

Date: February 2006

TERMINAL EVALUATION REPORT

Project Number AD/BRA/98/D31
Institutional Strengthening of the National Police Academy

Brazil

Report of the Evaluation Team

Mr. Tito Caetano Correa
Mr. Jonas Ribeiro da Silva
Mr. John Dillon

UNITED NATIONS OFFICE ON DRUGS AND CRIME

Vienna

CONTENTS

	<u>Paragraphes</u>	<u>Page</u>
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY		
I. INTRODUCTION		
1.1. Background and Context	1	1
1.2. Purpose and Objective of the Evaluation	14	3
1.3. Executing Modality / Management Arrangements	16	3
1.4. Scope of the Evaluation	19	3
1.5. Evaluation Methodology	20	4
2. ANALYSIS AND MAJOR FINDINGS	21	4
2.1. Overall performance assessment	46	8
2.2. Attainment of Objectives	51	9
2.3. Achievement of Project Results and outputs	58	11
2.4. Implementation	78	13
2.5. Institutional and Management Arrangements	85	15
3. OUTCOMES, IMPACTS and SUSTAINABILITY	89	15
3.1. Outcomes	89	15
3.2. Impact	94	16
3.3. Sustainability	97	17
4. LESSONS LEARNED AND BEST PRACTICES	101	17
4.1. Lessons Learned	101	17
4.2. Best Practices	108	18
4.3. Constraints	114	19

5. RECOMMENDATIONS	119	20
5.1. Issues resolved during evaluation	119	20
5.2. Actions/decisions recommended	124	21
6. OVERALL CONCLUSIONS	133	22

Annexes

1. Terms of reference	25
2. Organizations and places visited and persons met	26
3. Summary assessment questionnaire	27

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. Summary table of findings, supporting evidence and recommendations

<i>Findings: identified problems/issues</i>	<i>Supporting evidence/examples</i>	<i>Recommendations</i>
1. Project Management – no formal, recognized structure in place	No qualified project manager, no structure with Steering Committee, Working Group etc. In place in the Federal Police	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Participating Institutions to formulate project management structure 2. Suitably qualified Project Manager appointed 3. Recognised project delivery programme, including milestones etc 4. Above to be incorporated in project document
2. Financial Management – insufficient, up to date information available	Federal Police were unable to produce budget information of project expenditure; including spend to date, balance and any over or underspend	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Accurate, timely financial reporting to be made by all participating institutions 2. Above to be incorporated in project document
3. Communication- lack of effective communication between Federal Police Headquarters and Academy	Lack of information on the project's progress supplied to the Academy, due to no formal meeting structure being in place with the project team at headquarters	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Project meeting structure to be formalised 2. Above to be incorporated in project document
4. Bureaucracy – Procedures for acquiring equipment and materials overly complicated	There were delays in acquiring equipment due to bureaucratic processes and a lack of understanding by the Federal Police of the procedures to be followed	1. Review procedures for acquisition of equipment under international technical assistance projects
5. Devolvement of responsibility – no devolvement to the Academy's Director which slowed progress of project	The Director had no devolved responsibility or direct access to the funding which is contrary to modern management practice. This naturally hampers progress.	1. Consider devolving appropriate level of responsibility to junior managers
6. Standardization and consistency – achieved throughout Brazil's 27 States	All 27 States in Brazil are receiving consistent training.	1. Project plans to be formulated to ensure standardization and consistency of delivery
7. Shared resources – good use made of joint working practices	Resources shared with project D32 which was cost effective	1. Examine other projects to identify opportunities for sharing resources
8. Annual project reports – too brief and contained insufficient detail of progress and issues arising	Examination of annual reports revealed a lack of required information	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Review current process 2. Consider introducing a more detailed annual review

2. a) Description of project and objectives

The National Police Academy belongs to the Federal Police Department, which is subordinated to the Ministry of Justice for Brazil. Its installations and training programmes are judged to be among the best available in Latin America.

A shortage of funding over the last decade has prevented the much needed updating of the Academy's programmatic content, leading to an accumulated need to replace training means and methodology and to update its curricula.

As the mandate of the institution provides for continuous and comprehensive training for all Federal Police personnel, in addition to the provision of specialized training courses for state police forces, other governmental agencies and police from neighbouring countries, the Academy represents the focal point for the training of law enforcement agents nationally.

At present the Federal Police Department has approximately 6,000 police officers and 1,900 administrative employees supporting the operational activities. The Department is responsible for the investigation of a wide range of federal crimes, which include those related to the production and trafficking of illicit drugs. Due to the ever increasing sophistication and resourcefulness of organised crime groups, there is a requirement to select, prepare and train federal agents carefully and afford to them the most modern and efficient training techniques available.

In order to enhance the institutional capacity of the National Police Academy as a centre of excellence in public security in the country, the Brazilian government decided to initiate and install a process of restructuring the Academy within a global program of refining the State structure by developing a specific international cooperation project towards this end. The United Office on Drugs and Crime [UNODC] was requested to give its assistance to the project in order to guarantee the necessary coordination with other projects of a similar nature, as well as the involvement of international agencies that have met with successful experiences in the area of this type of project.

The strategy of project D31 was implemented by the Ministry of Justice, Federal Police Department, with support from Government funds [National Treasury and an Inter-American Development Bank loan], and from UNDCP.

In technical terms the strategy of the project had one prime aim, to ensure quality policing in Brazil through the institutional strengthening of the National Police Academy. This was to be done through achieving a number of objectives. Firstly, by the introduction of pedagogical reform in the methods of teaching law enforcement officers with a new up to date training curriculum to equip the police to deal with sophisticated levels of criminality. This included newly developed and tailored learning materials together with training exchanges at both national and international level.

Secondly, by integrating the work of the National Academy with that of the State Academies responsible for training civil and military police forces. This was to be achieved through the implementation of distance learning and would therefore ensure standardization and consistency in the training of public security officers throughout Brazil's twenty seven States.

Lastly, by the introduction of new communication and information technology to the Academy to meet the requirements of modern police training techniques.

b) Major findings

Project Management – There was not a formal, effective project management structure in place throughout the duration of the program, this led to a lack of clarity in the decision making process between those responsible within the Federal Police Headquarters for its implementation and the senior managers at the Academy.

Financial Management – The implementing institution should have considered maintaining a more concise, accurate and timely record of the project's expenditure. The program spanned several years and it was therefore essential to have in place a system for capturing and recording financial data on a regular basis. This assists the decision making process for managers of the project and ensures accountability.

Communication – One of the resultant factors of a formal project management structure not being in place was a lack of effective internal communication within the implementing institution. This was evident by the different interpretation of some aspects of the project made by those at the Academy and the project team at the Federal Police headquarters.

Procedural Issues – The process for the requisition and subsequent acquiring of communication, technological and other equipment for the project was unnecessarily burdensome and delayed the implementation of some parts of the program. Part of this was

due to a lack of understanding on the part of the implementing agency of some of the procedural issues that had to be followed. In addition, there was no devolvement of responsibility to the Academy's Director which also did not assist this process.

