	ACTIVITIES IN WHICH NGO WAS ASSOCIATED	OTHER FEATURES
	AP			
1		PRAJWALA	Training, 2. AHTU, 3. Counseling, 4. Mock Trial, 5. Posters 6. Developing Film, 7. Developing SOPs,8. Shelter Home Support, 9. Advocacy, 10. Inter state rescue	NGO working on AHT for over 15 years, member of Central Advisory Committee of MWCD, presently home has over 300 women / children being employed / trained in non-traditional livelihood options. Director, Dr. Sunitha Krishnan is a Master Trainer, has good national and international contacts and maintains excellent relationships with law enforcement officials
2		ANKURAM	1. Training, 2. Counseling, 3. Shelter Home Support, 4. Advocacy, 5. Rescue and post rescue care	NGO working on providing training on non-traditional livelihood options, prevention of trafficking with most vulnerable sections like migrant workers. Director, Ms. Sumitra is a master trainer and maintains excellent relationships with law enforcement officials
3		HELP	1. Training, 2. AHTU, 3. Rescue and post rescue care	Part of a national network of NGOs, working in Telangana region of AP, has grassroots contacts in several districts of AP. Director, Mr. Ramamohan and maintains excellent relationships with law enforcement officials
4		STHREE	1. Training, 2. AHTU, 3. Shelter Home Support, 4. Post rescue care, 5. Counseling,6. Inter state rescue	NGO working in Rayalseema area of AP. Part of national network of NGOs on AHT. Director, Ms. Hema Bedi is a nationally known activist in the field of AHT and maintains excellent relationships with law enforcement officials
5		REDS	1. Rescue, 2. Training	Director, Ms. Bhanu is a known activist
6		CRS	1. Developing posters and calendars in English and Telugu	Director, Mr. David Solomon is a known activist in AP on womens issues and a facilitator of NGO corporate linkage
7		KGMT	1. Training	Director, Ms. V Padmavathi is a known activist of repute and commitment
	BIHAR			

8.		ATSEC	1. Training, 2. Networking, 3. Advocacy	Has an International network of NGOs, state coordinator is Mr. YK Gautam. Mr. Gautam organized an Inter religious priest forum on AHT and organized a conference of parliamentarians on AHT.
9.		PRAYAS BHARTI TRUST	1. Training, 2. Counseling, 3. Rescue and post rescue care, 4. Rehabilitation, 5. Shelter Home Support	Director, Dr.Suman Lal has been working on AHT for more than a decade
10.		JAN JAGRAN SANSTHAN	1. Training, 2. AHTU, 3. rescue and post rescue care, 4. Advocacy and networking	Director, Mr. Gautam is a known activist working for a decade on AHT in Bihar
11.		ADITHI	1. AHTU, 2. Training, 3. Advocacy	Director, Mr. Ganesh Prasad Singh working on AHT in Bihar for over a decade and part of ATSEC.
12.		SAKHI	1. Training, 2. Empowerment programmes, 3. Counseling, 4. Advocacy and networking	Director, Ms. Suman Singh was earlier part of an NGO Adithi and has been working on issues of labour trafficking for a long time.
13.		SHAKTIVARDHINI	1. Empowerment programmes 2. Counseling, 3. Shelter home support	Director, Ms. Sudha Verma has been working for a long time on AHT issues especially on victim support and rehabilitation
14.		PRAYAS	1. Shelter Home support, 2. Counseling, 3. Empowerment programmes	The National Director of Prayas is Mr. Amod Kanth, has been working in this field for over a decade. Prayas has taken certain initiatives in working with corporates like Amul for rehabilitation.
15.		CNI	1. Networking, 2. public awareness programmes	CNI partnered with UNODC in converting the posters into regional languages and organizing regional workshops for disseminating the tools and generating public opinion.
16.		APNE AAP	1. Training, 2. Counseling, 3. Victim support, 4. Public awareness campaigns	Director, Ms. Ruchira Gupta is an internationally renowned person working against human trafficking. AA has produced a lot of public awareness materials and also a manual to address demand. All of these are being utilized in the training programmes Has also partnered with UNODC in developing Training Manual for Prosecutors.

	GOA			
17		ARZ	1. Training, 2. Rehabilitation, 3. Counseling, 4. Victim identification, 5. Networking	Director, Mr. Arun Pandey is working with ARZ since a long time, has made an innovative initiative in rehabilitation under the name SWIFTWASH wherein rescued persons are employed in an launderette.
18		WISE	1. Training police, prosecutors and judiciary, 2. Networking, 3. Public awareness	Mr. Kadri, who has taken over the job after late Mrs. Vipula Kadri is running several activities undertaken by WISE. Due to the initiatives of Mr. Kadri a state level cadre of trained social workers working at grassroots have been set up and are functional
19		CRG	1. Training, 2. Advocacy	Dr. Nishtha Desai and colleagues are working on several activities in addressing vulnerabilities especially relating to pedophilia
20		Bailancho Saad	1. Training, 2. Advocacy	Agency working on addressing vulnerabilities among the weaker sections in Goa
21		Childline Foundation	1. Advocacy	Agency working on child rights issues in Goa and part of the network in this regard.
22		TERI	1. Research	Has undertaken a research on trafficking of Lamani tribes to Goa, largely done by Ms. Saltant Kazi
	MAHARAHSTRA			
23		Prerana	1. Training, 2. Prevention, 3. Rescue, 4. Post rescue care, 5. Rehabilitation, 6. Empowerment programmes, 7. Networking, 8. Advocacy, 9. Multi stakeholder participation	Director, Mr. Priti Patkar, has been working on AHT for almost 2 decades running excellent Homes, has brought out classic models of rehabilitation by working with corporates, has been working with the Government and running joint supervision of government homes, intervention programmes etc.
24		Rescue Foundation	1. Training, 2. Rehabilitation, 3. Running Homes, 4. Counseling, 5. Rescue, 6. Repatriation of rescued persons to Nepal	Director, Ms. Triveni Acharya, has been working in this field for a decade and had brought out innovative initiatives in rescue and post rescue activities
25		STCI	1. Training police, prosecutors and judiciary, 2. Networking, 3. Public	Mr. Kadri, who has taken over the job after late Mrs. Vipula Kadri is running several activities undertaken by WISE. Due to the

