Terminal Evaluation Report

Project Number: CPR/G75

Project title: Suppression of illicit manufacturing and trafficking of Amphetamine Type Stimulants (ATS) in South China

Thematic area: Supply Reduction

Country: China

Evaluator: F. Richard Dickins

Period: 9 -20 November 2007
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONTENTS</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CONTENTS</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF ACRONYMS</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>I. INTRODUCTION</strong></td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1. Background and Context</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2. Purpose and Objective of the Evaluation</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3. Executing Modality / Management Arrangements</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4. Scope and Methodology of the Evaluation</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2. ANALYSIS AND MAJOR FINDINGS</strong></td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1. Overall performance assessment</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2. Attainment of Objectives</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3. Achievement of Programme/Project Results and outputs</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4. Implementation</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5. Institutional and Management Arrangements</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3. OUTCOMES, IMPACTS and SUSTAINABILITY</strong></td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1. Outcomes</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2. Impact</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3. Sustainability</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4. LESSONS LEARNED AND BEST PRACTICES</strong></td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1. Lessons Learned</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2. Best Practices</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3. Constraints</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5. RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1. Issues resolved during evaluation
5.2. Actions/decisions recommended

6. OVERALL CONCLUSIONS

Annexes

A. Terms of reference
B. Background papers/materials used during the evaluation
C. Organizations and places visited and persons met during the evaluation
D. List of eighteen substances identified from street samples by FPI
E. Excerpts from Jiangmen City Police report on G75 training
Acronyms

AFP  Australian Federal Police
ATS  Amphetamine Type Substances
CBT  Computer Based Training
CMIS Case Management Intelligence System
DVD  Digital Video Disc
FPI  Fujian Police Institute
HPLC  High Performance Liquid Chromatograph
MOU  Memorandum of Understanding
NCB  Narcotics Control Bureau (Provincial)
NCC  Narcotics Control Committee (Provincial)
NNCC  National Narcotics Control Commission (Beijing)
NPC  National Project Coordinator
ONCB  Officer of the Narcotic Control Board (Thailand)
PC  Project Coordinator
PSB  Public Security Bureau
PSD  Public Security Department
UNODC United Nations Office of Drugs and Crime

Disclaimer

Independent Project Evaluations are scheduled and managed by the project managers and conducted by external independent evaluators. The role of the Independent Evaluation Unit (IEU) in relation to independent project evaluations is one of quality assurance and support throughout the evaluation process, but IEU does not directly participate in or undertake independent project evaluations. It is, however, the responsibility of IEU to respond to the commitment of the United Nations Evaluation Group (UNEG) in professionalizing the evaluation function and promoting a culture of evaluation within UNODC for the purposes of accountability and continuous learning and improvement.

Due to the disbandment of the Independent Evaluation Unit (IEU) and the shortage of resources following its reinstitution, the IEU has been limited in its capacity to perform these functions for independent project evaluations to the degree anticipated. As a result, some independent evaluation reports posted may not be in full compliance with all IEU or UNEG guidelines. However, in order to support a transparent and learning environment, all evaluations received during this period have been posted and as an on-going process, IEU has begun re-implementing quality assurance processes and instituting guidelines for independent project evaluations as of January 2011.
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. Summary table of findings, supporting evidence and recommendations:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Findings: identified problems/issues</th>
<th>Supporting evidence/examples</th>
<th>Recommendations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. CBT is a highly regarded methodology for teaching basic drug enforcement techniques to large numbers of personnel.</td>
<td>An average of 50% increase in knowledge from pre-test to post test examinations. Officers can take this style of training at various times which permits regular work schedules to be adhered to.</td>
<td>Continue to provide CBT training to all law enforcement personnel regardless of their primary responsibility, e.g. Customs, Criminal Police, Community Police, Railway and Airport Police and Border Police.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Some problems exist with the translation of CBT programs into the Chinese language. Also recommendations that the programmes be updated.</td>
<td>Experienced officers undergoing this training reported some of the words and phrases were incorrectly translated. In addition new techniques and trends were not included in the current program.¹</td>
<td>Refer the comments to the manager of AD/GLO/03/H17 for consideration and action. Consideration be given to developing a system for circulating trends and information to front line personnel.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. CMIS is a valuable case management tool that benefits managers and investigators.</td>
<td>This system is still undergoing initial implementation. Experienced officers who have worked with the program see tremendous value to be derived in terms of capitalizing on all of the information held within the enforcement community.</td>
<td>Once there is a core group of trained persons in each province all drug investigational information should be entered in the central data base.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The FPI laboratory is using the HPLC to good advantage.</td>
<td>Discussion and records available at the Fujian Laboratory</td>
<td>Consideration be given to including this laboratory in the UN Regional network.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. The FPI laboratory does not have standard samples of every drug or precursor chemical.</td>
<td>Standard samples are an important requirement to establish the laboratory’s credentials on a national and international basis.</td>
<td>FPI should approach the national laboratory for standards. The UNODC laboratory could assist if necessary.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. The international meetings to exchange information and develop contacts has resulted in greater cooperation</td>
<td>Documented investigations involving more than one country have increased in number and quality.</td>
<td>Similar meetings, study tours should be encouraged as means of enhancing cooperation on international investigations.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

² The CBT software program is intended to provide a basic understanding an approach to drug enforcement. It cannot be a substitute for the communication of the latest information concerning trends.

2. Summary Report

2.1 Summary description of the project

This was a relatively short term project covering an initial period of eighteen months with a limited budget of just less than half million US dollars. The project was designed to enhance law enforcement capability in the South China provinces of Fujian and Guangdong to combat the production and trafficking of ATS. The overall objective was to provide skills and equipment that would enable the law enforcement agencies of the two provinces to better understand, gather, organize, and exchange drug control related information between themselves, NNCC, other provinces and internationally. This objective was to be achieved through four key activities:
a) **Enhanced Laboratory Services**

The project aimed to improve laboratory services through the provision of a High Performance Liquid Chromatograph (HPLC). The laboratory’s current equipment does not allow for rapid analysis that is needed to profile seized substances and conduct speedy trace analyses. Ancillary to the equipment was the training of technicians to operate and effectively use the highly technical equipment to its maximum potential.

b) **Expanded drug and ATS enforcement training programme**

Many enforcement officers are unfamiliar with drugs, ATS and precursor chemicals. It was recognized that not only the specialized drug enforcement units need drug and ATS training but all enforcement personnel should have a basic understanding in case they encounter drug related issues during the course of their duties. To provide quality training to large numbers of officers on a continual basis and in the Chinese language it was decided to use a Computer Based Training (CBT) program that has been developed by UNODC.

c) **Establishment of a Case Management System**

The project sought to introduce and install a computerized case management program. This program would allow the provincial law enforcement agencies to conduct better strategic and case planning through the analysis of intelligence and investigative information. Case Management Intelligence System (CMIS) was the system chosen as most appropriate to the needs of PSD in the two provinces. This portion of the project’s activities was to be undertaken by the Australian Government through the auspices of the Australian Federal Police (AFP).

d) **Improved international cooperation**

ATS and drug investigations involve other countries on a regular basis, either as recipients of ATS or drugs or as the production site for organized criminals. Bringing together senior drug enforcement officers from different countries is proven to increase the level of cooperation. The project intended to hold meetings for senior Chinese officers with their counterparts in other regional countries. During these meetings senior law enforcement officials could discuss the exchange of information and expert technical advice with a view to improving their level of international cooperation.

The project’s activities drew from other established UNODC projects that were underway in the region.

2.2 **Major finding of the evaluation**

2 The Accord Plan of Action –AD/RAS/00/F73
Precursor Control in East Asia – AD/RAS/01/F34
Global Expansion of CBT – AD/GLO/03/H17
Scientific Support to strengthen regulator and law enforcement control of ATS and their precursors in East, South and South-east Asia – AD/GLO/03/H44
The project achieved the objectives identified in the project document which was well designed and based upon a sound understanding of the drug and ATS situation existing in Fujian, Guangdong and the region in general. The objectives met a need and contributed to an improvement in the overall enforcement output respecting ATS in both of the Provinces. There was an expectation that the activities could be carried out in an eighteen month time period however due to staff changes and delays in ordering and receiving specialized equipment a nine month extension was granted. All of UNODC’s activity responsibilities have been concluded. The AFP is continuing with their support as part of their commitment under the project. The AFP liaison officer in Guangzhou continues to provide support to CMIS as part of the continuity following on from the project. The project design focused on four activities in order to achieve the overall objective. The following addressed each of the activities:

a) Improving the capacity of the provincial laboratory.