Standardization and Consistency – This was a major achievement by the Academy. Through the implementation of this project law enforcement training in Brazil now has standard training products consistent throughout all twenty seven States. The quality of training through these products aided by the use of new communication and information technology equipment has produced standardization not previously present. The importance of achieving this consistency cannot be over emphasised, without it officers are inadequately prepared to deal with both basic policing situations and the more sophisticated enquiries that occur.

Project Strategy – The goal of introducing pedagogical reform to the methodology of training public security officials in Brazil has been successfully achieved. The completed program of modernization of both communication and information technology equipment at the Academy has led to a much needed enhancement in their ability to deliver modern training products to all parts of the country.

They now offer a range of forty courses from basic training to specialised investigation such as drug trafficking and homicide, using modern training methods and materials.

c) Lessons learned and best practices

The non existence of a formal project management structure within the implementing agency was a significant factor in the delays that occurred in implementing the program. This was compounded by the lack of understanding of regulations applicable to international technical assistance programs.

An essential ingredient of implementing any project is the ability to access accurate, up to date financial information on the position of the program's budget at all times.

This was lacking and there was insufficient information readily available on the project's financial position to enable effective decision making to take place.

A valuable lesson gained from this project is the importance of actively involving the senior practitioners ultimately responsible for implementing the project. They need a sufficient level of responsibility throughout the project to influence the implementation process.

The involvement of the participating institutions at the planning stages of this project has been an essential ingredient in ensuring continuity and consistency of approach throughout the duration of the program.

The standardisation achieved in this project is an example of good practice for international technical assistance programs, as is the shared use of resources with a corresponding project.

The Academy has ensured credibility in its reputation for delivering effective training by utilising the services of experienced operational officers as instructors. This is seen as good practice for establishing the link between academic training and practical application.

d) Recommendations and Conclusions

Recommendations – 1) Participating institutions to international technical assistance programmes must appoint a suitably qualified project manager and have in place the structure to effectively manage the project. This should include a formal meeting structure, clear lines of communication and a recognised chain of command.

2) Accurate financial management data should be kept by participating institutions and presented in a timely manner.

3) A review of existing procedures and processes within UNODC policy for the acquisition of equipment in international technical assistance projects.

4) A review of the criteria and content required for completion of annual project reports.

Conclusions – The National Academy has through the implementation of this project become the centre of excellence for law enforcement training in Brazil. It has achieved pedagogical reform in its teaching methods, this coupled with new communication and information technological equipment has enabled the Academy to provide standardized, consistent training in all twenty seven States in Brazil.

The Academy now offers a total of forty training courses in both basic and specialist policing topics, and through enhanced international training cooperation with its Latin American counterparts has strengthened the country's ability to combat cross border criminality, in particular the trafficking of illicit drugs.

This project has succeeded in modernizing and improving the training of public security officials in Brazil. This has improved the quality of policing being delivered and enhanced

the reputation of the Federal Police as a law enforcement agency trained and equipped to deal with sophisticated levels of criminal activity.

This project has transformed the way in which law enforcement officers in Brazil are trained and the outcome is a model example of an effective international technical assistance program.

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Background and Context

1. The National Police Academy [Academia Nacional De Policia] belongs to the Federal Police Department, which is subordinated to the Ministry of Justice for Brazil. It was founded in 1979 and is based in the country's capital Brasilia. Its training programmes are judged to be among the best available in Latin America.
2. A shortage of funding over the last decade has prevented the much needed updating of the Academy's programmatic content, leading to an accumulated need to replace training means and methodology and to update its curricula.
3. As the mandate of the institution provides for continuous and comprehensive training for all Federal Police personnel, in addition to the provision of specialized training courses for state police forces, other governmental agencies and police from neighbouring countries, the Academy represents the focal point for the training of law enforcement agents nationally.
4. At present the Federal Police Department has approximately 6,000 police officers and 1,900 administrative employees supporting the operational activities. The Department is responsible for the investigation of a wide range of federal crimes, which include those related to the production and trafficking of illicit drugs. Due to the ever increasing sophistication and resourcefulness of organised crime groups, there is a requirement to select, prepare and train federal agents carefully and afford to them the most modern and efficient training techniques available.
5. In order to enhance the institutional capacity of the National Police Academy as a centre of excellence in public security in the country, the Brazilian government decided to initiate and install a process of restructuring the Academy within a global program by developing a specific international cooperation project towards this end.
6. The United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime [UNODC] was requested to give its assistance to the project in order to guarantee the necessary coordination with projects of a similar nature, as well as the involvement of international agencies that have met with successful experiences in this type of project.

7. The initial execution of the project was supported in partnership with the Advanced School of Financial Administration which is experienced in modernization programs for the Federal Executive. In 2002 the Administration undertook a comprehensive institutional assessment of the Academy and presented proposals to re-engineer the institution, including its organizational and administrative structure, its pedagogical practices, aimed at modernizing the work developed and delivered by the institution making it more efficacious.
8. The strategy of project D31 was implemented by the Ministry of Justice, Federal Police Department, with support from Government funds [National Treasury and an Inter-American Development Bank loan], and from UNDCP.
9. In technical terms the strategy of the project had one basic goal, to introduce pedagogical reform methods to the Academy. These updated teaching concepts, coupled with the modernisation of both communication and information technology would allow the development of tailored learning materials to be introduced thereby ultimately improving the quality of policing in Brazil.
10. It was the view of the evaluators that the project strategy was concise and accurate in its description of the achievements sought and of the holistic aims linked to Projects D32, D33, and D34. i.e. an overall improvement and modernization of policing being delivered in Brazil. This is an important factor, as effective training is key to achieving this end.
11. The D31 project document was compiled in a logical, sequential manner with a well constructed Control Objective accurately detailing its purpose. The expected results from the Control objective were also listed as were the five expected Outputs together with their Related Activities. It was noted in the Project Plan that at some stage during the life of the project a review had taken place and the Control Objective and the Results section of the document had been revised and the reworded, where applicable. Whilst the evaluators placed importance on an on-going review process taking place, the manner in which it was documented was somewhat lacking in clarity.
12. It was also felt that the Project Plan should have contained a section detailing the expected milestones for delivery of each part of the project. Whilst it is accepted that there were such expectations placed upon the participating institutions the details were not included in the project document viewed by the evaluators.

13. Overall the Project Plan contained the relevant sections expected, including the obligations placed upon each party to the project and the financial arrangements, including details of the total funding. A detailed structure of the persons responsible for implementation from each agency would have been useful, but it is accepted that at the time of compilation these details may not have been known. It is also accepted that due to the lifespan of this project [1998-2005] this information could not remain consistent.

1.2. Purpose and Objective of the Evaluation

14. Project D31 has concluded and the purpose of this final evaluation is to identify lessons learnt in order to draw conclusions for the basis to institute improvements for future and other follow up activities that can be accomplished by measuring achievements, outcomes and impacts, both positive and negative of the project. The objective of the evaluation is to examine the mandate, strategy, objectives, relevance, effectiveness, results, impact, sustainability and added value of UNODC's actions.