			awareness	initiatives of M. Kadri a network has been developed with Jet Airways wherein the latter partners with in several activities of rehabilitation and prevention.
26		Apne Aap	As mentioned earlier	
27		CNI	As mentioned earlier	
28		WISE	As mentioned earlier	
29		Prayog	1. Training, 2. Advocacy, 3. working with the media	Led by Mr Anurag, this agency is focused in media related issues and public awareness programmes.
WEST BENGAL				
30		Sanlaap	1. Training, 2. Shelter Home, 3. Rescue and post rescue care, 4. Rehabilitation, 4. Repatriation, especially to Bangladesh and Nepal, 5. Networking6. Public awareness programmes, 7. prevention	Director, Dr. Indrani Sinha, has been working in this field for almost two decades, and has made an excellent imitative in running the shelter home and empowering the survivors. Has also brought out useful tools in training and public awareness.
31		Jabala	1. Training, 2. Shelter Home, 3. advocacy	Director, Ms. Baitali Ganguly, has been working in this field for a long time and running a Home for trafficked persons.
32		Apne Aap	As mentioned earlier	
33		Women Coordinating Council	1. Training, 2. Shelter home, 3. Advocacy, 4. Rehabilitation	This is an NGO in existence for more than 30 years. Present in charge Ms. Shormista Biswas, has been actively involved in the training of police and prosecutors.
34		SLARTC	1. Legal Aid, 2. Research, 3. Training, 4. Advocacy, 5. Networking with government and judiciary	Director, Mr. Manabendra Mandal is the International Coordinator of ATSEC and was instrumental in setting up ATSEC. Has been working on AHT for almost two decades.
35		ATSEC	1. Training, 2. Networking, 3. Advocacy	It is an international network of NGOs working on action against trafficking for sexual exploitation
OTHERS				
40		Centre for Social Research	1. Research, 2. Advocacy, 3. Networking, 4. Documentation, 5. Training	Director, Dr. Ranjana Kumari, has supported UNODC in preparing the Training Manual for Police on AHT. CRS has to its credit several documents on women's issues, including a training manual. Known for activism on women's issues, runs a famous institution, the Gender Training Institute, only one of its kind in India.

41		HAQ – Centre for Child Rights	1. Research, 2. Advocacy, 3. Networking, 4. Documentation, 5. Training	Led by Ms. Bharti Ali and Ms. Enakshi Gnguly, HAQ works on gender budgeting and public awareness programmes, has brought out very useful documents earlier. Has worked with UNODC in developing the Best Practice Compendium by NGOs.
42		Bachpan Bachao Andolan	1. Training on anti Labour Trafficking, 2. Advocacy, 3. Prevention, 4. Networking, 5. Documentation, 6. Running Homes	Run by Mr. Kailash Satyarthi and Mr. Bhuwan, BBA has undertaken interesting initiatives on working against labour exploitation. Interventions have made tremendous impact against labour trafficking. Besides several tools and documents published by BBA they have partnered with UNODC in developing SOP on Investigation on Labour Trafficking,
43		Saarthak	1. Training, 2. Documentation, 3. Research, 4. Psycho social counseling	Led by Dr. Achal Bhagat, a medical professional with specialization in psychiatry, working on psycho social interventions for almost a decade. Besides several and resource materials brought out by SAARTHAK, they have partnered with UNODC in developing Manual on Psycho Social Interventions.
44		STOP	1. Prevention, 2. Documentation, 3. Rescue and post rescue activities, 4. Networking, 5. Public Awareness, 6. Advocacy, 7. Cross border repatriation, 8. Prosecution and Trial	Led by Dr. Roma Debabrata, working in this field for almost two decades, STOP has been notified by High Court of Delhi as the NGO which has to be associated by the police in rescue and post rescue activities. Has been instrumental in facilitating victim care and protection leading to conviction of several traffickers. Has also partnered with UNODC and are developing the Manual on Prevention.
45		Institute of Social Sciences	1. Research, 2. Documentation, 3. Training, 4. Advocacy	Led by Dr. George Mathew, ISS carried out Action Research on HT for NHRC, published by Orient Longman 2005. Has partnered with UNODC in bring out the Compendium on best practices on LEA.
46		Oasis India	1. Documentation, 2. Research	This agency supported by Mr. Ashley Varghese and Mr. Ranjit , both legal professional have been working with UNODC to develop

				the SOP on Prosecution.
47		National Law School University of India, Bangalore	1. Research, Training, Documentation	2. 3. India's premier institute on legal education , has partnered with UNODC in developing the Resource book on Legal Framework on HT.
48		IMADR	1. International networking, Women's Issues, Advocacy	2. 3. This agency has taken up the task of preparing Manual on Victim Care and Protection, which is being undertaken by Ms. Joyatri Ray, who has past experience in AHT.

QUESTIONNAIRE FOR PROJECT S16 EVALUATION

PROJECT MANDATE

Through the activities the project intends to further sensitize and train the police personnel and prosecutors on combating the problem of human trafficking in India, especially trafficking in women and children.

***Output 1:** A selected number of law enforcement officers (police and prosecutors) trained in target States (Andhra Pradesh, West Bengal, Maharashtra, Goa and Bihar) to address the problem of human trafficking.*

***Output 2:** Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) and Protocols developed to govern practices relating to operational aspects of anti-trafficking and field testing the same in the project States.*

***Output 3:** Anti Human Trafficking Units (AHTUs) strengthened (those already existing in project States of Andhra Pradesh and Goa) and developed in the States of West Bengal and Bihar.*

***Output 4** Improved liaison between law enforcement and civil society in respect to prevention, detection, prosecution and rehabilitation.*

PROJECT IMPACT AND OUTCOMES

TRAINING IMPACT

1. Was a Training Needs Assessment (TNA) carried out in all the project states to identify key training components (including selection of training sites / venues, schedule for training)?
 - a. Number of sessions held state wise?
 - b. Number of participants state wise?
 - c. Did the participants include representatives from different stakeholders?