The laboratory staff in concert with the project managers selected a HPLC as the most beneficial analytical equipment given the current state of the provincial laboratories. The Province of Guangdong went ahead and purchased one HPLC from its own resources and as a consequence the funds initially intended for this equipment were diverted into the CBT program. Authorities in Fujian Province augmented project funds from their own resources to purchase the selected HPLC. The Fujian Police Institute (FPI) received the HPLC in early 2007 and commenced regular operational use in August following training and testing period. Since August a large number of analyses have been conducted, without the new machine it would not have been possible to carry out this number of analyses in the same time period. Currently there is a study underway using the results from this HPLC to provide a profile of Fuzhou street level ATS. Laboratory management aims to expand this study to cover a larger portion of the province during 2008. Committing their own funds demonstrates strong support for this initiative and the long term plans show the HPLC is an integral part of the laboratory’s programme.

b) Computer Based Training to be provided to all enforcement agencies

The CBT program has been installed by the project in five locations in each province. CBT centres/classrooms are functioning from within existing PSD training institutes. Officers from drug law enforcement sections and many other enforcement agencies have had access to the training program. Senior management in both provinces reports an increase in enforcement activity that they attribute to the CBT program. This system is well received and each province has, from its own resources, added computer stations to those installed by the project. The Chinese Customs have created their own training centre using the UNODC software as a result of observing the success of the project’s training centres. Another CBT centre was established in the Yunnan Provincial Police Academy with the software and technical support provided by this project. There were a few constructive comments from students and managers regarding the content of the training, these are report in detail in the main section of this evaluation. None of the comments detract from the positive response to this training. The training has been a success and each province has incorporated the training into their regular curriculums.

c) The introduction of a case management system.

3 The term student refers to those taking the CBT training. In many instances this includes seasoned and senior personnel many of whom have extensive drug enforcement experience. It is only after these officers have completed the course that younger and less experienced personnel undergo the training.
The CMIS system has only recently become operational in Guangdong Province and while there have been some positive results the long term effects and implications will require further evaluation at a later time. The training of provincial officers was initiated in Guangdong province and progressed at a controlled rate to ensure a full understanding of the software. The decision to allow those taking the training to spend extra time working with the program has proven itself. These officers are better able to handle inquiries regarding the program at their local levels. This has helped to avoid the development of misunderstandings concerning the programs capabilities and limitations. The system effectively provides a data analysis tool that was not previously available to the investigators or managers in the two provinces. The installation and training are just commencing in Fujian Province. This initiative has not been implemented as fast as was expected by the project. It is unlikely that at the time the project document was drafted it would have been difficult to forecast the issues that have slowed the implementation of this system. Much of the delay has been technical which could not have been foreseen. The system is now operational in Guangdong and can be expected to be operational in Fujian early this coming year. The continuing of this activity is being monitored and supported by the AFP, primarily through the attention being given by the Liaison Office posted to Guangzhou.

\[d\] Improved International Cooperation.

Study tours have taken place. These provided senior enforcement personnel from the two provinces and NNCC to meet with their counterparts from other regional countries to discuss cooperation and other issues related to drug control. During interviews the participants indicate that meeting with their counterparts from other countries\(^4\) in the region provided a better understanding of the overall problem facing law enforcement. Plus the meetings allowed for a more personal contact to be developed which is important when considering the exchanging law enforcement intelligence. A number of international investigations have already been enhanced as a result of cooperation between China and other countries.

As initially noted this is a small project however the activities undertaken have proven to be a catalyst in that other provinces within China are interested in acquiring similar support for their jurisdictions. The positive results that have already been shown in Guangdong and Fujian have caused the other provinces to recognize the value of the project’s activities.

2.3 Lessons learned and best practices

The holding of regional, sub-regional and national meetings among law enforcement officials has beneficial effects beyond the specific topic of precursor control. Bringing people together results in an exchange of experiences and provides an added level of confidence with respect to undertaking actions that maybe new or innovative. Law enforcement information places people at risk and consequently the exchange of such information relies for the main part on trust. Trust can never be compulsory or taken for granted but must be developed. The meetings arranged under this project help to build up trust which has already led to improved cooperation in a number of international investigations.

Specialized training is expensive not only in the funds needed but the time consumed. Traditional methods for passing out large amounts of basic information do not work as well as the computer based interactive programs. The CBT concept as used in this project, although limited to basic level information, provides a standard level of education in the language of the

\(^4\) Australia, China, Indonesia, Malaysia, the Philippines and Thailand
student and is available on a twenty-four hour basis. This is an excellent technique for addressing the need to improve training in a variety of law enforcement subjects. This approach should not be regarded as only applicable to law enforcement but other fields of specialty should consider interactive CBT as a means of providing information to large numbers of people.

The flexibility to amend project activities is a necessity when there is a time lag between the development of the project and its implementation. Circumstances change and it is important to allow the project manager, with approval of the signing partners, to ensure that adjustments can take place. The decision by Guangdong to purchase an HPLC machine ahead of the project allowed additional funds to be utilized for CBT training in that province.

Computer based programmes are still new to many in law enforcement and often they are viewed with skepticism by seasoned officers. While many officers have a positive outlook on new and innovative programs some, in the management ranks, draw on any criticism as a means of negating the value of the program. This attitude has an impact on how new programs are viewed by the end users, i.e. the investigators. Training for the CMIS program has been extensive to ensure that those being trained had a thorough knowledge of the program. This will go a long way to countering any criticisms that develop locally. As a result of the controlled training there is a positive approach to CMIS and the operational units are keen to receive and participate in the program. By ensuring that the instructors who will teach or otherwise represent new programmes have a solid understanding of the program its capabilities and limitations ensures a smooth introduction into the wider enforcement community. It is anticipated that a similar approach will be taken in Fujian Province. Additional time is needed before a full evaluation of the benefits derived from this system can be assessed. Given the positive results in those jurisdictions where CMIS has been operating for a long time period there is every expectation that the same will occur in China.

2.4 Recommendation and conclusion

This project was primarily concerned with the provision of equipment and training. These activities are well underway with a very positive response from the recipients. Recommendations regarding management or policy are therefore limited. The following recommendations are not presented in any order of priority.

It is recommended that:-

a) When introducing new computer based programmes such as CMIS, that the training of those personnel who will in turn train others be thorough and comprehensive and not rushed. Such training, i.e. of instructors, should follow a prescribed training programme prior to their commencing field duties. This is important in that new programmes if not presented in a positive and confident fashion can be doomed to failure by the development of negative attitudes on the part of the end users.

b) The management of the CBT centers permits students to access the programs during after hours or in the evenings which is a positive step and encourages learning. This should not diminish the requirement to document the student’s progress which can be maintained with the use of a password.

c) It is recommended that FPI seek samples from the National laboratory. It is also recommended that consideration be given to creating a regional network of laboratories that could exchange UNODC’s laboratory could provide assistance if required.
d) That UNODC conduct an evaluation of CMIS in those regional countries that are using this system. The evaluation should include similar systems in order to provide the basis for advising other countries regarding case management systems. Management systems are valuable and have many varying features it is important that countries adopt systems that meet their needs and are not just the product of good salesmanish. Using a common system within a country or region provides an inherent benefit in that when there is an intention of exchanging information or data that having compatible systems makes sharing easier than if the systems are not compatible.

e) The comments regarding the CBT programs should be referred to AD/GLO/03/H17 for the attention of the project manager. While these are not major concerns they should be addressed with feedback to the CBT managers in Fujian and Guangdong.

f) A synopsis explaining the purpose, rationale, and limitation for CBT should be available. This should be supplied to CBT managers and instructors as a means of answering many questions posed by students. Students like the CBT approach and with a positive and constructive approach offer suggestions for additions and changes.

g) As the activities undertaken by this project have had good results. Similar project should be considered for other countries in the region, e.g. The Philippines, Indonesia, Malaysia and some of the Pacific Island States.

h) International workshops and study tours should be encouraged in order to foster cooperation.

i) Other provinces of China should be encouraged to install CBT training in order that with respect to the program topics there is a common level of training throughout the country.

2.5 Conclusion

This project was well designed and met the current needs of PSD in Fujian and Guangdong. It has been extremely well received by the authorities in these two provinces to the extent that they have added their own resources to expand the activities. Despite the activities being relatively new there is a view by senior management that they are already seeing positive results. There is an increase in enforcement and a better understanding of the problems facing the authorities as a result of the CMIS and the HPLC.

