

Date: February 2006

TERMINAL EVALUATION REPORT

AD/BRA/98/D32

Brazil

Report of the Evaluation team

Mr. Tito Caetano Correa
Mr. Jonas Ribeiro da Silva
Mr. John Dillon

UNITED NATIONS OFFICE ON DRUGS AND CRIME

Vienna

CONTENTS

| | <u>Paragraphs</u> | <u>Page</u> |
|---|-------------------|-------------|
| EXECUTIVE SUMMARY | | 6 |
| I. INTRODUCTION | 1 | 9 |
| 1.1. Background and Context | 1 | 9 |
| 1.2. Purpose and Objective of the Evaluation | 12 | 11 |
| 1.3. Executing Modality / Management Arrangements | 13 | 11 |
| 1.4. Scope of the Evaluation | 16 | 12 |
| 1.5. Evaluation Methodology | 17 | 12 |
| 2. ANALYSIS AND MAJOR FINDINGS | 20 | 12 |
| 2.1. Overall performance assessment | 44 | 17 |
| 2.2. Attainment of Objectives | 53 | 18 |
| 2.3. Achievement of Programme/Project Results | 59 | 19 |
| 2.4. Implementation | 76 | 22 |
| 2.5. Institutional and Management Arrangements | 82 | 23 |
| 3. OUTCOMES, IMPACTS and SUSTAINABILITY | 86 | 24 |
| 3.1. Outcomes | 86 | 24 |
| 3.2. Impact | 89 | 24 |
| 3.3. Sustainability | 92 | 25 |
| 4. LESSONS LEARNED AND BEST PRACTICES | 96 | 26 |
| 4.1. Lessons Learned | 96 | 26 |
| 4.2. Best Practices | 106 | 28 |
| 4.3. Constraints | 112 | 29 |
| 5. RECOMMENDATIONS | 124 | 31 |
| 5.1. Issues resolved during evaluation | 124 | 31 |

| | | |
|------------------------------------|-----|----|
| 5.2. Actions/decisions recommended | 129 | 32 |
| 6. OVERALL CONCLUSIONS | 136 | 33 |

Annexes

| | | |
|---|--|----|
| 1. Terms of reference | | 37 |
| 2. Organizations and places visited and persons met | | 39 |
| 3. Summary assessment questionnaire | | 40 |

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. Summary table of findings, supporting evidence and recommendations

| <i>Findings: identified problems/issues</i> | <i>Supporting evidence/examples</i> | <i>Recommendations</i> |
|---|---|--|
| 1. Project Management – no formal, recognised structure in place | No qualified project manager, no structure with a Steering Committee, Working Group in place in the Ministry of Justice | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Participating Institutions to formulate project management structure 2. Suitably qualified Project Manager appointed 3. Recognised project delivery programme, including milestones 4. Above to be incorporated in project document |
| 2. Bureaucracy and devolvement of responsibility – procedures for acquiring equipment and materials overly complicated. No devolvement of responsibility to those implementing the project | <p>Delays occurred in acquiring equipment due to bureaucratic processes.</p> <p>No devolved responsibility or direct access to funding which is contrary to modern management practice. This results in delays to the progress of a project</p> | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Review procedures for acquisition of equipment under international technical assistance projects 2. Consider devolving appropriate level of responsibility to junior managers |
| 3. Public opinion – this project is part of a programme in Brazil to enhance public security, control crime, in particular drug trafficking, and ultimately to improve the quality of life for those living in the country. The public's view as to whether this has been achieved is extremely important | No information has been gathered from the public in Brazil detailing their opinion of how this or any other of the law enforcement projects between 1998 and 2005 have impacted on public security in the country. | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Project plans to include where relevant, an obligation on the host nation to conduct a public opinion survey 2. Projects whose objectives include an improvement in public security, quality of life or are aimed at controlling specific crime trends, should at its conclusion canvas the views of the public as to its achievements |
| 4. Standardization and consistency – achieved throughout Brazil's 27 States | All 27 States are receiving consistent training | 1. Project plans to be formulated to ensure standardization and consistency of delivery |
| 5. Shared resources – good use made of joint working practices | Resources shared with project AD/BRA/98/D31 | 1. Examine other projects to identify opportunities for sharing resources |
| 6. Annual project reports – too brief and contained insufficient detail of progress and issues arising | Examination of annual reports revealed a lack of required information | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Review current process 2. Consider introducing a more detailed annual review |
| 7. Distance Learning – effective method of service delivery in large geographical countries, in particular where they consist of autonomous political structures | Implementation of training programme successfully achieved in all 27 of Brazil's States | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Consider using, where relevant, this method of delivering information and training on other UNODC projects 2. Consider profiling which countries this method of delivery could be most effective in |
| 8. Combining projects – projects that ultimately seek the same outcome may be more effectively and efficiently implemented if combined into one program. This will also avoid duplication of effort | This project and project AD/BRA/98/D31 were closely aligned and may have been more effectively implemented as one program. They were both focussed on modernising training in order to enhance and improve the skills of law enforcement officers | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Implementation of projects to be viewed holistically and where relevant consideration given to combining under one program 2. Where projects are within the same thematic area consider conducting a cost and resource analysis to identify if there are benefits from combining them under one program |

2. a) Description of project and objectives

Public security has constantly deteriorated in Brazil over recent years with steadily increasing crime rates registered by the Ministry of Justice. In 1995, Brazil had 46,385 homicides, 393,214 violent crimes, and 5,706 cases related to drug trafficking registered by a police force totaling 471,109 officers.

While state governments are unlikely to increase significantly the number of police officers in the near future, one of the objectives of this project is to increase the capacity and effectiveness of the existing police forces through better training and education.

Within its political-administrative structure based on federal states, Brazil has given *plenis potestatis* to State Governments over the two existing state police forces and thus to the development of basic police academy curriculum and training programmes used in training the state police. However, the states recognize the need for standardized approaches, as the pattern of urbanization coincides with increased crime rates, the existence of progressively more sophisticated crime organizations, and increasing problems of drug abuse and trafficking throughout the entire country, without exception.

These problems, and others emerging such as human right issues and greater incidence and severity of criminal activity throughout, make it necessary to establish common minimum training standards for all state police forces, particularly in the area of drug control. The project aims to introduce standardization and modernization of police training countrywide.

This project, is part of a set of measures under development by the Brazilian Government to combat rising crime and drug trafficking, and forms a vital component in a “package” of law enforcement projects. It is closely aligned to project AD/BRA/98/D31, Institutional Strengthening of the National Police Academy and forms an essential part of the “Federal Executive Power Modernization Programme”, an agreement concluded between the Brazilian Government through the Administration and State Reform Ministry (MARE) and the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB).

The principle objective of the project is to develop and implement a modern police training programme, including teaching materials to be introduced at all levels, and to strengthen international cooperation through exchange programmes. The aim of the project's strategy is to develop and promote common public security standards throughout Brazil. The timing of the project was appropriate for the much needed reform and modernization of the Country's training of its public security officials.

b) Major findings

Project Strategy - The evaluators felt that this strategy was sound in principle albeit with twenty seven States it was clearly not going to be achieved without overcoming inevitable hurdles created by the autonomy that existed. The evaluators found that the project had indeed achieved its aim and there was now a standardised, modern police training programme being provided for public security officials throughout Brazil. They have developed and implemented modern teaching materials and now have available for all ranks of official four training courses;

- a) Human Trafficking
- b) Local Crime
- c) Crime Prevention
- d) Human Rights

Standardization of Training - The most important achievement the evaluators felt had been achieved by this program, which it is believed has impacted on the quality of public security in Brazil, is the standardization of training that now exists throughout all twenty seven States.

Through the implementation of this project public security training in Brazil now has consistency in its approach and in the methods, techniques and materials being used. Best use has been made of modern technology and communications and there exists now a quality of training for public security officials which was not in place prior to this program.