1.3. Executing Modality/Management Arrangements

16. The Ministry of Planning, Budget and Management are the executing agency for this National Executing project. The Ministry of Justice through the Federal Police Department were responsible for the execution and management of the project.
17. UNODC provided technical assistance and collaborated where required with other federal and state level agencies to ensure smooth implementation and the widest impact of project activities. The UNODC office in Brazil provided institutional support to the project.
18. The project was the overall management responsibility of DR. Alciomar Goersch, Director Federal Police Department. It was felt that whilst appropriate that an officer of his seniority was appointed to this position the evaluators felt that his department did not possess the required expertise to manage a project of this type. That said, the project was successfully implemented despite there being a number of shortfalls in the process by which this was achieved.

1.4. Scope of the Evaluation

19. The timeframe established to cover in the Evaluation is from September 1998 to September 2005. The Evaluation will analyze: a) The project concept and design; b)

project implementation; c) outputs, outcomes and impact of the project. It will also ensure that lessons learnt from the project will be recorded and recommendations for the future and other follow-up activities will be made as appropriate.

1.5 Methodology

20. The evaluation team adopted a specific methodology for this final project evaluation, consisting of a detailed review of major documents attributed to the project, including annual, monitoring and budget reports. Personal interviews were conducted with all relevant parties to the project, including main stakeholders and beneficiaries. A site visit was also made to the National Police Academy which included a detailed presentation on the project from the Academy's Director, Dr. Viviane da Rosa, and key members of her staff, followed by an inspection of the Academy. Practical demonstrations of the new teaching methods and the use of the new information technology to assist in this process were also demonstrated. A field visit was made to a Police Station in Brasilia to assess the impact of this project.

2. ANALYSIS AND MAJOR FINDINGS

21. The success of this project was key to improving the quality of policing and public security, and arguably underpins all other projects, both now and in the future which are dedicated to improving the safety and security of Brazilian society. The effective training of Brazilian security officials is paramount in the country's efforts to combat the ever increasing rise in crime and the continual instances of violence that occur.
22. Whilst the examination of the relevant reports was of assistance to the evaluators the field visit to the National Academy afforded first hand experience of the achievements made under this project.
23. Analysis of the data coupled with information obtained through the examination of training literature and interviews with the relevant individuals led the evaluators to conclude the following.
24. Project Strategy – The goal of introducing pedagogical reform to the methodology of training public security officials has clearly and successfully been achieved. There was in evidence a completed program of modernisation of both communication and information technology equipment which the evaluators were satisfied has led to a much needed enhancement of the Academy's ability to deliver modern training products to all areas of

the public security sector. The equipment provided by the project was of a high standard and offered value for money. They had introduced up to date methods such as video conferencing and web based learning packages, which in view of the geographical size of Brazil was essential in reaching some of the outlying areas. The Academy's classrooms, library and indeed other facilities had been modernized through the project, to such an extent that it at least mirrored that of European standards of police training. There were tailored learning materials developed and methods of delivery were varied dependent on the type of course, whether it was initial training or a more specialized course such as Homicide, Trafficking in Human Beings or the Trafficking in Illicit Drugs. The Academy offered a total of forty training courses and they achieved an international exchange of training between a number of South American, primarily Portuguese speaking nations.

25. Financial Issues – The budget for the project was set at US\$5,875.000 [five million, eight hundred and twenty five thousand dollars], in view of such a substantial sum of money the evaluators would have expected to see a detailed breakdown from the Federal Police of how the money was spent, how much of it was spent and if there was a residue, then how much was under spent.
26. This was not the case and when requested to provide what the evaluators considered to be a basic breakdown of the project's expenditure, the senior officer responsible for the management and coordination of the project at the Federal Police Headquarters, Brasilia was unable to provide any details in this regard. UNODC Brazil did provide these details and the total expenditures was US \$2.621.405.
27. This was a cause for concern and raised an important issue as to their ability to manage such a large project. It should be stated at this point that the UNDCP's contribution of 5% [US \$550,000] was allocated and used.
28. A point worthy of note is that the Academy's Director stated that whilst the curricula and the training materials had been developed and implemented, they had not received of all of the equipment that was required under the project.
29. Project Management – A common theme throughout this and the other linked projects evaluated [D32, D33 and D34], was a lack of a generally recognised project management structure and procedure.
30. There was no evidence found, and indeed a lack of clarity, of a clear chain of command in the management of the project by the Federal Police, which would normally include such

things as a Steering Committee, Working Group etc and a properly formalised meeting structure to report on progress, budget expenditure, any exceptional reporting to include delays to the project or timescales for achieving objectives not being met. It is difficult to assess progress over a period of some seven years [1998-2005] without this structure being in place. It is accepted that due to the Country's legislative requirements introduced in 2001, that it is forbidden to hire a project manager for International Technical Assistance projects where Brazilian money is being used. However, this should not have prevented a recognised system of project management being implemented. It was also apparent that there should have been a much greater involvement in the way in which the project was run from the practitioners at the Academy, albeit at a senior level.

31. Use of Resources – This project is interlinked with project D32 “Training for Public Security Professionals” and it was felt by the evaluators to have been a good use of resources that the Academy's Director had ensured that wherever possible combined efforts were made to develop and produce learning materials thereby utilising resources to best effect. This was also evident by one of the satellite distance learning stations under D32 being installed at the Academy. An example of this effective combining of resources is the Distance Learning training package provided to all twenty seven states by the Academy. The technology suites used for this training are shared by both projects thereby greatly reducing costs and the human resources required to run and manage the units.
32. Standardisation and Consistency – One of the most important achievements made by this project which has undoubtedly impacted on the quality of policing in Brazil and ultimately the level of service provided by the public security sector of the administration, is the standardization and consistency of training throughout the country.
33. Brazil has twenty seven states who in the main act with autonomy, prior to this project being implemented the training of police officers, whether it is Federal, State, Military or Civil was carried out in isolation of each agency and without cohesion. This ultimately led to a police service which was unable to deliver effective law enforcement and a primary factor in this was their inability to work as a national entity and the manner and the way in which they discharged their duties differed from State to State, and from agency to agency.
34. Through the implementation of this project law enforcement training in Brazil now has standard training products consistent throughout the country. The quality of training

delivered through these products aided by the use of the new communication and information technology has led to a quality of training for the police which was not present prior to project D31 being implemented.