Unfortunately the criminal element always moves faster than law enforcement. They sense increased capability on the part of law enforcement and the consequence of higher risk of detection and capture. One approach to minimize more effective enforcement is to move their operations into those areas where enforcement is lax or non existent. It is therefore important for UNODC to develop project in other areas of the region to keep forcing criminals to take high levels of risks and removing areas where enforcement is not being carried out at the same level as elsewhere in the region. Improved enforcement through better training and equipment plus international cooperation is necessary to combat and minimize the spread of illicit drugs and ATS.

1. INTRODUCTION
1.1 Background and Context

1.1.1 This is a short term project, eighteen months duration, with a limited budget. It is intended to strengthen the drug enforcement capabilities with respect to ATS manufacture and trafficking in two of China’s southern provinces i.e. Fujian and Guangzhou. Both provinces are documented as being areas in which organized gangs produce and traffic in substantial quantities of ATS domestically and to regional countries and elsewhere.

1.1.2 The abuse of ATS has grown in recent years to where it now is considered to equal heroin abuse as a social problem. Enforcement units have not received the necessary information and training to bring their knowledge of ATS to the same level as heroin. Narcotic and precursor chemical investigations have become more complex than in the past. Criminal gangs learning from previous enforcement successes have change their methods of operation. Manufacture and trafficking now takes place over a wider area with drugs being produced in one area and sold at the street level in jurisdictions far removed from the production sites. In addition due to enforcement successes the manufacturers now tend to make the drug in a number of steps with each step taking place at a different location and with different people involved. These developments require improved training and a need to better manage investigations to take advantage of all the information known across the province rather than that contained within one office or unit. With the wide ranging operations that currently are taking place it is not unusual for information in one part of the province to be valuable to an investigation in a completely different jurisdiction many miles distant. The criminals are not bound by borders or jurisdiction and in a similar fashion the police must find a way to ensure that jurisdictional or boundaries do not impede the flow of relevant information. Training and case management have become more important to enforcement than in previous times. Analysis can provides senior management with a better understanding of the problem and allow a better use of resources. The ability to search through the information held by all enforcement officers allows those with similar investigations to contact and work with one another.

1.1.3 With the increasing problem of ATS abuse it was agreed that all enforcement officers needed additional knowledge and skills to be better equipped to recognize and investigate ATS cases. There was also a need to better understand the dynamics of the problem of ATS. Better information concerning the production and abuse is derived from profiling of street samples and comparing these with seizures made at illicit ATS production sites. A better knowledge of the processes being used and the chemicals needed for these processes requires speedier analysis and the ability to store, sort and collate the various ingredients.

1.1.4 The project’s strategy was to address the need for an improved level of investigative skill relating to ATS by providing support in four main activity areas:

a) Improving the capacity to analyze seized substances and to chart seizures in such a manner as to allow profiling to indicate drug sources of manufacture. The project design included upgrading of laboratory equipment to include High Performance Liquid Chromatograph machine is designed to provide this type of information.

b) Many enforcement officers have not been able to receive narcotic, precursor and investigative techniques training. The project aimed to establish a number of
Computer Based Training Centers (CBT). These centers allow students to study basic drug enforcement information and investigative techniques. Learning is independent, interactive and in the language of the student. This training approach has been developed by UNODC and is in use in all countries of the region and elsewhere in many part of the world. It is a proven teaching product.

c) The management of information gathered during investigations has become more unwieldy and complex due to cell-phones and the effect of wide spread and rapid transportation. Criminal organizations are spread across jurisdictions and it is difficult for police to link what appear to be unrelated pieces of information. Querying investigation that has occurred in other areas requires a central data base and a system that allows access from a number of locations and the ability to analyze and collate the information. The project in concert with the Chinese authorities selected a software program that has proven use in other countries as a means to meet their case management requirements. Case Information Management Intelligence System is being provided under the auspices of this project by the Australian Federal Police.

d) Cooperation between narcotic enforcement agencies has always been difficult due to formal channels not being able to respond quickly enough. Plus enforcement personnel are notoriously reluctant to share information with persons they do not know. Bringing senior enforcement officials from various countries together to discuss matters of mutual concern and allowing a trust to develop is needed to overcome these difficulties. Despite most international cooperation still being channeled through national headquarters meetings that establish relationships between senior personnel enhance the level of cooperation that is necessary in international drug investigations. Fujian and Guangdong ATS producers have targeted the growing abuse market in neighbouring countries of Indonesia, The Philippines, Malaysia and Thailand. The project arranged meetings for senior officials from Guangdong and Fujian to meet with their counterparts from these countries and to discuss cooperation.

1.1.5 The above strategy is sound and a proven approach to meeting the demands of the ATS situation in Southern China and elsewhere. The time allotment for the project’s implementation should have been sufficient. Due to some priority changes and slowness of acquiring much of the equipment additional time was necessary. The project was extended for and additional three months and this has been sufficient with the following exception. The installation of the CMIS software and the training of its managers are taking much longer than was expected. While it can be argued that this should have been recognized when the project document was first written it is equally unlikely that any of the participating parties were aware of the extent of work required to establish the equipment and install the software. The training has been slower than anticipated due to the diligence of the managers. To rush the training and the operational use of the system would have most probably caused problems resulting in many end users becoming dissatisfied thereby defeating the purpose.

1.1.6 The resources were not overly generous but were sufficient to establish these activities at sufficient a level that they became the catalyst for additional action by the local officials. In fact as anticipated in the project document there is an increasing demand for these activities by many other provinces in China who wish to operate in a similar fashion.

The project document is well written and clear in its intent and objectives. During the evaluation there was no indication from those participating in the project of any ambiguity in the content of the project document.
1.2 Purpose and Objective of the Evaluation

This is the Terminal Evaluation for the project and is to examine the activities conducted under the project to determine whether the design, management and performance of the project met the expectations of the participating countries and the donors.

In particular, the evaluation is expected to:

a) Establish the achievements of the project and comment whether the objectives were reached.

b) Determine whether the project met the needs of the two recipient provinces.

c) Comment on whether the project strategy and implementation was appropriate for the two provinces and met the donor’s expectations.

d) Decide whether the resources were utilized efficiently and produced sustainable results.

e) Identify any results of the project and their impact on the issue being addressed.

f) Identify any lessons learned from this project and make recommendations concerning the implementation of similar projects in the future.

A copy of the Terms of Reference for the Evaluation is attached as Annex A

1.3. Executing Modality/Management Arrangements

1.3.1 The overall administration of the Project was the responsibility of the UNODC Regional Centre at Bangkok in accordance with UNODC guidelines and rules. All operational and administrative aspects of the project were carried out by the Project Coordinator and one support staff. The initial Project Coordinator reported to the law enforcement adviser’s office in UNODC Regional Centre in Bangkok. Following the resignation of the project coordinator the law enforcement adviser took over these responsibilities. China appointed a National Project Officer (NPO) to facilitate the project’s activities being undertaken in two provinces. Each province appointed a project coordinator staffed from the Provincial Narcotic Control Bureau. Administrative support was provided by UNDP in Bangkok, Thailand and Beijing, China when necessary. The activities of AD/GLO/03/H17, the CBT training project, are closely linked to the activities of this project and were coordinated by the Regional Centre. The
project’s activities drew from other established UNODC projects that were underway in the region.

The primary activities of UNODC have been concluded however the Australian input will continue until 2010. This input is in the area of technical support and operational expertise to effectively utilize the CMIS.

1.3.2 This implementation process is familiar to both UNODC and NNCC having been used to implement a number of law enforcement projects in the past. The course of action has proven successful in previous projects and many of those involved are familiar with one another making implementation a relatively smooth undertaking.

1.4. Scope and Methodology of the Evaluation

1.4.1 This report was formulated following a review of numerous reports supplied by UNODC. The reports included but were not limited to the project document, annual project reports and previous evaluations. A verbal debriefing took place at the Regional Centre following the conclusion of the field portion of the evaluation. A list of the reports provided as background information is attached as Annex B.

1.4.2 The primary source of information concerning the project was derived from presentations and interviews with senior law enforcement officers, those involved with implementing the project, both instructors and students and other law enforcement personnel.

1.4.3 The evaluator traveled to both Fujian and Guangdong Provinces visiting the provincial capitals and one other location in each province that had benefited from the project’s activities. During these visits the evaluator met with senior officers of the PSB, including the NCB who have been responsible for administering the project’s activities. As a matter of course enforcement officers from PSB and the Border Police were interviewed. In Guangzhou the evaluator met with the Liaison Officer from the Australian Consulate who is familiar with the Australian input into the project and is currently continuing the liaison and support for the continuing activities related to the project by the Australian Government.