2. Was a Training of Trainers (TOT) carried out in all the project states? The purpose of the TOT should be to identify trainers and resource persons for the different topics to be covered.
 - a. Number of sessions held state wise?
 - b. Total number of participants state wise?
 - c. Did the participants include representatives from different stakeholders?
 - d. Was it done in consultation with the state government agencies?

- e. Were NGOs involved in the process?
 - f. Are the services of these trained persons used for later trainings?
3. Do the resource persons have good standing in their respective fields?
 4. Is the training curriculum as developed by UNODC flexible and being revised and amended several times, based on the feedback from the trained personnel and end users?
 5. Has such a revision taken place in the project period?
 6. Have the resource materials which are being utilized in the training course been developed in consultation with the training partners?
 7. Under the project mandate:
 - a) How many Nodal Training Cells (NTCs) have been set up in the project states?
 - b) Have they been provided with resource materials and equipment?
 - c) Have they been able to institutionalize the training programmes in the states?
 - d) Were the states faced with any challenges in setting up the NTC?
 - e) If yes, what were these challenges and how were they overcome?
 8. Was a training evaluation format adopted and field tested prior to commencing the training programmes?
 9. Has there been a visible attitudinal change amongst the trained law enforcement officials?
 10. a. State wise what is the total number of districts?
b. State wise what is the total number of districts covered by the Project?
 11. a. State wise what is the total number of police stations?
b. State wise what is the total number of police stations covered by the Project?
 12. Do the outputs by the trained law enforcement officials include improvements in the following?
 - i. the manner and number of the Anti-Human Trafficking cases registered (commercial sexual exploitation and labour exploitation)
 - ii. the number of the Rescue Operations held
 - i. the number of victims rescued
 - ii. the number of Minors among those rescued
 - iii. the number of traffickers and exploiters arrested

- iv. the number of customers (non Section 8 arrests under the ITPA) among those arrested
- v. the quality of investigation and increase in the number of Traffickers convicted
- vi. the number of places of exploitation closed
- vii. Improved cooperation between the law enforcement agencies and the police in tackling the menace
- viii. Increase in the number of rescued persons for whom the process of rehabilitation has been initiated
- ix. Are the victims being treated as ‘victim’ and not being arrested as a soliciting person, thereby reversing the earlier trend of criminalizing the victim?
- x. Focus attention on the issue of ‘demand’ as a major factor contributing to HT?

13. Is there is any specialized investigating agency in the state (CID, Crime against Women Cell, Prevention of Atrocities Cell)?

- a) If so, have the officials of these cells been trained?
- b) Have there services been utilized for field action (rescue, developing database, dissemination of resources, materials)?

14) Is there any integration between the training and operations wing?

- a) Are operational officials utilized as resource persons for training?
- b) Are trainers in touch with the trained persons in the field?
- c) Are trained personnel in touch with trainers for assistance and guidance to clarify doubts?

NETWORKING AMONG STAKEHOLDERS

1. Has there been advocacy and networking among key stakeholders intended to place the issue of human trafficking as a priority concern on the development and law enforcement agenda?

2. Shelter Home Support: During the implementation of the project activities, several stake holders brought out the urgency and necessity of setting up or supporting appropriate institutions/agencies/facilities for post rescue care and attention of the victims and survivors, which includes psycho social counselling, medical care, legal support, empowering them with life skill activities depending on their choice and preference, giving them specialized training, providing them appropriate mechanisms for rehabilitation and ensuring all steps towards proper rehabilitation and reintegration. After approval of the Project Steering Committee (PSC); appropriate NGOs were identified in the states with the help of the state government officials. The details of the shelter homes being supported in the project states is as follows:

- Andhra Pradesh – Ankuram, Prajwala and Sthree
- Bihar – Prayas Bharti Trust, Shaktivardhini and Prayas

- Goa – ARZ
- Maharashtra – Rescue Foundation
- West Bengal - Jabala and Sanlaap

1. Has a fair and transparent selection process been followed for selecting NGOs supporting Shelter Homes?
2. Has a monthly reporting format been developed and provided to all partner NGOs in the project states?
3. Have regular field visits been undertaken by the UNODC project team to ensure effective functioning of the Shelter Homes and correct utilization of the allocated funds?
4. Have the law enforcement official's networked with the NGOs in the state so that they may involve them in the rehabilitation process?
5. Have these NGOs been associated with the training process. Is there any linkage between the police training and the rehabilitation process by the NGOs (has the training police officer been instrumental in networking with NGOs and other stakeholders for facilitating rehabilitation)?
6. Has the project made any effort to bring together corporate and NGOs for rehabilitation work?
7. Has the project made any effort to bring together corporate and NGOs for empowering the vulnerable?

MOVING BEYOND THE PROJECT MANDATE

1. Beyond the planned outputs, have there been any positive spin-offs as a direct / indirect result of the project activities? (You may refer to the S16 progress report to evaluate these achievements):
 - (a) Has there been involvement of the media in Anti Human Trafficking?
 - (b) Has there involvement of the celebrities in Anti Human Trafficking?
 - (c) Has there involvement of the corporates in Anti Human Trafficking?
 - (d) Has there been Multi-Stakeholder Linkages and Involvement?
 - (e) Has there been involvement of the political leaders in Anti Human Trafficking?

