

Date: March 2006

TERMINAL EVALUATION REPORT

Project: AD/BRA/98/D33 - Strengthening of Chemical Precursor Control

Thematic Area:

Public Security – Drug Control

Brazil

Report of the Evaluation Team

John M. Dillon – International Consultant

Jonas Ribeiro da Silva – National Consultant

Tito Caetano Corrêa – National Consultant

UNITED NATIONS OFFICE ON DRUGS AND CRIME (UNODC)

Vienna

CONTENTS	<u>Paragraphs</u>	<u>Page</u>
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY		iv-vii
1. INTRODUCTION		
1.1. Background and Context	1	1
1.2. Purpose and Objective of the Evaluation	10	2
1.3. Executing Modality / Management Arrangements	13	2
1.4. Scope of the Evaluation	18	3
1.5. Evaluation Methodology	21	4
2. ANALYSIS AND MAJOR FINDINGS		5
2.1. Overall Performance Assessment	25	5
2.2. Attainment of Objectives	28	5
2.3. Achievement of Project Results and Outputs	31	6
2.4. Implementation	39	8
2.5. Institutional and Management Arrangements	41	8
3. OUTCOMES, IMPACTS AND SUSTAINABILITY		10
3.1. Outcomes	43	10
3.2. Impacts	51	11
3.3. Sustainability	55	12
4. LESSONS LEARNED AND BEST PRACTICES		14
4.1. Lessons Learned	60	14
4.2. Best Practices	60	15
4.3. Constraints	65	17

5. RECOMMENDATIONS		17
5.1. Issues Resolved during Evaluation	73	17
5.2. Actions / Decisions Recommended	74	18
6. OVERALL CONCLUSIONS		19
 ANNEXES		
1. Terms of Reference		20
2. Organizations and Places Visited and Persons Met		30
3. Summary Assessment Questionnaire		31

Disclaimer

Independent Project Evaluations are scheduled and managed by the project managers and conducted by external independent evaluators. The role of the Independent Evaluation Unit (IEU) in relation to independent project evaluations is one of quality assurance and support throughout the evaluation process, but IEU does not directly participate in or undertake independent project evaluations. It is, however, the responsibility of IEU to respond to the commitment of the United Nations Evaluation Group (UNEG) in professionalizing the evaluation function and promoting a culture of evaluation within UNODC for the purposes of accountability and continuous learning and improvement.

Due to the disbandment of the Independent Evaluation Unit (IEU) and the shortage of resources following its reinstatement, the IEU has been limited in its capacity to perform these functions for independent project evaluations to the degree anticipated. As a result, some independent evaluation reports posted may not be in full compliance with all IEU or UNEG guidelines. However, in order to support a transparent and learning environment, all evaluations received during this period have been posted and as an on-going process, IEU has begun re-implementing quality assurance processes and instituting guidelines for independent project evaluations as of January 2011.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. Summary table of findings, supporting evidence and recommendations

<i>Findings: identified problems/issues</i>	<i>Supporting evidence/examples</i>	<i>Recommendations</i>
1. Project management – centralized and informal, recognized structure in place	No project manager on a full-time basis, no structure with Steering Committee, Working Group, etc. at different levels in the Federal Police	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Consultants and participating institutions to help formulate project management structure 2. Qualified project manager appointed 3. Recognized project delivery programmes, including milestones 4. All of the above to be incorporated into project document
2. Financial management – insufficient, command chain not always efficient; advance payment made to the company hired to elaborate the computerized system	Executive levels unable to produce budget information on project expenditures, including expenses to date, balance and any over or under expenditure	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Financial reporting by all participating levels 2. Special care and search for other means and possibilities to follow schedule 3. All of the above to be incorporated into project document
3. Communication - lack of communication between the Federal Police HQ and the executive manager	Lack of information on the project's progress due to the lack of meetings with the project team at headquarters	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Formalize a project meetings schedule 2. Record minutes 3. All of the above to be incorporated into project document
4. Bureaucracy – Equipment and materials procurement procedures overly complicated	Equipment not acquired due to bureaucratic processes	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Update public and international procurement procedures 2. Review procedures for acquisition of equipment under international technical assistance projects
5. Experimental office – tries procedures before implementation in other states	Belo Horizonte Office chosen as the new procedure experimental office	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Feedback to the Central Office
6. Standardization and consistency – achieved throughout Brazil's 27 states	All 27 Brazilian states are receiving consistent training	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Plan project reformulation to ensure standardization and consistency of delivery
7. Shared resources – good use made of joint working practices	Resources shared with other enforcement projects	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Examine other projects to identify opportunities for sharing resources
8. Periodical project reports – too brief and containing insufficient detail of progress and new issues	Lack of the required information	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Review current process 2. Consider introducing a more detailed periodical review

2.

a) Description of the project and its objectives

Illicit drug trafficking to and through Brazil has increased over the last years. Cocaine crosses Brazil towards foreign markets. Brazilian authorities view this trend with great concern, particularly because of increasing drug abuse in the country, besides rampant corruption, disrupted internal security, and widespread violence associated with drug trafficking and abuse.

The project purpose is to reduce drug production and supply by avoiding deviation of the chemical precursors used in their manufacture and by controlling their flow through the borders of coca-producing countries. Brazil used to be one of the countries providing chemicals to drug traffickers through their deviation from the legal market. Therefore, the country sought help to develop a computerized control system in order to effectively avoid chemical precursors deviation.

The Brazilian Congress issued and adopted a new legislation on chemical precursors control in accordance with the UN Convention of 1988 and the model law elaborated by the Inter-American Drug Abuse Control Commission (CICAD). The mandate for this new legislation enforcement was assigned to the Narcotics Law Enforcement Division (DRE) of the Federal Police Department.

The project would encompass the whole country and all Federal Police Department units. It started in December 1998 and ended in December 2005.

b) Major findings

Project Management – It is noteworthy a certain lack of transparency in the decision-making process among those who were responsible for the project's implementation within the Federal Police HQ and the DRE's senior managers.

Financial Management – The project's executive levels were unable to produce information on the expenditures, not even on the ones incurred to date, nor the balance, nor any other one. With regards to the advance payment made to the company hired to develop the computerized system for the project, the evaluation team recommends extra care and the consideration of other possibilities.

Communication – There was no effective communication among the implementing institution's team, which could be noticed by the different procedures undertaken by the project's executive managers and the Federal Police HQ.

Bureaucracy – The procurement procedures for the project's equipment were very inconvenient. It is the evaluation team's opinion that the change in the interpretation of the law needs additional review regarding these procedures within the framework of international technical assistance projects.