---

5 The Accord Plan of Action – AD/RAS/00/F73
Precursor Control in East Asia – AD/RAS/01/F34
Global Expansion of CBT – AD/GLO/03/H17
Scientific Support to strengthen regulator and law enforcement control of ATS and their precursors in East, South and South-east Asia – AD/GLO/03/H44
evaluator visited the site of the HPLC machine in the Fujian Police Institute (FPI) and met with students at a number of the CBT centres where training was in progress.

1.4.4 Electronic files and DVDs used by the officials in Fujian and Guangdong were made available to the evaluator for his review. Translation was provided at all of the meetings other than with the Australian official. In summary the views of those responsible for implementing the project, those who carried out the activities and those participating, i.e. students attending training sessions, were made available to the evaluator.

1.4.5 The evaluator was concerned with the provision of equipment however his primary focus was the impact and sustainability of the project’s activities. It became apparent that the authorities in both provinces had made substantial contributions to the project activities outside of those expected under the project document. This support for the project was fully explored as to why and what results were expected. A questionnaire developed prior to making the on-site visits was used only as a guide and starting point for the interviews and group discussions.

1.4.6 The list of officials, their titles and organizations who met with the evaluator is attached as Annex C.

2. ANALYSIS AND MAJOR FINDINGS

2. For convenience this section is presented in four parts, HPLC installation, establishment of CBT centers and cooperation activities.

2.1) The provision of High Performance Liquid Chromatograph (HPLC).

Note: Prior to the project purchasing HPLC machines the Guangdong authorities purchased a HPLC from their own funds. Consequently the project was amended to recognize this step and funding intended for the Chromatograph was redirected to allow for the purchase of additional CBT resources. As a result only one HPLC machine was purchased under this project and it is located at the FPI, in Fuzhou City, Fujian Province. It should be noted as an indication of the support for the project and its activities that Fujian authorities contributed 20% to the purchase of the HPLC.

The HPLC that was purchased for Fujian has been installed in the FPS since August 2007 and the training of four technicians has been completed. The delay in obtaining the machine was due to agreement regarding the best machine to be purchased and the selection of the supplier. Four technicians received training from the company supplying the HPLC as part of the purchase agreement. Currently the HPLC is in its initial start-up phase with the laboratory staff becoming familiar with using the HPLC. From August to mid-November 474
samples had been analyzed with eighteen different narcotic and ATS being identified. A full list of the drugs identified is contained in Annex #D.

The laboratory is currently receiving samples of all seized substances from Fuzhou as part of a NCB survey of street drugs. Plans for 2008 include continuing the survey to other areas of Fujian and the construction of a simulated clandestine ATS laboratory to be used for training purposes. One deficiency is the lack of standards for all of the chemicals identified.

The addition of the HPLC to the forensic services of the Fujian Police Institute has provided a much needed capacity enlargement. The result is faster analysis and the ability to monitor trends and changes in illicitly manufactured ATS. The authorities have fully integrated the machine into their operating plans which will provide benefits into the future. The addition of the HPLC has augmented an ambitious program that will benefit law enforcement at the street and management levels.

b) Establishment and operation of CBT Centers:

The CBT centers planned as part of the project’s activities have been established and equipped in accordance with the project document. The centers are used almost continually to train law enforcement personnel in the basic requirements for investigating drug and ATS crimes. For the most part these centers are located within established police training institutes. This provides for the students to have access to dormitories, cafeterias and recreational facilities while undergoing their training. Training courses last five days with the students following a curriculum designed to meet their particular needs. For example the subjects taken by drug investigators differ in some respects from those studies by the airport or railway police. In some locations the CBT manager maintains close control over the student’s activities. They are only allowed to access the training when a supervisor is present. In other locations the management is more flexible allowing students to access the programmes on their own time. In many instances the CBT training is followed by a class discussion.

Those taking the courses were initially the specialized drug enforcement officers. As the training progressed the value of the CBT technique and appeal to students and instructors became apparent other enforcement agencies were included. In both provinces such agencies as the Border Police, Railway and Airport police and the routine highway officers have all been scheduled to take the training. The instructors select courses from the large menu that best suit the needs of each student.

Both provinces have committed additional resources to the CBT centers by providing extra computer stations. Customs have established their own CBT center using their own funds and the software provided by this project. The commitment of additional resources on the part of the provinces clearly indicates strong support for the project activities plus it reflects the provinces ownership of the activities and is committed to continuing.

Each of the CBT centers that were visited voiced satisfaction with the CBT programs. An example of the level of satisfaction and an indication of the achievement of CBT is characterized in the following excerpt taken from a report covering the effects of CBT training in Jiangmen City;

"The G75 Program is a broad and systematic training course for professional narcotics agents and it had very high values both in practice and supervision. Therefore, all participants study the course with enthusiasm. Through learning 28 subjects in the program and some popular current topics, trainees are involved in great
discussions and discover adequate solutions for each case. All of the students have gained both a precise knowledge and deep understanding of not only investigation of smuggled drugs, but appraisal of narcotics as well. Because of the use of multimedia devices and the trainer-trainee interactions in class, students have firmer memories of what they've learned. Through strict practice and in-time experience up-grade, all trainees have succeeded in their daily work.

After spreading the G75 Training Program, the use of practicum and tactics of narcotics investigations have improved in our City’s narcocop system, especially the rapid improvement in total awareness of strategies and tactics of narcotics criminal offences. For the first ten months in 2007, the whole city had investigated and uncovered 636 cases of narcotics offences, which was an increase of 42.6% compared to the same period in 2006. We arrested 760 suspects, an increase of 48% compared to the same period of the previous year. In the 636 cases we seized 4.5 kilograms of heroin, 1.5 million tablets of MDMA, 122 kilograms of liquid ice, 560 grams of ice, 1,027 tablets of shabu and 6,741 grams of ketamine.”

Many additional constructive comments were received regarding the training package:

i) Some portions have been translated into Chinese using incorrect terminology.
ii) On occasion the system collapses and the student/instructor cannot return to the programme. It must be shut down and re-started. While this is not a daily occurrence it is inconvenient and frustrating to students and instructors.
iii) Some of the instructors felt that the material was dated and could be upgraded to reflect more recent trends.
iv) There was a general feeling that the CBT approach could be expanded to provide training in additional areas.
v) Some students requested more case studies.

c) Development of cooperation locally and nationally.

The project undertook a number of international study tours and training exercises as follows:-

i) CBT managers trained in Chiang Mai, Thailand
ii) Senior enforcement officers from the two Provinces traveled to Thailand and Indonesia for discussions with their counterparts.
iii) Officers trained to use CMIS in Canberra, Australia
iv) AFP officers travel to Guangdong and Fujian to install CMIS

These provided an opportunity for senior law enforcement officials and others to meet and exchange information. This in turn allowed them to better understand the judicial workings of each others jurisdiction. The discussions also provided the opportunity for professional relationship to develop which have assisted in furthering a number of international investigations.

Eighteen officers from Fujian and Guangdong provinces traveled to Thailand to meet with their counterparts at ONCB. During this tour the officers visited ONCB’s CBT center and the information/intelligence division of the Narcotics Law Enforcement Bureau. A visit to the Cambodian border allowed for discussion on cross border cooperation. The study tour also visited Indonesia where they met with counterpart officers from the National Narcotics Board
needs and have brought about considerable progress towards meeting the primary objective.

The AFP arranged for the installation of servers and computer terminals to permit the establishment of a CMIS center in each of the two provinces. Technicians have been trained. There were technical problems concerning the installation that have now been overcome. The AFP arranged for the training of officers in the use and administration of CMIS. These key officers will be the basis for the training conducted in the two provinces. Continual monitoring and support is provided by the AFP liaison officer stationed in Guangdong. CMIS operates on a licensing system from the manufacturer. The license ensures that upgrades and technical support are available on an annual basis. The AFP have indicated that under the commitment to the project that licenses will be valid up to an including 2010. Subsequently the responsibility for renewing the licenses will rest with the Provincial authorities. During discussion with the senior enforcement officers it is evident they consider this system a long term investment and will undertake to renew the licenses from their own budget.

The installation of a computer system seldom takes place as planned. In this instance AFP technicians worked through a series of technical difficulties to get the system operating. Fifty eight Chinese officers received CMIS training. Many of these have now returned to their field postings and they will act as the CMIS analysts for their own jurisdictions. The training programme was longer than initially planned. The manager of the CMIS in Guangzhou recognized the need to ensure that the field representatives needed to be thoroughly trained as any problems or difficulties could cause a wave of negativism regarding the program which would be difficult to recover from.