35. The importance of standardisation and consistency in the training of law enforcement officials cannot be over emphasised, without this being in place it results in officers being inadequately prepared to deal with both basic everyday issues that arise, and also the more sophisticated enquiry that requires inter-state cooperation or the use of more advanced technology and techniques in the investigation of organised crime groups.
36. All initial training of Federal police officers is carried at the National Academy of Brazil for a period of four months which initiates that consistency from the outset of their service in the public security sector.
37. The evaluators were given a detailed account of this training and the modules and products contained within it. Prior to this project both the quality and the content of this training fell short of the requirements of modern law enforcement. During this training heavy emphasis is placed upon physical fitness, self defence and ability in the use of firearms. Unfortunately due to the levels of violence and gun related crime in some of Brazil's major cities this is an essential element of their training. Again standardization in this area has been achieved and equipment which has allowed this to take place was acquired through the project's funding.
38. Another area that the evaluators felt worthy of note is the standardization of training in Human Rights. It is a matter of record and indeed was commented upon by the Director of the Academy, that Brazilian police officers have a reputation for violence. To balance this observation it should be borne in mind that they do on numerous occasions operate in an extremely difficult and often dangerous environment, where access to firearms by criminals is commonplace.
39. That said the police are there to serve all sectors of the public and the Academy have developed a Human Rights training module for all officers which covers in detail the standards expected from its officers. It clearly states the way in which the public, whether they be victims, witnesses or indeed suspects, should be treated.
40. Lastly, through the project the Academy has developed a Distance Learning training package and has a technology suite both centrally in the Academy and in each of the twenty seven states. The equipment to enable this to be developed and implemented was

purchased through the project and again has greatly assisted in ensuring consistency in the training of law enforcement officers nationwide. The evaluators were particularly impressed with the quality of technology used in this learning environment.

41. Bureaucracy – The ability to access the funding allocated to the project was found to be unnecessarily difficult and hampered the development and implementation of the plan.
42. For example the process for accessing monies to purchase information technology equipment, training equipment and other materials essential for developing and delivering the quality training products required was over complicated, bureaucratic and on occasion took many months to achieve.
43. The evaluators felt that in line with modern management structures and processes there should have been a devolvement of the project's funding to those with direct responsibility for developing and implementing the project plan.
44. In this case it was felt that the Director of the Academy should have had direct access to the funding in order to have been able to progress the project at a far quicker pace than actually occurred. In view of the fact that this project commenced in 1998, it has taken longer than necessary to reach its present state and this is without question to a large extent due to both the lack of a formal project management structure, but also the exhaustive mechanisms that have to be gone through to get access to the funding.
45. Whilst it is accepted that the budget was a substantial amount of money if a project management structure had been in place with the authority to both release funding on an annual basis and oversee expenditure by audit, this it is believed would have been far more effective and allowed for a more timely delivery of the project's goals.

2.1. Overall Performance Assessment

46. The overall goal of the project was to institutionally strengthen the capability of the National Police Academy in its ability to deliver effective, relevant and efficient law enforcement training to the public security sector of Brazil.
47. The appropriateness of the project is without question and from observations made and through interviews conducted with relevant individuals this enhancement was long overdue and much needed in order to modernise the training and professionalism of law enforcement officers in Brazil.

48. A consultative training needs analysis was conducted nationally by the Academy at the commencement of the project to assess the perceived shortfalls in the current training criteria. From these findings the development of more dynamic, modern curricula has evolved aided by up to date teaching methods, techniques and equipment. The forty training courses have been designed to meet the needs of the Federal Police and the project has been focused on delivering the training that is actually relevant and needed.
49. Comment has already been made concerning measures and systems that had they been in place it is felt would have resulted in a more effective method of delivery and therefore efficiency. However, this should not detract from the fact that it is the view of the evaluators that this project has been successfully implemented resulting in vastly improved training for public security officials.
50. The design of the project accurately sought to concentrate on the core issues that needed to be addressed in what is ultimately a modernisation of policing standards in Brazil. The project was focussed on introducing pedagogical reform methods as a means of engineering this modernisation process over a fairly lengthy period, the results speak for themselves and the design of the project has allowed this success to take place.

2.2. Attainment of the Objectives

51. The principle objective of the project was to “ensure quality policing” in Brazil, which in itself is an extremely ambitious goal to achieve by effective training alone. Experience has shown that quality policing is achieved through public consent and cooperation and non acceptance of anti social behaviour. This coupled with an impartial, trustworthy police service acting with integrity in which the public have confidence.
52. Effective training of law enforcement officers is an important part of the process to achieve this end and when interviewed the Director of the Academy felt that the principle object had in fact been achieved. It is the view of the evaluators that the successful implementation of this project has greatly assisted in enhancing the quality of policing given to the public in Brazil. However, this achievement should be viewed in a wider context as one part of a holistic on-going programme of improvement to improve the quality of policing in this country.
53. An objective of this project was that by ensuring quality policing this would effectively curb the increase of drug trafficking and related drug abuse. Clearly this has not happened

and at present there appears to be no likelihood of it doing so, in this or any other country that is a source, transit or destination country for the production or supply of illicit drugs in Latin America.

54. However, what is important is that whilst drug trafficking continues to be a major problem for this and indeed many South American countries, the Federal Police in Brazil, through the implementation of this project are now far better prepared to investigate and deal with the trafficking of drugs. A specific course on the investigation of drug trafficking has been designed through the project and is now one of the forty courses available through the Academy.
55. The objective of introducing pedagogical reform methods to the teaching of law enforcement officers has contributed greatly to attaining the overall project goal of improving the quality of policing in Brazil. The new methods of teaching introduced by the Academy, the updated technology and the new, much improved modern training materials have all assisted in this process. There is clear evidence of an improvement in the quality of policing resulting directly from the implementation of this project.
56. The objective of integrating the work of the National Academy with that of the State Academies, who are entrusted with the training of civil and military police forces, has been achieved through the implementation of distance learning, shared teaching techniques and integrating technical and operational knowledge. This is aligned with the regulatory role of federal entities and has created a uniform expansion of capacity in all States with a reduction in costs through combining resources. The Director's of the Academies have a regular meeting cycle to assess progress.
57. The objective of assisting in the modernization programme for the National Police Academy was arguably one of the most important goals to achieve, and was the core of all subsequent developments within the project. It was essential to reach this target in order to strengthen the quality of policing Brazil. This was successfully achieved through the projects provision of the necessary communication and technical equipment, pedagogical reform and the subsequent implementation of modern teaching methods and techniques. The effects of this achievement are evident in the clear improvement of policing in Brazil accomplished through assistance from this project.

2.3. Achievement of Project Results

58. Result 1. - “Improve technical equipment for the National Police Academy, with available specifications [taking into account technological compatibility with existing equipment and other government projects], and purchase and installation of the equipment”.
59. An assessment was made of the requirements for technological equipment and a user requirement specification was then produced. From this it was established what equipment was required and the purchase, installation and testing of the equipment and materials was carried out. Following the installation stage comprehensive training was given to those responsible for operating the equipment. Continual monitoring of the technological communications and information structure has taken place throughout the duration of the project.
60. This result was achieved within the project budget and the timeframe allocated, albeit this may have been achieved in a shorter timescale had direct access to the funding been made available to the Academy.
61. Result 2 – “The pedagogical structure, the curriculum and the teaching components of training human resources at the National Police Academy improved, in place and functioning”.
62. The Academy contracted in specialist consultancy services with expertise in defining the pedagogical structure required and the needs to develop the appropriate curriculum. There was also a requirement to ensure compatibility in the pedagogical modernization with the technological specifications and standards being installed.
63. A specialist curriculum was prepared for different professional categories of the Federal Police, encompassing the Judiciary, the Public Prosecution Service and other federal, state, municipal and foreign organizations involved in security and compliance.
64. A Program for Training Instructors was also implemented using the revised curriculum and new pedagogical training methods, to enable the effective delivery of the modern training techniques.
65. There was clear evidence of this result being achieved and it was pleasing to see the compatibility between the technology installed under the project and the new training modules and materials being delivered.