Project Strategy – Reducing drug trafficking by controlling chemical precursors can be a successful means to protect people's health and decrease violence. The main arguments to convince the House of Representatives of that need were an effective development of a control computerized system and awareness rising among enterprises.

c) Lessons learned and best practices

The non-existence of a formal project management structure within the implementing agency was a significant factor in the project's development; daily assistance to the final computerized system's user is useful; an easy communication among the personnel involved helps to achieve a goal; a plural hierarchical decision line is necessary; the maintenance of the personnel involved can avoid some delays; it is possible to control chemical precursors by means of a well-elaborated information technology; in a large country like Brazil, it is crucial that some decisions be decentralized in order keep the process ongoing; a well-designed project aimed at reducing drug trafficking is good enough to change existing laws; industrial and trade companies are sensitive to drug matters and are able to change their procedures in order to contribute for the decrease of drug trafficking; Field laboratories can be an interesting experience during the project's development; an informal organizational structure to distribute tasks and responsibilities can better choose adequate personnel; developing a kit with several chosen chemical reagents to help identify drugs can make policemen's initial job easier.

d) Recommendations and Conclusions

Recommendations

- 1) Institutions participating in international technical assistance programmes must appoint a suitably qualified project manager and have the structure to effectively manage the project. This should include formal meetings, clear lines of communication, and a recognised chain of command.
- 2) Participating institutions should keep accurate financial data and present them in a timely manner.
- 3) A review of the existing UNODC's policy procedures for equipment procurement in international technical assistance projects is desirable.
- 4) A review of the criteria and contents required for completion of periodic project reports is also desirable.
- 5) The same initial staff should stay through the end of the project's implementation, if possible.

Conclusions –

- 1) In a broad view, a project aimed at controlling fabrication, commerce, transit, exportation, and importation of substances that can be used to produce or transform illegal drugs can be effective in reducing illegal drug trade.
- 2) The Project AD/BRA/98/D33 received support from the National Congress, developed an information technology, formed personnel in the computerized system and in investigative skills, had material support and enjoyed an easy communication among the units of the Brazilian Federal Police Department. It shall be more consistent when a line of communication with neighboring coca-producing countries is established.

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Background and Context

1. Illicit drug trafficking to and through Brazil has increased significantly over the last two decades. Andean cocaine passes through the country towards markets in North America, Europe, and Africa. Brazilian authorities view this trend with great concern, particularly because of the increasing drug abuse in the country, that threatens the society's health and integrity, besides rampant corruption, disrupted internal security and widespread violence associated with drug trafficking and abuse.
2. The project's purpose is to reduce drug production and supply by avoiding the deviation of the chemical precursors used in their manufacture and by controlling their flow through the borders of such coca-producing countries as Colombia, Bolivia, and Peru.
3. Brazilian chemical industries produce these chemical precursors and import them as well.
4. In this context, the country is a major source of chemicals that drug traffickers deviate from the legal market.
5. Within the framework of above reasons and of international agreements, Brazil sought help to develop a computerized control system in order to effectively avoid chemical precursors' deviation.
6. Such a system shall analyze these matters in all their complexity and not create bureaucratic obstacles for the chemical industry.
7. Meanwhile, the legal aspect should also be taken into account, since Brazil lacks a legal system on the matter. As part of the strategy, the Brazilian Congress issued and the country adopted a new legislation on chemical precursor control in accordance with the UN Convention of 1988 and the model law elaborated by the Inter-American Drug Abuse Control Commission (CICAD). The issuance of this federal law aimed at standardizing the control of chemical precursors and products used for the preparation of cocaine and its by-products, as well as other illicit substances that lead to psychological or physical dependency.
8. The responsibility for enforcing the aforementioned law fell on the Narcotics Law Enforcement Division (DRE) of the Federal Police Department (DPF). This federal law requires the formal registration of enterprises involved in the

fabrication and distribution of chemical products, as well as a special authorization from the DRE. To export these chemicals, the approval from import countries is also required.

9. The project should cover the whole country and involve all the DPF units. It started in December 1998 and ended in December 2005.

1.2. Purpose and Objective of the Evaluation

10. The purpose of the evaluation of the project AD/BRA/98/D33 - Strengthening of Chemical Precursor Control - is to assess the impact on law enforcement, showing what can be learned from the project. The lessons learned are meant to become the basis for institutionalizing improvements for the future. Other follow-up activities can be accomplished by measuring achievements, outcomes and impacts of the project, both positive and negative.
11. The objective of this evaluation is to examine the strategies, objectives, relevance, effectiveness, results, impact, sustainability, and added value of UNODC's actions.
12. Whilst the project has now been extended until June 2006, its official date for conclusion was December 2005. In view of this there is now a requirement for an independent terminal review to be carried out, the details and results of which are contained in this report.

1.3. Executing Modality / Management Arrangements

13. The implementation of the project followed progressive phases as long as execution proved them adequate. According to the personnel who were interviewed and to previous reports, the project followed a step-by-step planning. Some of the steps occurred simultaneously, while others depended on prior ones.
14. The computer technology that was used underwent a number of modifications while being shown to and tested by the managers, in an attempt to reach the most useful and friendly operational level.
15. The partnership in working exercises (computer technology development and final users) was very important, but caused unexpected delay.

16. The Brazilian governmental management structure led the executive manager through bureaucratic meanders that resulted in more unexpected delay. A centralized administration and the lack of experts were observed. The executive manager got around the management structure and improvised a nonofficial organization to execute the project.
17. The Attorney-General analyzed both the Brazilian and the United Nations' bidding rules and recently gave them a proper interpretation to strengthen the law, modifying procurement procedures regarding goods of interest to the government. Such a new vision of the law made an impact on the project implementation speed, making it slower. Nevertheless, it was not possible to evaluate the impact of such new interpretation of the bidding rules on precursor's control.

1.4. Scope of the Evaluation

18. This evaluation exercise covers the period from September 1998 until December 2005, although not at full-length.
19. The present document tries to draw an overview of the chosen strategies and of the development of a computerized system aimed at following the chemical precursors from the industries through their trade and distribution to the final customers. The main objective of it all is to find out whether it is a good tool to prevent the illegal drug fabrication and if the intended coverage of the project is coherent with the expected outputs. It will also provide an overview of the activities and inputs of the process. When put into practice, the system will be able to reach the objectives and check the compatibility between the proposals and the project goals. The scope of the evaluation also includes the clarity, the logic, and the coherence of the project document, the executing modality and managerial arrangements for the project, as well as its monitoring arrangements and its appropriateness. There was not an opportunity to analyze the appropriateness of all baseline indicators. Others goals of the evaluation are the adequacy of the identification and assessment of risks to the project and whether the implementation of activities specified in the project document was actually achieved. Besides, it shall analyze the quality and timing of inputs and, finally, the efficiency and effectiveness of the activities carried out.

20. The evaluation shall review the monitoring and management of the project, the support received from the government, the services provided by the implementing agency, and how any of them has affected the project implementation, either in a positive or a negative way.