Use of Resources - This project is closely linked with project AD/BRA/98/D31 "Institutional Strengthening of the National Police Academy" and it was viewed by the evaluators to have been a good use of resources that the heads of both projects had

ensured that wherever possible combined efforts were used to develop and produce learning materials to utilise finite resources to best effect.

This combining of resources has been instrumental in providing a distance learning package to all twenty seven States and once again has added to the consistent approach adopted under both of the training projects.

Project Management - The evaluators felt that there was not a generally recognised project management structure in place throughout the duration of the program. There did not appear to be mechanisms in place such as a Steering Committee and Working Group to ensure that objectives were met and that delivery of the training materials and other products was timely and in accordance with agreed milestones. This structure was felt essential considering the length of time the project was running (7 years), in order to monitor progress and assess whether adjustments needed to be made to the implementation plan.

Bureaucracy and devolvement of responsibility -The process and procedure for the purchase of equipment and materials was slow and unnecessarily bureaucratic. It was felt that in line with modern management structures and processes there should have been a devolvement of the project's funding to those with direct responsibility for developing and implementing the project plan. It is accepted that specific procedures must be followed under UN regulations before monies can be released but it must also be accepted that this in turn may influence the timeliness of program delivery.

Distance Learning - The concept of distance learning was not in place prior to the implementation of this program for the training nationally of public security officials. Operationally the project has integrated all security professionals through the medium of a distance learning network. The results of the distance learning technique of teaching public security officials in Brazil is evident, with a police service that nationally is now receiving training that is consistent throughout all twenty seven States. The enhanced use of technology has not only improved the quality and effectiveness of the training but has also resulted in a better service being delivered to the public of Brazil.

c) Lessons learned and best practices

When comparing this program with project AD/BRA/98/D31 there are a number of similarities in both the purpose and methodology that was applied in executing their implementation. Both sought to modernise the training of law enforcement officers and public security officials and a more holistic approach could have been considered. It was felt that both projects were so closely aligned that they could have been implemented as one program. Another lesson learned from the same issue was that of line management. The overall supervision of both projects should in the view of the evaluators have been the responsibility of one Brazilian official.

The project spanned some seven years due in part to delays in the implementation procedures of the program. The evaluators felt the lesson learned from this is that a formal project management structure needs to be in place within the executing institution. It was felt this was essential in order to ensure that projects such as these are managed effectively, professionally and within the planned timeframe.

The evaluators felt that a more concerted effort could have been made to inform junior officers working at “street level” of the new training programme. This observation is made following a visit to local police stations in Brasilia where there was limited awareness of the program.

It is of note and good practice that those in charge of implementing the two training projects did wherever possible collaborate and share resources. This was of particular importance in the installation and use of the new communication and technological equipment. It was felt that collaborating and sharing the resources of projects in the same thematic area is an example of best practice for future programs.

The standardization and consistency of training achieved in this program was good practice, as was funding those States who chose to implement the model. In view of their autonomy this seemed to be the most sensible and effective method to achieve the project’s aim.

The use of technology to deliver the training was also felt by the evaluators to be a good example of an effective method by which programs such as these can be implemented in countries of large geographical areas.

The 'distance learning' package is an effective medium for ensuring that training is delivered in a consistent fashion and with modern technology now readily available throughout most countries this should be viewed as an good example of how training can be communicated nationally.

d) Recommendations and Conclusions

Recommendations

- a) The project document whilst comprehensive in its content should have contained milestones documenting the timescale for delivery of each component part of the program.
- b) There should be a mandatory, recognised project management structure in place to implement all projects effectively and within the expected timeframe.
- c) The annual and intermediate reports on the progress of the project did not contain the detail needed in order to make an accurate assessment of progress against the objectives. A recommendation is that UNODC review the format and content of these reports.
- d) The distance learning technique employed on this project may be worthy of consideration for UNODC to use as an example of an effective training medium to other field offices operating in similar environments.
- e) This program achieved a standardized in training for law enforcement officials in all twenty seven of Brazil's States that was not previously in place and may be worthy of replicating in other UNODC training projects both in Brazil and other like countries.
- f) The ultimate objective of law enforcement projects is to improve the quality of service being delivered to the public and to enhance their feeling of safety and security. A recommendation is that public opinion surveys should be considered at the conclusion of projects of this nature.
- g) A future recommendation would be to assess proposed projects from the same thematic area holistically and where relevant to consider combining them under one programme.

Conclusions

The principle objective of this project was to develop and implement a modern police training programme, and to strengthen international cooperation through exchange programmes with neighbouring South American countries. This was to be achieved by

integrating all of Brazil's security professionals through the medium of a "distance learning" network.

The duration of the project was seven years and whilst it is accepted that during this period there was a change in the Brazilian government (2003) which may have delayed the program being fully implemented, more training courses and materials should have been developed and delivered in this timeframe.

However, the project has been successfully implemented and a National Curriculum is now in place for the training of public security officials. Through the use of technology training courses have been developed and are available to officers in all of Brazil's twenty seven States. This in itself is a considerable achievement given the geographical and political hurdles that required overcoming in order for this to take place. The methods of teaching now used incorporate the use of technology and practical training delivered by experienced personnel. This is essential for understanding how the academic part of training is intrinsically linked to the practical everyday situations that public security officials will be faced with.

The benefits of standardizing the training throughout the country are evident and there now exists a situation where public security officials in all States receive identical information and teaching methods which has produced a uniformity which was not in existence prior to this project being implemented.

The lack of a formal management structure within the Ministry of Justice for developing and implementing the program within a given timeframe contributed to the delays experienced. Had this mechanism been in place the project would have been managed more efficiently and with greater regard for timeliness of delivery.

The expenditure for this project was US \$2.382.473 and there was clear evidence that the funding had been put to good and effective use throughout the program, both in the acquisition of essential technological equipment and the creation and development of much needed new training materials.

The investment made in improving the quality of public security officials in Brazil has been considerable both in financial terms and in the devotion of resources. Whilst this program has been successfully implemented its benefit will only be truly realised by maintaining and further developing the training that has already been introduced.

In order to continue to raise the efficiency and effectiveness of Brazilian public security officials there is a need to build upon the training methods and models already in place under this and project AD/BRA/98/D31. To do so will require a commitment to continuously review and update the teaching methods and topics delivered to the officers, which is an essential element of ensuring that they are competent to deal with both basic and sophisticated law enforcement situations.

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Background and Context

1. Public security has constantly deteriorated in Brazil over recent years with steadily increasing crime rates registered by the Ministry of Justice. In 1995, Brazil had 46,385 homicides, 393,214 violent crimes, and 5,706 cases related to drug trafficking registered by a police force totaling 471,109 police officers.
2. While state governments are unlikely to increase significantly the number of police officers in the near future, one of the objectives of this project is to increase the capacity and effectiveness of the existing police forces through better training and education.
3. Within its political-administrative structure based on federal states, Brazil has given plenis potestis to State Governments over the two existing state police forces and thus to the development of basic police academy curriculum and training programmes used in training the state police. However, the states recognize the need for standardized approaches, as the pattern of urbanization coincides with increased crime rates, the existence of progressively more sophisticated crime organizations, and increasing problems of drug abuse and trafficking throughout the entire country, without exception.
4. These problems, and others emerging such as human right issues and greater incidence and severity of criminal activity throughout, make it necessary to establish common minimum training standards for all state police forces, particularly in the area of drug control. In view of this, the Government has requested UNDCP cooperation in support of activities for standardization and modernization of police training countrywide.
5. This project, is part of a set of measures under development by the Brazilian Government to combat rising crime and drug trafficking, and forms a vital component in a “package” of project of law enforcement, including the following other projects:

