Date 15.03.05
ORIGINAL: ENGLISH

PROJECT TITLE: STRENGTHENING OF THE “TURKISH INTERNATIONAL ACADEMY AGAINST DRUGS AND ORGANISED CRIME” (TADOC) PHASE II

Project Number: AD/TUR/02/G36

COUNTRY or Region: TURKEY

Report of the Evaluation Officer - Ms. AYDAN BASHLINSKAYA, LL.B. (Baku), LL.M. Eur., LL.M. (Bremen)

UNITED NATIONS INTERNATIONAL DRUG CONTROL PROGRAMME
Vienna
## CONTENT

TABLE OF CONTENT..............................................................................................................................2

LIST OF ACRONYMS...............................................................................................................................4

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY............................................................................................................................5

INTRODUCTION..........................................................................................................................................7

1. INTRODUCTION
   1.1. Background and Context..................................................................................................................7
   1.2. Purpose and Objective of the Evaluation........................................................................................7
   1.3. Executing Modality........................................................................................................................7
   1.4. Scope of the Evaluation....................................................................................................................8
   1.5. Evaluation Methodology..................................................................................................................9

2. MAJOR FINDINGS
   2.1. Overall performance assessment....................................................................................................9
   2.2. Attainment of Objectives.................................................................................................................10
   2.3. Achievement of Project Results and Outputs................................................................................10
   2.4. Implementation................................................................................................................................16
   2.5. Institutional and Management Arrangements...............................................................................16

3. OUTCOMES, IMPACT and SUSTAINABILITY
   3.1. Outcome........................................................................................................................................17
   3.2. Impact...........................................................................................................................................18
   3.3. Sustainability..................................................................................................................................19

4. LESSONS LEARNED
   4.1. Lessons.........................................................................................................................................19
   4.2. Best Practices...............................................................................................................................20
   4.3. Constraints....................................................................................................................................21

5. RECOMMENDATIONS
   5.1. Issues resolved during evaluation................................................................................................23
   5.2. Actions/decisions recommended....................................................................................................23

6. OVERALL CONCLUSION....................................................................................................................29
ANNEX A
Draft TOR for Evaluation of Phase II of TADOC Project

ANNEX B
Organizations and places visited and persons met

ANNEX C
Summary assessment questionnaire

ANNEX D
List of Publications of TADOC

ANNEX E
Table showing the number of Courses and Meetings Achieved against the Target set for Phase II

ANNEX F
Extract from the Annual Drug Counter Fight Report from the Ministry of Interior, TNP, Department of Anti-Smuggling and Organized Crime

Disclaimer

Independent Project Evaluations are scheduled and managed by the project managers and conducted by external independent evaluators. The role of the Independent Evaluation Unit (IEU) in relation to independent project evaluations is one of quality assurance and support throughout the evaluation process, but IEU does not directly participate in or undertake independent project evaluations. It is, however, the responsibility of IEU to respond to the commitment of the United Nations Evaluation Group (UNEG) in professionalizing the evaluation function and promoting a culture of evaluation within UNODC for the purposes of accountability and continuous learning and improvement.

Due to the disbandment of the Independent Evaluation Unit (IEU) and the shortage of resources following its reinstitution, the IEU has been limited in its capacity to perform these functions for independent project evaluations to the degree anticipated. As a result, some independent evaluation reports posted may not be in full compliance with all IEU or UNEG guidelines. However, in order to support a transparent and learning environment, all evaluations received during this period have been posted and as an on-going process, IEU has begun re-implementing quality assurance processes and instituting guidelines for independent project evaluations as of January 2011.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CBT</td>
<td>Computer Based Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECO</td>
<td>Economic Cooperation Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>European Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LEA</td>
<td>Law Enforcement Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MASAK</td>
<td>Mali Suclari Arastirma Kurulu (Financial Crime Investigation Board)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NPO</td>
<td>National Project Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TADOC</td>
<td>Turkish International Academy Against Drugs and Organized Crime</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TNP</td>
<td>Turkish National Police TNA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TDO</td>
<td>Training Development Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TTT</td>
<td>Train the Trainer Course</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDCP</td>
<td>United Nations International Drug Control Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>United Nations Development Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNODC</td>
<td>United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

### 1. Summary table of findings, supporting evidence and recommendations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Findings: identified problems / issues</th>
<th>Supporting evidence / examples</th>
<th>Recommendations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Financial constraints - unexpected amendments in the funding allocations in Phase II of the Project</td>
<td>Cancellation of a number of activities planned for Phase II (see Nr. 2)</td>
<td>Conduct of cancelled activities in Phase III of the Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. UNODC funding not completely secured for Phase II and not secured for Phase III of the Project</td>
<td>Cancellation of Regional Operational Meeting and TNA visits. UNODC funded regional courses postponed</td>
<td>Activate the fund-raising. Improve the initial fund-raising in order to ensure funding availability for the financial commitments undertaken. Conduct the cancelled activities in Phase III of the Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Delay in the NPO appointment</td>
<td>Cancellation of a Regional Operational Meeting, delay in the delivery of some courses, extra work on other units and persons</td>
<td>This shall be regarded as lessons learned for the elimination of such delays in Phase III of the Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Duration of Phase II</td>
<td>10 month delay, not all objectives set for Phase II, are achieved</td>
<td>It is suggested to catch up with the activities postponed or cancelled during Phase III of the Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Regional activities - funding challenges</td>
<td>There are more challenges for the regional evolvement of TADOC, but the funding is not enough</td>
<td>It is suggested to secure the necessary regional evolvement of TADOC by allocating more funding for regional activities, which present TADOC’ budget does not have</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. TOR for Regional Operational Meetings</td>
<td>Still not completed</td>
<td>To be completed in Phase III of the Project in order to ensure the effectiveness of meetings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. No permanent instructors at TADOC</td>
<td>Not enough efficiency in course delivery</td>
<td>To be recruited during Phase III of the Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Not enough evolvement of national and regional LEA’s</td>
<td>More evolvement of Jandarma as well as other national and regional LEAs in TADOC’ training, management and other activities is desired</td>
<td>It is suggested to expand the variety of TADOC’ courses, programs and facilities and to address the specific needs of different LEAs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 2. Summary

a) **Summary of the project or program evaluated including project objectives**

The Project ‘Strengthening of the “Turkish International Academy against Drugs and Organized Crime” (TADOC)’ consists of 2 Phases - Phase II and III. Phase I was implemented successfully by setting up the ‘TADOC’ in Ankara, Turkey. The content of Phase II is to conduct activities, which should be focused on the introduction of CBT at TADOC and other Learning Resource Centers across Turkey, on the delivery of national and regional training activities as well as the conduct of TNA in the countries of the region.

b) **The major findings of the evaluation**
Considering the objectives set in the Project Document there is a delay of a 10 month period in the completion of Phase II and commencement of Phase III of the TADOC Project. The tasks of course delivery at national, regional and international level have been overdone and are considered as an outstanding success. National and Regional Boards and Regional Operational Meetings have not always been conducted in-time and in a sufficient frequency. TNA has not been completed in all countries, as foreseen by the Project Document. NPO and International Training Advisors have been recruited and have been performing their tasks in an excellent manner. The construction of TTC has been completed. CBT is now operational at TADOC and across the country. The research centers, international and national training sections are adequately staffed. Not all the recommendations from Phase I have been fully addressed.

c) Lessons learned and best practices

Lessons learned: Unless a secured budgeting is provided, there is a threat to appropriate and in-time delivery of the project. Since there was not enough funding secured for Phase II of the TADOC Project, some of the activities had to be cancelled. The delays in project delivery are sometimes due to the non-timeliness in addressing the project needs. Since no NPO was recruited to commence the implementation of tasks and duties regarding the second phase of the Project, the Project delivery was delayed. A better and more efficient Project delivery in Phase II could have been guaranteed by the availability of full-time instructors employed at TADOC, since this could have resulted in an increase of the quality and achievement of sustainability. Since the project delivery was not comprehensive enough, there was a major delay of 10 months in the delivery of Phase II of the Project.

Best Practices: Train the trainer courses, establishment of a Tactical Training Centre, delivery of high quality national, regional and international courses, commitment, dedication and professionalism of TADOC’ management team and staff, implementation of CBT in 10 cities across Turkey, translation of 43 CBT modules into Turkish and Russian, establishment of TADOC research centers, outstanding national, regional and international cooperation, good relationship with donors and stakeholders, good progress with course evaluation, establishment of comprehensive Training Strategy & Implementation Plan as well as Training Development Strategy, excellent work completed by the TADOC’ management and all units.


d) The recommendation, conclusions including implications to UNODC of the evaluation

It is suggested to provide a better information circulation to donors regarding the courses and other activities planned; a more intense involvement of various national LEAs in TADOC’ training and management is necessary; a better cooperation should be sought with Jandarma; TADOC should place more accent on regional and international activities; more financial involvement in regional activities should be sought; it is necessary to disseminate TTT courses and CBT to Central Asia, Afghanistan and South Caucasus as a matter of priority, since the issues of trafficking are most important there; it is recommended to improve the initial UNODC project fund-raising in order to comply better with the primary financial obligations; TADOC’ facilities should be expanded, the number of courses increased, the courses and programs made diverse; TADOC should expand its training tasks to peace-keeping courses; permanent instructors shall be recruited; 2 new modules shall be created in Turkish (Money Laundering and Precursor Chemicals); ‘Computer simulated tactical firearms scenarios’ and a ‘life-size mock-up clandestine laboratory’ shall be established at TTC; 2 new modules should be created at CBT TADOC (Interviewing Techniques and Surveillance Techniques); TNA shall be conducted in the South Caucasus, Balkans, ECO and Black Sea; more efficient management of TADOC through NABM, RABM and Operational Meetings is recommended; TOR for the Regional Operational Meeting shall be completed; TADOC shall gain its own legislation, in which its status and tasks are regulated; the Project shall be revised in a view of many changes occurred since its conclusion; the strategy plans and training development strategy of TADOC shall be implemented; the recommendations from Phase I shall fully be addressed; all the goals not achieved in Phase II shall be achieved in Phase III of the Project; recommendations concerning the training needs evolving from the TNA to Kyrgyzstan, Uzbekistan and Tajikistan shall be addressed; more TTT courses at national, regional and international level are recommended; CBT should be established in all Turkish LEAs which should be assisted to deliver their own basic national courses; TADOC shall concentrate on the expertise training; customer focus shall be further developed.
1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Background and Context
Turkey and its neighboring countries are the world’s most affected by illicit trafficking of opiates and related problems. To fight illicit drug trafficking and related crimes, the Government of the Republic of Turkey has set up a Turkish Academy against Drugs and Organized Crime in Ankara that is to benefit national inter-agency training, as well as regional training and cooperation. The strategy of the Project agreed between the Government of Turkey and the UNDCP is to develop the Academy into a regional training and resource centre and consultation forum for drug related issues. The project consists of 3 Phases. During Phase I (August 2000 - June 2001), the Academy has developed its training facilities, management and teaching structures, and has delivered several training courses for trainees from Turkey, ECO and Black Sea Countries. During Phases II and III, the activities should have been focused on the introduction of CBT at TADOC and in Learning Resource Centers in various cities of Turkey and the Region as well as on the conduct of a Training Needs Assessment in the Region. In addition, national and regional training activities should have continued and standard training curriculum should have been developed. The overall duration of the Project is 4 years and 10 months. Phase I of the Project has been successfully completed.