There is always resistance to change whenever new systems are introduced. This is especially the situation with computer based systems. Not all people are familiar or comfortable with using computers. In many instances this reluctance to embrace new techniques is often found in the middle management and if they are negative to the system it can affect the way in which it is used. Should the new user experience difficulties with the system it can taint the way in which the system is viewed. It is therefore critical that those using the system are well trained and have experience in using the system. It was therefore a sound decision to make the training period for these officers longer than initially planned to ensure they had a thorough and complete knowledge plus the confidence to present the system to others in their home stations.

The CMIS in Guangzhou is now full operational and data is being inputted and queries are taking place. Already there have been some successes and this can be expected to increase as the users become more familiar with CMIS.

2.1 Overall Performance Assessment

2.1 Overall Performance Assessment

2.1.1 The project was well designed to meet the objectives. This was due mainly to having full discussion between all partners, i.e. NNC, AFP and UNODC. The activities met the described needs and have brought about considerable progress towards meeting the primary objective.
There were some delays due to defining and delivering some of the equipment. These delays were not substantial and only required a short extension of the project. The recipients of the activities all expressed satisfaction with the manner in which the activities were implemented.

a) Appropriateness and relevance

The activities outlined and carried out by the project are deemed to be fully appropriate for the issues that were identified. The need for additional training was met with one of the latest training techniques available to law enforcement. The requirement for a more efficient and effective analytical capacity was addressed with the provision of advanced technical equipment including the specialized training of operators.

The need to better access the information and intelligence held by all enforcement personnel in order to more effectively develop investigations was reviewed extensively. The decision to install CMIS which is a proven analytical computer based enforcement program definitely met the needs identified by NNCC. The exchange of information between provincial enforcement units is served by CMIS. The increasing need to develop contacts internationally within the region has been encouraged by the workshops and meetings initiated under this project.

Effectiveness and efficiency:

The project has been effective in meeting the issues that it was funded to undertake. The level of improvement within the enforcement units was cited at all locations as stemming in part from the projects activities. Increased enforcement statistics provide empirical support for his assertion. The project chose to address the objectives in an efficient manner. The use of CBT learning programme is considered highly efficient and effective as the training can be carried out with minimal supervision and at times convenient to the officers involved. This allows them to undertake their regular duties without undue interruption while still receiving the training. The training can be undertaken at various times which also accommodates other duties that would normally interfere with class room style teaching. The project greatest strength was in pointing the way and acting as a catalyst to expose methods and technology that was hitherto not available. This has spurred the authorities of the two Provinces to expand the activities from their own resources.

2.2. Attainment of the Objectives

2.2.1 Upgrading of laboratory services

The laboratory services in both provinces have been upgraded by the addition of a PCL\(^6\). Street level samples are being submitted FPI as an initial survey to profile seizures. This objective has been fully met. It will continue to show positive results. The value of the provision of this machine can be overlooked as it is not possible to attribute any one positive investigation solely to analysis. However the speedy analytical capability will allow for more informed management decisions which will in the long run contribute to improved enforcement. Additionally no investigation can be successfully processed through the court system without a certificate of analysis. The provision of the HPLC will contribute more to an improved management that to specific investigations.

\(^6\) Note: The project only provided 80% of the funds for the HPLC in Fujian Province. Guangdong authorities obtained their HPLC through their own funding.
B) Training of a wide range of law enforcement officers is fully underway in both provinces. With the initial commitment of five CBT centers in each province the centers have been fully committed to training on a regular basis since the installation was completed. This activity makes the most obvious contribution to meeting the overall objective of the project. The positive difference between pre test and post test examinations is approximately a fifty percent increase showing the value of this training technique. Increased knowledge levels regarding ATS and investigative procedures definitely is resulting in an improved investigative capability. This is borne out by the comments of senior PSD officers.

c) Computer based management system

The case management system CMIS, is just becoming operation in Guangdong Province. Already the feedback from the operators and field investigators points to increased successful investigations. CMIS is not only a management tool but it provides strong support to the individual investigator. The project has only (at the time of this report) installed the one CMIS center and completed the training of technicians and trainers i.e. in Guangzhou. The Fujian installation is underway and can be expected to follow within the next few months. CMIS stations operate under licenses which provide upgrades to the system and also technical support. The licenses function on an annual basis and the AFP have committed to provided licenses until 2010 at which time the responsibility will shift to the respective provincial authorities. From discussions with the current management it is clear that the licenses will be renewed after 2010. This system provides a rapid method for searching and sharing information on a province wide basis. Previous methods were slow and based on a manual approach which does not meet the need for speedy analysis of data. As this system becomes more familiar to the enforcement officers it can be expected to contribute to the overall objective of the project far into the future.

d) Greater cooperation.

The study tour undertaken by senior enforcement officials to Thailand and Indonesia has already resulted in cooperation taking place in a number of investigations. The improved understanding of the situation in these other countries makes cooperation easier. In addition the contacts and personal relationship resulting from the study tour promotes cooperation. The training in Chang Mai, Thailand and Canberra, Australia also results in an improved understanding of the problems in different jurisdictions. The establishment of CMIS fostered by the AFP and the stationing of a liaison officer in Guangzhou will also strengthen the level of cooperation between these to countries. All of these contacts and the resulting trust will work to achieve the project objective.

2.3 Achievement of Project Results and Outputs

The activities have been completed and the results are in line with the expectations of the project document. The HPLC is installed in the FPI and working as expected. The first profiling survey is underway with others planned for the coming year. CBT centers were installed as planned and have been used continually for ongoing training. Those officers assigned to narcotic control duties have all been through the training. This has resulted in a substantial increase in the enforcement outputs. Training is seen as an ongoing activity with other enforcement agencies e.g. Border Police, Railway and airport police, highway check point police now being trained. The increased spread of knowledge will impact positively on the overall enforcement program within the two provinces. The CMIS system is only just coming on line in Guangdong Province. Already the training has been completed and the
system has been operational for a few months. Despite the newness of this system data is being inputted and already some positive investigative leads have been developed. This progress will continue as the officers become more familiar with the system. The international study tour took place with officers traveling to Thailand and Indonesia to meet with their counterparts. Indications from senior officers are that the improved understanding of the situation in these other countries and the personal contacts developed during the tours have contributed to increased cooperation.

2.4. Implementation

The project for the most part was implemented according to the project document. Delays have occurred in the areas of providing the HPLC and the installation and training of CMIS. The delays were unforeseen at the time the project document was drafted. There was no way of anticipating the technical difficulties that arose with implementing CMIS. At this time these difficulties have been resolved and the AFP is committed to continuing the installation and training of the Fujian CMIS. The departure of the project coordinator did not cause any undue difficulties as the law enforcement advisor took over this responsibility.

2.5. Institutional and Management Arrangements

As previously noted the implementation and delivery of this project followed a tried and true process. The implementation process brought together all of the stakeholders and constructive and informed decisions were able to be made. Support from other project and other UN agencies were forthcoming. The process worked well and no criticisms were voiced to the evaluator concerning the management arrangements. The supervision from the Law Enforcement Coordinator and his subsequent management of the project was a smooth transition and caused no difficulties.

3. OUTCOMES, IMPACTS AND SUSTAINABILITY

3.1. Outcomes

The activities carried out under this project have made a positive contribution to meeting the overall objective of the project. The goal was to raise the awareness of law enforcement in the two provinces regarding ATS manufacture, trafficking and use. This is a law enforcement project and it has improved the working capabilities of the front line officers and their managers in carrying out drug law enforcement. The improved understanding of international issues and the establishing of contact with counterparts in other countries has already resulted in an increase in cooperation. The level of enforcement has risen and this is attributed to the CBT training provided under the terms of this project. The installation of CMIS centers in both provinces will greatly enhance the collation and coordination of information relating not only to ATS investigations but to drug enforcement in general. The additional capacity of the provincial laboratories resulting from the acquisition of the HPLC machine is adding to management’s understanding of the ATS problem they are facing. The activities will not end with the conclusion of this project. The continuation will improve as officers become more familiar with the new CMIS system and as more and more officers receive CBT. The curve indicating increased enforcement will continue to rise as a result of the project’s activities.
3.2. Impacts

In terms of law enforcement’s capacity to better investigate and counter the production and use of ATS the project has already made a positive contribution. The project’s activities have stimulated an interest on the part of other provinces in China to obtain the same facilities as Fujian and Guangdong received. There have been no other unforeseen impacts although the activities are new and with time and more experience it is possible that other positive results will manifest themselves.