66. Result 3 – “Pedagogical materials prepared and adjusted to the new teaching methods to be established at the National Police Academy and in the States”.
67. A baseline assessment was conducted to establish the existing pedagogical material and methodology which existed in the National Police Academy at the commencement of the project. From this research the pedagogical reform was initiated and methods of teaching were introduced in line with this reform, including modern investigation techniques in the prevention and repression of the trafficking in illicit drugs.
68. The audiovisual suite was developed together with material for distance learning and communication. This was prepared tested and successfully disseminated as part of the pedagogical reform process where modern technology complimented practical teaching techniques.
69. Result 4 – “Improved cooperation and exchange of information with other countries by means of teaching methods and processes developed in similar international institutions, study trips, courses specially geared to Portuguese and Spanish speaking countries, emphasizing the combat against organized crime, particularly in the area of drug trafficking, arms smuggling and money laundering”.
70. The Academy defined and developed a methodology for international training and the exchange of officers and study trips to observe the teaching experiences of other country’s law enforcement officers. Training materials were developed, drafted and published with guidelines specifically geared to training in an international environment. Agreements were articulated and established with selected training institutions to participate in exchange activities.
71. The courses were created for Portuguese and Spanish speaking students and the exchange and cooperation activities implemented. These exchanges have taken place with a number of South American countries and when evaluated by the Academy have proved to be of benefit in enhancing existing cooperation at an operational level. In particular in the investigation of drug trafficking and the exchange of information on border activities relating to organized crime groups working ‘cross country’.
72. Whilst this result has in the main been achieved with notable success the evaluators felt that by restricting the international exchanges to Portuguese and Spanish speaking nations the Academy, and ultimately the Federal Police, were limiting their opportunity to gain further cooperation and exchange of information through a more multi-national approach.

It is accepted that the countries neighbouring Brazil are of most interest in combating drug trafficking activities, and speak these languages, but that should not prevent future development in international exchanges and knowledge sharing in a wider context.

73. Result 5 – “Sustainable mechanisms of resources identified to complement those of the National Treasury for the maintenance and permanent technological updating of the National Police Academy”.
74. The entire subject of sustainability is covered in detail at paragraph 3.3. of this report, however in the context of achieving this result the following observations are made.
75. The Academy has an annual budget of RIAS 29.000.000 for expenditure on all areas of its functionality. They have researched existing, pertinent Brazilian legislation, to find other sources and mechanisms of funding and income.
76. They have sought information from other institutes and academies, both here and overseas, on sustainable methods of financing. They have made efforts to develop alternative fund raising methodologies, including foreign training resources, developing relationships with non governmental organisations and sub-contracting for training activities for foreign institutions.
77. When interviewed the Director of the Academy was acutely aware of the need to secure alternative funding in order to maintain and develop the technological capacity of the training establishment. A ‘Support Foundation’ or another self-sustenance organization is the preferred option but at present there are no confirmed plans for this to take place. Whilst the annual budget appears to be a substantial sum of money the commitment placed on the Academy to maintain its current level of delivery and develop its training for the future is considerable. The evaluators took the view that additional funding from some other source will almost certainly be required to maintain its technological capacity.

2.4. Implementation

78. It appeared to the evaluators that whilst the project was implemented successfully and immense benefit has been gained by the Federal Police through the reforms that have taken place it was not without its hurdles. This was in the main due to the administrative shortfalls of those responsible in the Federal Police for the management and coordination of the project. Included in this observation is the lack of understanding of the rules governing the selection criteria, requisition and purchase of equipment, either

technological or otherwise, which are laid down by the Brazilian government when involved in international technical assistance projects.

79. This is of particular relevance when considering the reasons why only approximately 50% of the funding allocated to the budget was used. The evaluators learnt that the persons in charge of implementing the project from the Federal Police, through failing to adhere to the procedures required by both the Brazilian government and UNODC, caused unreasonable delays, on occasions many months, in the purchase of equipment required under the project.
80. Other constraining factors in the implementation of this project which have been documented in some detail in this report at paragraph 4.3. respectively were project management, financial management and bureaucracy. Added to this what the evaluators considered to be a consistent theme throughout this and the other three projects, D32, D33 and D34, was the lack of communication between those in charge of the management of the project centrally and those senior officers at an operational level responsible for the practical aspects of implementing the program.
81. This was evident in the interviews conducted with Dr. Viviane da Rosa, the Director of the National Academy, and the National Director in overall charge of the project Dr. Alciomar Goersch. Dr. Rosa commented on the poor communication and project management, also the fact that there had not been any formal meeting structure established between the senior officers at the Academy and Dr. Alciomar's team.
82. The National Director when spoken with did not accept that this was the case and additionally rejected all other objective observations that had been made by members of the Federal Police involved in the implementation of this and the other projects.
83. This included issues such as the financial management, project management, communication and the non-devolvement of responsibilities to individuals such as Dr. Rosa. Indeed, Dr. Alciomar laid the cause of all problematic issue throughout the implementation of the project solely with UNODC. The evaluators are totally satisfied that this is not the case and the criticism is unfounded , a lack of adequate knowledge of Brazilian statutory requirements in international technical assistance programs and project management expertise on the part of the National Project Director and his team was the core reason for the difficulties experienced.

84. Fortunately the UNODC field office in Brasilia were acutely aware of the situation and constantly monitored the evolution of the project, offering comprehensive guidance and assistance where needed.

2.5. Institutional and Management Arrangements

85. The Ministry of Justice was responsible through the Federal Police Department for the management of the project and as the executing agency responsible for completing the activities detailed in the project document. The evaluators believe that in principle this was the correct and most logical arrangement for the implementation of an international project of this kind.
86. In real terms Dr. Alciomer Goersl, Director, Federal Police was in overall charge of the project, however on a daily basis Mr. Paulo Filho of the Federal Police was the person delegated to manage the implementation process.
87. The Brazilian Cooperation Agency was the institution responsible for the evaluation of the actions carried out within the project's framework. The Ministry of Planning, Budget and Management was responsible for the coordination of the entire modernisation program and as the executing agency for this project. The UNODC office in Brazil, a participating institution in this project provided advice and guidance throughout the duration of the project.
88. As far as coordination and collaboration is concerned there appears to have been a lack of formal structure in the way in which those responsible within the Federal Police ensured that this important process took place both within their own organisation and with external partners and stakeholders. This was confirmed by the Director of the Academy and by UNODC Brazil.

3. OUTCOMES, IMPACTS AND SUSTAINABILITY

3.1. Outcomes

89. The purpose of the project was to ensure quality policing in Brazil, including curbing the increase of drug trafficking and related abuse. With UNODC assistance I think it is accurate to report that the professionalism of the Federal Police and indeed other law enforcement agencies in Brazil, who have benefited from the training modernisation program, has been greatly enhanced and the quality of service provided to society by them has improved.