1.2. Purpose and Objective of the Evaluation
The purpose of the present evaluation is to determine whether and to what extent Phase II of the TADOC Project has been successfully implemented and how the achieved results could be improved in Phase III of the Project. The objective of the present evaluation is to examine the mandate, strategies, objectives, relevance, effectiveness, results, impact and sustainability of Phase II of the Project as well as the added value of UNODC’s actions.

1.3. Executing Modality / Management Arrangements
TADOC is managed by the Directorate, National and Regional Advisory Boards, Anti-Smuggling and Organized Crime Department of the TNP and the General Directorate of the TNP under the Ministry of Interior of Turkey. The TADOC Project receives continuous management support from the UNODC and UNDP offices. All these organs have been successful in implementing the goals set for Phase II of the Project. The implementation has been carried out with operational plans worked out during the National and Regional Advisory Boards Meetings and Regional Operational Meetings. The Directorate has been successful in addressing and implementing the issues of operational plans. The National and Regional

---

Boards, responsible for managing, monitoring, overseeing, planning and execution of TADOC, have addressed the issues of operational plans to higher management, as foreseen by the Project Document.

1.4. Scope of the Evaluation
Scope of the evaluation included the review of quantitative data in the relevant Project documentation as well as quality of the accomplishment of Project tasks. To this end, the following matters have been evaluated: implementation of the main components of Phase II of the Project and implementation of recommendations from Phase I of the Project.

1.4.1. Main components of Phase II of the Project
- Duration of Phase II of the TADOC Project: beginning date June 2002 - ending date May 2004 (24 months). Schedule of Phase III of the Project: June 2004 - May 2006 (24 months)
- Delivery of at least 4 regional, 4 basic national and 6 specialized national training courses per year
- Conduct of at least 1 Regional Advisory Board Meeting, 1 Regional Operational Meeting and 2 National Advisory Board Meetings per year
- Approval of Terms of Reference for National and Regional Advisory Boards
- Conduct of Training Needs Assessments in all participating countries of the ECO, Black Sea and Balkan regions
- Recruitment of an International Training Advisor to assist TADOC for the duration of 3 months per year
- Recruitment of permanent staff for 4 research centers on Crime Prevention, Demand Reduction, IT Crimes and Money Laundering; making the research centers fully operational with Government resources
- Creation of a Tactical Training Facility at TADOC
- Recruitment of new permanent staff:
  - 4 persons for each of the research centers
  - 2 persons for the newly created Training Evaluation Centre
  - 2 persons for the International and National Training Centers
- Establishment of the Computer Based Training Centre at the Academy. Introduction of CBT in Turkish
- Establishment of Learning Resource Centers with CBT across the country
- Recruitment of NPO (part-time)

1.4.2. Recommended actions from Phase I of the Project
- Recruitment of a person with a managerial background responsible for the maintenance of TADOC’ facilities
- Implementation of the use of CD ROM Computer Based Training
- Recruitment of instructors from national and regional agencies to allow TADOC to become a role model for the national and regional agencies
- Recruitment of a team of interpreters at TADOC
- Active involvement of TADOC Regional Advisory Boards in the management of the Academy
- Use of a variety of methodologies to develop an environment where learning can take place for students of all learning styles
- Use of an ongoing program of development to assist trainers to develop their teaching skills and methodologies. At least one trainer from the Academy should participate in a thorough trainer’s course
- Development of minimum effective training levels at TADOC, based upon performance measures linked to the four levels of evaluation
- Establishment of a minimum effective training level for the region once achieved for the Academy

1.5. Methodology
The present evaluation has been conducted in a number of phases. The first phase included a desk review of relevant project documentation, reports and all other data that addressed quantitative issues. The second phase included a field-research trip to Turkey where qualitative issues were addressed. These issues involved visual examination of infrastructure set up during Phases I and II of the Project, meetings with Turkish Government officials, representatives from UNODC, representatives from US, UK, German and French Embassies, TADOC Directorate and higher management and other representatives from TNP, Jandarma, Customs and Coast-Guard, staff from different units of the Academy, guest trainers, students and their line-managers as well as non-participant observation of ‘Training in action’. The third phase included production of the report of findings and recommendations. Overall, duration of the evaluation mission is 11 days.

2. ANALYSIS AND MAJOR FINDINGS
2.1. Overall Performance Assessment
The second Phase of the TADOC Project has clearly identified the needs and set the goals to be achieved. The Project design is therefore very appropriate and relevant.

The performance of the second phase of the TADOC Project can be observed from two perspectives. On the one side it has successfully implemented the main goals and objectives, demonstrating the necessary effectiveness and efficiency in meeting the needs and solving the problems. The results have been achieved in a superior manner. On the other side, it has overproduced the necessary outputs without considering financial and time constraints. Moreover, delays in project delivery were due to the late appointment of personnel and no funding availability. This has resulted in the cancellation of a number of events, which
have primarily been scheduled for Phase II of the Project as well as in the extension of the overall duration of this phase. However the overall performance should be seen as very effective, since it has addressed the major needs and prioritized tasks, which first needed to be accomplished due to feasibility requirements.

2.2. Attainment of the Objectives
Out of the main objectives set for Phase II of the Project, 88% has been achieved; 37% of this figure has been achieved to the degree varying from 50% to 80%. Out of the recommendations from Phase I of the Project, 87% has been addressed; 25% of this figure has been addressed to the degree varying from 80% to 90%. However, there have been many goals achieved which were not primarily set for Phase II of the Project, involving the early implementation of objectives set for Phase III. Moreover, there have been very many results achieved, not even foreseen by the Project Document. Finally, the tasks performed have been commonly admitted as of a very high quality. It is therefore fair to say that Phase II of the Project has been completed in a very successful manner.

The main objectives of the second phase of the TADOC Project have been attained, since the Academy is successfully dealing with the training and research issues related to drugs counter fight. It has been demonstrating competence and necessary effectiveness through conduct of national and regional training courses and establishment and operation of research facilities. The recent establishment of CBT in the Academy and its early spread across the country is one of the best examples to be used in the Region. TADOC is also on the way to become an international centre of “EXCELLENCE” granting valuable training and research to regional and international agencies. The overall performance of Phase II of the Project gives a very good sign for a successful fulfillment of Phase III of the Project.

2.3. Achievement of Project Results

2.3.1. Attainment of objectives set for Phase II of the Project

2.3.1.1. Duration of Phase II
Phase II of the TADOC Project has commenced in June 2002 and it is foreseen now that it will be completed until End of March 2005, allowing Phase III to start on April 1, 2005. Considering the primary goal set in the Project Document there is a delay of 10 month in completing Phase II and commencing Phase III of the TADOC Project.

2.3.1.2. Delivery of courses
2.3.1.2.1. National basic and specialized courses
A goal of delivery of at least 4 basic and 6 specialized courses per year\(^2\) has been fully achieved. In fact, it

\(^2\) At least 8 basic and 12 specialized courses in Phase II.
has been carried to excess. In 2002 there were 13 national basic courses benefiting 531 students and 28 national expertise courses benefiting 526 students delivered. In 2003 there were 8 national basic courses benefiting 240 student and 16 national expertise courses benefiting 364 students delivered. Finally, in 2004 there were 6 national basic courses benefiting 160 students and 44 national expertise courses benefiting 748 students delivered. Consequently, there is an increase of a number of national basic and specialized courses delivered annually. A very successful cooperation takes place on bi-lateral level regarding the courses delivered by the UK, USA, Canada, France and Germany.

2.3.1.2.2. Regional Courses
A goal of delivery of at least 4 regional courses per year has been achieved. In 2002 there were 3 regional courses benefiting 74 students delivered. In 2003 there were 4 regional courses benefiting 61 students delivered. Finally, in 2004 there were 9 regional courses benefiting 229 students delivered. A tendency of an increase of a number of courses delivered annually can also be observed on regional level.

2.3.1.2. Regional and National Advisory Board Meeting, Regional Operational Meetings
Terms of Reference for National and Regional Advisory Boards have been approved during Phase II of the Project. A goal of a conduct of at least 1 Regional Advisory Board Meeting, 1 Regional Operational Meeting and 2 National Advisory Board Meetings has not been fully achieved. No meetings were conducted in the year 2002. Regional Advisory Board Meeting was conducted once per year in 2003 and 2004. Regional Operational Meeting was conducted only in 2004. National Advisory Board Meetings were conducted once per year in 2003 and 2004.

2.3.1.3. Training Needs Assessment
There has been a successful mission undertaken from an assessment team consisting of Mr. David Byrom, the UNODC International Training Advisor, and Inspector Mr. Murat Sariguzel, Head of International Training Division at the TADOC, to assess prioritized law enforcement training needs within Uzbekistan, Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan. As a result of this mission a joint report has been produced. There have been no missions organized to any other countries of the ECO, Black Sea and Balkan regions due to financial restrictions and other priorities set.

2.3.1.4. International Training Advisor and NPO
International Training Advisor, Mr. David Byrom, has been recruited with a slight delay in September 2002 to assist the managing staff and trainers of TADOC in developing their management structures, best

---

3 At least 8 regional courses in Phase II.
training practices, training curricula and mobilized regional and international support. He has been successfully assisting TADOC for duration of 3 months per year as planned. National Project Officer was recruited on a part-time basis with a major delay in August 2003, resulting in the delay of project delivery. The NPO is highly qualified and manages its duties professionally.