1.5. Evaluation Methodology

21. The evaluation team followed the methodology designed to collect data from various sources. The team had the opportunity to study the previous documents provided by the agency, such as the Project Document (PRODOC) and its respective annual and semi-annual reports. At least five formal interviews were carried out with the personnel directly involved in the project implementation and two field visits were performed: to the Federal Police in Sao Paulo (the capital of the most developed Brazilian state) and in Belo Horizonte (the city chosen by the managers as the laboratory for new procedures.)
22. The first interview occurred at the Coordination Office for Chemical Products Control of the Federal Police Department; the second one happened at the General Coordination of Information Technology of the Federal Police Department, where the main aspects of the control system were presented. The third visit was to the general manager of the Federal Police HQ. The other two formal visits are the ones mentioned above.
23. All field visits were attended by the second top authority from the Coordination Office for Chemical Products Control of the Federal Police Department.
24. After the meetings, the evaluation team discussed their findings and their points of view.

2. ANALYSIS AND MAJOR FINDINGS

2.1. Overall Performance Assessment

25. The project aimed at providing means for the control of chemical precursors either produced in Brazil or crossing its borders. Considering the project implementation context, there was a lack of personnel to exert the demanded control. Besides, increasing drug trafficking menaced public health in Brazil and in neighboring countries as well. Brazil is presently not known as a drug producer, but as one of the most important regional industrial parks gathering chemical precursors manufacturers. The old methodology of control was not efficient and required a very large number of law enforcers. In addition, the control laws did not encompass numerous chemical products.
26. Both a computer technology-based control and a change in legislation could be undertaken. The project AD/BRA/D33, with its proposal of an effective control of chemical precursors, pointed out a reduction in the diversion of such substances to illicit markets and the strengthening of institutional activities. Controlling the production, trade, and distribution of chemical precursors, together with the political will to change behaviors, seems to be the appropriate means to reduce the drug threat.
27. The implementation and development of the project demonstrated its effectiveness and efficiency. According to the PRODOC and to the information technology, the consultants agree that the project is able to show effectiveness and efficiency in controlling chemical products. It is noteworthy that the fact that the industrial parks in the drug producing countries are not able to meet the manufacturing needs.

2.2. Attainment of the Objectives

28. Nevertheless the project's implementation and development the full certainty chemical precursor control depends on police intelligence attention.
29. All infrastructure support is complete, the issued law assigns the necessary legality to the task at hand, the personnel are adequately recruited and able to perform the work; the companies addressed are aware of the importance of controlling chemicals, the most part of the benefits - such as intercommunications among

decentralized units and database structure for police intelligence - is achieved, and the sustainability is secured by a legal fund.

30. Because of internal management, a little part of the project's implementation and development is still missing. It will be complete, as hired company and Federal Police Department assured, next June.

2.3. Achievement of Project Results

31. Presently, the control is being exerted quite satisfactorily, but it is expected to improve with new inputs. The Federal Police and all of their offices around the country are ready to give assistance to the chemical precursors factories..
32. The Federal Police outsourced typing the controlling inputs data from the factories. The consistency verification caused almost three months data delay
33. **Output 1:** The institutional framework for the control and monitoring of chemical precursors is defined, developed and made functional according to coordination mechanisms established among 27 Superintendence and decentralized units. The definitions and design of the organizational structure required for the computerized system to perform registration and licensing are done; the access to the necessary equipment and personnel required to set up the "control system" is ready; the revision of the organizational chart for precursor control within the DRE, the staff assigned to perform the task , and the organizational requirements to be fulfilled by the Regional Superintendences have been arranged. The Regional Superintendence provide services and support structures for chemical precursor monitoring and control, as well as laboratory services. The issuance of laws and decrees ensures the necessary legal framework. The training plan (including pedagogical materials) was completed for all agencies involved in precursor control. International cooperation is ongoing.
34. **Output 2:** A fully operational computerized precursor control system, interconnected and coordinated among the 27 Regional Superintendences, with their respective decentralized Federal Police units, depends on the deliveries by the outsourced company. It is currently partially functioning, as well as the related activities. The computer hardware and software that are necessary for the implementation stage of the chemical precursor control system are already available.

The personnel to work with chemical precursor monitoring and control in each decentralized unit is specialized and trained in registration, analysis, mapping, and control of producers, transportation companies, import and export companies, and retailers. The connections with relevant governmental and international systems are established, as is information exchange with the Internal Revenue, the State Police, the Ministry of Health, and affiliated agencies.

35. **Output 3:** Improving the technical capacity of all relevant control agencies and support services through fully trained instructors and staff working in precursor control, as well as elaborating teaching materials, are going to be a continual task. Pedagogical materials for the training of different personnel categories in different government agencies were provided; the on-the-job training modules for instructors in the decentralized units were not shown to the consultants. The implementation of a training program for the Federal Police personnel and for other government control agencies personnel, including the Internal Revenue, the State Police, the Ministry of Health, and the Federal Highway Police was carried out. The improvement of technical capacity had another related activity: the design and publication of “user-friendly” manuals, information booklets, and posters for reference at control posts (seaports, airports, and Highway Police frontier outposts).
36. **Output 4:** Access to technological equipment and materials allowing for the implementation of chemical precursors control in 27 Federal Police Superintendences and decentralized units was provided. The laboratories to support control activities are located in the Superintendences. Related activities like transportation and test kits acquisition were duly performed. The manager informed that the test kits were developed by the Police experts themselves. The project equipped the Superintendences laboratories and the National Forensic Institute (INC).
37. **Output 5:** A Memorandum of Understanding between Brazil and frontier countries ensured the maintenance of a systematic coordination and information exchange within Brazil and with its Latin-American neighbors for cooperation in the monitoring and control of chemical precursors. This Memorandum of Understanding includes: international workshops/seminars on precursors control coordination in the National Police Academy, in Brasilia; coordination meetings for precursor control programme managers; training programs in chemical precursor

control for South American managers at technical and intermediary levels. The project provided the necessary support for the Brazilian police officers to participate in meetings, workshops, and training programmes in chemical precursor control in other Latin-American countries. A computerized information system between Brazil and neighboring countries is still missing and is to be developed.

38. All aforementioned outputs are linked to the main control objective.

2.4. Implementation

39. A new Brazilian president took office in the beginning of 2003 during the project implementation period. The new government made changes in the management level personnel, thus affecting the project implementation. The documents available to the consultants include monitoring reports (Project Progress Report), which did not show any constraints for the execution of the project. Nevertheless, these changes adversely effected the execution of the implementation schedule, as the newly appointed managers needed time to familiarize themselves both with the project and of the responsibilities now placed upon them to complete the program.

40. Monitoring the implementation by following the regular reports is useful and should be carried out at occasional meetings, when doubts can be clarified.

2.5. Institutional and Management Arrangements

41. The Brazilian governments' structure to manage public affairs used to be centralized. The Federal Police has a command chain hierarchically defined, but not always efficient in dealing with management issues. The lack of communication among the different levels could be a factor of difficulty. Some relevant information could not be delivered by nor to a medium-level manager, under pains of being mistaken. The consultants were concerned and embarrassed to ask for important information at various levels. The project executive manager's creativity mostly overcame these problems; as a result, there was not a negative impact on the management arrangements. A delay in the project delivery is considered an expected difficulty derived from a new government situation.

42. The document that was made available for the evaluation team indicated that the project received the necessary support from the UNODC in Brasilia. The same document points out the cooperation and partnership of the Brazilian Cooperation Agency/ Ministry of Foreign Affairs (ABC/MRE).