ANNEXURE 5

Model Questionnaire for the officials attending training
(Pre and Post Training Evaluation)

Please tick (√)

No.	ISSUES	Pre-Training		Post-Training	
		Yes	No	Yes	No
1	Trafficking and prostitution are the same.				
2	Trafficked persons are also called as “soliciting persons” under the law				
3	Trafficked person indulges in flesh trade and is, therefore, a criminal				
4	Arrest under Section 8 ITPA is the easiest solution to deal with a trafficked person				
5	“Customers” can never be arrested under ITPA because they have committed no crime				
6	An adult woman can never be trafficked				
7	Section 511 IPC is the appropriate section to deal with attempt to trafficking.				
8	A brothel house can be ordered to be closed only by a Judicial Magistrate				
9	The scene of crime in a case of trafficking is the brothel room where sexual act takes place				
10	The scope of ITPA is limited, and it does not apply to a private house where a massage parlour is being run even if a trafficked woman is indulged in sexual act along with massage parlour				

ANNEXURE 6

LIST OF PERSONS INTERVIEWED/ MET DURING EVALUATION

A. New Delhi

1. Justice Mr. J S Singhvi of the Supreme Court of India
2. Mr. K Koshy, IPS, Director General, Bureau of Police Research and Development, GOI
3. Ms. Anita Choudhary, IAS, Addl. Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs
4. Mr. N S Kalsi, IAS, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs
5. Ms. Manjula Krishnan, Economic Advisor cum Joint Secretary, Ministry of Women and Child Development
6. Ms. Ranjana Kumari, Director, CSR
7. Mr. Achal Bhagat, Director, SAARTHAK
8. Ms. Enakshi Ganguly, Executive Director, HAQ: Centre for Child Rights
9. Ms. Bharti Ali, Executive Director, HAQ: Centre for Child Rights
10. Ms. Ruchira Gupta, Executive Director, Apne Aap Women World Wide
11. Ms. Anjali Pathak, Coordinator, Apne Aap Women World Wide
12. Mr. Bhuwan Ribhu, Bachpan Bachao Andolan
13. Mr. Gary Lewis, Representative, UNODC ROSA
14. Ms. Ashita Mittal, National Programme Officer, UNODC
15. Dr. P M Nair, IPS, Ex- Project Coordinator, Anti Human Trafficking Project
16. Dr. Geeta Sekhon, Officer-in-charge, Anti Human Trafficking Project
17. Ms. Swasti Rana, Consultant, Anti Human Trafficking Project
18. Mr. Varghese John, Admin/Finance Assistant, Anti Human Trafficking Project

B. West Bengal

19. Mr. Raj Johri, ADGP, Training, WB
20. Mr. Sanjay Singh, DIG, Training, WB
21. Mr. Mr Manavendra Mandal, International Coordinator, ATSEC
22. Dr. Indrani Sinha, Director, Sanlaap
23. Ms. Souvik Dutta, Sanlaap
24. Ms. Tapoti Bhowmick, Sanlaap
25. Mr. Taj Mohammed, Dy Director, Prosecution, West Bengal
26. Mr. Sarfaraj Khan, professor, National University of Juridical Sciences, Kolkata
27. Ms. Samapti Banerjee, Sub Inspector, Police Training College (PTC), WB
28. Mr. Basu, Inspector of Police, PTC, WB
29. Mr. Bhupinder Singh, IPS, Additional Director General of Police, CID
30. Mr. Sanjoy Mukherjee, IPS, Special Inspector General of Police, CID

C. Bihar

31. Mr. Yashvant Malhotra, ADGP, CID,
32. Mr. AK Gupta, ADGP
33. Mr. AR Sinha, DGP
34. Ms. Suman Lal, NGO Prayas Bharti Trust
35. Ms. Suman Singh, Sakhi
36. Ms. Sudha Verma, Shakti Vardhini
37. Ms. Sanju Singh, Shakti Vardhini
38. Mr. Sarfaraz Ahmed Khan, NUJS
39. Mr. Y K Gautam, ATSEC
40. Mr. Mahfooz Alam, Panah Ashram
41. Ms. Ashita Maldahiyan, Aditi
42. 5 Master Trainers of Nodal Training Cell, Bihar

C 1. Muzaffarpur, Bihar

43. Mr. Krishna Choudhary, IPS, Additional Director General of Police, Muzaffarpur Zone, Bihar
44. Mr. Kshatraneel Singh, IPS, Asst. Superintendent of Police
45. Mr. Amrendra Jha, Sub Inspector, Muzzafarpur
46. Mr. Upendra Prasad, Sub Inspector, Muzzafarpur
47. Mr. S Singh, Sub Inspector, Government Railway Police, Muzzafarpur
48. 2 Trained Officials of Bihar Police

D. Mumbai

49. Mr. CK Pawar, Principal, Police Training School, Marol, Maharashtra
50. Mr. Mahesh Ruparelia, Rescue Foundation
51. Mr. Neerav Mehta, Rescue Foundation
52. Ms. Nandini Thakker, Save the Children India
53. Ms. Usha Maheshwari, Save the Children India
54. Mr. Pravin Kadam, Women's Institute for Social Education
55. Ms. Gayatri Divecha, Prerana

E. Goa

56. Mr. Arunendra Pandey, ARZ
57. Ms. Vincy, ARZ
58. Ms. Shobha Dhumaskar, Director of Prosecution, Goa
59. Mr. Vinayak, Prosecutor
60. Mr. Kishan Kumar, Inspector General of Police
61. Mr. Vishram Borkar, Superintendent of Police
62. Mr. MK Desai, Superintendent of Police

- 63. Ms. Sunita, Inspector of Police
- 64. Ms. Audrey Pinto, Child Rights

F. Hyderabad

- 65. Mr. M Ratan, IPS, Additional Director General of Police, Training
- 66. Mr. Siva Narayana, IPS, Additional Director General of Police, CID
- 67. Mr. Umapathi Sattaru, IPS, Inspector General of Police, CID
- 68. Mr. SSP Yadav, IPS, Director General of Police
- 69. Ms. Sumithra, Ankuram
- 70. Mr. David, Catholic Relief Services
- 71. Ms. Saxena, Assistant Superintendent of Police
- 72. Ms. Chaya Ratan, Principal Secretary, Department of Women and Child Development
- 73. Dr. Sunitha Krishnan, Prajwala
- 74. Dr. Gopi Natha Reddy, IPS, Director, Andhra Pradesh Police Academy
- 75. Mr. Ramachandra Raju, IPS, Additional Director, APPA
- 76. Mr. Jeetender, IPS, Assistant Director, APPA
- 77. Mr. B Reddy, Professor of Forensic Sciences, APPA

G. Telephonic Interviews

- 78. Justice Ms Roshan Dalvi of High Court of Mumbai
- 79. Mr. J P Singh, Chief Secretary, Goa

ANNEXURE 7

NATIONAL ANTI HUMAN TRAFFICKING MISSION

Rationale: Government of India may set up a mission, which could be titled ‘National Anti Human Trafficking Mission’ (NAHTM) to bring together in a Mission mode under a Central Coordination Cell, all stakeholders involved in different facets/ activities of anti human trafficking. The stakeholders being the GOI, State Governments, Civil Society, Media, the public at large and the UN agencies, actively involved in the AHT initiatives.