2.3.1.5. Recruitment of staff
Research Centers on Drugs Control & Demand Reduction, Dirty Cash & Money Laundering as well as IT Crimes have been staffed each by one person. Part-time personnel have been recruited for Organized Crime and Crime Prevention Research Centers. Recruitment of 4 persons for each of the resource centers has not taken place, since there have been considerations to reduce the number to one. There is one person presently recruited for Training Needs Analysis Evaluation & Curriculum Development Section, the planned goal of having 2 staff members is now envisioned. There are 2 persons recruited for National and International Training Sections as planned. There has been a full time coordinator of research centers recruited. All other units at TADOC are presently staffed with at least 1 person. The research centers are now activated and deliver training courses, seminars, programs, workshops and projects in cooperation with other countries and organizations.

2.3.1.6. Tactical Training Facility at TADOC
A great success is attributed to the creation of a Tactical Training Facility at TADOC. The second level of TADOC’s guesthouse basement has been renovated; a training class with a capacity of 20 trainees, a duplex house, an operational training room for practical trainings (body search, car search, close defense techniques and other) and a café for public place search have been built. Furthermore, tactical training division office, tactical training equipment office and a room for investigative interview und undercover training activities have been prepared on the 1st level of the guesthouse basement. The instructor of the TTC has designed research centers in computers to allow students to work with the data. This all has been accomplished in 2004.

2.3.1.7. CBT at TADOC and across Turkey
One of the goals of the Project was to establish a Computer Based Training Sector (CTB) at the Academy and in various cities of Turkey, accompanied with the introduction of CBT CD in Turkish. These tasks have been successfully accomplished. The whole process can be summarized as follows: The CBT expert mission to Turkey took place in September 2002. In the following year, translation of 43 CBT modules into Turkish was completed and the CTB equipment was procured to TADOC. Learning resource centers were selected across the country followed by the expert’s mission to visit these centers and
to provide advice and guidance. Further, a training workshop was organized for training managers responsible for the learning resource centers. The procurement of training equipment to learning resource centers was completed in 2004. In the same year 2 new CD Rom training modules were produced, the work on Turkish modules and administrative system was completed and the final version of CTB was established at TADOC. There have been specific courses designed and policy document produced for implementation by CBT training managers. The CBT sites are presently activated in 10 cities (Ankara, Adana, Istanbul, Antalia, Diyarbakir, Edirne, Erzerum, Izmir, Samsun, Van). There are at least 2 people employed at each of CBT sites. An extension of these sites to 14 more cities in Turkey is planned (Eskişehir, Ankara, Sivas, Ağrı, Gaziantep, Hakkari, Hakkari (Yüksekova), Trabzon, Şırnak, Konya, Kilis, Malatya, Kilis, Mardin)\(^4\) and the spread of CBT to the regional courses at TADOC and countries of the Region.

2.3.2. Implementation of Recommendations from Phase I of the Project

2.3.2.1. Recruitment of a person with a managerial background responsible for maintenance of TADOC facilities is fully addressed. Mr. Mehmet YILDIRIM started his duties in 2002.

2.3.2.2. TADOC has established CD ROM training facilities that are used comprehensively in TADOC. In addition, TADOC with the assistance of UNODC has established 9 further CBT training centers throughout Turkey.

2.3.2.3. At present TADOC does not have a cadre of permanent instructors based at the Academy. There are a few instructors working permanently but they have extensive administrative roles to fulfill in addition to delivering of part-time training. TADOC involves instructors coming from operational departments on course-by-course basis. There are no instructors from different national agencies or region permanently recruited by TADOC. This recommendation has not been addressed.

2.3.2.4. Recruitment of a team of interpreters at TADOC has been considered as neither feasible nor cost-effective. This recommendation has been omitted.

2.3.2.5. National and Regional Boards and Regional Operational Meetings have been accomplishing their tasks in a successful manner, however there is room for improvement and more intense involvement in the management of the Academy.

2.3.2.6. TADOC is actively using a variety of methodologies to develop an effective learning environment. The trainers are trained using a program, which ensures that they are competent in delivering ‘Student Centered Learning’.

2.3.2.7. TADOC has been very successful in developing and delivering efficient TTT courses, which develop trainers’ teaching skills and knowledge of methodologies.

2.3.2.8. There is a great progress in developing minimum effective training levels at TADOC, work on

\(^4\) The costs for the creation of these sites are being met by the Government of Turkey.
which is being continued.

2.3.2.9. Establishment of a minimum effective training level for the region is dependent upon the progress achieved on a national level.

2.3.3. Achievement of results not planned in the Project Document; achievement of goals not set for Phase II

Other than direct goals set and attained in Phase II, the following progress and results have been achieved:

2.3.3.1. More national and regional courses delivered

There have been more courses delivered on regional and national levels as planned. The quality of the courses is commonly admitted as very high.

2.3.3.2. International Courses

International courses delivered during Phase II of the Project have not been planned in the Project Document. In 2002 there were 2 international courses benefiting 32 students delivered. In 2003 there were 6 international courses benefiting 62 students delivered. Finally, in 2004 there were 8 international courses benefiting 92 students delivered. An increase of the number of courses, other activities and cooperation can be observed on an international level.

2.3.3.3. Train-the-Trainer courses

A new type of TTT courses has been delivered, even though not foreseen until Phase III. The aim of the course is to equip participating law enforcement trainer with knowledge, skills and attitudes to enable them to adopt and develop a student centered approach to law enforcement training. In 2002 there were 2 TTT courses benefiting 32 students, in 2003 - 5 courses benefiting 102 students and in the following year 4 courses benefiting 79 students delivered. As a result, a more efficient course methodology was applied during training.

2.3.3.4. Translation of CBT CD into Russian

Translation of 43 CBT modules into Russian was completed during Phase II of the Project. This was considered the most cost efficient and was completed in 2003 to allow its further spread to the countries of the Region.
2.3.3.5. TADOC Training City
The Construction works on “TADOC Training City” on 200 sq. km. were commenced in 2004 and are envisioned to be completed in 2006-2007. A funding to the equivalent of Euro 3 million has been approved by the Turkish Government. The city should develop a virtual “urban environment” including roads, buildings such as houses, shops and offices as well as various classrooms. The intention of this project is to facilitate the delivery and practice of practical and technical skills such as searching premises, planning and executing anti-drug operations, vehicle check-points, firearms operations, surveillance and arrest and interviews in a realistic environment. CCTV and audio links will enable trainers and other students to observe critique and debrief practical exercises.

2.3.3.6. Publications of TADOC
There have been 12 publications produced by TADOC. A complete list of them is attached in Appendix E.

2.3.3.7. International Cooperation
TADOC has supported the creation of a regional law enforcement academy in Jos, Nigeria. It has provided a number of documents related to the development of TADOC as well as managerial training of persons, who will be concerned with the management of Jos Academy.

2.3.3.8. TADOC’ Strategic Plan and Training & Development strategy
The newly developed TADOC’ Strategic Plan addresses many issues in regard with the future development of TADOC, such as national courses, regional and bilateral training programs, type and number of trainers, regional and national advisory board meetings, regional irrational meetings, seminars and conferences, CBT, evaluation and need analysis, research centers and various projects. It is being successfully implemented.

TADOC’ Training & Development Strategy for the years 2003-2006 addresses guiding principles, background, mission statement, methodology, strategy outline, intent, underlying assumptions, the approach, commitment to Professional Ethics and Human Rights, operating process and delivering effective training, future developments and monitoring strategy. Both documents are important contributions to the overall development of TADOC’ strategy.

2.3.3.9. TADOC mobile teams
TADOC’ Mobile Training Teams and Mobile CBT Teams have been set up to undertake training activities in various countries of the Region.
2.3.3.10. Cooperation with EMCDDA and MEDA

TADOC has been assigned as a National Focal Point of the European Monitoring Centre for Drugs and Drug Addiction. Turkish Monitoring Centre for Drugs and Drug Addiction (TMCDDA) has been established within TADOC in order to undertake the responsibilities of National Focal Point and to coordinate in a multi-disciplinary approach to the fight against illicit drugs by ensuring collaboration between the related bodies and agencies. Being a national focal point TADOC will identify the profile of drug abusers in Turkey. This will be conducted in collaboration with 20 data centers and partners of the project. Further TADOC will help to develop an action plan based on findings and to set drug demand reduction policies and strategies nationwide with the EU terms and legislation. There has also been personnel trained and designated as local focal points in order to deliver awareness raising conferences, panels and similar activities on drug abuse and addiction to students and teachers of high schools, parents, personnel of prisons and detention houses. TADOC is also a partner of another EU Accession Project “Strengthening the Police in Financial Crimes and Money Laundering Investigations” where TADOC will provide training. TADOC has also been identified as a focal point of the MEDA project, which will be carried out in the coordination of the International Training Unit.

2.4. Implementation

Implementation of Phase II of the Project has been conducted in a successful manner. The operational plans, which were designed during the National and Regional Board Meetings and Regional Operational Meetings, have successfully been implemented by the Directorate. The operational plan included a list of issues, which needed to be addressed during a 6-month term. A ‘Strategic Plan’ and ‘A Training and Development Strategy of TADOC’ have been developed as well which made the implementation and achievement of goals of Phase II easier and more effective. The financial issues have been addressed according to the academic calendar and draft budgets presented to the TNP.

2.5. Institutional and Management Arrangements

TADOC is headed by a Director who reports through the Head of the Anti-Smuggling and Organized Crime Division to the General Directorate of the TNP. National and Regional Advisory Boards are established by the General Directorate of the TNP under the Ministry of the Interior and are responsible for overseeing, planning, execution, and management of TADOC’s activities. Advisory Boards are independent professional bodies that present TADOC’ training needs and program recommendations to the General Directorate of the TNP via the Anti-Smuggling and Organized Crime Department. Regional Operational Meetings are responsible for addressing the regional operational needs. The Directorate has been successful in implementing the operational plans and addressing other needs of
TADOC. Collaboration with donors and stockholders has been very well managed by the Directorate of the Academy. The activity of National and Regional Advisory Boards could have been more efficiently documented and managed so that clear and achievable action points would be identified and addressed.\(^5\) The Academy receives a continuous support from the Ministry of Interior of the Government of Turkey. The implementation of the TADOC Project has been supported from the UNODC and UNDP offices.