3. OUTCOMES, IMPACTS AND SUSTAINABILITY

3.1. Outcomes

43. As expected in the AD/BRA/98/D33PRODOC, the outcomes are as follows:

Outcome 1: An institutional structure for the control of chemicals defined, developed, and implemented through the establishment of coordinating mechanisms involving 27 Federal Police Regional Superintendencies and their respective decentralized units.

45. Before the implementation of the project, the chemical precursor control was just an idea, due to the weakness of the institutional structure to perform the necessary actions to avoid the possible diversion of such substances. The Federal Police budget alone could not have covered the mission expenditures without external inputs.

46. The UNODC's experience, support, and know-how, together with the assistance provided by the project's managers, enabled the project to:

- Hire a consultant to detail the macro diagnosis for the purpose of organizationally restructuring, drawing up, and implementing specific programmes;
- Hire a consultancy to design, develop, and implement a computerized chemical precursor control system;
- Carry out a basic training in the new registration module for national companies into the chemical Precursors Control System, according to the changes introduced in the chemical precursors control law;
- Hold a Seminar on Specialization in Techniques for Investigating the Misuse of Chemicals in partnership with the Internal Revenue, the Federal Highway Police, the State Police, and all neighboring countries;
- Hold a training course on Chemical Substances Analysis;
- Facilitate the Brazilian officers' participation in the international meeting;
- Make it possible for a group of experts to participate in a meeting to discuss the control of chemical products and chemical substances for pharmaceutical use at a global level;

- Send a Technical Assistant to attend a Conference of Drug Control Experts held at the UNODC headquarters.
47. **Outcome 2:** A fully operational computerized precursor control system to link and coordinate the 27 Regional Superintendences and their respective decentralized units.
48. The project included:
- Specifications of the equipment and platforms to be acquired for the system (they have already been delivered);
 - Hiring of a consultancy company to design, develop, and implement a computerized control system for monitoring the activities related to chemical precursors;
 - Training professionals from the South, Southeast, North, Northeast, and Midwest regions on how to use the new chemical precursor control system.
49. **Outcome 3:** Chemical control physical infrastructure improved, including that of laboratory facilities, making it possible for the Regional Superintendences to effectively control chemicals.
50. In addition of the mentioned outcomes, during the project implementation, the following activities were performed:
- A Seminar on Specialization in Techniques for Investigating the Misuse of Chemicals;
 - A bilateral training course involving Brazil and Colombia on Analysis of Chemical Substances.

3.2. Impact

51. The implementation of the project is yet to be completed, but, in spite of that and according to its conception and design, the chemical precursors diversion will be better controlled. Police intelligence, by analyzing the data, already knows the industrial production and the average trade. Some of these results have been shown during the evaluating team's meetings. The chemical precursor's route, according to the policemen's meeting, is changing and it is possible to track the changes.

52. It is the consultants' opinion that the real impact of the project will only be known after its full implementation and by comparison with other indicators.
53. The effects caused by the drug trafficking law enforcement are positive and can be even ameliorated. The judge's interpretation of the law states clearly now that the chemical precursors diversion may be a drug trafficking modality. This interpretation can protect society against criminals. Police officers were able to demonstrate by the sentences being imposed that judges now viewed the illegal diversion of chemical precursors as a crime of equal seriousness to that of trafficking in drugs.
54. The full implementation of the computerized system will not adversely affect the industry or the regular trade, since the new system will issue the legal documentation immediately and production data feeding is programmed to operate online, directly from the chemical plants computers into the police database.

3.3. Sustainability

55. The Strengthening of Chemical Precursor Control project has its sustainability guaranteed by a federal law, which charges fees from the private sector to issue a registry number and an authorization to commercialize, export, and import those substances. It also demands that the government invest a percentage of all fees received in the fight against de drug trafficking. Since the project managers do not officially deal with public budget themselves their autonomy is limited.
56. The total amount deposited into this legal fund during the year 2005 was about seventeen million *reais* (approximately US\$7,400,000 equivalent). It seems that the percentage charged is enough to guarantee the sustainability of the project's actions.
57. The same law makes provisions on chemical precursors and enables the Ministry of Justice to update the chemical substances list. This legal consent can speed police actions and assign legality to them, besides maintaining the law enforcement according with the last scientific discoveries.
58. Federal Police Department developed a special way to recruit, among its officers, who had the capacity to do the precursors control. Policemen specialization and the special way to recruit personnel to perform these jobs made them able to create a

social awareness of the importance of controlling chemical precursors. The professional awareness is one of the project sustainability guarantees.

4. LESSONS LEARNED AND BEST PRACTICES

4.1. Lessons Learned

59. During the elaboration of this evaluation report, the evaluating team observed as lessons learned:

- a) For effectiveness and efficiency, it is necessary for an organization to have professional personnel mainly or fully dedicated to the project management;
- b) Daily assistance to the final user of the computerized system is useful;
- c) An easy communication among the personnel involved helps achieve a goal;
- d) For creativity and effectiveness purposes, it is necessary a plural hierarchical decision line in the organization;
- e) It is possible to control chemical precursors using a reliable and well-conceived computerized system;
- f) The politician are sensitive to a well-done project design aimed at reducing drug trafficking and it can give confidence enough to justify changes in law even if it produces further obligation;
- g) Industrial and trade companies are sensitive to drug matters and can change their procedures to contribute with the fight against drug trafficking.

4.2. Best Practices

a. –Laboratory Practice –

60. The criminals' creativity varies on a day-to-day basis; therefore, a *modus operandi* that has been found by the police can be outmoded a few days later. A project management could also use speedy maneuvers.

61. The creation of a field laboratory during the project development can be an interesting experience.

62. The General Coordination of Drug Law Enforcement Police (CGPRE) chooses one of the most important units as a managing unit and as a police practical laboratory. It is supposed to send a new general orientation to their decentralized offices, which

is then tried and tested in the city of Belo Horizonte. Only after the new process is approved it can be adopted countrywide. The CGPRE, as the main administrative controller, avoids giving an order that has not been tested and approved beforehand.

b. – Informal structure –

63. The government formal structure is not flexible enough to allow for changes, which hinders performance. Because of such rigidity, the CGPRE adopted an informal organizational structure to distribute tasks and responsibilities. With this stratagem, it can better hire adequate personnel without breaching current rules or requiring a change in legislation.

c. – Kits development –

64. For policemen to identify the substances they encounter, even when they are not experts, the National Forensic Institute/Federal Police Department (INC/DPF) in consultation with UNODC, developed a kit with several chosen chemical reagents to help them recognize the substances, thus making their initial job easier. The development of these kits was based on another came from UNODC/Vienna. These kits are less expensive than those that are industrialized and save money for the police administration.