The **purpose of the Mission** is manifold, including:

- Integrating the Initiatives of different Ministries / Departments of GOI.
- Integrating the Initiatives of GOI with that of the state governments.
- Synergizing the initiatives of Government Agencies with that of NGOs, civil society and UN bodies.
- Institutionalizing the best practices developed in the present project (S16).
- Ensuring sustainability of the impact in the present project on a permanent basis.
- Sustaining the objective of the national mission of preventing and combating Human Trafficking.

Where to be placed: The NAHTM may be set up in the Ministry of Home Affairs. The NAHTM can **undertake the following activities:**

- Coordinate, facilitate, promote, support and monitor the AHT activities by all the state police agencies.
- It will coordinate all the AHT activities being done and proposed to be done by MHA.
- It will coordinate with MWCD and facilitate, at a national level and in all states, the linkage between Home/ Police Department and other departments dealing with rehabilitation, prevention, protection, etc.
- It will coordinate with MWCD and facilitate, at a national level and in all states, the linkage between Home / Police Department and NGOs.
- It will coordinate with MWCD and facilitate, at a national level and in all states, the linkage among NGOs across the country.
- It will facilitate the functioning of NGOs.
- It will coordinate the training programmes of law enforcement agencies, including police, prosecutors, correctional services, NGOs, media, medical professionals, forensic scientists, etc. in the centre and states.
- It will work with the High Courts as well as Judicial Academies in India and undertake necessary programmes of training, sensitization, etc. of judicial officers.
- It will coordinate and facilitate training programmes at the national and at the police academies and other institutions like NICFS, NIPCCD as well as other

- government/ private agencies willing to undertake programmes of capacity building for various stakeholders.
- It will work along with NCRB and develop Management Information System and database on Human Trafficking (HT) and response patterns to HT and collate and disseminate the data.
 - It will maintain a national database of trafficking and responses to trafficking with respect to all types of trafficking, including that for Commercial Sexual Exploitation, exploitative labour, adoption, organ transplant, begging, marriage, entertainment industry, etc.
 - It will bring out analytical notes, advisories, etc. to prevent and combat HT for all stakeholders.
 - It will work with Ministry of Tourism and Culture and agencies concerned with tourism to address issues of sex tourism and facilitate safe tourism.

Coordinating Role: The NAHTM will coordinate the activities being undertaken to prevent HT by all Ministries and departments including MHA, MWCD, Ministry of Labour, Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment, Ministry of Health, Ministry of tourism and Culture, as well as all agencies of the Ministries, besides coordinating AHT activities of all UN agencies working in India. It will also coordinate its activities with SAARC Secretariat and facilitate necessary linkages with the SAARC countries in respect of AHT activities.

Proposed Structure: It is essential that NAHTM has to start on a fast track mode. It is also essential that it undertakes its activities with full dedication, commitment. This requires a National Coordinator with required support structures including one Project Associate, and 2 Consultants. Considering the impact that the UNODC project S16 has made in the last 2 years, it is suggested that the National Coordinator, the Project Associate and the Consultants be employed by UNODC and placed at the disposal of MHA until such time a permanent structure is set up in MHA. MHA/ UNODC may consider providing adequate infrastructural facilities to the National Coordinator and the supporting staff.

The National Coordinator of the NAHTM: Considering the tremendous impact of the UNODC Project in two years, mainly due to the design of the project and the efficient way in which it has been handled by the Project Coordinator it would be advisable to use the services of an experienced person with expertise and dedication for anchoring the Mission, and kick start the process of setting up the AHTUs and training the master-trainers for all the States. The dynamism, initiative, missionary zeal and the expertise in anti human trafficking (a perfect combination of experience in law enforcement, activism, research, administration and running the largest UN Project on Anti Human Trafficking), seen in Dr. PM Nair, IPS, makes him an excellent candidate to take on this position of National Coordinator of the NAHTM.

LIST OF MASTER TRAINERS/ RESOURCE PERSONS

SUBJECT	NAMES	SPECIALIZATION
1. Concepts and Dimensions of HT	<p>1. Dr. Sunitha Krishnan, Founder Secretary, Prajwala, Hyderabad (09848025014)</p> <p>2. Ms. Priti Patkar, Prerana, Maharashtra (09821274865)</p> <p>3. Ms. Sayantani, Contact Base, West Bengal (033-24178516)</p> <p>4. Dr. P.M. Nair IPS, Ex Project Coordinator, AHT, UNODC (pm.nair.ips@gmail.com , nairpm@hotmail.com, 9910150290)</p> <p>5. Ms. Geeta Sekhon, Officer-in-charge, AHT, UNODC (9968474897) geeta.sekhon@unodc.org</p> <p>6. Mr. Umapathi , IG, Police Headquarters, Andhra Pradesh (09440700900)</p> <p>7. Mr. V.U. Borkar, SP,Goa (09422640707, vishramborkar@yahoo.co.in)</p> <p>8. Mr. Manabendra Mandal, SLARTC, West Bengal (09433454183)</p> <p>9. Mr. Gopi Natha Reddy, Director, Andhra Pradesh Police Academy (09440796999)</p> <p>10. Mr. M.V. Ramachandra Raju IPS, DIG & Joint Director, AP Police Academy, Hyderabad (09440627593)</p> <p>11. Mr. J. Satyanarayana, Deputy Director, AP Police Academy, Hyderabad (09440627596)</p> <p>12. Ms. Samapti Banerjee, Police Training College, West Bengal (09434250280)</p> <p>13. Mr. Taj Mohd. Deputy Director, Prosecution, West Bengal (09830264159 , taj_prosecution@yahoo.co.in)</p> <p>14. Dr. Neelam Borhe, Sthree Adhar Kendra, Pune (098022155, sak@vsnl.net)</p> <p>15. Mr. Souvik Datta, Sanlaap (033-24649596)</p> <p>16. Mr. Anindt, Sanlaap, Kolkata (09831577959)</p>	
2. Law	1. Dr. P.M. Nair IPS, Ex Project Coordinator,	Trafficking Laws