3.3. Sustainability

As noted previously sustainability was one of the key avenues of inquiry pursued by the evaluator. The commitment on the part of those involved at the national and provincial level has been complete. All of the project activities have been well received and the contributions ascribed to the Chinese authorities in the project document have been fully met. In addition both provinces have contributed extra resources which are a clear indication of their support and ownership of the activities introduced through this project. There is little doubt that all of the activities will be continued by the local authorities after the conclusion of this project. Future plans for the laboratory and CBT clearly indicate a long term commitment to these activities. The CMIS is in demand by the operational officers and as they become more familiar with the system it can be expected that it will be expanded.

The positive comments regarding CBT and CMIS from the officers in Guangdong and Fujian have attracted the attention of a number of other provinces and it can be expected that these programmes will be expanded into other parts of China.

4. LESSONS LEARNED AND BEST PRACTICES

4.1. Lessons learned

4.1.1. This project was fairly straightforward and therefore any lessons to be learned were minimal. The following two points should be considered when undertaking similar project activities:

a) Calculating the length of time needed for the delivery of technical equipment is not merely a matter of contacting suppliers and determining their delivery time. The installation and testing of specialized equipment can take time plus there is a need for technicians to become familiar with the equipment in order to carry out maintenance and repairs. These requirements can add considerably to the time required between ordering and operational readiness.

b) The project in many peoples minds became a computer based training project. The other activities had fairly limited participation with the overwhelming numbers of participants being involved with CBT. CBT provided training beyond the project objective of ATS awareness. The additional knowledge gained from the training is a good thing and is part and parcel of drug investigators background. It is important however to keep focused on the objective of the project as this can, at times, be lost in the bigger picture of drug enforcement.
c) It is important that all partners and persons to be involved either in delivering or receiving activities from a project be consulted to ensure there are no major areas that have not been considered. This project was well researched and consequently its implementation was relatively smooth.

d) Senior managers must be onside when introducing programs or systems that will be used by their subordinates. It is important that senior management be in agreement and understand the purpose of the new program. In the case of Guangdong the senior person was so enthusiastic that he undertook the training himself and this caused most of the other senior managers to follow suite. The end result being full support for the CBT program. The same situation is taking place with respect to CMIS.

4.2. Best Practices

4.2.1. Selecting two key locations in which to demonstrate programs and activities has resulted in other areas wanting the same level of capacity. In addition, although funds were limited there was sufficient to show the value of the program. This resulted in the local supplementing the programs. The project funded the main server, software and workstation computers. Local police authorities’ demonstrated their support and commitment to the project by adding more terminals.

4.2.2. The establishment of the CBT, albeit in small quantities was a sufficient catalyst to encourage other funding, and has prompted other provinces to seek to establish similar programs in their jurisdictions..

4.2.3. The holding of regional, sub-regional and national meetings among law enforcement officials has beneficial effects beyond the specific topic of precursor control. Bringing people together results in an exchange of experiences and provides an added level of confidence with respect to undertaking actions that maybe new or innovative. Law enforcement information places people at risk and consequently the exchange of such information relies for the main part on trust. Trust can never be compulsory or taken for granted but must be developed. The meetings arranged under this project help to build up trust which has already led to improved cooperation in a number of international investigations..

4.2.4. Specialized training is expensive not only in the funds needed but the time consumed. Traditional methods for passing out large amounts of basic information do not work as well as the computer based interactive programs. The CBT concept as used in this project, although limited to basic level information, provides a standard level of education in the language of the student and is available on a twenty-four hour basis. This is an excellent technique for addressing the need to improve training in a variety of law enforcement subjects. This approach should not be regarded as only applicable to law enforcement but other fields of specialty should consider interactive CBT as a means of providing information to large numbers of people.

4.2.5. The flexibility to amend project activities is a necessity when there is a time lag between the development of the project and its implementation. Circumstances change and it is important to allow the project manager, with approval of the signing partners, to ensure that adjustments can take place. The decision by Guangdong to purchase an HPLC machine ahead of the project allowed additional funds to be utilized for CBT training in that province.
4.2.6. Computer based programmes are still new to many in law enforcement and often they are viewed with skepticism by seasoned officers. While many officers have a positive outlook on new and innovative programs some, in the management ranks, draw on any criticism as a means of negating the value of the program. This attitude has an impact on how new programs are viewed by the end users, i.e. the investigators. Training for the CMIS program has been extensive to ensure that those being trained had a thorough knowledge of the program. This will go a long way to countering any criticisms that develop locally. As a result of the controlled training there is a positive approach to CMIS and the operational units are keen to receive and participate in the program. By ensuring that the instructors who will teach or otherwise represent new programmes have a solid understanding of the program its capabilities and limitations ensures a smooth introduction into the wider enforcement community. It is anticipated that a similar approach will be taken in Fujian Province. Additional time is needed before a full evaluation of the benefits derived from this system can be assessed. Given the positive results in those jurisdictions where CMIS has been operating for a long time period there is every expectation that the same will occur in China.

4.3. Constraints

The major constraint was a lack of funds to carry out a larger project. Timing for the purchasing of equipment contributed to delaying the implementation of the project. While this is not unusual the issue of timing necessary for delivery of specialized and technical equipment should receive closer considered in future projects.

5. RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1. Issues resolved during the evaluation

Few issues were raised by those interviewed during the evaluation.

a) The laboratory in Fujian does not have standards for all of the chemicals/drugs that it is analyzing. The manager was advised that this issue would be noted in the evaluation and brought to the attention of UNODC. The evaluator agreed that this is a requirement for laboratories and accordingly it is included in the recommendations.

b) The CBT training drew the majority of comments. CBT has trained close to four thousand students and many see the project primarily as a computer based training project. The effects of the laboratory equipment and CMIS are limited and many PSB officers are not aware of these project activities. The evaluator attempted to address CBT related issues such as, the training should

i) Cover more topics,

ii) Go into greater depth in the subjects,

iii) Introduce case studies into the programs.

iv) Allow students to review the correct answers for those questions they answer I incorrectly.
The evaluator explained that the CBT is not an advanced training program. Rather it is intended to provide basic knowledge for those officers who have not received specialized training respecting narcotics, ATS or precursor chemicals and related topics. CBT is excellent for raising the basic level of knowledge of these subjects. CBT is not able to provide training where officers must weigh options and make decisions. Especially in those circumstances where the decisions might differ depending upon all of the information available. Not all of the CBT trainers/center managers were present and it would be beneficial to have a one or two page explanation of the limitations and purpose of the current CBT programs. Regarding point iv) the evaluator advised that the instructors can provide the correct answers and assist the students where necessary.

v) The system tends to crash at times which requires the student to restart the program. This does cause a degree of frustration to students and instructors. This is a technical issue and should be dealt with by the manager of the CBT Global Project.

5.2. Actions/decisions recommended

This project was primarily concerned with the provision of equipment and training. These activities are well underway with a very positive response from the recipients. Recommendations regarding management or policy are therefore limited. The following recommendations are not presented in any order of priority.

It is recommended that:-

a) When introducing new computer based programmes such as CMIS, that the training of those personnel who will in turn train others be thorough and comprehensive and not rushed. Such training, i.e. of instructors, should follow a prescribed training programme prior to their commencing field duties. This is important in that new programmes if not presented in a positive and confident fashion can be doomed to failure by the development of negative attitudes on the part of the end users.

b) The management of the CBT centers permits students to access the programs during after hours or in the evenings which is a positive step and encourages learning. This should not diminish the requirement to document the student’s progress which can be maintained with the use of a password.

c) It is recommended that FPI seek samples from the National laboratory. It is also recommended that consideration be given to creating a regional network of laboratories that could exchange UNODC’s laboratory could provide assistance if required.

d) That UNODC conduct an evaluation of CMIS in those regional countries that are using this system. The evaluation should include similar systems in order to provide the basis for advising other countries regarding case management systems. Management systems are valuable and have many varying features it is important that countries adopt systems that meet their needs and are not just the product of good salesmanship. Using a common system within a country or region provides an inherent benefit in that when there is an intention of exchanging information or data that having compatible systems makes sharing easier than if the systems are not compatible.
e) The comments regarding the CBT programs should be referred to AD/GLO/03/H17 for the attention of the project manager. While these are not major concerns they should be addressed with feedback to the CBT managers in Fujian and Guangdong.

f) A synopsis explaining the purpose, rationale, and limitation for CBT should be available. This should be supplied to CBT managers and instructors as a means of answering many questions posed by students. Students like the CBT approach and contribute suggestion for additions and changes.

g) As the activities undertaken by this project have had good results. Similar project should be considered for other countries in the region, e.g. The Philippines, Indonesia, Malaysia and some of the Pacific Island States.

h) International workshops and study tours should be encouraged in order to foster cooperation.

i) Other provinces of China should be encouraged to install CBT training in order that with respect to the program topics there is a common level of training throughout the country.