4.3. Constraints

a. Communication gap among the different administrative levels

65. The management of the project fell under the responsibility of a very busy professional from the Federal Police headquarters, who was actually in charge of more than one project. In addition to that, many other tasks prevented this manager from giving the project the required attention. As a result, not all decisions were timely made, causing a few complaints on the part of a few other professionals involved in the project development.
66. These same professionals, on the other hand, faced a similar complaint from their operational personnel, who asked for more autonomy.

b. Change in bidding rules interpretation

67. During the project development, the Federal Court of Accounts gave its own law interpretation concerning the strength of the law as well as Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the UN/System. The bidding procedures for procurement had to comply

with this new interpretation. The Converge Manual was designed and approved by all Parties and has been applied since 2004.

c. Delay in the development of the computerized system

68. Changes in the executive management personnel resulted in a need to comply with a new point of view. In this regard, some new measures have been adopted within the framework of the information technology, such as a different structure for elaborating reports and filing. The company hired to develop that technology was not able to do it on a timely basis nor train its personnel in updating the changes. Some of those who bought the technology devices could not use them.

5. RECOMMENDATIONS

69. For the evaluating team, the AD/BRA/98/D33 - “Strengthening of Chemical Precursor Control” – project was a very important prevention tool against drug trafficking increase.
70. The project design is ambitious, considering the number of controlled chemical products, the size of the country and the length of its borders. It takes a permanent and well-built structure to tackle the huge task of covering such large territory against drug trafficking.
71. The general recommendations include: the development of a similar project to the one under evaluation after a clearer idea and data have been gathered about the most predictable number of possibilities or alternatives to keep the main management team and hire specialized personnel in each field, even for the bidding process. A system must include not only policemen chosen among those who are more knowledgeable about their work, but also a number of experts who can develop tools aimed at making the job easier and less dangerous.
72. The evaluation team recommends attention to the company hired to develop the computerized system for the project being careful and analyze possibilities and alternatives, always bearing the schedule in mind.

5.1. Issues resolved during the evaluation

73. During this final evaluation, the evaluating team did not find important issues to resolve. The visits to the offices of Belo Horizonte and Sao Paulo were very useful in practical terms. In Brasília, the explanation offered by the company that elaborated the computerized system about the system itself and its devices was very enlightening regarding its usefulness.

5.2. Actions/decisions recommended

74. The evaluating team suggests that projects like this one should have personnel in charge of their management on a full-time basis.
75. The project should be sustainable and the knowledge acquired by the personnel should be disseminating as a means to keep progress and updating ongoing.

6. OVERALL CONCLUSIONS

76. The project AD/BRA/98/D33 - Strengthening of Chemical Precursor Control - was designed to prevent deviation of chemical precursors to be used in drug fabrication by controlling their flow into the country and through the borders of the coca-producing countries.
77. The project conception foresaw police control over the manufacture, the domestic trade, the transit, and the export and import of about 150 legal substances that can produce or transform illegal drugs. It also includes personnel education on the system, investigative skills, material support, and easy communication among the units of the Federal Police Department.
78. The police offices had their physical infrastructure improved with adequate furniture, vehicles and computers being purchased through this project. The evaluators considered that the acquisition of this equipment is more than sufficient to allow the police to manage an effective control of chemical precursors.
79. The National Congress granted legal support to the project by editing a specific law. The same law provides for the financial sustainability of the project through fees and fines paid by the companies in order to receive their registration and/or trade authorization.
80. The neighboring countries were invited to participate in control, information exchange, and personnel specialization.
81. As it happens with many other governmental actions, this project had its management difficulties, but they were not strong enough to cause serious damages to the results.
82. The AD/BRA/98/D33 project (Strengthening of Chemical Precursor Control) was successful.

ANNEX ONE

UNITED NATIONS OFFICE ON DRUGS AND CRIME

PROJECT EVALUATION

TERMS OF REFERENCE

1. BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Project Title: Institutional Strengthening of the National Police Academy
(ANP)

Project Number: D31

The National Police Academy belongs to the Federal Police Department, which in turn is subordinated to the Ministry of Justice. Based in Brasilia, it was founded in 1979. Its installations and training programs are among the best in Latin America. A shortage of funds over the last decade has hampered proper updating of the Academy's programmatic content, leading to an accumulated need to replace training means and methodology and to update curricula.

As the mandate of the institution provides for continuous and comprehensive training for all Federal Police personnel, in addition to specialized courses for state police forces, other governmental agencies and police from other countries, the Academy represents the focal point for training agents of the law nationally.

At the present moment the Federal Police Department (DPF) has about 6,000 police officers and 1,900 administrative employees. They are responsible for solving a wide range of federal crimes, which include those related to the production and traffic of drugs. Due to the increasingly greater sophistication and organization of criminal groups, there is a need to select and prepare federal agents very carefully and within a modern and efficient teaching structure.

In order to enhance the institutional capacity of the ANP as a center of excellence in public security in the country, the Brazilian Government has decided to install a process of re-structuring the Academy within a global program of refining the State structure by developing a specific international-cooperation project towards this end. The United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) was requested to lend its assistance to the project in order to guarantee the necessary coordination with other projects of a similar nature, as well as the cooperation of international agencies that have had successful experiences in the area of the project in question.

The initial execution of the project was supported in partnership with the Advanced School of Financial Administration (ESAF), which is experienced in modernization programs of the Federal Executive Power. In 2002, the ESAF undertook an institutional assessment of the Academy and presented a proposal to re-engineer the institution, including its organizational structure and administrative and pedagogical practices, aimed at modernizing the work developed by the institution and making it more efficacious.

Project Title: Training for Public Security Proposals

Project Number: D32

Public security has constantly deteriorated in Brazil over recent years with steadily increasing crime rates registered by the Ministry of Justice. In 1995, Brazil had 46,385 homicides, 393,214 violent crimes, and 5,706 cases related to drug trafficking registered by a police force totaling 471,109 police¹. While state governments are unlikely to increase significantly the number of policemen in the near future, one of the objectives of this project is to increase the capacity and effectiveness of the existing police forces through better training and education.

Within its political-administrative structure based on federal states, Brazil has given plenipotentiary powers to State Governments over the two existing state police forces and thus to the development of basic police academy curriculum and training programmes used in training the state police. However, the states recognize the need for standardized approaches, as the pattern of urbanization coincides with increased crime rates, the existence of progressively more sophisticated crime organizations, and increasing problems of drug abuse and trafficking throughout the entire country, without exception.

These problems, and others emerging such as human right issues and greater incidence and severity of criminal activity throughout, make it necessary to establish common minimum training standards for all state police forces, particularly in the area of drug control. In view of this, the Government has requested UNDCP cooperation in support of activities for standardization and modernization of police training countrywide.

This project, is part of a set of measures under development by the Brazilian Government to combat rising crime and drug trafficking, and forms a vital component in a "package" of project of law enforcement, including the following other projects::

- "Institutional Strengthening of the National Police Academy" (AD/BRA/98/D31) ;
- "Integrated National System for Information on Justice and Public Security– InfoSeg"; (AD/BRA/98/D34),
- "Strengthening of Chemical Precursor Control " (AD/BRA/98/D33)

Together with the first two projects as listed above, this project forms an essential part of the "Federal Executive Power Modernization Programme", an agreement concluded between the Brazilian Government through the Administration and State Reform Ministry (MARE) and the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB). Through MARE the Government provides funds to this project, with additional complementary assistance from UNDCP.