3. OUTCOME, IMPACTS AND SUSTAINABILITY
3.1. Outcomes
3.1.1. General outcome
The drug control objective of this Project has resulted in the creation of a lasting training and consultation capacity in the region, improvement of knowledge, awareness, cooperation and results in the field of drug control and organized crime. It has limited the further spread of drug trafficking, abuse and organized crime in the region. Fulfillment of the immediate objectives and related results of Phase II of this project has made the achievements of this overall project objective possible and made necessary contributions to the further attainment of goals set in Phase III.

3.1.1. Outcome on a national level
The outcome of the Project is a clear increase of competence of law enforcement officers, which can be attributed to the training they have been receiving at TADOC. This can be seen from the fact, that the law enforcement officers return to their assigned duties and apply the knowledge they have gained from the training to the satisfaction of their line managers. There is also a sign for a better inter-agency cooperation since TADOC has become an institution, which is addressing the training needs of different national LEAs.\(^6\)

3.1.2. Outcome on regional and international levels
TADOC has initiated a very successful development of regional cooperation in the fight against drugs. TADOC provided valuable training not only to the personnel of the national LEAs of Turkey, but also to the law enforcement personnel of the countries of the ECO, the Black Sea Economic Cooperation, the Balkan Countries, and the countries that are parties to the mutual cooperation agreements signed with

\(^5\) The meetings comprised all members as indicated in the Project Document. The recommendations of National and Regional Board Meetings were being addressed to the higher management. Moreover, 6-7 times a year Minister of Interior and Head of TNP visit TADOC and all the issues of TADOC are being addressed. During the meetings the needs are being discussed recommendations are being made and the implementation plan is been developed which then is then being implemented by the Directorate of TADOC. There have been productive meetings, which address many national and regional issues and needs.

\(^6\) This assessment has been made after meeting and interviewing the high rank personnel and the line managers from different Turkish LEAs (Turkish National Police, Department of Anti-Smuggling and Organized Crime, Istanbul Police Narcotics Department, Jandarma, Customs, Coast Guards) as well as past TADOC student serving their duties at various LEAs and present
Turkey. All these countries benefit from training programs in the field of combat against illegal production, abuse, smuggling of drugs and organized crime. Work in partnership with the Law Enforcement and Judicial Agencies of Turkey, neighboring countries and other international partners and organizations is being continued. There is a clear sign for a better cooperation and coordination on the regional and international level. TADOC has also become a centre for research activities, addressing the needs of national and regional research. Finally, TADOC has become a centre of cooperation with other drugs related organizations and is presently engaged in very many projects.

3.2. Impacts

3.2.1. General Impact
TADOC is on the way to be developed as an International Centre of Excellence and a model in the provision of research facilities and relevant modern training technologies and methodologies. The law enforcement officers trained at TADOC are now better equipped with the necessary awareness, knowledge, skills and abilities that enable them to be effective in countering drug related and organized crime within Turkey and the Region. There has been an improvement in the performance of the organizations and individuals that form these organizations. Effective regional and international cooperation take place between law enforcement and the social network of the members of these agencies. Effective collaboration and coordination across the region to develop and then to deliver common curricula in support of regional and national strategies and policies, achieve common minimum standards and the dissemination and exchange of best practice, training material and resource has been implemented successfully. This all has been achieved by providing research facilities and multi-agency training to law enforcement officers investigating drug related and organized crime issues.\(^7\)

3.2.2. Concrete Impact
The training has resulted in the improvement of knowledge, capacities and operational drug control results, improvement of cooperation, coordination and availability of national and regional level expertise, improvement of the design and delivery of high quality training in drug law enforcement and related matters to a large and diverse audience. The high dependency rate of countries in the region on international training in drug control and related matters was reduced to a certain extent during the second phase of the project.\(^8\)

As the result of competence increase, the law enforcement officers were able to deliver outstanding results in the year 2004. Seizure Statistics obtained from the Ministry of Interior (Department of Anti-Smuggling

\(^7\) student at TADOC and CBT site in Istanbul. (See Annex B).

\(^8\) See Fn. 6.
and Organized Crime Department) shows$^9$ that 15 tons of illicit drugs have been seized in Turkey. This amounts to the whole EU volume. Out of these 15 tons, 11 tons are attributed to TNP, 2 tons to customs and 1 ton to other LEAs. This statistics is compared to one from previous years is more improved, since there have been more drugs seized and suspects arrested. This can also be attributed to the TADOC training courses and consequent improvement of task skills of law-enforcement personnel. There is a clear link between the courses delivered and this improvement. Parameters, which affect success, are training courses, which lead to competence increase.$^{10}$

### 3.3. Sustainability

In the TADOC’ Strategic Plan it is stated that by the end of 2006 TADOC will aim to hand over all basic trainings to national law enforcement agencies and will be solely committed to expertise programs. To achieve this aim TADOC will help TNP, Jandarma, Customs and Coast Guard to standardize their basic training nationwide. In addition and in order to further support this transition, a Training Development Officer (TDO) Program will be held at TADOC with the participation of national LEAs in order to realize the standardization of basic training. TADOC will also offer to provide some of TADOC trainers to assist those agencies’ deliver their own basic training courses. There are good reasons to believe that this process will take place since national LEAs are willing to establish their own training. Further, the Strategic Plan indicates that the countries of the Region will get more involved in training through the TTT courses, which then will be delivered by the countries to their LEAs. The countries will also get more involved in financing the travel and other expenditures during the regional courses delivered by TADOC.

There is a good sign for sustainability since TADOC has been accrediting itself through good practice of cooperation and excellent training delivery on national and regional levels. TADOC has also been accrediting itself in the donor’s crisis very well and receives a stable support from the Government of Turkey.

### 4. LESSONS LEARNED AND BEST PRACTICES

#### 4.1. Lessons

4.1.1. It is knowledge derived from the practice that unless a secured budgeting is provided, the proper and in-time delivery of the project is threatened. Since there was not enough financing secured for Phase II of the Project, some of the activities had to be cancelled. It is therefore important that in-time and sufficient budgeting is guaranteed by the Project at the very beginning.

---

$^9$ See the extract from the Report attached in Appendix C.

$^{10}$ See Fn. 6.
4.1.2. The delays in the project delivery are sometimes due to the fact that the project needs are not being addressed in time. So there has been no NPO recruited to commence the fulfillment of tasks and duties, which has amounted to the delays in project delivery.

4.1.3. A better project delivery in Phase II could have been guaranteed by the availability of full-time instructors attached at TADOC, which could have delivered better quality training.

4.1.4. Since the project needs were not addressed in a comprehensive way, a major delay of 10 months in the delivery of Phase II has occurred. Addressing all arising issues in time and in proper manner can eliminate this problem in future.

4.1.5. The strategy of the Project dealing with the fight through training involving many countries of the Region is admitted to be successful and has worked up to now very well.

4.1.6. Working out the strategy of the Academy allowed planning the future activities and achieving better results.

4.1.7. The TTT courses have made courses more efficient and project delivery more cost-effective.

4.1.8. CBT allows a better inter-active training and is very effective.

4.2. Best Practices

4.2.1. Train-the-trainer courses, which were not envisaged until Phase III, are considered an outstanding success.

4.2.2. Establishment of the TTC is an absolute success since it has perfect facilities with all necessary components for a successful practical training.

4.2.3. Significant achievements in types and number of courses and training events delivered by TADOC as well as significant increase in the capacity and capability to deliver national expertise courses. The courses delivered produce very good results and are very effective.

4.2.4. Commitment, dedication and professionalism of the TADOC management team and staff are commonly admitted and were confirmed once again during my visit to TADOC.

4.2.5. Training & Development Strategy and TADOC’ Strategic Plan give a straight direction for future activities.

4.2.6. A great success was the implementation of CBT sites across the country. There are presently 10 regional CBT sites across Turkey, which perform effective work. There has been a successful translation of 43 CBT modules into Russian not envisaged until Phase III.

4.2.7. Research centers are now successfully involved in the production of publications and other research activities and projects.

4.2.8. A great success is the ability to produce modules at the CBT centre at TADOC using its expertise experience acquired during 5 years of expertise and in cooperation with different agencies and experts.
4.2.9. The relationships and cooperation between TADOC and the embassies of the USA, France, Germany and UK in Ankara are very good. There is also room to extend the existing bilateral cooperation in regards with courses delivered. The donor countries are very satisfied with the management, professional staff, training instructors, facilities and courses (program) of TADOC.

4.2.10. There has been a good regional cooperation in addressing the training needs. The result of it is a better coordination and communication with other countries. Officers in different countries of the Region are trained the same, which makes the cooperation in the fight against drugs and related crimes easier and more effective: there are the same standards, which are being used in the regional cooperation, and the trained officers “speak” the same language. The flight through training is being activated on a regional level.

4.2.11. Significant progress has been made with the course structure and evaluation. Evaluation sector has completed the evaluation of courses to level 1 (Kirkpatrick), procedure are now being implemented to commence level 2 and level 3 on certain courses.

4.2.12. Considerable work and effort by staff at TADOC has been put into designing and developing a regional anti-narcotics training course for the managers of Afghani Drug Investigation teams. This course took place at TADOC on 27 October -07 November 2003 and was a success.¹¹

4.2.13. Significant work continued to develop and improve facilities, TTC, quality and quantity of equipment and training resources.

4.2.14. Creation of a web page in three languages, which clearly displays UN Logo, provides information about TADOC’s purpose, activities, academic calendar and other items of interest.

4.3. Constraints

4.3.1. Financial constraints
Unexpected and significant amendments in the funding allocations late in the II phase of the Project resulted in the cancellation of a number of activities planned by TADOC. These amendments arose from doing the activities involving the translation and production of CBT modules in Russian as well as the delivery of some Train the Trainer courses, which had originally been scheduled for Phase III. Since UNODC funding has not been secured for Phase III, the financing has been provided from Phase II, which has not been completely secured.

4.3.2. UNODC funding not secured for Phases II and III of the TADOC Project
UNODC has not completely secured funding for Phase II of the Project.¹² This resulted in a slowdown of

¹¹ See Fn. 6.
¹² See Fn. 6.
regional and international training and cooperation activities of TADOC and concentration on national training activities, which is now being seen as a problem. So there have been 2 UNODC regional courses postponed due to lack of funding, a Regional Operational Meeting postponed to January 2005 due to no budget available for 2004 as well as TNA visits not fully completed in Phase II as planned.

There is at present no UNODC funding available for Phase III of the Project. The only contribution has been made by the Turkish Government. The lack of UNODC funding has to do with the lack of donor interest after initial 50% of funds were raised to launch the project. The lack of finances has a disturbing influence on the project delivery.