- a) Institutional Strengthening of the National Police Academy (AD/BRA/98/D31)
 - b) Integrated National System for Information on Justice and Public Security (AD/BRA/98/D34)
 - c) Strengthening of Chemical Precursor Control (AD/BRA/98/D33)
6. Together with the first two projects as listed above, this project forms an essential part of the “Federal Executive Power Modernization Programme”, an agreement concluded between the Brazilian Government through the Administration and State Reform Ministry (MARE) and the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB). Through MARE the Government provides funds to this project, with additional complementary assistance from UNDCP.
 7. The aim of the project’s strategy is to develop and promote common public security standards throughout Brazil. The project commenced in 1998 with an allocated budget of US \$2,725.000, training being ‘rolled out’ from 2002. The funding appears to have been adequate to achieve the expected outcomes and the evaluators felt that the project document was clear and also concisely documented the objectives sought.
 8. The concept of the project was the evaluators felt well founded and logical in its aim of achieving a consistent, basic level of training for all public security officers in Brazil’s twenty seven States. This consistency of approach was not in place prior to the commencement of this project, due largely to the autonomous nature of control that exists in each State. The timing of the project was appropriate for the much needed reform and modernization of the Country’s training of its public security officials.
 9. The life of the project has been some seven years which should have been more than sufficient time to develop and implement the required national, standardized training for public security professionals in Brazil.
 10. It should be noted that in 2003 there was a change of government in Brazil, the incumbents having been in power for the preceding eight years. It is fair to state that this factor has had a bearing on the length of the project which otherwise one would have expected to have been completed in a shorter timescale.

11. The evaluators also make comment on the similarities between this program and project ADBRA/98/D31 “Institutional Strengthening of the National Police Academy”. The latter primarily aimed at the Federal Police whilst project AD/BRA/98/D32 encompasses all of Brazil’s public security professionals. This observation is not intended as a criticism; however it may have been a consideration at the time to examine the merits of implementing both reforms under one project. The positive considerations of this suggestion are examined in more detail later in this report.

1.2. Purpose and Objective of the Evaluation

12. Project AD/BRA/98/D32 has now concluded and the purpose of this final evaluation is to identify lessons learnt in order to draw conclusions for the basis to institute improvements for the future and other follow up activities that can be accomplished by measuring achievements, outcomes and impacts, both positive and negative of the project. The objective of the evaluation is to examine the mandate, strategy, objective, relevance, effectiveness, results, impact sustainability and added value of UNODC’s actions.

1.3. Executing Modality/Management Arrangements

13. The Administration and State Reform Ministry are the executing agency for this National Executing project. The Ministry of Justice were responsible for the implementation of the project through the Department of Public Security Issues.

14. UNODC provided technical assistance and collaborated where required with other federal and State level agencies to ensure a smooth implementation and the widest impact of project activities. The UNODC field office in Brazil provided institutional support to the project.

15. The project was the overall management responsibility of Mr. Marcelo Durante and Mr. Paulo Gobbi both of the Ministry of Justice; they were interviewed as part of the evaluation process and were able to explain in some detail the development and implementation of the program. Both individuals were in the view of the evaluators capable individuals who were able to demonstrate how the project had been introduced in all twenty seven States.

1.4. Scope of the Evaluation

16. The timeframe established to examine in the Evaluation study is between 1998 and 2005. The Evaluation will analyze: a) The project concept and design; b) Project implementation; c) Outputs, outcomes and impact of the project. It will also ensure that lessons learnt from the project will be recorded and recommendations for the future and other follow-up activities will be made as appropriate.

1.5. Methodology

17. The evaluation team adopted a specific methodology for this terminal project evaluation, consisting of a detailed review of major documents attributed to the project, including annual, monitoring and budget reports.

18. Personal interviews were conducted with all relevant parties to the project, including main stakeholders and beneficiaries. As part of this project evaluation and the evaluation of AD/BRA/98/D31 a site visit was made to the National Police Academy which included a presentation on the Distance Learning techniques introduced to enable improved training to be delivered in all twenty seven States.

19. A field visit was also made to a police station in Brasilia and further site visits were carried out at police stations in Belo Horizonte and Sao Paulo in order to assess the impact the project had delivered at ground level.

2. ANALYSIS AND MAJOR FINDINGS

20. The successful implementation of this project was key to improving the institutional capacity for training public security officials in Brazil. Before the commencement of this project there had been no standardised training programme for public security officials in the twenty seven States. This had resulted in a disparity between the effectiveness of the way in which training was delivered in different parts of the Country. In turn this has an adverse effect on the quality of policing being given to the public in Brazil and can undermine society's confidence in its law enforcement to protect it.

21. The effective training of Brazilian public security officials is paramount in the country's efforts to combat the ever increasing rise in crime and the continual instances of violence that occur.
22. Detailed below are the main findings which the evaluators felt were of note and relevance to this project and to future programs of this nature. Analysis of the data coupled with information obtained from interviews and visits to establishments led to the following observations.
23. Project Strategy

The strategy of the project was by the development of a process of standardized training for public security officials throughout Brazil to institutionally strengthen the system of policing in the country. The evaluators felt that this strategy was sound in principle albeit with twenty seven States it was clearly not going to be achieved without overcoming inevitable hurdles created by the autonomy that existed.
24. The evaluators found that the project had indeed achieved its aim and there was now a standardised, modern police training programme being provided for public security officials throughout Brazil. Good use of technological developments was also being made to deliver the training through distance learning packages.
25. The communication and technology equipment provided by the project was of a high standard and offered value for money. They have developed and implemented modern teaching materials and now have available for all ranks of official four training courses;
 - a) Human Trafficking
 - b) Crime Scene Handling
 - c) Crime Prevention
 - d) Human Rights

One observation that the evaluators made was that in view of the time period that the project had been in place for, some seven years, there may have been an expectation that more training courses would have developed and implemented by now.

Standardization of Training

The most important achievement the evaluators felt had been achieved by this program, which it is believed has impacted on the quality of public security in Brazil, is the standardization of training that now exists throughout all twenty seven States.

26. Through the implementation of this project public security training in Brazil now has consistency in its approach and in the methods, techniques and materials being used. Best use has been made of modern technology and communications and there exists now a quality of training for public security officials which was not in place prior to this program.
27. The importance of standardization and consistency in the training of public security officials cannot be over emphasised, without this process being in place it results in officials being inadequately trained to deal with everyday issues that arise and also the more sophisticated investigation that requires a higher level of knowledge and expertise.
28. Apart from the four courses mentioned at paragraph 25 all new public security officials also receive initial training which again is consistent throughout the country. The evaluators were given a detailed account of the training courses provided and of the equipment and techniques used in the distance learning package. It was noted that a course on Human Rights is available to all ranks of officer which was felt to be most encouraging.
29. The evaluators could see clear evidence of an improvement in the quality of training now being delivered through this standardized approach, interestingly the training is not compulsory, however, the States that do decide to adopt it receive funding to assist with its implementation. Whilst this is not an ideal situation the fact that there are twenty seven different autonomous States probably makes it a viable option.

Use of Resources

32. This project is closely linked with project AD/BRA/98/D31 “Institutional Strengthening of the National Police Academy” and it was viewed by the evaluators to have been a good use of resources that the heads of both projects had ensured that wherever possible combined efforts were used to develop and produce learning materials to utilise finite resources to best effect.

33. This was also evident at the National Police Academy where project D32 had installed satellite distance learning stations. The technology suites at the Academy used in the distance learning training are shared by both projects thereby reducing the costs and the human resources required to manage the units. This combining of resources has been instrumental in providing the distance learning package to all twenty seven States and once again has added to the consistent approach adopted under both of the training projects.

34. Project Management

The evaluators felt that there was not a generally recognised project management structure in place throughout the duration of the seven year program. There did not appear to be mechanisms in place such as a Steering Committee and Working Group to ensure that objectives were met and that delivery of the training materials and other products was timely and in accordance with agreed milestones. This structure was felt essential considering the length of time the project was running for, in order to monitor progress and assess whether there needed to be any adjustments made to the implementation plan.

35. There was no evidence found of clear communication channels that existed between individuals at Ministry level and those responsible for the implementation on a daily basis. Included in this observation is the lack of any formal, regular meeting structure within the Ministry to report on the project's progress.