6. OVERALL CONCLUSIONS

The project was well designed and met an identified need within the two Provinces. Despite the limitations of time and funds the project activities were well received and were effectively implemented. To attempt these activities throughout China would require considerable funding. The effective implementation of this project has acted as a catalyst by setting an example that is encouraging other provinces to give serious consideration to following the model set by Guangdong and Fujian.

The enforcement people involved with implementing the project were extremely well motivated. They found funding to expand the projects activities which demonstrated their satisfaction with the activities and the results that have occurred to date.. It is clear that delivering a sound and needed programme has positive results. The increased awareness regarding ATS production and trafficking on the part of operational enforcement personnel who have received CBT training is reflected in the statistics and by the comments from senior management of PSB, much of the improvement is attributable to this project. Similar activities should be carried out in other countries of the region as a mean of continuing the momentum gained in Fujian and Guangdong. The Philippines, Indonesia, Malaysia and some of the Pacific Island states who are beginning to encounter an ATS problem could benefit from activities such as were carried out by this project. The success in Fujian and Guangdong could be used to support similar activities elsewhere in the region.
TERMS OF REFERENCE
FOR SPECIAL SERVICE AGREEMENT

POST TITLE: Evaluator
AGENCY/PROJECT NAME: UNODC Project on Suppression of Illicit Manufacturing and Trafficking of Amphetamine-Type Stimulants (ATS) in Southeast China (CPR/G75)
COUNTRY OF ASSIGNMENT: Bangkok, Thailand

1. General Background:

The immediate objective of this project is to strengthen provincial law enforcement capacity to gather, organize and exchange drug control information with other provincial and foreign law enforcement agencies to better combat illicit drug trafficking in the region.

The strategy for achieving the objective involves providing assistance to strengthen Fujian and Guangdong drug law enforcement capacity in suppressing the illicit manufacturing and trafficking of ATS in South China and the region as a contributing factor against the spread of the epidemic, with a focus on strengthening law enforcement capacity to cooperate, gather, analyze and share information within the country and the region, by providing various training programme based upon internationally accepted drug law enforcement training standards, drug identification and analysis scientific equipment, specialized software for investigative analysis, case management and international workshops and study tours.

Activities carried out under the project include the following:

i. 27 June – 2 July 2005: travel of the project coordinator, inception meeting with AFP in Canberra and Melbourne, Australia; work plan revised;
ii. 25-29 Sept 2005, travel of project coordinator with CBT expert, training needs assessment mission to China (Guangzhou & Fuzhou); more computers needed;
iii. 12-21 Dec 2005: AFP experts and the project coordinator, CMIS Scoping and Introduction mission to Guangzhou & Fuzhou
iv. 20-28 Feb 2006, 4 Chinese officials in CMIS software trained in Canberra, Australia
v. 3-7 April 2006: 2 Chinese CBT managers from Guangdong and Fujian trained in Chiang Mai
vi. May 2006: procurement for 132 computers, 8 servers and 10 laser printers for ten CBT centres
vii. 24-30 June 2006: establishment of 10 CBT centres; the project coordinator visited Fujian
viii. June 2006: AFP experts visited Guangdong and Fujian to install servers and CMIS software; 30 officers in Guangdong and 28 officers in Fujian trained on CMIS software
ix. July 2006: arrangement of 5 new CBT modules translation into Chinese
x. Sept 2006: turnover of project management; the project coordinator resigned and the project was transferred to the Senior Law Enforcement Adviser
xi. 17-25 Oct 2006: the SLEA made a field trip to Fujian and Guangdong visiting 10 CBT centres
xii. Procurement of HPLC for Fujian (installed in Jan 2007)
xis. 8-14 Jan 2007, study tour for 18 LE officers from two provinces to Thailand and Indonesia
xiv. Final workshop to review the project activities, 10-14 June 2007.

2) OBJECTIVES OF THE ASSIGNMENT

The purpose of the evaluation is to establish what the project has achieved and whether it has attained its objectives. The evaluation should assess the extent of which the project is meeting the needs of the beneficiary agencies and whether the strategy and implementation arrangements are appropriate and the approach relevant to the needs of beneficiary agencies and the expectations of the donors. Further it is to determine whether resources are utilized efficiently to produce sustainable outcomes. What are the results achieved as a whole, in particular the outcomes and impact, in relation to the explicit or implicit objective(s) of the project.

The evaluation should also assess the beneficiary agencies' experience of the project and their perspectives on the benefits received. In addition the evaluation should assess whether and to what extent the project has stimulated governments to implement measures or carry out activities on their own initiative, to improve the drug law enforcement capacity in countering ATS both domestically and internationally.

3) SCOPE OF WORK

The evaluation of the project will address the following issues. However, as the evaluation mission progresses, the evaluator may shift the evaluation focus for the purpose of better assessment of the project achievements and learning from its operations.

Relevance:

- To what extent are the project concept and strategy appropriate and relevant to strengthen the law enforcement capacity and suppression of illicit manufacturing and trafficking of Amphetamine Type Stimulants (ATS) in South China and in the region? Were project activities an appropriate response?
- Analyze the relevance of the main project objectives and activities vis-à-vis the drug and precursor situation in the region but also globally.
- Review the inter-relation of the project with other activities of the governments concerned as well as with assistance from bi-lateral donors.
- Analyze the magnitude, scope and strategy of the project in relation to the ATS problem.
- Has the project contributed to the drug control agencies being better equipped to understand and tackle the ATS problem both domestically and internationally?
**Effectiveness:**

Assess achievements of the project results as a whole, in particular the project objectives, outputs and outcome.

- To what extent has the project contributed to the improvement of institutional and operational capacities to -
  - interdict and suppress ATS manufacturing and trafficking, and
  - increasing international cooperation in suppressing ATS manufacturing and trafficking, especially in intelligence sharing and coordinated investigation
- Have the targeted agencies been reached as intended, and their needs met?
- To what extent are the project activities enhanced regional cooperation among countries in East and South Asia?
- To what extent has the training provided under this project enhanced knowledge and operational skills of trainees? Any specific evidence documented?
- Have the equipment (e.g. CBT computers and software, Lab equipment) provided by the project reached the targeted agency (e.g. CBT training centres) units and been used as intended? Did this support improve the effectiveness of agencies concerned?
- To what extent have the rapid appraisals and national surveys contributed to understand and tackle the drug problem in the region?

**Efficiency:**

- The effectiveness and efficiency of project management and quality and timeliness of monitoring and backstopping of the project by all parties concerned.
- The roles and responsibilities of the various parties: the two project provinces, AFP, including donor countries; UNODC; other parties.
- Have the resources been mobilized and used efficiently? Are there any less costly methods which could have the same effect at the intended beneficiary level?

**Effect/Impact:**

- To what extent has the assistance provided to individual agencies contributes to improvement of drug law enforcement in the country and in the region as a whole? Any specific evidence documented?
- To what extent can the project expect to contribute the intended and unintended impacts of the project, and in the case of the latter, both positive and negative?

**Sustainability:**

- Will the results and outcomes, as well as the impact the project is likely to achieve be sustainable?
- What concrete measures have been taken, or are required, to ensure sustainability of the national agencies, regional cooperation mechanism etc. supported and/or
established by the project?
• Does the national government accept the project concept and initiatives to continue the similar activities on their own in addressing the problem?

The evaluator may make recommendations as appropriate, for the purpose of the future direction of technical assistance on the suppression of illicit manufacture and trafficking in ATS in the country and the region, including:
• The broad objectives and activities of the future law enforcement projects, if deemed necessary, either national or regional project(s);
• Priorities for fund allocation to ATS control project(s) in the region;
• Continuation of specific project activities in the successor project(s) and any modifications as deemed appropriate;
• Execution modalities and implementation arrangements;
• Coordination and collaboration arrangements;
• Synergies and links with other regional projects on drug law enforcement if any.

Best practices and lessons learned from the project which are valid beyond the project itself, particularly the usefulness in general of similar projects, should be recorded by the evaluator. It should be borne in mind that consultancy services should not be used to fill perceived gaps in field office capabilities, but should be limited to specific complementary activities.