4.3.3. Delay in the appointment of NPO and international training advisor
The delay in the appointment of the NPO has resulted in the delay of courses, delay in the delivery of Regional Advisory Meetings, which has been rescheduled from 2002 to the following years because the funds for these activities could not be readily accessed. It has placed significant extra work and responsibility on the members of TADOC, UN staff in Ankara and Vienna and on the International Training Advisor.

4.3.4. No permanent instructors at TADOC
There is no cadre of permanent full-time instructors established. No short or long term secondment to TADOC of trainers from other agencies and region has been done.

4.3.5. Cooperation with national agencies
Not enough cooperation has been sought with the Jandarma. More participation and cooperation should have taken place also with other national law enforcement agencies, because it is important to expand their tasks in drug counter fight by providing them with the necessary training.

4.3.6. Regional activity - funding challenges
There is not enough funding for regional and international courses and other international activities, which remain a goal of TADOC, outlined in the strategy documents.

4.3.7. TOR for Regional Operational Meetings
No TOR has been developed for Regional Operational Meetings.

13 This contribution (USD 200,000) has been already allocated to activities.
14 This has taken place 15 month after start of Phase II of the Project.
4.3.8. Duration of Phase II of the Project. Evaluation
Phase II of the Project has had a delay of 10 months. Even considering this delay, not all the objectives set for Phase II have been fulfilled. There was also considerable delay in the evaluation of Phase II. This all has had a negative effect on the overall project delivery.

5. RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1. Issue resolved during the evaluation

5.1.1. The issue of more involvement of national agencies in the activities of TADOC has been well accepted and already planned before in the strategic document of TADOC. It was agreed that there is a need to expand TADOC’s facilities as well as make courses diverse in order to achieve this goal.

5.1.2. The Directorate of TADOC is seeing the regional activity of TADOC as its main mission. TADOC will become more represented in the region and internationally if it has relevant budget for these activities. The need is being seen for more courses for the region, since the demand from the region is large. Because the borders are important, the regional fight against drugs is admitted to be very challenging.

5.1.3. The need for permanent instructors attached to TADOC is also very well admitted.

5.1.4. The spread of TADOC’s Train the Trainer Courses as well as CBT to the countries of Central Asia and Afghanistan, South Caucasus, ECO and the Balkans is now being pursued.

5.2. Actions / decisions recommended

5.2.1. Better information circulation to donors and stakeholders
It is recommended that TADOC coordinate better with the donor countries in order to eliminate the double courses being delivered. Planned courses should be better circulated; more management coordination in regards with the planned courses is also desired. The information on activities planned for Phase III of the Project should be better distributed.

5.2.2. Multi-agency TADOC
TADOC should become a more multi-agency organization. It is strongly recommended to involve more law-enforcement officers from the Jandarma, Customs, Coast Guards, MASAK and other national agencies in TADOC’s training, since the proportion of students from these agencies participating in TADOC courses is highly unequal to the proportion\(^{15}\) of students trained from the TNP. Although the current statistics shows that the number of police officers dealing with drug matters compared to that of other LEAs is significantly high, it is important to expand the tasks of LEAs in drug counter fight by providing them with the necessary training. A strong accent should be placed on the Jandarma, since it is responsible for the national expertise training is 85% Police, 10% Jandarma and 5% other agencies.

\(^{15}\) Currently the ratio of agencies receiving the national expertise training is 85% Police, 10% Jandarma and 5% other agencies.
securing the borders where drug transfer is also intense. In fact, there is a need for more security on borders than elsewhere, since only a small amount of drugs is transported by air. Therefore, a better participation of and involvement with the Jandarma should be further pursued. An inclusive approach and more appropriate ratios in delivering the training to the Turkish National LEAs is part of the TADOC’ Strategic Plan and should be further perused. To this end, a mechanism should be established to ensure an equitable distribution of training being offered and delivered to different national and regional law enforcement agencies.

5.2.3. Multi-agency cooperation

It is necessary to intensify TADOC’s cooperation with national agencies in regards with the distribution of publications, training material and best practices. It is important to involve these agencies in the design of the courses in order to allow them to reflect their needs and priorities. Moreover, they should actively participate in the schedule of the courses in order to address the issues of timeliness necessary to prepare the staff to be trained.

It is essential that TADOC becomes an inter-disciplinary institution comprising all national agencies in order to fight interdisciplinary crime. At present, the inter-agency cooperation to fight interdisciplinary crime is being blocked by the closed up structure of the TNP.

5.2.4. Regional TADOC

5.2.4.1. Activities in the Region

There is a great progress achieved on the regional level, since TADOC has been over fulfilling its regional and international course responsibilities and regional and international cooperation has been significantly improved. Yet, the ratio of courses delivered at national and regional levels is highly unequal. It is therefore suggested that TADOC intensifies its regional and international activity by increasing the number of regional and international courses as well as TTT courses. Mobile training teams and mobile CBT teams should be made operational to travel to the countries. Introduction of CBT to countries of the Region should be perused.

The idea of establishing new Drugs Counter Fight Academies in the countries of the region (for example a planned establishment of such an Academy in Turkmenistan) should be seen in the view of the fact that TADOC is able to become an efficient centre of regional cooperation with necessary training and research capabilities. It is therefore suggested to fully use and develop the potential of TADOC instead of

---

16 See Chapter 2, Analysis and Major Findings.
17 TADOC Strategic Plan indicates, that by the end of 2006 TADOC will aim to deliver 60% regional and 40% national courses. Moreover it also indicates, that by the end of 2006, International Training Programs will be increased to 60% of all trainings delivered by TADOC.
duplicating the existing structures.

5.2.4.2. Central Asia and Afghanistan
It is suggested to spread TTT and CBT courses in Central Asia and Afghanistan at first, since the issues of trafficking are the most important there. Then, in the line of priority the countries of the South Caucasus, Balkans, Black Sea and ECO should follow.

5.2.4.3. Financial challenge
A greater regional and international involvement of TADOC depends on the availability of relevant budgets for such activities. Once established as a goal of TADOC, regional and international involvement can only be pursued if the relevant funding addressing a variety of costs associated with such activities is provided. At present, the budgets are limited and it is therefore recommended to make a strong accent on the availability of sufficient financing for the regional and international activities of TADOC.

5.2.5. Execution of financial responsibilities by UNODC
The non execution of the UNODC financial obligations undertaken in the Project Document caused significant problems during the execution of Phase II of the Project. Although the Project Document secures, that the execution of the contract is subject to the availability of funding, the whole credibility of UNODC and appropriate Project delivery can be significantly damaged by the non-execution of financial responsibilities. It is therefore recommended to get more involved in securing the funding necessary for the Project at the very beginning, which also include a more intense involvement with donors attraction. It is also recommended to eliminate the existing financial bureaucracy and to deliver proper auditing of the Project in order to guarantee the appropriate Project delivery.

5.2.6. Expansion of TADOC
5.2.6.1. Facilities
It is necessary to expand TADOC’s facilities, capacities, personnel (administration), and equipment. During the evaluation, a great demand was observed for more space and classrooms in order to meet the training needs of the regional and national agencies. It was observed that TADOC does not have a capacity it is challenged to have. This problem is now being addressed by the construction of the TADOC-city.

5.2.6.2. Training courses and programs
It is recommended to increase the number of courses and programs delivered at TADOC in order to meet the interests and increasing demands of all national, regional and international LEAs. It is suggested to
make the courses more diverse\textsuperscript{18} to address the emerging needs of various LEAs. There is a clear demand for more senior level official training courses and specialized courses instead of basic ones. This complies as well with the strategy of TADOC to hand the basic courses in the near future to national LEAs and to concentrate on the specialized courses. There is also a demand for more practical training, which is now possible in the new TTC. Both Coast Guard and Customs see their tasks and skills different from those of TNP, which is why they can not get use of the courses fully. It is therefore suggested to adopt certain courses to the needs of various LEAs. An intensification of bilateral cooperation in regard with course delivery is also suggested. Although progress has been made at TADOC in regards with the new types of programs and projects\textsuperscript{19}, there is still need to develop new ones. Further it is recommended to extend the duration of the courses\textsuperscript{20} for 2-3 weeks, since it is seen that the courses are then more effective.

5.2.6.3. Peace keeping tasks

It is suggested to involve peacekeeping tasks in the training scope of the Academy, which is to meet the demand in the enlargement of the task scope of the Academy, as well as international and regional cooperation. The Academy could provide training to the UN-peace keeping forces drawn from different countries of the world.

5.2.7. Permanent Instructors

It is recommended to attach permanent instructors to TADOC. The instructors should come from different national LEAs and have different operative and training backgrounds. There should be at least 5 permanent instructors at TADOC who can concentrate only on their duties. Although TADOC presently has 20 non permanent instructors from operational bureaus and different national departments it is difficult to involve them in training considering the fact that they all have to perform the duties at their LEAs.

5.2.8. CBT

It is recommended to fund the production in Turkish of two additional CBT Modules addressing Money Laundering and Precursor Chemicals that are currently available in English and French. New modules should be produced for Central Asia and Afghanistan. There is also a need for more modules to be produced at CBT Centre at TADOC. Creation of 2 new modules at CBT TADOC is currently planned - Interviewing Techniques and Surveillance Techniques. Since funding is needed for the conduct of these activities it is recommended to support these activities financially.

\textsuperscript{18} It is suggested to make courses on import and export procedures, since the smuggling of drugs occurs though import in trucks.

\textsuperscript{19} For example, there has been newly a program on safety in driving and VIP protection designed (TTC).
5.2.9. Tactical Training Centre
It is recommended to establish ‘Computer simulated tactical firearms scenarios’ and a ‘life-size mock-up clandestine laboratory’ at the Tactical Training Centre.

5.2.10. Training Need Assessment
It is suggested to conduct further TNA in the South Caucasus, ECO, Black Sea and Balkan Regions. A very important drug trafficking problem exists in the South Caucasus, where one of the most important drug trafficking routes from Afghanistan and Central Asian countries to Europe leads. It is therefore suggested to conduct TNA in Azerbaijan (ECO, Black Sea) and Georgia (Black Sea) in the matter of priority.