Project Title: Strengthening of Chemical Precursor Control

Project Number: D33

Illicit drug trafficking to and through Brazil has increased significantly over the last two decades. A considerable amount of Andean cocaine transits Brazil every year for markets in North America, Europe and Africa. This trend has been noted with great concern, particularly given increased drug abuse in the country, which threatens the health and integrity of Brazilian society. In addition, increased corruption, a break down of internal security and more widespread violence associated to drug trafficking and abuse is reported in the country, especially in metropolitan areas such as Sao Paulo,

¹ Ministry of Justice, "Programa de Apoio a Modernizacao, DEASP, DPF. Brazil, 1997.

Rio de Janeiro, Fortaleza and Belo Horizonte and states bordering drug producing countries Bolivia, Colombia and Peru.

A significant amount of Cocaine produced in Colombia, Peru and Bolivia enters in Brazil through northern, western and eastern boundaries. The destination of a portion of this cocaine is the consumption in Brazil, while the remaining portion is exported to the United States and Europe. Brazil is the manufacturer of acetone and ether and also imports amounts of chemical precursors from Asia, Europe and the United States. In this context, unknown amounts of these products are diverted to illicit drug producing laboratories in neighboring countries

In 1995, as part of an overall strategy to reduce illicit drug trafficking, the Brazilian Congress adopted a new legislation on chemical precursor control in accordance with the UN Convention of 1988 and the model law elaborated by CICAD. The federal law No. 9,017 of 13 March 1995 establishes the standards of control of chemical precursors and products, which can be used for the preparation of cocaine and its derivatives, and other illicit substances, which lead to psychological or physical dependency.

The Decree No. 1,646 of 26 September 1995 assists to regulate the above-mentioned law and delegates the mandate for control of 11 essential chemical precursor products to the Narcotics Division for Prevention and Repression (DRE) of the Federal Police Department. The number of controlled chemical precursors was increased from 11 to 146 following a Ministry of Justice resolution. This Federal Law demands the formal registration of enterprises involved with the fabrication and distribution of chemical products, and for the manufacture of these chemicals, a special authorization is required from the DRE, and in the case of export, the approval of import countries is also required.

In the context of the government's efforts to tackle the increasing drug problem, the first National Anti-Drug Action Plan (PANAD) was approved in 1996. The Action Plan covers a broad range of activities including law enforcement, prevention, rehabilitation and social re-integration. With regard to law enforcement, the PANAD envisages the implementation of a national programme aimed at broadening, integrating and strengthening the fight against illicit drug trafficking. The programme includes planning, evaluation, cooperation and information exchange among Brazilian and foreign law enforcement agencies.

The programme identified, inter alia, the integration of control systems through the strengthening of the capacities of the Chemical Precursor Control Unit of the Narcotics Division, Federal Police Department (DPF), with a view to enforcing the provisions of the relevant laws. PANAD foresees the use of resources from the FUNCAB (National Fund for Drug Abuse Prevention, Treatment and Control) to implement its programmes and activities.

In efforts to tackle cross border trafficking, in 1996, an International Conference on "Internal and Across-the-Border Transportation of Chemical Precursors" was held in Rio de Janeiro, with representation from Brazil, Peru, Colombia, Venezuela, and Ecuador, among others. At this conference, the Brazilian strategy was outlined as focused on control of cross border traffic in the Amazon Basin. The Brazilian delegation presented measures to avoid the entrance of chemical precursors, the identification of drug trafficking organizations and the surveillance of illicit products coming from such enterprises. The same statement highlighted the importance of Brazil as bordering many cocaine producing countries. In addition, chemical precursors control in the

Amazon was stressed, for it is the main transit point for these substances in the country.

Project Title: National Integrated System of Information on Justice and Police
Security - INFOSEG

Project Number: D34

The continuous increase in the crime rate in Brazil, progressively connected to illicit trans-national activities, reflects the destructive potential for Brazilian society due to the growth in criminal activity and its globalization. This large-scale criminal association and the worsening of the crime rate can be especially noted in the big cities, in particular in densely populated urban areas where the State's presence is reduced and which have sprung up all over the country, notably in the last few years.

Another phenomenon noticed lately in the profile of criminal activities in Brazil is the transformation of crime into an activity with business characteristics, with a varied degree of sophistication in administrative management of the criminal groups. This may be observed in the hierarchical organization of such groups, in the segmentation of their activities, in their articulation with other criminal factions inside and outside the country, in the refinement of their *modus operandi*, in the detailed planning of simultaneous criminal operations in various states of the federation, in the infiltration of criminals within the repressive sector of the State, and in the co-opting of public agents into crime. It might be said that the present increase in criminality in the country derives both from the expansion of the criminal groups and the increased operative capacity of already established groups. There has also been a broadening of the spectrum of activities of organized crime and – as a result of the globalization of markets – an increase in the capacity to legalize profits obtained from illicit activities that take advantage of the excellent structure of services offered by the national banking system.

In the face of this challenge, the Brazilian Government, attentive to the growing threat of urban criminality and organized crime in the country and to the signs of weakening of the power of the State to provide society with security, has been developing a series of concrete actions to combat the criminal organizations. This strategy includes short- and long-term actions in the area of increasing the repressive capacity of the State, training and modernizing the police force, expanding the prison system, promoting respect for human rights, ensuring individual protection of the citizen, legislative actions, incentives and support for public organizations, greater organizational capacity for civil society, among others.

In this context the Ministry of Justice acknowledged the need to develop an Integrated National System of Information on Justice and Public Security (Infoseg) to centralize all the available information on justice in the country, as well as to make all this information readily available to the State agents responsible for public security. Infoseg is to operate as a system for accessing the various databases of personal and criminal information that exist on the federal level, as well as those held in the states by the Public Security Secretariats.

Another characteristic of Infoseg - one common to control systems that make extensive use of information technology – is the existence of a module with the capacity to produce intelligence to support police activities through selective processing of a large quantity of information.

To help to implement this system, the Brazilian Government sought the cooperation of the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime in order to permit articulating actions with other countries in the area of combating trans-national crime, as well as benefiting from international experiences that have proved successful in this area.

In the early phase of development, the Ministry of Justice contracted for this purpose the Data Processing Company of the State of Rio Grande do Sul (Procergs) and the Data Processing Company of the State of São Paulo (Prodesp). Procergs presented an initial project to evaluate and select the technology to be used, starting work in August 1996. A pilot-project was developed and implemented in January 1997, linking up Brasília, Rio Grande do Sul and São Paulo. After a period during which the Ministry of Justice, the Federal Police and other public-security organs of the two states made an assessment of the operational capacity of the system and the quality of the information made available, it was decided that the other states would be interlinked to the system.