<p>3. Investigation Techniques</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Dr. P.M. Nair IPS, Ex Project Coordinator, AHT, UNODC 2. Mr. Mahesh Bhagwat IPS, SP, Andhra Pradesh (09440700908) 3. Mr. Tapas Kumar Basu, Law Instructor, PTC, Kolkata 4. Mr. Umapathi IPS, IG, Police Headquarters, Andhra Pradesh 5. Mr. Sanjoy Mukherjee, IGP, CID, Bhowani Bhavan, Kolkata (09830005111) 6. Ms. Neeloo Sherpa. Addl. SP, West Bengal (neeloo69@yahoo.com) 7. Mr. V.U. Borkar, SP,Goa 8. Mr. N.K Singh, IP, ATS, Patna, Bihar (C/O ATS Patna. 0612-228292) 9. Mr. Ratan Sanjay IPS, SP, CBI, New Delhi (011-24360422) 10. Mr. Anirban Chakroborty, SI, PTC, Kolkata 11. Mr. Deboshree Roy, Inspector, Kolkata Police 	
<p>4. Rescue Related Activities</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Ms. Indrani Sinha, Sanlaap, West Bengal (0983104776) 2. Dr. Sunitha Krishnan, Founder Secretary, Prajwala, Hyderabad 3. Ms. Sumitra, Ankuram, Hyderabad (09391316575) 4. Mr. Ramamohan, HELP, Andhra Pradesh (helpap2002@yahoo.com, 09949723666) 5. Dr. Roma Debabrata, STOP, Delhi (9810135207) 6. Ms. Priti Patkar, Prerana, Maharashtra 7. Dr. Suman Lal, Prayas Bharti Trust, Patna (09431019244) 8. Ms. Triveni Acharya, Rescue Foundation, Mumbai (09820210705) 9. Mr. Arun Pandey, ARZ , Goa (09422438109) 10. Ms. Hema Bedi, Sthree, Hyderabad (09849866494) 	
<p>5. Post Rescue Care and Attention</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Ms. Indrani Sinha, Sanlaap, West Bengal 2. Mr. Manabendra Mandal, SLARTC, West Bengal 	

	<p>3. Dr. Sunitha Krishnan, Founder Secretary, Prajwala, Hyderabad</p> <p>4. Mr. Ramamohan, HELP, Andhra Pradesh</p> <p>5. Dr. Roma Debabrata, STOP, Delhi</p> <p>6. Ms. Priti Patkar, Prerana, Maharashtra</p> <p>7. Ms Suman Singh, SAKHI, Patna</p> <p>8. Ms. Triveni Acharya, Rescue Foundation, Mumbai</p> <p>9. Mr. Arun Pandey, ARZ , Goa</p> <p>10. Ms. Hema Bedi, Sthree, Hyderabad</p> <p>11. Dr. Neelam Borhe, Sthree Adhar Kendra, Pune (098022155, sak@vsnl.net)</p> <p>12. Mr. Amod Kanth IPS (Retd), Prayas, New Delhi (9810995059)</p> <p>13. Mr. Anindt, Sanlaap, Kolkata (09831577959)</p>	
6. Forensics	<p>1. Mr. Dhananjay More, Maharashtra (09821121650, dhananjaymore@hotmail.com)</p> <p>2. Dr. P. Butchi Reddy, Professor of Forensic Medicine, Andhra Pradesh Police Academy (C/O Mr. Reddy)</p> <p>3. Mrs. A. Sharda , Deputy Director, Forensic Science, Andhra Pradesh Police Academy (9440904356)</p> <p>4. Mr. A.K. Gupta, Retd. Professor, Medical College, Kolkata</p>	
7. Psycho Social Counseling	<p>1. Dr. Achal Bhagat, Saarthak, Delhi (9810065735, achalbhagat@yahoo.co.in)</p> <p>2. Dr. Sunitha Krishnan, Founder Secretary, Prajwala, Hyderabad</p> <p>3. Mr. Gopi Natha Reddy, Director, Andhra Pradesh Police Academy</p> <p>4. Ms. Mohsina Parwin, Advocate and Counselor, Women Protection Cell, CID , Hyderabad (C/O CID, AP, 04023240663)</p> <p>5. Dr. Neelam Borhe, Sthree Adhar Kendra, Pune (098022155, sak@vsnl.net)</p> <p>6. Ms. Farida Dias, Goa (0982268629)</p>	
8. Prosecution	<p>1. Mr. M. Bhaskar Rao, Retired Director of Prosecution, Andhra Pradesh</p> <p>2. Mr. E. Ramulu, AP Police Academy (9440904361)</p>	