90. In achieving this there are a number of notable factors that have contributed to the improvement in policing standards. Firstly, the implementation of pedagogical reform at the Academy has resulted in a far more effective method of training public security officials.
91. The installation of modern communication and information technology has resulted in the introduction of a sophisticated, efficient method of training which enables modern teaching practices to be promulgated to both the Academy and the twenty seven states in Brazil. This includes the distance learning training that has been introduced.
92. The production of up to date training materials, including manuals, practical training aids and the installation of equipment, has all led to a greatly improved ability by the Academy to deliver the training required to combat modern criminality and increase public security.
93. Through these outcomes the level and quality of training for the public security sector has improved which in turn has had a positive effect on Brazilian society's safety and their perception of the police that serve them.

3.2. Impacts

94. The implementation of this project has fundamentally changed the methodology and training rationale used by the National Police Academy in delivering the knowledge, both practically and academically, required by its officers to provide an effective law enforcement agency.
95. The benefits have already been realised in an improved quality of policing being delivered and the long term effect will undoubtedly see not just the present status quo being maintained but an evolving program of training that continues to meet the ever changing needs of modern policing.
96. Whilst the distance learning program introduced by the Academy is accepted by the evaluators as being essential for delivering training to all twenty seven states, it was felt that this should not replace periodical personal training at the Academy. In particular for such topics as new legislation and investigation techniques, where the ability for students to interact with tutors and peers is invaluable in the learning process.

3.3. Sustainability

97. On this issue one of the evaluators was not entirely convinced of the Academy's ability to maintain the quality of service currently being delivered as a direct result of the funding from this project.
98. It is accepted that the pedagogical reform has been achieved as well as the introduction of new communication and information technology. Also, the training materials and courses now being offered (40) coupled with new teaching techniques will continue into the future and develop further as new needs arise. In addition the annual budget for the Academy RS 29,000,000 is a substantial sum of money for what is in effect a relatively small law enforcement agency. However, the Academy is at present seeking an external funding source in the Support Foundation to supplement its income which indicates that there is a concern that to continue at its current capacity will require additional funding.
99. Indeed, if as is anticipated the Academy will develop further as a centre of excellence for law enforcement training in Brazil, then an additional injection of funds may be required. It was noted that the Academy's Director is keen to expand the site and the evaluators were shown plans of a building development project which if new funding was to be made available, may assist in realising this objective.
100. On balance it was the collective opinion of the evaluators that subject to effective management of both the Academy and its resources sustainability and continued growth should be ensured.

4. LESSONS LEARNED AND BEST PRACTICES

4.1. Lessons Learned

101. The design and structure of this project was in the opinion of the evaluators well formulated and comprehensive in both its content and purpose. During the evaluation there were some issues that emerged which are worthy of comment and may assist in the application and execution of future projects.
102. The non existence of a formal project management structure within the Federal Police was a significant factor in the delays that occurred in implementing the program. This was compounded by the lack of understanding on the part of their senior managers of existing Brazilian regulations applicable to international technical assistance programs.

103. In future projects it may be useful to formulate if not in the program document itself, but certainly as part of the implementation process the requirement for participating agencies to adopt a recognised management structure for ensuring effective project control. This lesson should have been identified and acted upon at an early stage of this project.
104. An essential ingredient of implementing any project is the ability to access accurate, up to date financial information on the position of the program's expenditure at all times. There will of course always be the occasion due to administrative procedures when this is not possible; this should be the exception not the rule.
105. This was not the case and the evaluators felt that there was insufficient information readily available on the projects financial position and again for the future the discipline of participating organisations in preparing and maintaining accurate, timely accounting records should be emphasised at the outset.
106. One other valuable lesson gained from this and projects D32, D33 and D34 is the importance in involving the senior practitioners who will ultimately be responsible for implementing the tasks contained within the project. In this case it was Dr. Viviane da Rosa, the Director of the Academy, who expressed the opinion that she had not been given sufficient responsibility throughout the project to enable her to be adequately influential during the implementation process. This caused unnecessary delays in securing equipment and the production of training materials.
107. Lastly, one of the most common factors causing a lack of consistency between those in charge of the project at the Federal Police Headquarters and Dr. de Rosa's staff at the Academy was the poor communication that existed between them. No formal meeting structure existed to allow for exchanges of views or a regular update on the progress of the project. This caused not only frustration from the Academy's perspective but also hampered the progress of the implementation.

4.2. Best Practices

108. The involvement of the participating institutions at the preparatory, planning stages of this project has in the view of the evaluators been an essential ingredient in ensuring continuity and consistency of approach throughout the duration of the program.

109. It was felt to be a key element in any project, regardless of the thematic area, that collective and collaborative arrangements and agreements are entered into at the earliest stage possible and form the underpinning required for ensuring a successful outcome.
110. One of the principle reasons for this project succeeding was the rationale adopted by the Academy's Director in ensuring that there was a consistency of approach in the development of the new training model and its subsequent delivery throughout Brazil.
111. The standardisation achieved in this project is on occasions missing from international technical assistance programs, this results in diverse practices being undertaken which are often self defeating. In turn this creates a situation where a national organisation, such as in this case the Federal Police, delivers a quality of service which varies depending on the region. This in itself adversely affects the image of the organisation concerned and does not contribute to portraying it as a professional body.
112. So often in developing countries there are a number of international technical assistance projects being conducted at any one time, Brazil being no exception. It is therefore not only good practice but essential in avoiding duplicity of both effort and resources that a holistic overview is taken of what is sought to be achieved in an overall context.
113. In this case project AD/BRA/98/D32 "Training for Public Security Professionals" was closely linked in its objectives to this program so quite correctly shared resources were used in developing and delivering both projects. [There is an argument that the two were so closely aligned that they could have been incorporated under one project]. The evaluators felt this type of collaborative approach displayed an understanding of the need to use finite resources efficiently and ensure again that both projects were delivered consistency in all twenty seven states.

4.3. Constraints

114. The constraining factors in this project have already been documented in some detail in this report and can be summarised as follows;
115. Project Management – The lack of a formally recognised structure by the Federal Police to manage and implement the project adversely effected its smooth transition. It is accepted that due to legislative constraints it was not possible to employ an independent project manager.

116. Financial Management – There was a lack of up to date, accurate financial data available from the Federal Police on the spending throughout the project.
117. Communication – An evident lack of communication had existed between those responsible within the Federal Police Headquarters for the project and the senior management at the Academy.
118. Bureaucracy – The ability to access funding allocated to the project was found to be burdensome and clearly in the view of the evaluators hampered the implementation of the project. This was particularly so in the case of purchasing information technology equipment. The fact that there was no devolvement of responsibility to Dr. de Rosa for the management of any of the project's funding seems at odds with modern management practices.