36. It is worthy of note however that when asked to produce a breakdown of the financial expenditure of the project, including funding allocated, spent and the balance that had remained, they were able to do so immediately. This indicated to the evaluators that there had at least been a degree of financial management maintained throughout the life of the project.

37. Bureaucracy

When interviewed Mr. Marcelo Durante, the person in charge of implementing the project stated that whilst he had been able to access funding through a national budget for the purchase of equipment and other materials, the internal process and procedure for doing so was slow and unnecessarily bureaucratic.

38. The evaluators felt that in line with modern management structures and processes there should have been a devolvement of the project's funding to those with direct responsibility for developing and implementing the project plan.
39. The evaluators discussed with UNODC field office Brazil the process of purchasing equipment in international technical assistance projects and the procedure that must be followed under UN regulations before monies can be released. The evaluators whilst accepting that these regulations are in force still felt that this issue is one that they should comment upon in this report; as a factor that may influence the timeliness of program delivery.
40. Distance Learning

The standardization and consistency of training now in place throughout Brazil's twenty seven States has already been highlighted at paragraph 26 of this report, however the evaluators feel that the success achieved developing and implementing the distance learning training is worthy of individual note and is a major finding of the evaluation.
41. The concept of distance learning was not prior to the implementation of this program in place for the training nationally of public security officials. Operationally the project has integrated all security professionals through the medium of a distance learning network.
42. This has been achieved by the introduction and use of technology with a uniform programming in order to address the need for standard knowledge and police techniques throughout Brazil. In addition the project has developed a new curriculum and created training materials which has allowed modern pedagogic and didactic methods to be employed and progressively expanded throughout police training institutes in Brazil.
43. The results of the distance learning technique of training public security officials in Brazil is evident with a police service that nationally is now receiving training that is consistent throughout all twenty seven States. The evaluators were satisfied that this enhanced use of technology has not only improved the quality and effectiveness of the training but has also resulted in a better service being delivered to the public in Brazil.

2.1 Overall Performance Assessment

44. The overall goal of this program was to develop and implement a modern police training programme, including teaching materials to be introduced at all levels, and to strengthen international cooperation through exchange programmes. The project was to set common, minimum standards of training for all public security officials in Brazil. This aim should be viewed in a wider context as part of a set of measures being introduced by the Brazilian government to combat rising crime and drug trafficking.
45. The timing and appropriateness of this project was correct, and indeed in all probability was a much needed modernization of the methods by which public security officials were trained in Brazil.
46. A consultative training needs analysis was conducted by the project team to assess the shortfalls in the training that was being delivered and from these findings a strategy was then put into place to develop and implement a national curriculum which addressed the minimum training standards required by law enforcement officers.
47. The evaluators noted that feedback had been sought from those officials trained as to the quality and effectiveness of the new national training curricula. The response was encouraging and one objective observation was made that some of the training syllabus was quite difficult, however, when looking at the subjects taught they were basic, fundamental policing topics that were essential for all public security officials to be knowledgeable in.
48. As far as the efficiency of the project is concerned whilst undoubtedly a considerable achievement has been made in standardising minimum training levels for public security officials throughout Brazil there were the evaluators felt areas where delivery could have been improved.
49. Firstly, the length of time the project has taken to reach its present stage, some seven years, is too long. The training products that were developed consist of four basic courses which with the appropriate advice, be it national or international, could have been designed and implemented in a much shorter period. It is accepted that the project relied heavily on communication and technological equipment being installed

in all twenty seven States; this in itself with the processes that have to be adhered to was a lengthy procedure. However, the evaluators felt this should have been achieved in a shorter timescale than it was.

50. It is arguable that whilst there was to some extent a sharing of resources between this project and AD/BRA/98/D31 both projects could have been combined and then implemented under one program. This in turn may have improved the efficiency in its delivery and almost certainly reduced the overall cost of implementing both projects.
51. Whilst these views are the objective observations of the evaluators this should not detract from the fact that this project has successfully implemented a standardized, national training program for all public security officials in Brazil.
52. The design of the project accurately sought to address the core issue, the introduction of a minimum training standard for public security professionals. This result was achieved and the focus of the program maintained throughout its duration.

2.2. Attainment of the Objectives

53. The principle objective of the project was to develop and implement a modern state police training programme throughout Brazil, which in turn would strengthen the system of policing in Brazil. This has been achieved albeit in an extended timeframe to the one originally planned.
54. Another objective was to develop and install the necessary communication and technological equipment in all twenty seven States in order for the new training to be delivered electronically in a distance learning environment. This was also achieved and there is now web based training and video conferencing facilities to assist with training public security officials in all States. This should be viewed as a very positive step and was instrumental in being able to deliver the standardized training nationally and with consistency.
55. Fundamental to achieving a successful outcome was the objective of developing a minimum common curriculum containing up to date materials and aids. The provision of a base minimal knowledge was essential for public security officials in order for them to be trained to a standard where they could confidently carryout their duties in a professional, efficient manner. This was achieved, albeit as previously commented

upon the evaluators would, given the seven year timeframe, have expected to see more training courses available than currently available. It is accepted that development will continue and the current focus is quite correctly on training all 600,000 public security officials in the basic policing skills.

56. The objective of incorporating human rights training into the national curricula has been achieved and indeed one of the four courses produced is dedicated to that topic; the evaluators felt that this was an important, fundamental subject that was quite properly included within a curriculum for the national training of law enforcement officers.
57. A challenging objective for the project was to strengthen international cooperation through the development of exchange programmes, study tours and other forms of information interchange with other countries, in particular with those in South America. The evaluators were informed that this had been achieved and that other Latin American countries were now considering implementing a similar system to train their own officers.
58. One objective of the project team was to publish a web page on the national curricula in three languages, Portuguese, Spanish and English. Mr. Marcelo Durante the coordinator of the program reported to the evaluators that as yet the web page was available only in Portuguese, but it was planned for it to be available in Spanish and English in the near future.

2.3. Achievement of Programme/Project Results

59. Result 1.- The “minimum curriculum plan” articulated and related training materials and aids developed, with the programme made operational in state training academies.
60. An international seminar was conducted for the joint articulation of the Minimum Curriculum plan, which included subjects, syllabus and the schedule of the curriculum. From this an action plan was developed for the implementation of the curriculum into a continuing education programme throughout Brazil.
61. The project developed didactic material, teaching aids and audio visual components which were subsequently used in the minimum curriculum plan and the continuing education programme.

62. Due to the constitutional autonomy of the States in Brazil a participatory approach was adopted to identify, select and sign agreements with the State academies to be part of the national process for implementing the newly developed curriculum and related didactic materials and aids.
63. This result was achieved and to the projects credit it successfully overcame the quite substantial hurdle of not only the geographical size of Brazil, but also the political obstacles that exist between each state.
64. Result 2- “The technical equipment required for the distance learning network identified, installed and made operational at State police training centres for supporting the newly developed training activities”.
65. An assessment was conducted for the user specification required and the equipment needed to implement the project based on the current training programmes in the States. The acquisition and bidding process was then undertaken for the purchase of the equipment which was installed and tested at all of the participating State academies.
66. As this was a radical change from previous methods used to teach public security officials there was a requirement for technical operators to be trained in the maintenance and use of the new installations. Once installed and operational the training was able to be delivered nationally and the project monitored the progress and development of this new methodology which it soon became apparent was a far more effective medium for achieving consistency than existed previously.
67. Result 3- “Human resources adequately available and operational for the training of instructors (in coordination with project AD/BRA/98/D31 Institutional Strengthening of the National Police Academy).
68. Clearly with such a change to previous didactic methods employed in training public security officers there was a requirement for the project to ensure that those delivering the training were adequately equipped to do so; this could have had an adverse effect on the credibility of the project if this was not attended to.