	<p>2. Mr. Taj Mohammad, Deputy Director Prosecution, West Bengal</p> <p>3. Mr. Manebendra Mandal, SLARTC, West Bengal</p> <p>4. Mrs Shobha Dhumaskar, Director Prosecution, Goa</p> <p>5. Ms. Kavita Singh, National University of Juridical Science, West Bengal</p> <p>6. Mr. Sarfaraz Ahmed, National University of Juridical Science , West Bengal</p> <p>7. Mr. Syed Rosedar, Senior Prosecutor, Andhra Pradesh Police Academy</p> <p>8. Mr. G. Ramanjaneya Reddy, Assitant Public Prosecutor, Karim Nagar, AP</p> <p>9. Mr. T. Devdas, APP, Guntur, AP</p> <p>10. Mr. G. Sudhakar Reddy, Joint Director (Prosecution), Hyderabad, AP</p>	
9. Training Methodology	<p>1. Ms. Sayantani, Contact Base, West Bengal</p> <p>2. Mr. Amitava Bhattacharya, Contact Base, West Bengal</p> <p>3. Mr. Parnab Mukherjee, Kolkata (09899396487 / 09330934109)</p> <p>4. Mr. N.A. Kaleem, Professor, National Police Academy, Hyderabad</p> <p>5. Mr. A.K. Saxsena, Professor, National Police Academy, Hyderabad</p> <p>6. Mr. Vineet Kapoor (09425150465)</p> <p>7. Ms. Ananya Bhattacharya, Contact Base, Kolkata (09830173382)</p>	
10. Combating HT	<p>1. Dr. P.M. Nair IPS, Ex Project Coordinator, AHT, UNODC (pm.nair.ips@gmail.com , nairpm@hotmail.com, 9910150290)</p> <p>2. Ms. Geeta Sekhon, Officer-in-charge, AHT, UNODC</p> <p>3. Mr. Mahesh Bhagwat IPS, SP, Andhra Pradesh</p> <p>4. Mr. Umapathi , IG, Police Headquarters, Andhra Pradesh (09440700900)</p> <p>5. Mr. V.U. Borkar, SP,Goa</p> <p>6. Shri. Bhaskar Rao, IP, Guntur, AP</p> <p>7.Mr. Nawal Bajaj IPS, SP, Thane Rural (nawalbajaj@yahoo.co.in, 022-25343027)</p> <p>8. Ms. Archana Tyagi IPS, ACP, Mumbai</p>	

	<p>(tyg_arch@yahoo.com, 022-26402122)</p> <p>9. Mr. Ratan Sanjay IPS, SP, CBI, New Delhi (011-24360422)</p>	
11. Preventing HT	<p>1. Ms. Sayantani, Contact Base, West Bengal</p> <p>2. Ms. Indrani Sinha, Sanlaap, West Bengal</p> <p>3. Dr. Sunitha Krishnan, Founder Secretary, Prajwala, Hyderabad</p> <p>4. Mr. Ramamohan, HELP, Andhra Pradesh</p> <p>5. Ms. Ruchira Gupta, Apne Aap (ruchiragupta@gmail.com, 9830717681)</p> <p>6. Dr. P.M. Nair IPS, Ex Project Coordinator, AHT, UNODC (pm.nair.ips@gmail.com , nairpm@hotmail.com, 9910150290)</p>	
12. Transborder Issues	<p>1. Dr. Roma Debabrata, STOP, Delhi</p> <p>2. Ms. Indrani Sinha, Sanlaap, West Bengal</p> <p>3. Ms. Triveni Acharya, Rescue Foundation, Mumbai</p> <p>4. Ms. Ruchira Gupta, Apne Aap (ruchiragupta@gmail.com, 9830717681)</p> <p>5. Dr. P.M. Nair IPS, Ex Project Coordinator, AHT, UNODC (pm.nair.ips@gmail.com , nairpm@hotmail.com, 9910150290)</p>	
13. Training Coordination	<p>1. Mr. Gopi Natha Reddy, Director, Andhra Pradesh Police Academy</p> <p>2. Mr. R.K. Johri, ADGP, PTC, Kolkata</p> <p>3. Mr. V.U. Borkar, SP,Goa (09422640707, vishramborkar@yahoo.co.in)</p> <p>4. Mr. C.K Pawar, Prinincpal , PTS, Marol</p> <p>5. Mr. Shafi Alam IPS, Addl DG Training, Patna, Bihar</p> <p>6. Mr. Sarfaraz Ahmed, National University of Juridical Science , West Bengal</p> <p>7. Mrs Shobha Dhumaskar, Director Prosecution, Goa (09822998880)</p> <p>8. Ms. Nandini Thakkar(09819747470)</p> <p>9. Mr. M. Bhaskar, Judge , Fast Track Court, Consumer Forum, AP (Contact C/O Mr. Umapathi)</p> <p>10. Mr. Anindt, Sanlaap, Kolkata (09831577959)</p> <p>11. Mr. Amitava Bhattacharya, Contact Base, West Bengal (033-24178516, 09831038904)</p>	

14. Judicial Perspectives	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Hon'ble Justice Roshan Dalvi, Mumbai High Court (roshandalvi@hotmail.com) 2. Mr. Bora, District Judge, Pune (9323963633) 3. Principal, District Judge Pune 4. Justice Samresh Banerjee, Retd. Judge Kolkata High Court and now Lok Ayukta WB 	
15. Trafficking for Exploitative Labour	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Mr. Bhuvan Ribhu, BBA (9212736777, bhuvan.ribhu@gmail.com) 2. Ms. Shanta Sinha, Chairperson, National Commission for Protection of Child Rights (01123731583, shanta.sinha@nic.in) 	
16. Role of Executive Magistrates in AHT	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Mr. Levinsons Martins, Sub Divisional Magistrate, Goa (09822140087) 2. Dr. P.M. Nair IPS, Ex Project Coordinator, AHT, UNODC (9910150290) 3. Shri. Bhaskar Rao, Inspector of Police, Guntur, AP (Contact C/O Mr. Umapathi) 	
17. Ice Breaker	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Ms. Sayantani, Contact Base, West Bengal 2. Mr. G.A. Kaleem, NPA, Hyderabad 	
18. Media Intervention	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Dr. Sunitha Krishnan, Founder Secretary, Prajwala, Hyderabad 2. Ms. Indrani Sinha, Sanlaap, West Bengal 3. Mr. Ravikant, Shaktivahini, (shaktivahini@yahoo.co.in, 01292271267, 01292258111, 09312599210) 4. Mr. Preetu Nair, Times of India Goa, (preetu.nair@gmail.com, 09823244103) 	
19. Good Practices on AHT	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Ms. Joyatri Ray (joyatri@gmail.com, 09836240333) 2. Mr. Sanker Sen, Institute of Social Sceinces, Vasant Kunj (011-26895370, 09810321503) 3. Ms. Bharti Ali, HAQ (bhartiali@yahoo.co.in, 011-26492551) 	
20. Child Rights	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Ms. Bharti Ali, HAQ (bhartiali@yahoo.co.in, 011-26492551) 2. Ms. Tapoti Bhowmick, Sanlaap, Kolkata (09831380830) 	