5. Recommendations

5.1. Issues resolved during the evaluation

119. The system for the requisition and purchase of equipment for the project was clearly not understood by the senior management of the Federal police resulting in delays occurring in its acquisition. The correct method for this process has been explained to them in some detail.
120. The level of staffing was raised by the Federal Police as being an issue that was reducing their ability to deliver the proposed outputs. The personnel assigned to them was according to Federal Police headquarters correct and the confusion had arisen due to managers at a junior level producing their own staffing level figures, which were not approved.
121. The total spend figures for the project were unable to be produced by the Federal Police and as previously stated in this report the issue was of concern to the evaluators. This was resolved and UNODC field office Brazil who were able to appraise the evaluators of the closing budget figures.
122. A question was raised by the evaluators regarding the use of information technology companies for the project and the process for their selection. This was established to have been carried out according to Brazilian regulations and the company was well versed in handling sensitive data.

123. The issue of the lack of a qualified project manager from outside the Federal Police was resolved by UNODC explaining the Brazilian legislative restrictions preventing this from happening. However, there is a mechanism whereby this difficulty could be overcome whilst still complying with the legal requirements placed upon international technical assistance projects. This procedure is detailed at paragraph 125 b) below.

5.2. Actions/decisions recommended

124.A] The project document whilst comprehensive in its content should the evaluators believe have contained milestones for the delivery of each core component of the program. It is understood these details were in existence, however, we consider the inclusion of milestones in all project plans to be a fundamental part of the planning and implementation process.

125.B] The structure for managing this project by the Federal Police was inadequate and lacked the expertise and resilience of individuals experienced in the field of project management. We note the country's legislative constraints in this regard in that it is not permissible to retain the services of a project manager using national funds. One option for consideration would be for UNODC to utilise its own funds that have been allocated to a project to hire the services of a project assistant. This would not contravene any legal requirement and would ensure that the relevant expertise is available to assist in implementing a project.

126. We recommend as a matter of course that institutions participating in international technical assistance projects formally agree their respective arrangements for managing the implementation and delivery of the project plan.

127. This must include a chain of command with designated responsibilities and effective lines of communication, a factor missing from the Federal Police headquarters to the Academy.

128. In essence this subject should be incorporated within the project document and should follow the accepted structure for the implementation of projects. It makes both individuals and organisations accountable for delivery and assists in clarifying what is expected from each institution.

129.C] Comprehensive, accurate and timely budget figures throughout any project are essential in order to enable effective decision making by the project management team. It also ensures that there is adequate transparency and that the accounting system will stand

scrutiny if needed. Also, whilst clearly it is a matter for the implementing agency the devolvement of financial resources to those charged with delivering the objectives would it is suggested be a far more effective mechanism of ensuring a timely progression of the program.

130. We would recommend a standardised method be developed for this that would be acceptable to technical assistance partners worldwide. Clearly there will be countries who will find it difficult to amass the information required either by their inability in financial procedures or the lack of technical capability in this area. If such a system is in being it was not evident in this case to the evaluators.

131. Again, it was felt that standardised financial reporting should be a formal requirement contained within the project document placing each institution under an obligation to produce the information required on a regular basis.

132. D] The evaluators were afforded the opportunity of viewing a number of annual reports on the yearly progress of the project. These reports did not contain sufficient detail of the activities, financial expenditure, progress against objectives and other information which would allow an accurate assessment to be made of the position of the project to date.

133. The brevity of these reports was also of note and they were normally no more than a couple of pages in length; this may of course be the standard format for such reports by the UNODC. However it was felt that if this is the case then they are far too brief both in content and detail, and there should be a requirement for all international technical assistance programs to evaluate the progress of a project in a far more detailed, concise and comprehensive manner on an annual basis.

6. OVERALL CONCLUSIONS

134. The effective training of public security and law enforcement officers is essential in any democratic society if an environment is to exist where the public have confidence in their police service to deliver an impartial, professional service where integrity is paramount.

135. The object of the project was to introduce pedagogical reform into the way in which the police are trained and produce a modern curriculum which is fit for purpose in dealing the sophistication now employed by criminal gangs. The project strategy was clear in its aims and appropriate in its timing for introducing reforms designed at improving the quality of policing in Brazil.

136. The National Academy of the Federal Police has been enabled through this project to become the centre of excellence for law enforcement training in Brazil. The Academy has developed high quality training materials which through communication and technological equipment purchased through this project, is now able to be utilised in all twenty seven of Brazil's states. The Academy now offers a broad range of training courses, some forty in number, including the specialised training required to combat organised crimes such as the trafficking in drugs and humans.
137. The methods of teaching now being used incorporate the use of technology and practical training delivered by experienced personnel. This is essential for understanding how the academic part of training is intrinsically linked to the practical, everyday situations that officers will be faced with.
138. It has to be accepted that Brazil due to its geographical location will remain for the foreseeable future a country affected by the trafficking of illicit drugs. However, what is clear is that the Federal Police through this reform program are now trained to a much higher standard, and are better informed and equipped to combat this ever increasing problem. Indeed, through this project an enhanced cooperation has been established with neighbouring Latin American countries in combating cross border criminality.
139. The rationale under which this project has been introduced across Brazil has brought a standardisation and consistency in law enforcement training which did not previously exist in its states. The autonomy which had prevailed previously has hampered the development of the Federal Police; this project has succeeded in establishing and delivering a high standard of training using modern teaching techniques resulting in uniformity in the service provided to the public.
140. There are a number of areas within the project where had certain mechanisms and processes been in place, the speed and efficiency with which the program was implemented may have been favourably affected.
141. It was apparent that improved communication was needed between the Academy and those responsible at the Federal Police Headquarters for managing the project. Aligned to this was the lack of any formal project management structure within the Federal Police. The inability on occasions by the Academy to progress the project in a timely fashion was the evaluators felt due to there being no devolvement of responsibility or budget to the Academy's Director.

142. Whilst the project's expenditure was established with assistance from UNODC field office Brazil, a detailed breakdown of these figures should have been maintained throughout the project by the Federal Police, if this was the case it was neither apparent or made available to the evaluators.
143. There is further work being undertaken at the Academy to continue developing the training being delivered and to design courses that meet the needs of an ever changing policing environment. Whilst this is now continuing outside the life of this project it is as a direct result of this program that the Academy now has the equipment and the pedagogical reforms in place to enable this essential work to continue.
144. In conclusion, the evaluators believe this project has succeeded in modernising and improving the training of law enforcement officers in Brazil. This has been achieved by introducing the pedagogical reforms needed for the institutional strengthening of the National Police Academy.

Annex 1

UNITED NATIONS OFFICE ON DRUGS AND CRIME

PROJECT EVALUATION

TERMS OF REFERENCE

1. BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Project Title: Institutional Strengthening of the National Police Academy (ANP)

Project Number: D31

The National Police Academy belongs to the Federal Police Department, which in turn is subordinated to the Ministry of Justice. Based in Brasilia, it was founded in 1979. Its installations and training programs are among the best in Latin America. A shortage of funds over the last decade has hampered proper updating of the Academy's programmatic content, leading to an accumulated need to replace training means and methodology and to update curricula.

As the mandate of the institution provides for continuous and comprehensive training for all Federal Police personnel, in addition to specialized courses for state police forces, other governmental agencies and police from other countries, the Academy represents the focal point for training agents of the law nationally.