69. Specialist consultants were engaged to prepare a training plan for the instructors and to assess international experiences in distance learning methods of instruction in Latin American countries in the region.
70. This plan was developed and teaching materials were designed for the instructors to be given the training required in order to deliver the distance learning package. This was successfully implemented under the project and the instructors not only have the knowledge to deliver the training but many come from a strong operational background and are able to relate theory into practice for the students.
71. Result 4 – “The overall project monitored and evaluated, including its component plans and programmes, allowing for modification of implementation during the duration of the project”.
72. A formal review and evaluation structure was in place throughout the life of the project and a revision of the project outputs was made. The evaluators have had the opportunity to view the annual reports of this project and felt that they could have contained more detail, and were in fact too brief to enable a full overview of progress to be ascertained on a yearly basis.
73. When interviewed Mr. Marcelo Durante, the project coordinator, Ministry of Justice, stated that a review of the project had taken place a year ago and that there was a consultative process with the public security officials receiving the training to assess their views and opinion of the distance learning package. This was done with the purpose of developing current and future training needs as well as a form of ‘quality assurance’ for the training materials and methods being used.
74. A point worth noting with both this and project AD/BRA/98/D31 is that whilst each program employed internal mechanisms for assessing the quality and effectiveness of the training being delivered, there was no consultative process for seeking the views of the Brazilian public as to whether their confidence in the police and their feeling of security had improved.
75. The project coordinator, Mr. Marcelo Durante, did believe this to be the case but this could not be substantiated.

76. Ultimately the aim of improving policing in any country is to enhance public security and the quality of life, so it is important to assess whether the implementation of these projects has assisted in this process.

2.4. Implementation

76. The evaluators considered that the project had been successfully implemented with the national curriculum now in place, and through technological means standardized training is now available via a distance learning package to all public security professionals in the country.

77. Through the implementation of this programme a total of 2,600 public security officers are currently being trained in the four courses at present available (Human Trafficking, Crime Scene Handling, Crime Prevention and Human Rights). It is planned to train a further 5,000 public security officers in 2006 and the entire 600,000 public security officers in a three year continuous cycle. At the time of completing this evaluation 3,000 officers had been trained in Human Rights.

78. The implementation has not been without its hurdles to overcome, Mr. Marcelo Durante when interviewed by the evaluators felt that more international involvement and cooperation may have speeded up the process, through the sharing of experiences and ideas.

79. As previously mentioned in this report, the implementation may have been completed sooner had there been in place a formal project management structure to oversee and direct the program and its resources. It was noted that delays had occurred in the implementation phase due to work plans being of poor quality. This constraining factor may have been overcome or its impact reduced had a project management structure been in operation. Delays such as these could have been identified at an early stage and the appropriate intervention made to address the situation.

80. The implementation of the project was originally scheduled to take place over a three year period which was extended to seven years. The evaluators felt that a period of three years should have been sufficient for implementing the system that is now in place for training public security officials. Even with the technological and

communication equipment needed this should have been achievable within this timescale.

81. The intervention of UNODC field office in Brazil in identifying some of the shortfalls in the implementation of the project by the Brazilians was noted by the evaluators, as was the continual support and advice given by them throughout the duration of the project.

2.5. Institutional and Management Arrangements

82. The Ministry of Justice was the Project Implementing Agency through the Department for Public Security Issues and was responsible for the management of the project, and as the executing agency responsible for completing the activities detailed in the project document. The evaluators believe that this was in principle the correct and most logical arrangement for the implementation of an international technical assistance program of this design.
83. In practical terms, Mr. Marcelo Durante and Mr. Paulo Gobbi both from the Ministry of Justice were responsible on a daily basis for the management and implementation of the project. Both individuals were interviewed as part of the terminal evaluation process and were able to assist in explaining the development and implementation of the project.
84. The Brazilian Agency for Cooperation was the institution responsible for the evaluation of the actions carried out within the project's framework. The UNODC field office in Brazil, a participating institution, provided advice and guidance throughout the duration of the project.
85. Whilst there was evidence that coordination and collaboration between the participating institutions had taken place throughout the project in the form of an annual Tripartite meeting, there appeared to the evaluators to have been no other formal structure in place. There was no Steering Group or Working Group within the Ministry of Justice that directed the management and progress of the project. It was felt that this process should have been in place both for accountability purposes and to ensure that the project was progressing according to schedule.

3. OUTCOMES, IMPACTS AND SUSTAINABILITY

3.1. Outcomes

86. The ultimate purpose of this project, as part of a set of measures developed by the Brazilian Government to combat rising crime and drug trafficking, is to form a vital component in a package of programs for the improvement of law enforcement and public security in Brazil. This includes its capacity to tackle criminality at local, national and international level.
87. As far as this project is concerned it has achieved a number of positive outcomes that have notably contributed towards improving the quality of law enforcement in the country. Detailed below are the key outcomes the identified by the evaluators;
- a) Standardization and consistency of training for all public security professionals
 - b) Introduction of technological training aids
 - c) Development and implementation of “Distance Learning” medium
 - d) National curriculum
 - e) Modern training materials
 - f) Pedagogic and didactic reform
 - g) Improved international cooperation with Latin American countries
 - h) Officers better equipped to discharge their duties
 - i) Four specialized training courses
88. The implementation of this new training has led to a greatly enhanced ability to deliver the knowledge that public security officials need to be able to carry out their role more effectively. Through the outcomes listed in the above paragraph at a) to i) the level and quality of instruction for public security officers has improved which ultimately should have a positive effect on the quality of service being delivered to the Brazilian public.

3.2. Impacts

89. The implementation of this program in delivering a standardized training product to public security officials in all twenty seven States in Brazil has improved the

professionalism of its officers in the way they enforce the law and provide security for the public.

90. This was achieved through the introduction of a National Curriculum and a distance learning training package that has benefited all public security professionals by providing them with access to the most up to date modern training materials enabling them to deliver a professional service to the community.
91. As far as the impact the project has had on crime and in particular the trafficking and abuse of illicit drugs, it has not reduced these in number, in fact crime in Brazil continues to rise each year and the trafficking in narcotics is as prevalent now as it was when the project commenced in 1998. However, the evaluators feel that to view a successful impact for the project solely based on crime statistics would not be an accurate representation of the programs achievements. What can be said is that through the implementation of this project public security officials are now trained to a much higher standard and are now far better prepared to carry out their law enforcement duties.

3.3. Sustainability

92. There was considerable dialogue between the evaluators as to whether the Ministry of Justice would be able to maintain the quality and quantity of training being delivered nationally to the twenty seven States now that the project had concluded. Additionally, did it have the resources, experience and capability within the Ministry not only to maintain its present level of delivery, but to continue with the on-going developmental work needed to update and add to its curriculum on a regular basis.
93. The consensus of opinion was that the evaluators had serious doubts as to whether the Ministry could deliver its existing training requirements let alone develop and deliver new ones. Mr. Marcelo Durante when interviewed was confident that all 600,000 public security officials could be trained in a three year continual cycle; the evaluators felt this was highly unlikely without a considerable, additional injection of human resources and financial support.
94. Mr. Durante also stated that at present they had sixty training centres and planned to increase this to two hundred in 2006, again it was felt that it would take additional

resources to achieve this. Mr. Durente stated that in the same year an extra 5,000 public security officials will be trained in Brazil.

95. The achievements made in improving the training of public security officials under this project are commendable and it has most definitely enhanced the skills and knowledge of the officers. However, unless this level of training is not only maintained but also continually revised and updated, public security officials will not be equipped to deal with the ever changing methods of criminality and threats to public safety.