	<p>3. Mr. Rajib Haldar, Prayas (26055449)</p> <p>4. Ms. Geeta Sekhon, Officer-in-charge, AHT, UNODC</p> <p>5. Dr. P.M. Nair IPS, Ex Project Coordinator, AHT, UNODC (pm.nair.ips@gmail.com , nairpm@hotmail.com, 9910150290)</p> <p>6. Ms. Swasti Rana, Consultant , UNODC (Swasti.rana@unodc.org, 9810395910)</p> <p>7. Ms. Anjali Gokrn, Mumbai (09969194291)</p> <p>8. Mr. Gerry Pinto, Independent Consultant (gerrypinto2001@yahoo.com)</p> <p>9. Mr. Amod Kanth IPS (Retd), Prayas, New Delhi (9810995059)</p>	
<p>21. Gender Perspectives in AHT</p>	<p>1. Dr. P.M. Nair IPS, Ex Project Coordinator, AHT, UNODC (pm.nair.ips@gmail.com , nairpm@hotmail.com, 9910150290)</p> <p>2. Ms. Geeta Sekhon, Officer-in-charge, AHT, UNODC</p> <p>3. Dr. Sunitha Krishnan, Founder Secretary, Prajwala, Hyderabad</p> <p>4. Ms. Indrani Sinha, Sanlaap, West Bengal</p> <p>5. Ms. Priti Patkar, Prerana, Maharashtra</p> <p>6. Ms. Ruchira Gupta, Apne Aap (ruchiragupta@gmail.com, 9830717681)</p>	

ANNEXURE 9

Total no. of law enforcement officials trained during Sep 2006 – April 2008

	Police						Prosecutors						Total
	Mah	WB	Goa	AP	Bih	Ors.	Mah	Goa	WB	AP	Bih	Ors.	
<u>TNA</u>													
No. of sessions	1	1	1	1	1	1.	1	1	1	1	2.	3.	9
Number trained	23	30	25	30	52	4.	5	5	125	15	*	1.	210
<u>TOT</u>													
No. of sessions	1	1	1	1	1	5.	1	1	1	1	6.	7.	9
Number trained	27	25	23	1	50	1.	17	5	23	20	15*	1.	206
<u>TRG</u>													
No. of sessions	60	112	19	35	40	6	8	5	6	8	8.	9.	299
Number trained	2002	2990	474	2685	1368	212	274	82	144	160	103*	1.	10494
<u>TOTAL</u>													
Trainings	62	114	21	37	39	6	9	7	8	10	10.	11.	316
Number trained	2052	3045	522	2716	1470	212	296	92	192	195	118*	1.	10,910

ACRONYMS

1. ADGP	Additional Director General of Police
2. AHT	Anti Human Trafficking
3. AHTU	Anti Human Trafficking Unit
4. AP	Andhra Pradesh
5. ARZ	Anyay Rahit Zindagi (NGO)
6. ATSEC	Action Against Trafficking and Sexual Exploitation of Children
7. BPR&D	Bureau of Police Research and Development
8. BSF	Border Security Force
9. CAC	Central Advisory Committee
10. CBI	Criminal Bureau of Investigation
11. CID	Criminal Investigation Department
12. CNI	Church of North India
13. CRG	Child Rights Group
14. CRS	Catholic Relief Services
15. CWC	Child Welfare Committee
16. DGP	Director General of Police
17. DWCD	Department of Women and Child Development
18. FIR	First Information Report
19. GOI	Government of India
20. GRP	Government Railway Police
21. HT	Human Trafficking
22. IAS	Indian Administrative Services
23. IPC	Indian Penal Code, 1860
24. IPS	Indian Police Service
25. IRPF	Inter Religious Priests Forum
26. ITPA	Immoral Traffic (Prevention) Act, 1956
27. JJA	Juvenile Justice (Care and Protection of Children) Act, 2000
28. KGMT	Kasturba Gandhi Memorial Trust
29. MEA	Ministry of External Affairs
30. MHA	Ministry of Human Affairs
31. MLA	Member of Legislative Assembly
32. MLC	Member of Legislative Council
33. MP	Member of Parliament
34. MWCD	Ministry of Women and Child Development
35. NAHTM	National Anti Human Trafficking Mission
36. NCRB	National Crime Records Bureau
37. NGO	Non Governmental Organization
38. NIRD	National Institute of Rural Development
39. NTC	Nodal Training Cell
40. PSA	Public Service Announcements
41. PSC	Project Steering Committee
42. RPF	Railway Protection Force
43. SAARC	South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation

44. SDM	Sub Divisional Magistrate
45. SI	Sub Inspector of Police
46. SLARTC	Social Legal Aid and Research and Training Centre
47. SOP	Standard Operating Procedures
48. SP	Superintendent of Police
49. SSB	Sashastra Seema Bal
50. STCI	Save the Children India
51. TERI	The Energy and Resources Institute
52. TIP	Trafficking in Persons
53. TNA	Training Needs Analysis
54. TOT	Training of Trainers
55. UNODC	United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime
56. VIP	Very Important Person
57. WB	West Bengal
58. WISE	Women Institute for Social Education
59. <i>Panchayat</i>	Local body of self-governance at the village level
60. <i>Anganwadi</i>	The Anganwadi, is a childcare centre, located within the village or the slum area and is the focal point for the delivery of services at the community level, to children below six years of age, pregnant and nursing mothers, and adolescent girls.