5.2.11. National and Regional Advisory Boards, Regional Operational Meetings
It is recommended to make every effort to ensure that Meetings of Regional and National Advisory Boards as well as Operational Meetings are more effectively documented and managed so that clear and achievable action points are identified and addressed. NTAB and RTAC should take more active role in the development and management of TADOC. I would suggest the donor countries should be invited to Regional Board Meetings in order to participate in the discussions and see what needs exist in the Region.

5.2.12. TADOC Legislation
TADOC should have an act, which will regulate its legal status, funding potential, activities, implementation and training needs. This will also include the initial Project Documents. I would suggest there should be a government act passed from the Parliament addressing this issue.

5.2.13. TOR for Regional Operational Meetings
I would suggest that a clear TOR for the Regional Operational Meetings should be developed, that ensures tighter focus on addressing achievable operational effectiveness and co-operation between the countries in the Region.

5.2.14. Project Revision
In view of the fact that the original Project Document was produced in 2000 and that changes have occurred since then concerning the issues being faced, it is recommended that the objectives set out in it be reviewed and if necessary revised, reiterated or removed to contemporary priorities.

Presently the duration of courses is as follows: 1 week preparation, 2 weeks duration, 1 week evaluation.
5.2.15. Implementation of Strategy Documents

It is recommended to implement the Strategic Plan and the Training and Development Strategy of TADOC. In particular, more specialized and advanced training courses should be conducted while the basic courses should be handed to national LEAs.

5.2.16. Recommendations from Phase I

All recommendations from Phase I of the Project should be fully addressed.

5.2.17. Objectives set for Phase III of the Project

5.2.17.1. CBT training should be extended to Central Asia, especially Uzbekistan, Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan. TADOC should hold courses dedicated to meeting the prioritized law enforcement training needs of Central Asian Countries. This could provide training in identified priority to over one hundred officers over the next 2-3- years. TADOC should as well hold at least two TTT Courses dedicated to meet the specific needs of Uzbekistan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan and other Central Asian countries. Furthermore, the recommendations from TNA mission to Central Asia should be addressed. These are to activate and deploy the newly established qualified and operationally experienced ‘mobile training teams’ to provide relevant and cost effective training in all three countries possibly using suitable venues and facilities available in each country or even sub-regionally, using one or more of the excellent training institutions that currently exist in Uzbekistan. Such a program, if comprehensive enough, would have the potential to train one or two hundred officers per year in identified skill area.

5.2.17.2. There should be more TTT courses conducted, since they are considered most effective and can prepare for own training at different national and regional LEAs.

5.2.17.3. CBT should be established in different national LEAs (Jandarma, Customs, Coast Guard)

5.2.17.4. The standard curriculum of TADOC should be finalized and a full-fledged annual training program should be developed. CBT shall be integrated into the curriculum.

5.2.17.5. Works should be pursued to develop ‘customer focus’ to identify prioritized regional and national training needs.

5.2.17.6. It is recommended to establish CBT sites in other cities of Turkey (14 cities are now envisioned).

5.2.17.7. Regional training courses, Operational meetings and Regional Advisory Committee meetings shall be further supported. Research capabilities shall further be developed. The project should support TADOC in research initiatives on specific issues related to drug demand reduction. The Academy and its research units should be used for national strategy planning and policy development.

5.2.17.8. It is recommended to catch up with the schedule of project delivery for Phase III considering a major delay in Phase II of the Project.
6. OVERALL CONCLUSIONS

The problem of drug trafficking in Turkey and in the Region has led to considerations how this problem can be countered and the trafficking in the Region reduced and eliminated. To this end the Government of Turkey and the UNDCP have established the Turkish International Academy Against Drugs and Organized Crime to serve the training and cooperative needs of national and regional LEAs. The success of Phase I was repeated in Phase II of the Project. The main components of this Phase were implemented successfully which give a good sign for the successful delivery of the final Phase of the Project. Notwithstanding some significant constraints evolved during the execution of Phase II of the Project, the outcome shows that many other results have been achieved other than those objectives foreseen in the Project Document. TADOC has been delivering a great number of outstanding courses on national and regional levels and on a bilateral basis and is increasing their quantity annually. TADOC has increased the cooperation on regional and national levels through the regional and international courses. An outstanding success was the implementation of CBT across the country and the delivery of TTT courses, which were not foreseen until Phase III of the Project. The dedication, commitment and professionalism of the whole TADOC team have been widely admitted. This work is also highly appreciated by the donor countries.

The training has an outstanding influence on task accomplishment of the trained law enforcement officers. The drug seizure statistics has increased drastically, which can also be attributed to the training courses. TADOC is on the way to be developed as an International Centre of Excellence and a model in the provision of research facilities and relevant modern training technologies and methodologies. As a result of courses the law enforcement officers of the Region are now better equipped with the necessary awareness, knowledge, skills and abilities that enable them to be effective in countering drug related and organised crime within Turkey and the Region. Effective regional and international cooperation take place between law enforcement agencies of different countries, which is seen as one of the efficient ways to counter the regional drugs problems. Effective collaboration and coordination across the Region to develop and then deliver common curricula in support of regional and national strategies and policies, achieve common minimum standards and the dissemination and exchange of best practice, training material and resource has been implemented successfully. This all has been achieved by providing research facilities and multi-agency training to national and regional law enforcement officers investigating drug related and organized crime issues.\footnote{To sum up, the second Phase of the TADOC Project has been completed successfully. There is space for further development and for addressing the goals not fully achieved during this phase. Therefore, the recommendations evolving from the Evaluation of Phase I as well from the present Evaluation shall be fully addressed.}
ANNEX A

DRAFT TOR FOR EVALUATION OF PHASE 2 OF TADOC PROJECT

Project No AD/TUR/02/G36 [The TOR should be written in accordance with “UNODC Guidelines for Evaluation TOR,” which describes what type of information needs to be covered in the evaluation]

Background.

The Turkish International Academy Against Drugs & Organised Crime (TADOC) was established on 26th June 2000. TADOC is to benefit national inter-agency training, regional training and cooperation. The current project, implemented in 3 phases, will provide resources, new training techniques, methodologies and advise to turn this Academy into a regional resource centre and consultation forum for drug related issues. The Academy has developed its training facilities, managerial and teaching structures, and has delivered several training courses for trainees from Turkey, ECO, Black Sea and Balkan countries. It was established as a result of a partnership between Turkish Government and UNODC who continue to co-fund its operation during the above project, which has been divided into a number of phases.

   Phase 1. Has addressed the initial construction and establishment of TADOC

   Phase 2. Is addressing the development of an appropriate curriculum, a fully operational training and research institution, the establishment of computer based training (CBT) and the undertaking of Training Need Assessments (TNA) within participating countries in the region.

   Phase 3. Will address the finalisation of a standard curriculum, the development of a fully-fledged annual training programme and the spread of CBT, delivered in Russian, at other training centres in the region, mainly in Central Asia.

The drug control objective of this project is the creation of a lasting training and consultation capacity in the region, and to improve the knowledge, awareness, cooperation and results in the field of drug control and organized crime; thereby limiting the further spread of drug trafficking, abuse and organized crime in the region.

   Objective 1   To improve the regional training capacity in the Academy and promote national and regional cooperation and coordination mechanisms in the fields of drugs and related crime.

   Objective 2   To establish computer-based training (CBT) capability at the TADOC and in Learning Resources Centres across Turkey, and to start spreading CBT to the countries of the region.

In accordance with Section ‘G’ of the original ‘Project Document’, “the project shall be subject to joint valuation at the end of Phase 2 and Phase 3”. The ‘Project Document, further states that “the TOR for the evaluation will be prepared by TADOC two months before the evaluations will take place. The composition of the evaluation team will be agreed upon by UNODC and the Turkish counterparts, and MAY, apart from participants from UNODC and Turkey, include an external training expert. Provisions for the evaluations have been made in the project budget ($6,800 per phase) and may not be reduced or eliminated except by written agreement of all parties to the project document and any subsequent revisions.”

Phase 2 is scheduled to conclude at the end of 2004.

Intention

A joint evaluation team, the composition of which will be agreed by UNODC and Turkish counterparts will be set up.
They will be tasked with conducting an evaluation of phase 2 of the above project that will address

¾ Both the quantitative and qualitative elements of its actual delivery, activities and outputs as regards the intended and expected delivery, activities and outputs set out in the original ‘Project Document’ and subsequent revised costed work-plans.

¾ The identification of any ‘good practice’ or areas for further development.

¾ Issues that may effect sustainability

¾ Recommendations that will confirm, amend or add to the activities and outputs for Phase 3 that were set out in the original ‘project document’

The ‘Evaluation Team’ will be expected to report their findings and recommendations before the end of December 2004.

Method

The evaluation should be conducted in a number of phases. These phases will include

¾ A desk review of relevant reports and data that will mainly address quantitative issues;

¾ A field-research trip to Turkey where more qualitative issues can be addressed and finally

¾ The production of the report of evaluations team’s findings and recommendations.

■ Desk Review. During the desk review, the written material that should be examined will include:

- The original Project Document and any subsequent costed work-plans;

- The main project reports (yearly, six-monthly and ‘mission reports’, which will include key budgetary information);

- Minutes and conclusions of National and Regional Advisory meetings;

- Details of course outlines and profiles.

- Progressive copies of TADOC’s Academic Calendar

- Information on the pattern of student attendance at the courses including Computer Based Training (CBT);

- Summaries of the course evaluations;

- Information on the activities and publications of the various Research Centres

- Any other material that would be relevant.

- The report on the “Training Needs Assessment mission” to Central Asian countries.
Field-Research Trip. This will involve a field trip to Turkey of approximately 5-6 days. Whilst it is anticipated that all the necessary research can be conducted within Ankara it may be necessary to conduct a short side-visit to another location in Turkey: The purpose of this field trip is to conduct:

- Face-to-face discussions with the members of the TADOC Directing staff including heads of the various TADOC Research Centres, the NPO and the UNODC International Training Advisor on the basis of the written material already provided. The evaluation team should provide, some days in advance of their visit, a note summarising those issues that they would particularly look to explore further.

- A visual examination of the infrastructure and facilities existing at TADOC

- Observation of ‘Training in action’ in one of the training courses that may be ongoing during their visit.

- Discussions with senior representatives donors, stakeholders and direct beneficiaries based in Ankara.

- Discussions with past and present students and their line managers. (Ideally this would be conducted in Ankara but it may be necessary for an additional meeting in for example Istanbul).

The preparation of a written report. This should record the findings of the review, and any associated recommendations, action plans, etc, which should be delivered to the UNODC and TADOC in final form on a date to be agreed but in any case before the end of December 2004.