4. LESSONS LEARNED AND BEST PRACTICES

4.1. Lessons

96. The design and structure of this program was in the opinion of the evaluator's comprehensive in content and clearly documented its purpose. There were a number of issues that arose during the course of the terminal evaluation that are worthy of mention and may assist in the application and execution of future projects.
97. When comparing this program with project AD/BRA/98/D31 there are a number of similarities in both the purpose and methodology that was applied in executing their implementation. Both sought to modernise the training of law enforcement officers and public security officials by introducing pedagogical reform and new teaching methods and materials. Key to both projects was the introduction and use of new communication and technological equipment.
98. It is accepted that there was some degree of collaboration and shared resources, however the evaluators felt that both projects were so closely aligned that to implement them under one program would have been preferred option. The advantages in costs, resources and management are apparent and would also have streamlined the implementation process. However, the evaluators accept that due to institutional barriers this course of action was not possible which then resulted in the creation of two separate projects.
99. The evaluators considered this lesson should be borne in mind when proposing future UNODC international technical assistance projects worldwide. A holistic approach

should be taken, where projects are not viewed in isolation but as part of a programme of reform and improvement.

100. Another lesson learned from the same issue was that of line management. The overall supervision of both projects should in the view of the evaluators have been the responsibility of one Brazilian official, whereas in this case there were two separate managers. It is accepted that because the projects were the responsibility of different Ministry's then presumably this could not take place.
101. As previously mentioned in this report the project spanned some seven years presumably due in part to delays in the implementation procedures of the program. The evaluators felt that the lesson learned from this is that a more formal project management structure needs to be in place within the respective Brazilian Ministry (or indeed whichever Ministry is responsible for implementation). It was felt this was essential in order to ensure that projects such as these are managed effectively, professionally and within the timeframe allowed.
102. An important factor in implementing this or any other project is an effective marketing strategy whereby the clients, in this case the public security officials, are made aware of the new training program, its content and how to access it.
103. During the interviews with Mr. Durante and Mr. Gobbi the evaluators were shown brochures, information booklets and other literature concerning the National Curriculum and the training courses now available to public security officials of all ranks. The production of these documents was both of high quality and informative in its content.
104. However, whilst due regard is given to the difficulties in marketing this new training due to the size of Brazil and the fact that it is divided into twenty seven separate, autonomous States, the evaluators felt that a more concerted effort could have been made to inform junior officers working at "street level". This observation is made following a visit to local police stations in Brasilia by one of the evaluators where those officers spoken to had limited awareness of the program.
105. The lesson adduced is that for projects such as this where the intention is to implement a program nationally, then the project plan should include as an output,

awareness and a marketing strategy designed to reach and inform all of the programs intended recipients.

4.2. Best Practices

106. Whilst the evaluators as commented upon above felt that consideration should have been given to this and project AD/BRA/98/D31 being amalgamated, it is of note and good practice that those in charge of implementing the respective projects did wherever possible collaborate and share resources.
107. This was of particular importance in the installation and use of the new communication and technological equipment in both programs. By combining resources the evaluators believe that not only has this been cost effective but has ensured that the training now given is consistent and standardized throughout Brazil. Indeed, the evaluators felt that collaborating and sharing the resources of projects in the same thematic area is most certainly an example of best practice for future programs.
108. The aim of this project was to introduce a standardized National Curriculum for the training of public security officials in all twenty States and use distance learning as one medium for achieving this. The evaluators felt this was a challenging target which the program successfully achieved and was a clear example of good practice. The standardization and consistency of training achieved in this program is on occasions lacking from international technical assistance projects, resulting in diverse practices being undertaken which in turn are self defeating.
109. This program of national training is not as far as the evaluators could adduce either enshrined in legislation or made mandatory by any Brazilian government regulation. It is therefore the decision of each State as to whether they implement this program of training for public security officials. Whilst debatable, the evaluators felt that it had been good practice to offer funding to those States who wished to implement the model. In view of their autonomy this seemed to be the most sensible and effective method to achieve the projects aim.

110. The use of technology to deliver the training was also felt by the evaluators to be a good example of an effective method by which programs such as these can be developed and implemented in countries consisting of large geographical areas with or without autonomous governmental structures.
111. The 'distance learning' package is an effective medium for ensuring that training is delivered in a consistent fashion and with modern technology now readily available throughout most countries this should be viewed as an good example of how training can be communicated nationally.

4.3. Constraints

112. The evaluators considered this issue at some length and felt that the constraining factors in this project could be summarised as follows;
113. Duplication of Effort – As previously mentioned in this report the evaluators felt that this project was so closely aligned to AD/BRA/98/D31 that the most logical step to have taken in 1998 when they both commenced would have been to amalgamate the two under one program
114. By not doing so it has necessarily resulted in a duplication of efforts in the management, implementation and resourcing of the project. This the evaluators feel was a constraining factor in the project being implemented efficiently and by best utilising the resources available.
115. Also, whilst it is accepted there have been collaborative efforts made by both project leaders in the use of the communication and technological equipment, realistically the implementation of both projects may have progressed more quickly had this information technology structure been combined as one.
116. Project Management - This was most certainly a constraining factor to the effective and timely delivery of this project. Had there been in place a recognised project management structure, with a steering committee and working group to ensure that the implementation phase was progressing according to schedule, then it is reasonable to assume that it would not have taken seven years to complete the program.
117. One of the shortfalls of not having this structure in place is that there is a lack of coordination and accountability in the delivery of the program's outputs. Under this

structure milestones for each element of the project are agreed upon and set, making those responsible for delivering the results accountable.

118. Bureaucracy – Any project where there is a requirement to purchase equipment and use funding to buy either resources or materials necessitates those responsible for the implementation phase to have ready access to the monies and be authorised to make such expenditure as is required.
119. The process that currently exists does not allow for this to take place and as far as the evaluators could adduce there was no financial devolvement of responsibility to the individuals whose duty it was to implement the program. The National Director, who is responsible for National Executed Projects, is not permitted to sign any contractual agreements related to these issues. This lack of delegated responsibility from the Ministry of Justice must naturally have introduced a time delay into each and every phase of the implementation.
120. It is accepted that there are regulations in place, both UNODC and Brazilian government, that direct the procedure for dealing with the expenditure of funding under international technical assistance projects. However, whilst this is accepted it is only proper for the evaluators to highlight the fact that in their opinion it is a constraining factor to a project's timely implementation.
121. Line Management – This was mentioned earlier in the report that the evaluators felt that both this project and project AD/BRA/98/D31 were fundamentally about improving the quality and effectiveness of public security officials in Brazil. This was to be achieved in both projects by a fundamental modernization in the methods and techniques used to train them, including the introduction of new communication and technological equipment.
122. Project AD/BRA/98/D31 was primarily focused upon the training of the Federal Police whilst AD/BRA/98/D32 incorporated the training of all of Brazil's public security professionals. Each project was managed by a different individual which was not felt to be the most effective method of ensuring continuity in the implementation of either program.

123. It was the view of the evaluators that both projects should not only have been combined but have been the responsibility of one project manager and implementation team.

5. RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1. Issues resolved during the evaluation

124. During the interview with Mr. Durante and Mr. Gobbi the issue was raised regarding the effect that the change in Government in 2003 had upon the implementation of this project, as it was the understanding of the evaluators that this may have had an adverse bearing on international technical assistance projects in the country.

125. A contrary opinion was given by both gentlemen who believed that it had made a positive impact on the project as it was reviewed and moved forward under an amended plan.

126. The evaluators raised the point with Mr. Durante that the web page on the National Curriculum was only available in Portuguese and therefore maximum exposure was not being given to the program. He accepted this but also confirmed that they would be producing a version in both Spanish and English.

127. The training programme is now available through the distance learning package nationally for all public security officials to access, the evaluators raised the question of whether the Ministry of Justice was able to calculate how many of the 600,000 officials had been trained. It was explained that the data from the computer system supplies this management information so they are able to accurately state how many of the officers have been trained at any given time.

128. A question was raised by the evaluators regarding the security and selection of information technology companies used to install the equipment on the project. It was explained that Brazilian regulations had been complied with and the companies used are experienced in handling sensitive data.