2. PURPOSE OF THE EVALUATION

The purpose is to evaluate 4 Law Enforcement Projects (2 related to training area and 2 related to IT area) learn from the Projects so that lessons are drawn to become the basis for instituting improvements for future and other follow-up activities that can be accomplished by measuring achievements, outcomes and impacts both positive and negative of the Projects and preparing a final evaluation report.

The evaluation is being undertaken because the Projects will be terminated in September 2005, considering that an external final evaluation is foreseen in the project document.

The main stakeholders are:

Brasília:

Ministry of Justice: Training Unit and Infosegs' Management

Federal Police Department: Drug Law Enforcement Unit, Chemical Precursors Unit, and the National Police Academy.

3. EVALUATION SCOPE

The timeframe established to cover the Evaluation will be from September 1998 to September 2005.

The Evaluation will analyze: a) project concept and design; b) project implementation; and c) outputs, outcomes and impact of the project. It should also ensure that lessons learnt from the project will be recorded and recommendations for the future and other follow-up activities will be made, as appropriate.

Project concept and design

The evaluation should assess the project concept and design, specifically:

- f* The project strategies;
- f* The immediate objective/s and planned outputs, activities and inputs as compared to cost effective alternatives;

- f* The clarity, logic and coherence of the project document;
- f* The executing modality and managerial arrangements for the project;
- f* Arrangements for monitoring and evaluation;
- f* The appropriateness and cost effectiveness of baseline studies and achievement indicators;
- f* The adequacy of the identification and assessment of risks to the project;

Implementation

The evaluation should assess the project implementation, specifically:

- f* Implementation of activities specified in the project document:
- f* the quality and timeliness of inputs;
- f* the timeliness, efficiency and effectiveness of activities carried out.

Monitoring and management:

- f* of the project
- f* the support from Government
- f* the services provided by the implementing agency.

External factors:

- f* the extent to which external factors (beyond the control of project management) significantly affected implementation in a positive or negative way;
- f* the adequacy of the project's response to the external factors.

Project outputs, outcomes and impact

The evaluation should assess the project outputs, outcomes and impact, specifically:

- f* the quality and quantity of outputs produced and of outcomes;
- f* the achievement of the immediate objectives;
- f* the sustainability of project results and benefits;
- f* whether the project had any significant unexpected effects of beneficial or detrimental character.

Missing: These information are part of all reports: TPR, PPR, Monthly and Quarterly. Including also the mid-term evaluation report. This will be part of the package for the consultants.

- f* Problems and constraints encountered during implementation
- f* Impact of project
- f* Whether project addresses the identified needs/problems
- f* Role played by FO in development and implementation of project

Recommendations

The consultants shall make recommendations, as appropriate. They should constitute proposals for concrete action, which could be taken in future to improve or rectify undesired outcomes. Recommendations may also be made in respect of issues related to the implementations of management of the project.

Lessons learned

The evaluation will record any lessons learned from the project, which can contribute, to follow-up activities, as well as the design of new strategies and project in the area of law enforcement.

Documentation

Attached to the terms of reference, the consultant will find copy of project document in English, the revisions, mid term evaluation, PPRs (Annual) and TPR reports (Annex I). Other documents will be available at UNODC Office in Brasilia and in the project coordination unit.

4. EVALUATION METHODS

The evaluation team should develop a specific methodology for the final evaluation based on the terms of reference. The quantitative and qualitative information will be collected and analysed by:

- f* Document review, this will include major documents such as the project document and its revisions, progress and monitoring reports, terminal reports, self-evaluations;
- f* Interviews with all key informants and key players;
- f* Field visits - 2 visits are planned to state authorities to interview beneficiaries from training programmes, equipment, Infoseg users, and chemical precursors unit. Meetings will take place with state authorities and Federal Police officers to cover individual aspects of the evaluation.
- f* Questionnaires;
- f* Observation and other participatory techniques such as focus groups;
- f* Participation of partners and stakeholders;
- f* Benchmarking.

Interviews can also be conducted by phone calls to stakeholders in border regions.

5. EVALUATION TEAM COMPOSITION

An independent evaluation team, that has had no prior involvement with the projects during its design and implementation phases, will be formed and carry out the evaluation.

The team will be composed of one international and two national consultants/evaluators. The international evaluator will be a professional who has expert knowledge and experience in the following areas

- f* Expertise in quantitative and qualitative research evaluation methods, with at least 06 years of professional experience in the field of public security;
- f* Advanced university degree, preferably in social sciences or related area. This can be substituted by a first-level degree and at least 10 years of professional experience in evaluation methods;
- f* Fluency in English and Portuguese is an asset;
- f* Conflict resolution skills.

One national evaluator will be a professional who has expert knowledge and experience in the following areas

- f* Expertise in quantitative and qualitative research evaluation methods, with at least 06 years of professional experience in the field of public security;
- f* Expertise in operations management in the field of public security training;

- f* Advanced university degree (*strictu sensu*), preferably in information systems or related area.;
- f* Fluency in English;
- f* Conflict resolution skills.

One national evaluator will be a professional who has expert knowledge and experience in the following areas

- f* Expertise in quantitative and qualitative research evaluation methods, with at least 06 years of professional experience in the field of public security;
- f* Expertise in evaluation of implementation process;
- f* System analysis;
- f* IT Infrastructure for networks, security and Oracle Database;
- f* Advanced university degree (*strictu sensu*), preferably in IT management or related area. This can be substituted by a first-level degree and at least 10 years of professional experience in technical assessment activity of the implementation and management of information policies processes;
- f* Fluency in English;
- f* Conflict resolution skills.

Work experience in the United Nations will be considered an asset.

The invitation for the consultant will be officially signed and sent by UNODC.

The consultant will not act, as representative of any party, but should use its independent judgment. The consultant was not involved in the design, appraisal or implementation of the project.

6. PLANNING AND IMPLEMENTATION ARRANGEMENTS

Briefings, Consultations and Administrative Support

Upon arrival in Brasilia, the team will be briefed by the UNODC Representative, who will provide the necessary substantive and operational support.

The evaluation mission will be carried out in Brazil, during the period of November 8 to December 2 2005.

The Evaluator does not have the authority to make any commitment on behalf of the project parties, i.e. UNODC and donors.

Evaluation Report and Follow-Up

A meeting will be arranged by UNODC where the consultant will present and discuss with Project parties the main findings of the evaluation mission. Although the consultant should take the views expressed into account, it should use its independent judgment in preparing the final report. Within two weeks after the end of the mission the consultant will produce the draft report in English that will be circulated for comments to the Project Executing Agency, the UNODC Brazil. The consultant may then incorporate any comments in the final evaluation report using his independent judgment.

The UNODC standard format and guidelines for the preparation of project evaluation reports will be followed by the consultant. The UNODC standard format for the final evaluation report (Annex II) is attached to these terms of reference. The consultant is

also expected to fill out the summary assessment questionnaire (Annex III) and an evaluation summary (Annex IV), according to the attached guidelines.