Approach

The aim of the implementation review of Phase 2 should be to conduct an evaluation of how successful or otherwise the implementation of the second phase of the project has been, in particular assessing the extent and quality to which expected or additional outputs have occurred, identifying any lessons learnt and offering practical proposals for addressing any areas for further development and ensuring the sustainability of those elements which have the potential to continue to add value. Necessarily, within the constraints of time and budget, this evaluation will restricted to desk research in Vienna and fieldwork within Turkey and will be conducted at a fairly high level and on the basis of sampling the views of key stakeholders, operational managers, students etc. In doing so the following questions should be addressed:

1 – How the project has been "run"

Key questions here include:

- How has the project operated on the ground – how have key decisions been taken, what levels of input have been secured, how have budgets been controlled and audited?

- How far has it maximised use of limited resources – e.g. in decisions about the allocation of the budget, the training places and the type of training offered as well as the occupancy and usage rate of the ‘Guesthouse accommodation’, classrooms and conference facilities etc?

- How far has the training been able to benefit from contributions whether financial or “in kind” from other agencies, organisations or donors?

Key points on the analysis are:
The bulk of it would be desk-based, reviewing the management information that the NPO, International Training Advisor and the TADOC management team have been collecting throughout the project;

It would include reviewing who has been trained, from which agency, and at what level. It would also be useful to have this information compared on an annual basis since TADOC’s establishment. This would assist in assessing any variations in the amounts and types of training being delivered and would enable some comparisons and assessment to be made of the rate in which TADOC is developing both as a provider of multi-agency law enforcement training nationally and regionally.

The evaluation should also review other documentation such as the ‘Training Strategy’, the ‘Strategic Plan’, successive versions of the project plan (costed workplan), the six-monthly Project Progress Reports and any other interim reports concerning changes in activities and budgets, etc;

There would be a need for some face-to-face interaction, probably over a couple of days, with senior members of the TADOC Directorate staff, the NPO, the International Training Advisor, donor countries Drug Liaison officer and direct beneficiaries of the project in the area of law enforcement to clarify issues and probe further.

2 – What results the project has delivered

As is always the case with training projects it is relatively easier to evaluate the quantitative elements than the qualitative elements, which are more complex areas to evaluate. However an attempt should be made to evaluate both quantitative and qualitative elements –

Quantitative Elements [Be guided by the objectives/activities stated in the Project Document.]. In assessing the quantitative results the evaluation should consider the actual outputs delivered compared to the targets set out in the original ‘Project Document’ and revised ‘costed work-plans’. These outputs should include: -

1. The number of courses delivered on a year-by-year basis, categorised as National Basic, National Expertise, International Expertise and Train the Trainer.
2. The numbers of students trained on a year-by-year basis, categorising them by law enforcement agency, country and the training received.
3. The number of National and Regional Advisory Board meetings held.
4. The number and extent of Computer Based Training (CBT) modules produced, the establishment and coverage of CBT Centres and the extent to which a CBT programme has been implemented.
5. [Whether or not?] a comprehensive training strategy and curriculum has been developed and implemented.
6. Whether training has been evaluated.
7. Whether the various research centres, as outlined in the original ‘Project Document’, have been established and details of any outputs they have generated.
8. Other activities that TADOC have been involved in which may be additional or complementary to the expected outputs documented in the original project document.

Qualitative Elements. In assessing the qualitative results the evaluation should consider, to the extent that it is possible to do so: -

1. The quality/coverage of the training courses as actually delivered. The first stage of this will be a desk review of the actual numbers, types and content of the courses and an analysis of the nationality and function of students who have been trained.
2. How the courses were received by students who actually attended, both at the time and, to the extent possible, afterwards. This will involve a desk review and analysis of available students’ course evaluations, together with some qualitative face-to-face discussions with people who have attended courses in the past. [Obtaining the feedback from participants on the quality of training provided will be one of the key areas of this assessment. The evaluation should plan a sufficient time to collect such data.] A meeting will be arranged with one or more participants who have attended courses in the past.

3. Views of line managers - both at “operational” level and some at more senior levels. While taking on board the views of those with specific expertise/interest in training, it would be important that this included those actually involved in enforcement work. The key issues here would include how far the training improved students’ effectiveness on the job – “what difference did it make?” TADOC would be expected to make the practical arrangements for these discussions, but there should of course be discussion with the evaluations team as to what the range of coverage needs to be’. [Supervisors’ assessments could provide a glimpse of (potential) organizational change and would be highly valuable. But there may be a problem of attrition due to a long duration of this project, i.e. those who had taken the training may already have left their work or transferred to another offices by now. Every effort should be made to try to match training participants and their direct managers, in order to collect meaningful data.] Meetings with line managers from different agencies will be arranged within the evaluation mission.

4. Views of some key stakeholders, including the representatives of International Donors (UK, USA, Canada, France etc), which could be sought by correspondence or by face-to-face meetings with representatives of the relevant embassies in Ankara as to TADOC’s value, strengths and areas for further development.

5. Views of key beneficiaries within Turkey including Police, Jandarma, Customs and Coastguard, which could be sought by correspondence or face-to-face meetings with relevant senior representative of the respective agencies in Ankara as to TADOC’s value, strengths and areas for further development. [It is not clear from this TOR, but the Phase 2 description on page 1 suggests that there have been multiple participating countries to this project, other than Turkey. If so, what about their views?] We are in possession of letters from the countries for which TADOC has been delivering training. Facet to face meetings with relevant authorities and liaison officers from the Embassies will be arranged within the evaluation mission as well.

**Deliverables.**

In terms of written deliverables, the evaluation team should provide to the NPO and TADOC an “issues list” in advance of starting the fieldwork in the Turkey, and would be expected to brief the NPO, TADOC and the International Training advisor informally during the fieldwork as to emerging findings and any issues that require further investigation. [As soon as the team is established, the evaluation team should produce a detailed work plan for evaluation, including the list of countries to visit, who to meet, total duration of evaluation exercise, and the division of responsibility, etc. A copy of the final project evaluation report should also be submitted to the Independent Evaluation Unit, UNODC.]

The main deliverable will be a project review report. The production of the report would be expected to take a total of around five days of effort, spread over two or three weeks following the end of the fieldwork in Turkey. This report will pull together the results of the evaluation team’s analysis, drawing on desk research, course observation, and the other group and individual discussions, which would inevitably have yielded outputs of variable quality. In addition to the above it is also expected that the evaluation team will make recommendations concerning:

1. Areas for further development or focus
2. Examples of good practice

3. Issues about longer-term sustainability. Whilst it will probably be difficult to get a comprehensive view of this, discussions at senior levels with past and prospective donors, stakeholders and customers would give at least an indication of how far there was commitment to integrating the benefits of the project into long-term planning.

4. Proposed activities and outputs for Phase 3 of the project taking into consideration the activities and outcomes outlined in the original project document and their findings from their evaluation of Phase 2 [In Phase 3, according to the description above, the project is expanded to other neighbouring countries, including those in Central Asia. Recommendations from the Phase 2 evaluation should address the appropriateness/relevance of the current project (i.e. design, implementation strategy) to other countries, and potential risks in doing so, and means to mitigate such risks, etc.]

In terms of written deliverables, the evaluation team should provide to the NPO and TADOC an “issues list” in advance of starting the fieldwork in the Turkey, and would be expected to brief the NPO, TADOC and the International Training advisor informally during the fieldwork as to emerging findings and any issues that require further investigation.

It is not envisaged that the report will be a very long document, and its main focus will be to pull together the analysis in a way that highlights key points, particularly issues to be taken into account in moving forward to the implementation and completion of Phase 3 of the TADOC Project and future sustainability once the project has concluded. [Refer to the “UNODC Standard Format and Guidelines for Project Evaluation Report” in preparing the report.]
ANNEX B

LIST OF PERSONS MET DURING EVALUATION MISSION

I. Government of the Republic of Turkey

Ministry of Interior

Deputy Minister of Interior Mr. Sehabettin Harput

Ministry of Interior, Turkish National Police, Department of Anti-Smuggling and Organized Crime

Mr. Hanefi AVCI, Head of Department
Mr. Yasar YAMAN, Chief Superintendent, Director of Central Narcotics
Mr. Ibrahim CIHANGIR, Superintendent, Administration Chief, Narcotic Division, Central Anti-Narcotic Department, Instructor at TADOC and OSCI, Line Manager
Mr. G. Cem GEHDIOPU, Major, Deputy Chief of Narcotic Division
Meeting with a former TADOC student, who is now serving his duties in the Department of Anti-Smuggling and Organized Crime

Prime Ministry, Undersecretariat for Customs, General Directorate of Enforcement Customs

Mr. Ferruh GOPUROGLU, Section Director
Ms. Ebru CAN, Assistant Customs Expert
Ms. Nuray EREL, Customs Enforcement Officer (Narcotics)
Mr. Abdulla OGUZ, Assistance Customs Department

General Command of Gendarmerie, Anti Smuggling and Organized Crime Department

Mr. Cengiz YILDIRIM, Chief of Anti Smuggling and Organized Crime Department
Mr. Tayfun ALBAYRAK, Colonel, Director of Planning and Coordination

Turkish Coast Guard

Mr. Seyit Ali KURNAZ, Captain, Chief of Int. Department
Mr. Hüseyin AKIN, Chief of Training Department
Ms. Yasemin ARSLAN, Civil Management, Training Specialist

II. UNODC

Ms. Yasemin KAYA, National Project Officer
Mr. David Byrom, International Training Advisor
Mr. Mark Stanley, Regional Project Coordinator, South Eastern Europe

III. Donors to the project and courses

Embassy of the UK
Det. Ch. Ins. Warren SPIVEY, Drugs Liaison Officer
Mr. Garry BROWN, Drugs Liaison Officer
Mr. Geoff COLLIER, Second Secretary, Political and Public Affairs
Embassy of France
Mr. Michel MORETTI, Officier de Liaison de Sécurité Intérieur (Immigration)

Embassy of the United States of America
Mr. James V. ALLEN, Resident Agent in Charge, Istanbul Resident Office, United States Department of Justice, Drug Enforcement Administration
Michelle G. LOS BANOS, Economic Officer

Embassy of the Federal Republic of Germany
Mr. Heinrich M. REISER, Liaison Officer

IV. TADOC Management and staff

Mr. Celal BODUR, Director of TADOC
Mr. Ilhami HÜNER, EMCDDA National Project Coordinator
Mr. Gökhan AKSU, Chief of International Training Senter
Mr. Ali CEVIK, Chief of TNA, Evaluation and Development Section
Ms. Kezban KARAKAYA, Chief of CBT
Mr. Yakup YILMAZER, Head of Money Laundering Research Centre
Mr. Fatih CELAN, Deputy Chief of National Training Centre
Mr. M. Ünal ERTEN, Deputy Chief of CBT
Mr. Mustafa EDISAN, Chief of Tactical Training Section

V. CBT site in Istanbul

Mr. Mehmet KARAKAS, Istanbul Police Department, Narcotics Department, Line Manager
Mr. Ali ÜNLU, Inspector, Istanbul Police Department, Narcotics Department, Chief of CBT in Istanbul
Meeting with 4 students who have completed CBT courses in Istanbul and now serving their duties in the Istanbul Police Department
ANNEX C

EVALUATION ASSESSMENT QUESTIONNAIRE

Programme/Project Title: Strengthening of the ‘Turkish International Academy Against Drugs and Organized Crime’

Programme/Project Number: AB/TUR/02/G36

Introduction:

This assessment form must be completed by the evaluator or evaluation team and submitted to the Independent Evaluation Unit. The purpose of the assessment is to provide information for UNODC evaluation database. This information will be used to provide an overview of UNODC’s overall performance of programmes and projects.