5.2. Actions/decisions recommended

129. a) The project document whilst comprehensive in its content should have contained milestones documenting the timescale for delivery of each component part of the program. Whilst no doubt there was such a plan in existence the evaluators were not able to locate or view it. The inclusion of this in a project plan is a fundamental element of the planning and implementation process.
130. b) There was not in evidence throughout the life of the program a recognised project management structure to implement it effectively and within the expected timeframe. It would have been difficult due to the seven year period that the project lasted to have expected there to have been continuity in the management team, however, that should not have prevented its formation or its function from being effective.
131. c) The evaluators were afforded the opportunity of viewing a number of annual and intermediate reports on the progress of the project. These reports were too brief and did not contain the detail needed in order to make an accurate assessment of progress against the objectives. They lacked detailed information on budgetary issues and activities carried out in the period under report. A recommendation is that UNODC review the format and content of these reports and consider introducing a more detailed annual reporting process for international technical assistance projects.
132. d) The evaluators were impressed with the distance learning technique employed on this project as a method of training in a country that is geographically large and autonomous in its political structure. It may be a consideration for UNODC to use this as an example of an effective training medium to other field offices operating in similar environments.
133. e) As with project AD/BRA/98/D32 this program achieved standardization in training for law enforcement officials in all twenty seven of Brazil's States that was not previously in place. The evaluators felt that not only was this a significant achievement but one that was worthy of replicating in other UNODC training projects both in Brazil and other countries. The recommendation would be, to

consider where relevant ensuring that the technique, training materials and teaching is consistently delivered both in content and method.

134. f) The ultimate objective of most law enforcement projects is to improve the quality of service being delivered to the public and to enhance their feeling of safety and security through trust and confidence in the police. Unfortunately the issue that is usually overlooked at the conclusion of most improvement programmes is the public's opinion. Has the improved, modernized training of public security officials made a difference to the way in which the Brazilian public perceive the effectiveness or otherwise of its police service? There needs to be built into projects such as these an evaluation process by the host nation to assess the public's view of its effectiveness. This is particularly relevant in Brazil where over the past seven years four projects, AD/BRA/98/D31-34 have been implemented. All four were designed and intended to modernise and improve policing in the country, the question should be asked of the public as to whether they feel the situation has improved.
135. g) Comment has already been made in this report regarding the similarity of this and project AD/BRA/98/D31. Both sought to achieve improvements in the way in which public security officials are trained and in the view of the evaluators should have been implemented as one project. A future recommendation would be to assess proposed projects from the same thematic area holistically and where relevant to consider combining them as one entity.

6. OVERALL CONCLUSIONS

136. The effective training of public security officials in Brazil is essential in order for an environment to exist where the public have confidence in their law enforcement officers to deliver an impartial, professional service where integrity is paramount. The principle objective of this project was to develop and implement a modern police training programme, including teaching materials to be introduced at all levels, and to strengthen international cooperation through exchange programmes with neighbouring South American countries. The project aimed to allow the

- institutional capacity for a base nucleus of knowledge which could strengthen the impact of the entire system of policing in Brazil.
137. This was to be achieved by integrating all of Brazil's security professionals through the medium of a "distance learning" network, including the use of new communication and technological equipment to implement standardized knowledge and policing techniques in all of Brazil's twenty seven States.
 138. In addition to this the development of a National Curriculum and the creation of training materials was to be an important, key achievement of the project, allowing for modern pedagogic and didactic methods to be employed and progressively expanded throughout all of the police training institutes in Brazil.
 139. The evaluators when forming their conclusions had regard for and took account of the constitutional autonomy of the different States, and accepted that a successful implementation of the program could only be achieved by a participatory, consensual approach being adopted.
 140. The duration of the project was seven years and whilst it is accepted that during this period there was a change in the Brazilian government (2003) which contributed to the delay in the program being fully implemented, the evaluators felt that more training courses and materials could have been developed and delivered in this timeframe. At the time the evaluation was carried out there were a total of four training courses available nationally. There is a desire to develop more specialist courses in the future in addition to training all 600,000 public security officials in a 'rolling' three year cycle. This the evaluators felt would be extremely difficult to achieve without additional resources being made available.
 141. However, the project has been successfully implemented and a National Curriculum is now in place for the training of public security officials. Through the use of technology this and the training courses that have been developed are available to officers in all of Brazil's twenty seven States. This in itself is a considerable achievement given the geographical and political hurdles that required overcoming in order for this to take place. The methods of teaching now used incorporate the use of technology and practical training delivered by experienced personnel. This is

- essential for understanding how the academic part of training is intrinsically linked to the practical everyday situations that public security officials will be faced with.
142. The benefits of standardizing the training throughout the country are evident and there now exists a situation where public security officials in all States receive identical information and teaching methods which has produced a uniformity which was not in existence prior to this project being implemented.
 143. This project should be viewed in conjunction with AD/BRA/98/D31 “Institutional Strengthening of the National Police Academy” as the evaluators felt that it was fundamentally trying to achieve the same end; the modernisation of training for law enforcement officials. It is accepted that AD/BRA/98/D31 was focussed primarily on the Federal Police, whereas AD/BRA/98/D32 involved all public security officials, however, when looking at the methods, techniques and materials used to implement both projects it was the view of the evaluators that they could have been incorporated into one program.
 144. Comment has already been made in this report concerning the lack of a formal management structure within the Ministry of Justice for developing and implementing the program within a given timeframe and financial constraint. Had this mechanism been in place the evaluators believe that the project would have been managed more efficiently and with greater regard for the timeliness of delivery required.
 145. The expenditure for this project was US \$2.382.473 out of a total budget of US \$2.725.000; these financial details were made readily available to the evaluators by the Ministry Of Justice. Whilst there was clearly an under spend of some US \$342.527 there was clear evidence that the funding had been put to good and effective use throughout the program, both in the acquisition of essential technological equipment and the creation and development of the much needed new training materials.
 146. The evaluators concluded that the implementation of this project and of project AD/BRA/98/D31 is the first step and the foundation of what should be a continuing programme by the Brazilian government to equip its law enforcement officers to meet the challenges and demands of future policing and public security. Through

the introduction of new, modernised training methods and materials, delivered in a consistent, standardized manner they have now completed this most important first stage.

147. The investment made in improving the quality of public security officials in Brazil has been considerable both in financial terms and in the devotion of resources required to complete the implementation phase of the project. The evaluators believe that whilst this program has been successfully implemented its benefit will only be truly realised by maintaining and further developing the training that has already been introduced.
148. The key to raising the efficiency and effectiveness of Brazilian public security officials is to build upon the training methods and models already in place under this and project AD/BRA/98/D31. To do so will require a commitment from the government to continuously review and update the teaching methods and topics delivered to the officers, which is an essential element of ensuring that they are competent to deal with both basic and sophisticated law enforcement situations.

Annex 1

Project Title: Training for Public Security Proposals

Project Number: D32

Public security has constantly deteriorated in Brazil over recent years with steadily increasing crime rates registered by the Ministry of Justice. In 1995, Brazil had 46,385 homicides, 393,214 violent crimes, and 5,706 cases related to drug trafficking registered by a police force totaling 471,109 police¹. While state governments are unlikely to increase significantly the number of policemen in the near future, one of the objectives of this project is to increase the capacity and effectiveness of the existing police forces through better training and education.

Within its political-administrative structure based on federal states, Brazil has given plenis potestis to State Governments over the two existing state police forces and thus to the development of basic police academy curriculum and training programmes used in training the state police. However, the states recognize the need for standardized approaches, as the pattern of urbanization coincides with increased crime rates, the existence of progressively more sophisticated crime organizations, and increasing problems of drug abuse and trafficking throughout the entire country, without exception.

These problems, and others emerging such as human right issues and greater incidence and severity of criminal activity throughout, make it necessary to establish common minimum

¹ Ministry of Justice, "Programa de Apoio a Modernizacao, DEASP, DPF. Brazil, 1997.

training standards for all state police forces, particularly in the area of drug control. In view of this, the Government has requested UNDCP cooperation in support of activities for standardization and modernization of police training countrywide.