At the present moment the Federal Police Department (DPF) has about 6,000 police officers and 1,900 administrative employees. They are responsible for solving a wide range of federal crimes, which include those related to the production and traffic of drugs. Due to the increasingly greater sophistication and organization of criminal groups, there is a need to select and prepare federal agents very carefully and within a modern and efficient teaching structure.

In order to enhance the institutional capacity of the ANP as a center of excellence in public security in the country, the Brazilian Government has decided to install a process of re-structuring the Academy within a global program of refining the State structure by developing a specific international-cooperation project towards this end. The United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) was

requested to lend its assistance to the project in order to guarantee the necessary coordination with other projects of a similar nature, as well as the cooperation of international agencies that have had successful experiences in the area of the project in question.

The initial execution of the project was supported in partnership with the Advanced School of Financial Administration (ESAF), which is experienced in modernization programs of the Federal Executive Power. In 2002, the ESAF undertook an institutional assessment of the Academy and presented a proposal to re-engineer the institution, including its organizational structure and administrative and pedagogical practices, aimed at modernizing the work developed by the institution and making it more efficacious.

|

Annex 2

Organisations and places visited and persons met

Organizations

1. National Police Academy, Brasilia
2. Ministry of Public Security, Brasilia
3. UNODC Field Office, Brasilia
4. Federal Police, Brasilia
5. Civil Police, Brasilia
6. Federal Police, Belo Horizonte
7. Federal Police, Sao Paulo

Persons

1. Dr. Viviane da Rosa, Director of National Police Academy
2. Senior management and training staff at the National Police Academy
3. Dr. Alciomar Goersch, Director of Project, Federal Police
4. Paulo Martins Beltrao Filho, Chief of Projects Division, Federal Police
5. Senior management of Projects Division, Federal Police
6. Reiner Pungs, Program Coordinator, UNODC Field Office, Brasilia
7. Luis Carlos da Silva Ramos, Delegado Federal Police
8. Julio Danilo Souza Ferreira, Delegado Federal Police
9. Rodrigo Geraldo Aguiar, Delegado Federal Police
10. Local officers, Civil Police Brasilia
11. Superintendent of Federal Police and staff, Belo Horizonte
12. Superintendent of Federal Police and staff, Sao Paulo

Annex 3

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime

Project evaluation Summary assessment questionnaire

This questionnaire is to be filled out by the evaluator or evaluation team and to be submitted to backstopping office. A copy should be provided to the Senior Evaluation Officer, Division for Operations and Analysis. A separate questionnaire should be filled out for each project encompassed by the evaluation. The information provided must be fully congruent with the contents of the evaluation report.

The purpose of the questionnaire is to provide information for UNODC's evaluation database. The information will be used to establish evaluation profiles which should give a quick and correct overview of the evaluation of individual projects and programmes. It will also be used for the purpose of analyzing results across project evaluations to obtain a systematic picture of the overall performance of the Programme.

I. NUMBER AND TITLE OF PROJECT:

AD/.BRA/98/D31 "Institutional Strengthening of the National Police Academy"

II. SUMMARY ASSESSMENT:

1. Please provide an assessment for all categories listed (including categories constituting headings) by ticking one of the boxes ranging from 0 to 5. The ratings from 0 to 5 are based on the following standard favor-to-disfavor scale:

- 5 - Outstanding, highly appropriate, much more than planned/expected, certain to materialize
- 4 - Very good, very appropriate, more than planned/expected, highly likely to materialize
- 3 - Good, appropriate, as planned/expected, likely to materialize
- 2 - Fair, less appropriate, less than planned/expected, less likely to materialize
- 1 - Unsatisfactory, not appropriate, far below plans/expectations, unlikely to materialize
- 0 - Cannot determine, not applicable

2. If a category has been significant (as a cause or effect) in relation to the overall quality and/or performance of the project please tick the “S” column (if significant) or the “H” column (if highly significant).

	H	S	0	1	2	3	4	5
OVERALL QUALITY AND PERFORMANCE OF PROJECT:							X	
I. PROJECT CONCEPT AND DESIGN:								
1. Project document (overall clarity, logic and coherence).						X		
2. Identification/analysis of problem addressed by project:							X	
3. Project strategy (overall assessment):						X		
4. Drug control objective (s) (Appropriateness, obtainability):					X			
5. Immediate objective(s) (appropriateness, Obtainability):							X	
6. Achievement indicators:								
7. Base-line study/arrangements for base-line study:			X					
8. Outputs (compared to cost effective alternatives):						X		
9. Activities (compare to cost effective alternatives):						X		
10. Inputs (compared to cost effective alternatives):						X		
11. Executing modality and managerial arrangements:						X		
12. Identification and assessment of risks						X		
13. Prior obligations and prerequisites:						X		
14. Workplan/planned project duration:						X		
15. Budget:					X			

3

	H	S	0	1	2	3	4	5
II. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION:								
1. Quality and timeliness of UNODC inputs:							X	
2. Quality and timelines of Government inputs:						X		
3. Quality and timeliness of inputs by third parties:			X					
4. Equipment: *inappropriate in the sense of being premature and generous			X					
5. Advisory/training services:						X		
6. Project personnel:					X			
7. Sub-contracting:			X					
8. Management of project:					X			
9. Project workplans:						X		
10. Implementation of activities:						X		
11. Monitoring and backstopping by UNODC HQ:						X		
12. Monitoring and backstopping by UNODC field Office:						X		
13. Monitoring and backstopping by Executing Agency:					X			
14. Monitoring and backstopping by Government:					X			
15. Government fulfilment of prerequisites:						X		
III. PROJECT RESULTS:								
1. Timeliness of produced outputs;					X			
2. Quantity of produced outputs:						X		
3. Quality of produced outputs:							X	
4. Outcomes: achievement/likely achievement of immediate objective(s):							X	
5. Drug control impact achieved:						X		

	H	S	0	1	2	3	4	5
6. Drug control impact to be expected						X		
7. Likely sustainability of project results:						X		

3. If external factors had an impact on project performance please tick the appropriate boxes: external factors impeded:_____/ promoted:_____ project performance. The effect on project performance of this influence was significant:_____/ highly significant:_____. Please provide a short description of the nature of the external factor(s):

4. Did the evaluation recommend to:

- a) _____ abandon the project
- b) _____ continue/extend the project without modifications
- c) _____ continue/extend the project with minor modifications
- d) _____ continue/extend the project with some modifications
- e) _____ continue/extend the project with extensive modification
- f) X terminate the projects, as planned

(please tick the relevant category).

5. If a modification of the project was recommended did the evaluation recommend a revision of: the drug control objective(s): _____, the immediate objective(s): _____, the outputs: _____, the activities: _____ or the inputs: _____. Please tick as appropriate.

It is recommended that the project be redesigned into a new project.

6. If the evaluation recommended that the project or significant elements of it be replicate please tick as appropriate: yes: X / no: _____

Silvia E. Levissianos
 Evaluation Assistant
 Division for Operations and Analysis
 P.O. Box 500
 A-1400 Vienna, Austria
 Tel. + 43 1 26060 4262
 Fax. + 43 1 26060 5896
silvia.levissianos@UNODC.org