The incumbent will perform the evaluation based on the following:

i. A study of relevant documents;
   - Project document
   - Inception report
   - Annual progress reports
   - Mid-term evaluation report
   - Terminal Report
   - Guiding Principles for Evaluation at UNODC
   - Summary assessment questionnaire
   - Standard Format and Guidelines for Project Evaluation Report

ii. Initial briefing by responsible UNODC staff at the Regional Center for East Asia and the Pacific in Bangkok; (refer to Evaluation Programme)

iii. Initial evaluation methodology, questionnaires/evaluation tools before going to the field.

iv. Direct interviews in the more important countries with national officials, experts and other knowledgeable parties. In the two project provinces of South China, evaluation can be conducted by questionnaire to be answered by national and provincial officials, experts and other knowledgeable parties, and telephone interviews as necessary. (refer to Evaluation Programme)

v. Interview of UNODC staff (refer to Evaluation Programme)

vi. Observation (if appropriate)
4) DURATION OF ASSIGNMENT, DUTY STATION AND EXPECTED PLACES OF TRAVEL

Duration of the assignment: 8 November – 21 December 2007
Duty station: Bangkok, Thailand
Mission: China (refer to Evaluation Programme)

5) FINAL PRODUCT

The draft evaluation report shall be discussed with UNODC. The evaluator, while giving due consideration to comments provided by UNODC (country, regional desk and IEU) on the draft evaluation report, shall use his/her independent judgment in preparing the final report.

The evaluation report will contain findings, conclusions and recommendations as well as a recording of the lessons learnt during the project implementation. In addition the evaluator is required to complete and submit the summary assessment questionnaire.

The evaluator shall produce a draft and final evaluation report in English of a quality acceptable to the UNODC Regional Centre and within the stipulated time frame and in accordance with report outline below.

- Executive summary (maximum 4 pages)
- Introduction
- Background (Project description)
- Evaluation purpose and objective
- Evaluation methodology
- Major findings
- Lessons learnt (from both positive and negative experiences)
- Constraints that impacted project delivery
- Recommendations and conclusions

The final report shall be submitted to UNODC no later than three weeks upon completion of the mission. The report should not exceed 25 pages excluding annexes and the executive summary. Annexes should be kept to an absolute minimum and not more than 15 pages.

6) PROVISION OF MONITORING AND PROGRESS CONTROLS

The incumbent will work under the direct supervision of Senior Technical Adviser (Law Enforcement).

7) DEGREE OF EXPERTISE AND QUALIFICATIONS

The evaluator shall have a university degree in public administration, international law, or economics or equivalent professional experience in precursors control at national and international levels. Knowledge of drug control, policy and administrative procedures with regard to precursors control, as well as the chemical/pharmaceutical industry. Knowledge of the Southeast Asian sub-region an advantage. Experience in the design, implementation and evaluation of technical assistance, preferably in drug control.

In addition the evaluator shall have:

- Extensive management level experience of project design and operations (managerial as well as financial),
• Previous experience of project evaluations,
• Good knowledge of UNODC’s mandate, strategies, priorities and operational procedures,

8) REVIEW TIME REQUIRED

10 working days
Files provided for review during evaluation:

G75 Project Document
G75 Annual Report 2006
Fujian Report
Guangdong Forum Report September 2003
Guangdong Meeting NFTF-2
G75 Project Revision
G75 Terminal Report 2007
Annual Report on Drug Control in China 2007 (DVD)
G75 Fuzhou Laboratory Report 2007 (DVD)
G75 CBT Report Fuzhou 2007 (DVD)
福建省G75项目总结汇报材料
联合国G75项目培训工作总结
Work Report on the Training Center of Project G75 in NCB of Guangdong PSD (DVD)

Persons and Organizations that met and briefed the evaluator.

Annex ‘C’
Fujian Province:

**Fuzhou**
1. Mr. Li Hongjian, the Deputy Director of Narcotics Control Division of Fujian Provincial Public Security Department
2. Mr. Huang Jianguang, the Section Chief of Intelligence Section of Narcotics Control Division of Fujian Provincial Public Security Department
3. Ms. Lin Qiao, officer of the Intelligence Section of Narcotics Control Division of Fujian Provincial Public Security Department (Coordinator of Project G75 in Fujian Province).
4. Mr. Shaoyu Zhang, Department of Forensic Sciences, Fujian

**Xiamen City**
1. Mr. Zhang Guohui, the Deputy Director of Narcotics Control Sub-division of Xiamen Municipal Public Security Bureau
2. Ms. Wang Wei, the Team Leader of the Prevention and Education Section of Narcotics Control Sub-division of Xiamen Municipal Public Security Bureau
3. Mr. Xu Wenqu, Officer of Narcotics Control Sub-division of Xiamen Municipal Public Security Bureau (Manager of CBT)

**Fujian Police Academy**
1. Mr. Liu Ruirong, the Vice President of Fujian Police Academy
2. Ms. Zhu Xiaoli: the Professor of Fujian Police Academy (Manager of CBT)
3. Mr. Li Yuechuan: Teacher of Fujian Police Academy
4. Mr. Zhang Lin: Teacher of Fujian Police Academy
5. Mr. Huang Yunfeng: Teacher of Fujian Police Academy (Manager of CMIS)

**Fujian Border Police**
1. Mr. Xie Qingcan, the Director of Intelligence Division of Fujian Border Police
2. Mr. Wang Zhang, the Deputy Director of Intelligence Division of Fujian Border Police
3. Mr. Nie Jianghua, the Director of Training Center of Fujian Border Police
4. Mr. Zhou Chunming, the Deputy Director of Training Center of Fujian Border Police
5. Mr. Wang Chuanwang, Officer of Intelligence Division of Fujian Border Police (Manager of CBT)

Guangdong Province

**Guangdong PSD**
1. Mr. Guo Zehui, Assistant Director-General of Narcotics Control Bureau, Guangdong Public Security Department
2. Mr. Zhu Yuhui, Chief of General Administration Section, NCB, Guangdong PSD
3. Mr. Wu Guozhen, Chief of Intelligence and Information Section, NCB, Guangdong PSD (in charge of CMIS)
4. Mr. Wang Yukai, Deputy Chief of General Administration Section, NCB, Guangdong PSD
5. Mr. Chen Yihao, Official, General Administration Section, NCB, Guangdong PSD (manager of Guangdong CBT)
6. Ms. Chen Qiuyan, Official, Intelligence and Information Section, NCB, Guangdong PSD

**Jiangmen Municipality**
1. Mr. Li Wohua, Deputy Director of Public Security Bureau of Jiangmen Municipality
2. Mr. Liang Wenhui, Director of Narcotics Control Division, PSB of Jiangmen Municipality
3. Mr. Liu Bifa, Deputy Director of Narcotics Control Division, PSB of Jiangmen Municipality
4. Mr. Huang Zhuoqiao, Deputy Director of Narcotics Control Division, PSB of Jiangmen Municipality
5. Mr. Xing Jianhua, Deputy Director of Narcotics Control Division, PSB of Jiangmen Municipality
6. Ms. Guan Wenzhu, Chief of General Administration Section, Narcotics Control Division, PSB of Jiangmen Municipality
7. Mr. Wu Xiaozhen, Official Narcotics Control Division, PSB of Jiangmen Municipality (manager of Jiangmen CBT)

Annex ‘D’
List of substances identified by the FPI, laboratory using the new HPLC;

Opium
Heroin
O6-Acetylmorphine
Acetylcodeine
Cannaboid
D9-THC
Amphetamines
Methamphetamine
3, 4- MDMA
Ephedrine
Ketamine
Caffeine
Benodiazepines
Nimetazapam
Lorazepam
Nitrazepam
Barbitals
Phenobarbital

Annex ‘E’
Strict Practice and apparent success:

The G75 Program is a broad and systematic training course for professional narcotics agents and it had very high values both in practice and supervision. Therefore, all participants study the course with enthusiasm. Through learning 28 subjects in the program and some popular current topics, trainees are involved in great discussions and discover adequate solutions for each case. All of the students have gained both a precise knowledge and deep understanding of not only investigation of smuggled drugs, but appraisal of narcotics as well. Because of the use of multimedia devices and the trainer-trainee interactions in class, students have firmer memories of what they’ve learned. Through strict practice and in-time experience up-grade, all trainees have succeeded in their daily work.

After spreading the G75 Training Program, the use of practicum and tactics of narcotics investigations have improved in our City’s narco-cop system, especially the rapid improvement in total awareness of strategies and tactics of narcotics criminal offences. For the first ten months in 2007, the whole city had investigated and uncovered 636 cases of narcotics offences, which was an increase of 42.6% compared to the same period in 2006. We arrested 760 suspects, an increase of 48% compared to the same period of the previous year. In the 636 cases we seized 4.5 kilograms of heroin, 1.5 million tablets of MDMA, 122 kilograms of liquid ice, 560 grams of ice, 1,027 tablets of shabu and 6,741 grams of ketamine.

Note: The above in an excerpt taken from a report by Jiangmen City Police regarding the effects of the G75 CBT training program in Jiangmen City.