This project, is part of a set of measures under development by the Brazilian Government to combat rising crime and drug trafficking, and forms a vital component in a “package” of project of law enforcement, including the following other projects::

“Institutional Strengthening of the National Police Academy” (AD/BRA/98/D31) ;

“Integrated National System for Information on Justice and Public Security– InfoSeg”;
(AD/BRA/98/D34),

“Strengthening of Chemical Precursor Control ” (AD/BRA/98/D33)

Together with the first two projects as listed above, this project forms an essential part of the “Federal Executive Power Modernization Programme”, an agreement concluded between the Brazilian Government through the Administration and State Reform Ministry (MARE) and the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB). Through MARE the Government provides funds to this project, with additional complementary assistance from UNDCP.

Annex 2

Organisations and places visited and persons met

Organizations

1. Ministry of Justice, Brasilia
2. Department for Public Security Issues, Brasilia
3. National Police Academy, Brasilia
4. Ministry of Public Security, Brasilia
5. UNODC Field Office, Brasilia
6. Federal Police, Brasilia
7. Civil Police, Brasilia
8. Federal Police, Belo Horizonte
9. Federal Police, Sao Paulo

Persons

1. Marcelo Ottoni Durante, Project Coordinator, Ministry of Justice
2. Paulo Gobbi, Projects Director, Ministry of Justice
3. Ms. Juliana, Programme Manager, Ministry of Justice
4. Dr. Viviane da Rosa, Director of National Police Academy
5. Senior management and training staff at the National Police Academy
6. Reiner Pungs, Program Coordinator, UNODC Field Office, Brasilia
7. Luis Carlos da Silva Ramos, Delegado Federal Police
8. Julio Danilo Souza Ferreira, Delegado Federal Police
9. Rodrigo Geraldo Aguiar, Delegado Federal Police
10. Local officers, Civil Police Brasilia
11. Superintendent of Federal Police and staff, Belo Horizonte
12. Superintendent of Federal Police and staff, Sao Paulo

Annex 3

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime

Project evaluation Summary assessment questionnaire

This questionnaire is to be filled out by the evaluator or evaluation team and to be submitted to backstopping office. A copy should be provided to the Senior Evaluation Officer, Division for Operations and Analysis. A separate questionnaire should be filled out for each project encompassed by the evaluation. The information provided must be fully congruent with the contents of the evaluation report.

The purpose of the questionnaire is to provide information for UNODC's evaluation database. The information will be used to establish evaluation profiles which should give a quick and correct overview of the evaluation of individual projects and programmes. It will also be used for the purpose of analyzing results across project evaluations to obtain a systematic picture of the overall performance of the Programme.

I. NUMBER AND TITLE OF PROJECT:

AD/.BRA/98/D31 "Institutional Strengthening of the National Police Academy"

II. SUMMARY ASSESSMENT:

1. Please provide an assessment for all categories listed (including categories constituting headings) by ticking one of the boxes ranging from 0 to 5. The ratings from 0 to 5 are based on the following standard favor-to-disfavor scale:

- 5 - Outstanding, highly appropriate, much more than planned/expected, certain to materialize
- 4 - Very good, very appropriate, more than planned/expected, highly likely to materialize
- 3 - Good, appropriate, as planned/expected, likely to materialize
- 2 - Fair, less appropriate, less than planned/expected, less likely to materialize
- 1 - Unsatisfactory, not appropriate, far below plans/expectations, unlikely to materialize

0 - Cannot determine, not applicable

2. If a category has been significant (as a cause or effect) in relation to the overall quality and/or performance of the project please tick the “S” column (if significant) or the “H” column (if highly significant).

| | H | S | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| OVERALL QUALITY AND PERFORMANCE OF PROJECT: | | | | | | X | | |
| I. PROJECT CONCEPT AND DESIGN: | | | | | | | | |
| 1. Project document (overall clarity, logic and coherence). | | | | | | X | | |
| 2. Identification/analysis of problem addressed by project: | | | | | | X | | |
| 3. Project strategy (overall assessment): | | | | | | X | | |
| 4. Drug control objective (s) (Appropriateness, obtainability): | | | | | X | | | |
| 5. Immediate objective(s) (appropriateness, Obtainability): | | | | | | X | | |
| 6. Achievement indicators: | | | | | | | | |
| 7. Base-line study/arrangements for base-line study: | | | X | | | | | |
| 8. Outputs (compared to cost effective alternatives): | | | | | | X | | |
| 9. Activities (compare to cost effective alternatives): | | | | | | X | | |
| 10. Inputs (compared to cost effective alternatives): | | | | | | X | | |
| 11. Executing modality and managerial arrangements: | | | | | | X | | |
| 12. Identification and assessment of risks | | | | | | X | | |
| 13. Prior obligations and prerequisites: | | | | | | X | | |
| 14. Workplan/planned project duration: | | | | | | X | | |
| 15. Budget: | | | | | | X | | |

3

| | H | S | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| II. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION: | | | | | | | | |
| 1. Quality and timeliness of UNODC inputs: | | | | | | | X | |
| 2. Quality and timeliness of Government inputs: | | | | | X | | | |
| 3. Quality and timeliness of inputs by third parties: | | | X | | | | | |
| 4. Equipment: *inappropriate in the sense of being premature and generous | | | X | | | | | |
| 5. Advisory/training services: | | | | | | X | | |
| 6. Project personnel: | | | | | | X | | |
| 7. Sub-contracting: | | | X | | | | | |
| 8. Management of project: | | | | | X | | | |
| 9. Project workplans: | | | | | | X | | |
| 10. Implementation of activities: | | | | | | X | | |
| 11. Monitoring and backstopping by UNODC HQ: | | | | | | X | | |
| 12. Monitoring and backstopping by UNODC field Office: | | | | | | X | | |
| 13. Monitoring and backstopping by Executing Agency: | | | | | X | | | |
| 14. Monitoring and backstopping by Government: | | | | | X | | | |
| 15. Government fulfilment of prerequisites: | | | | | | X | | |
| III. PROJECT RESULTS: | | | | | | | | |
| 1. Timeliness of produced outputs; | | | | | X | | | |
| 2. Quantity of produced outputs: | | | | | | X | | |
| 3. Quality of produced outputs: | | | | | | X | | |
| 4. Outcomes: achievement/likely achievement of immediate objective(s): | | | | | | X | | |
| 5. Drug control impact achieved: | | | | | X | | | |

4

| | H | S | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
|--|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 6. Drug control impact to be expected | | | | | | X | | |
| 7. Likely sustainability of project results: | | | | | X | | | |

3. If external factors had an impact on project performance please tick the appropriate boxes: external factors impeded: / promoted: project performance. The effect on project performance of this influence was significant: / highly significant: . Please provide a short description of the nature of the external factor(s):

The Brazilian Government changed in 2003, its predecessors having been in power for some eighty years. When interviewed the project team from the Ministry of Justice were asked by the evaluators if this factor had impacted on the project and if so to what extent. The team stated it had a positive effect because the project was reviewed and the implementation continued afterwards. However, the evaluators believe that this process in fact delayed the implementation of the project and was not in effect advantageous to either the development or introduction of the program.

4. Did the evaluation recommend to:

- a) abandon the project
- b) continue/extend the project without modifications
- c) continue/extend the project with minor modifications
- d) continue/extend the project with some modifications
- e) continue/extend the project with extensive modification
- f) terminate the projects, as planned

(please tick the relevant category).

5. If a modification of the project was recommended did the evaluation recommend a revision of: the drug control objective(s): _____, the immediate objective(s): _____, the outputs: _____, the activities: _____ or the inputs: _____. Please tick as appropriate.

It is recommended that the project be redesigned into a new project.

6. If the evaluation recommended that the project or significant elements of it be replicate please tick as appropriate: yes: / no:

Silvia E. Levissianos
 Evaluation Assistant
 Division for Operations and Analysis
 P.O. Box 500
 A-1400 Vienna, Austria
 Tel. + 43 1 26060 4262
 Fax. + 43 1 26060 5896
silvia.levissianos@UNODC.org