Ratings:

The evaluators are required to give a rating to each of the items shown below. The ratings are on a scale of 1 – 5 (1 being the lowest and 5 being the highest). Ratings are based on the following criteria:

Excellent = 90% + (5)
Very good = 75 – 89 % (4)
Good = 61 – 74 % (3)
Fair = 50 – 60 % (2)
Unsatisfactory = - 49 % (1)

The ratings must reflect the level of achievement, completion, attainment or impact depending on what is being measured. These ratings are base on the findings of the evaluation and hence are a translation of the evaluation results.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A. Quality Performance Items</th>
<th>Ratings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Project Design (clarity, logic, coherence)</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Appropriateness of overall strategy</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Achievement of objectives</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Prerequisites fulfilment by Government</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Adherence to Project Duration</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Adherence to Budget</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>B. Implementation</th>
<th>Ratings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7. Quality and timeliness of UNODC inputs</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Quality and timeliness of Government inputs</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Quality and timeliness of Third Party inputs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>UNODC HQ Support (administration, management, backstopping)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>UNODC FO Support (administration, management, backstopping)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Executing Agency Support</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### C. Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Ratings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>Achievement of results</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>Timeliness and quality of results</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>Attainment, timeliness and quality of outputs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>Programme/project impact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>Sustainability of results/benefits</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### D. Recommendations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Ratings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18.</td>
<td>Continue/extend no modifications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.</td>
<td>Continue with modifications (minor, extensive)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20.</td>
<td>Complete Project Revision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21.</td>
<td>Terminate</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ANNEX E

THE LIST OF PUBLICATIONS BY TADOC (prepared by TADOC)

1. Turkish Drug Reports: These reports are published by TADOC in cooperation with the other divisions within Counter-Drugs and Organized Crime Department annually. These reports are available from 2000 to 2003 both in Turkish and English. The report concerning 2004 has been prepared and due to be published in Turkish and English.

2. Anti-Smuggling and Organized Crime Manual: It was prepared in 2000 to be used as the basic reference material as to the content of the training programs delivered at TADOC.

3. Anti-Smuggling and Organized Crime Manual Second Edition: The manual prepared in 2000 was updated and made into a book in 2001 to be delivered to the trainees and used as the basic reference material.

4. Anti-Smuggling and Organized Crime Manual Third Edition: The book published in 2001 was updated by adding new topics into the existing manual and adjusting the relevancy of its existing content in 2004. The third edition is now being delivered to each participant on the Basic Anti-smuggling and Organized Crime Course for study. It will also be delivered to other national law enforcement agencies for their own use.

5. Dictionary of Anti-smuggling and Organized Crime: A dictionary containing administrative, financial, technical and law terminology associated with smuggling and organized crime was published in 2002 to ensure the consistency in terms of terminology being used.

6. Illicit Drug Use Risk Assessment Survey Forms: A booklet containing standard forms and manual how to fill in those forms on drug use was published 2004. Those booklets of forms have been delivered to all provinces to be send back to TADOC after being filled in appropriately about the drug users for every drug use incident so that a profile for risk assessment can be identified.

7. Interpretation of Illicit Drug Use Survey Forms: A document for interpretation of illicit drug abuse survey forms was prepared by the Turkish Monitoring Centre for Drugs and Organized Crime, TADOC. This report will be published in the Turkish Drug Report for 2004 as well. The main objective of the survey was to produce a profile of the persons subjected to criminal investigation for use of drugs.

8. Story Books for Drug Demand Reduction: 4 story books were published by TADOC with respect to drug demand reduction activities addressing children and youngsters to effectively raise their awareness of the consequences of drug use by story telling with illustrations.


12. Investigative Interview and Statement Analysis Manual: It was prepared by the trainers of ‘Investigative Interview and Statement Analysis Course’ to be used as the main reference material for the content of the course.
Table showing the number of Courses and Meetings Achieved against the Target set for Phase 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category of Course/meeting</th>
<th>National Basic</th>
<th>National Expertise</th>
<th>Train the Trainer</th>
<th>Regional</th>
<th>International</th>
<th>NTAB</th>
<th>RTAC</th>
<th>ROAC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number Achieved</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Target Set</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number Achieved</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3. ILLICIT DRUG SEIZURES IN TURKEY FOR THE YEAR 2004

The following seizures were made in Turkey in 2004 under the police jurisdiction in 5,164 cases and 11,109 suspects were arrested as a result of the effective and intensive anti-trafficking efforts of Turkey in the field of illicit drug trafficking: 4 tons 330 kg 994 gr hashish, 6 tons 515 kg 297 gr heroin, 4 tons 491 kg 348 gr morphine base, 52 kg 081 gr opium, 125 kg 061 gr cocaine, 99,000 lt acetic anhydride, 7,696,252 captagon tablets, 718,734 ecstasy tablets.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DRUG TYPE</th>
<th>CASE</th>
<th>SUSPECT</th>
<th>QUANTITY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HASHISH</td>
<td>3,843</td>
<td>7,495</td>
<td>4.331 (Kg.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HEROIN</td>
<td>485</td>
<td>1,363</td>
<td>6.515 (Kg.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MORPHINE BASE</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4.491 (Kg.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OPIUM</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>52 (Kg.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COCAINE</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>386</td>
<td>125 (Kg.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACETIC ANHYDRIDE</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>99 (Liter)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAPTAGON</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>7,696,252 (pc.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECSTASY</td>
<td>516</td>
<td>1,443</td>
<td>718,734 (pc.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>5,164</td>
<td>11,109</td>
<td>8,414,986 pcs.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

An increase of 38% by number of cases and 40% by number of suspects is observed in 2004, when the figures are compared with 2003. Drug-related cases are common in Turkey by the regions as in following order: Marmara region, Mediterranean and Aegean regions, Southwest of Central Anatolia and the West of South Eastern Anatolian region. There are very rare illicit drug-related cases in the Black Sea region, north of Eastern Anatolia and north of Central Anatolia.
4. OVERVIEW BY DRUG TYPE

4.1. General

There observed a significant increase in the seizure of opiates (heroin, morphine base and opium), cocaine, hashish and synthetic drugs, whereas a decrease in acetic anhydride when data for illicit drug seizures of 2000-2004 are examined.

When the seizure figures of 2003 and 2004 are compared, there reported a 149% of an increase in opiates, 57% in hashish, 203% in synthetic drugs (ecstasy-captagon) and almost 40 folds of an increase in cocaine and nonetheless a decrease of 98% in acetic anhydride seizures in 2004.

74% of the overall cases in 2004 was found to be hashish-related, 10% opiate-related (heroin, morphine base, opium), 14% synthetic drug-related (ecstasy-captagon and other synthetics) and 2% cocaine-related.
67% of the overall number for arrested suspects corresponded to hashish related cases, 13% to opiates, 16% synthetic drugs (ecstasy-captagon and other synthetics) and 4% cocaine.

When the number of seizures and amount of the seized drugs are analysed, it can be observed that 1.1 kg hashish, 13.4 kg heroin, 1.2 kg of cocaine and 15327 synthetic tablets were seized per incident, which indicates retail seizures in hashish and cocaine, wholesale seizures in heroin and synthetic drugs. Retail and wholesale phrases give an idea about the destination (transit, domestic market, import or export) of the drugs.

4.2. Opiates

In 2001, due to the ban of Taliban Administration, opium production in Afghanistan decreased to the lowest level in the recent years. However, a dramatic increase has been observed in the subsequent years. In this frame, opiates seizures, which declined by 22% globally in 2001, increased by 9% in 2002. This rise mainly resulted from the enlivening of production in Afghanistan in 2002. Afghanistan, Myanmar and Laos produced 90% of the world’s opium volume in 2003. 45 kg/hectare of raw opium was harvested in Afghanistan. This output declined to 13 kg. in Southeast Asia. Therefore, ensuring a control over the cultivated lands in Afghanistan is very important for preventing global heroin supply. However, opium cultivation continued to increase also in 2004 and resulted in an output volume of 4200 tons, as a natural consequence of lack of effective drug control efforts in Afghanistan. Trafficking routes in the region became more active due to increasing outputs by Afghanistan and there has been an increase in opium drug seizures. Turkey has also experienced an increase in opium seizures, in parallel to these developments. Opium drug seizures reached its peak level with 11 tons 58 kg by the year 2004.
4,491 kg. morphine base was seized and 12 suspects arrested in Turkey in 3 cases in 2004. Morphine base seizures declined by 75% between 2000 and 2002, however, the seizures increased by roughly 3 folds in 2003 and 5 folds in 2004. Share of morphine base seizures in the overall opium drug seizures in Turkey is reported as 19.3% in 2000, 9.2% in 2001, 9.4% in 2002, 16% in 2003 and 40.6% in 2004.

Teams of İstanbul Narcotics Division seized a total of 4 tons 410 kg. morphine base at an operation in İstanbul on 29 March 2004. It was revealed as a result of the investigation that the morphine base had been brought to the country between 2000/2001, however, failed to be processed into heroin as a result of the strict controls and unfavorable physical and other related conditions of the country.