The final version of the evaluation report shall be sent to the UNODC, Brazil, in not more than 20 (twenty) days after leaving Brazil. The reports should be individual and submitted in English, not exceeding 20 pages for each project, to the office at headquarters responsible for the project. The UNODC will distribute the final report to the other parties of the project. The draft report will be discussed at a project final tripartite meeting (TPR) where conclusions and recommendations on the evaluation will be made. A draft final evaluation report should be submitted to Chief of the Independent Evaluation Unit (IEU) for comments and clearance.

Evaluation report outline

The evaluation report will have the following topics:

- f* Executive summary (maximum 4 pages);
- f* Introduction;
- f* Background (Programme/project description);
- f* Evaluation purpose and objective;
- f* Evaluation Methodology;
- f* Major findings;
- f* Lessons learnt (from both positive and negative experiences);
- f* Constraints that impacted project delivery;
- f* Recommendations and conclusions.

Annexes to the evaluation report should be kept to an absolute minimum. Only those annexes that save to demonstrate or clarify an issue related to a major finding should be included.

Timetable

This section should specify the overall timetable for the evaluation and should, in particular, identify the starting and finishing dates of the evaluation.

8/September/2005	Draft TOR
/2005	Send TOR to HQ (LAC+IEU)
30/October/2005	Publish TOR
11/November/2005	Last day to receive proposals
18/November/2005	Issue contracts
22/November/2005	Arrival in Brasilia
23/November/2005	Meeting with UNODC
24/November/2005	Meeting with D31
25/November/2005	Meeting with Project D32
28/November/2005	Meeting with Project D33
29/November/2005	Meeting with Project D34
30Nov to 02Dec/2005	Meeting with other stakeholders
05/ to 09 December/2005	Field Visit
16/DecemberNovember/2005	Meeting with UNODC for the presentation of the draft report
21/ December2005	Departure
16/ January/2006	Delivery of the Final Report

ANNEX TWO

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime

Project evaluation

AD/BRA/98/D33 - Strengthening chemical precursor control

Organisations and places visited and persons met

Organizations

1. National Police Academy, Brasilia
2. Ministry of Public Security/ Public Security National Secretary, Brasilia
3. UNODC Field Office, Brasilia
4. Federal Police Department Head Quarter and TI General Coordination, Brasilia
5. Federal Police, Belo Horizonte
6. Federal Police, Sao Paulo

Persons

1. Dr. Viviane da Rosa, Director of National Police Academy
2. Senior management and training staff at the National Police Academy
3. Dr. Alciomar Goersch, Director of Project, Federal Police
4. Paulo Martins Beltrao Filho, Chief of Projects Division, Federal Police
5. Senior management of Projects Division, Federal Police
6. Reiner Pungs, Program Coordinator, UNODC Field Office, Brasilia
7. Luis Carlos da Silva Ramos, Delegado Federal Police
8. Julio Danilo Souza Ferreira, Delegado Federal Police
9. Rodrigo Geraldo Aguiar, Delegado Federal Police
10. Superintendent of Federal Police and staff, Belo Horizonte
11. Superintendent of Federal Police and staff, Sao Paulo

ANNEX THREE

Summary Assessment Questionnaire

I. NUMBER AND TITLE OF PROJECT:

AD/BRA/98/D33 - Strengthening chemical precursor control

II. SUMMARY ASSESSMENT:

1. Please provide an assessment for all categories listed (including categories constituting headings) by ticking one of the boxes ranging from 0 to 5. The ratings from 0 to 5 are based on the following standard favor-to-disfavor scale:

- 5 - Outstanding, highly appropriate, much more than planned/expected, certain to materialize
- 4 - Very good, very appropriate, more than planned/expected, highly likely to materialize
- 3 - Good, appropriate, as planned/expected, likely to materialize
- 2 - Fair, less appropriate, less than planned/expected, less likely to materialize
- 1 - Unsatisfactory, not appropriate, far below plans/expectations, unlikely to materialize
- 0 - Cannot determine, not applicable

2. If a category has been significant (as a cause or effect) in relation to the overall quality and/or performance of the project please tick the “S” column (if significant) or the “H” column (if highly significant).

	H	S	0	1	2	3	4	5
OVERALL QUALITY AND PERFORMANCE OF PROJECT:							X	
I. PROJECT CONCEPT AND DESIGN:								
1. Project document (overall clarity, logic and coherence).							X	
2. Identification/analysis of problem addressed by project:							X	
3. Project strategy (overall assessment):						X		
4. Drug control objective (s) (Appropriateness, obtainability):						X		
5. Immediate objective(s) (appropriateness, Obtainability):							X	
6. Achievement indicators:								
7. Base-line study/arrangements for base-line study:			X					
8. Outputs (compared to cost effective alternatives):						X		
9. Activities (compare to cost effective alternatives):						X		
10. Inputs (compared to cost effective alternatives):							X	
11. Executing modality and managerial arrangements:					X			
12. Identification and assessment of risks							X	
13. Prior obligations and prerequisites:						X		
14. Workplan/planned project duration:						X		
15. Budget:						X		

	H	S	0	1	2	3	4	5
II. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION:								
1. Quality and timeliness of UNODC inputs:						X		
2. Quality and timeliness of Government inputs:					X			
3. Quality and timeliness of inputs by third parties:					X			
4. Equipment: *inappropriate in the sense of being premature and generous						X		
5. Advisory/training services:						X		
6. Project personnel:				X				
7. Sub-contracting:			X					
8. Management of project:					X			
9. Project workplans:						X		
10. Implementation of activities:						X		
11. Monitoring and backstopping by UNODC HQ:						X		
12. Monitoring and backstopping by UNODC field Office:						X		
13. Monitoring and backstopping by Executing Agency:					X			
14. Monitoring and backstopping by Government:					X			
15. Government fulfillment of prerequisites:						X		
III. PROJECT RESULTS:								
1. Timeliness of produced outputs;						X		
2. Quantity of produced outputs:						X		
3. Quality of produced outputs:						X		
4. Outcomes: achievement/likely achievement of immediate objective(s):							X	
5. Drug control impact achieved:							X	
6. Drug control impact to be expected							X	
7. Likely sustainability of project results:								X

3. If external factors had an impact on project performance please tick the appropriate boxes: external factors impeded: ___/ promoted: X project performance. The effect on project performance of this influence was significant: ___/ highly significant: X. Please provide a short description of the nature of the external factor(s):

Nevertheless the specific law, the involvement chemistry's industries and external commerce enterprises in this matter were very important to the success of this project.

4. Did the evaluation recommend to:

- a) ___ abandons the project
- b) ___ continue/extend the project without modifications
- c) X continue/extend the project with minor modifications
- d) ___ continue/extend the project with some modifications
- e) ___ continue/extend the project with extensive modification
- f) ___ terminate the projects, as planned

5. If a modification of the project was recommended did the evaluation recommend a revision of: the drug control objective(s): ____, the immediate objective(s): ____, the outputs: ____, the activities: X or the inputs: ____.

It is recommended some change in the decision chain, searching for management decentralization.

6. If the evaluation recommended that the project or significant elements of it be replicate please tick as appropriate: yes: X/ no: ____