



## ANNEX 1

# SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY OF STUDIES REGARDING CORRUPTION INDICATORS AND MEASUREMENT

# QUANTITATIVE ANALYSIS WITH THE OBJECTIVE OF IDENTIFYING VULNERABILITIES TO OR RISK FACTORS OF CORRUPT BEHAVIOURS OR PRACTICES

## ITALY

Title: Corruption risk indicators and red flags at local level: The ANAC experience in the PON governance framework

Author(s): ANAC

Publisher: ANAC

Year 2021

Type of data used: public procurement data, data related to socioeconomic context (education, labour market, criminality, environment, social capital, etc.)

Brief description of methodology: development of corruption risk indicators in public procurement using the source of the Italian national public procurement database (BDNCP) managed by ANAC. To allow the proposed indicators to be used in practice for even preventive purposes, ANAC is experimenting a validation methodology based on the cross-use socioeconomic data and indicators.

Main findings: The document explain briefly the main objectivities and the first results of the work coordinated by ANAC in the context of the “PON” project<sup>1</sup>, involving several Italian institutions and experts. 13 risk indicators based on public procurement have already been calculated and further will be developed using the open data contained in the BDNCP. Another innovative aspect of the project is the approach used for data processing. A open source (and free) software, "R", is used to calculate the indicators, which includes a wide range of statistical data analysis tools, including the analysis of large databases and the use of so-called artificial intelligence techniques.

An important hypothesis that is being evaluated within the Project is that not only the data, but also the calculation programs can be released "open", that is, freely available, re-usable in other research context.

In the openness and participation perspective, the document also describes the general approach adopted in the project, and in particular aspects such as:

- use of several information systems and databases managed by different Italian institutions and creation of structured forms of interoperability , with the view of feeding a business intelligence system capable of providing dashboards of indicators and red flags on various aspects related to corruption and maladministration;

---

<sup>1</sup> This project, called “Misurazione del rischio di corruzione a livello territoriale e promozione della trasparenza”, is financed by European Union funds under the “Programma Operativo Nazionale Governance e Capacità Istituzionale 2014 – 2020”.

- promotion of civic participation and investment in forms of dissemination of data on corruption risks in order to foster the “cultural” practices that are fundamental for combating corruption and complementary to regulatory ones.

Link to the study/paper/report:

[http://www.anticorruzione.it/portal/rest/jcr/repository/collaboration/Digital%20Assets/anacdocs/Attivita/Anticorruzione/MisurazioneTerritorialeRischio/PropostaANACPON16\\_03\\_2021\\_sito.pdf](http://www.anticorruzione.it/portal/rest/jcr/repository/collaboration/Digital%20Assets/anacdocs/Attivita/Anticorruzione/MisurazioneTerritorialeRischio/PropostaANACPON16_03_2021_sito.pdf)

<http://www.anticorruzione.it/portal/public/classic/Attivita/documentazione/Anticorruzione/MisurazioneTerritorialeRischio>

Title: Rules, discretion and corruption in procurement: Evidence from Italian Government Contracting

Author(s) F. Decarolis, R. Fisman, P. Pinotti, S. Vannutelli

Publisher National Bureau of Economic Research

Year 2020

Type of data used: A confidential database obtained from the Agenzia Informazioni e Sicurezza Interna (AISI), the Italian equivalent of the FBI. The database lists individuals that have been flagged by the AISI as suspected of various crimes, including corruption. By linking this list to administrative data on the top employees and owners of Italian companies, we classify a firm as investigated for corruption if at least one employee or owner was flagged by the AISI for suspected corruption. The resultant firm-level database was linked to information on over 200,000 procurement auctions for the construction and maintenance of public infrastructure held throughout Italy during 2000-2016. Procurement data come from a database provided by the Public Contracts Observatory at the Italian Anticorruption Authority (ANAC), the public entity that oversees public procurement in Italy.

Brief description of methodology: Regression analysis

Main findings: Evidence suggests that discretion, to the extent that it limits competition, is associated with higher suspected corruption in procurement. Analysis shows that these auctions are chosen more often by officials suspected of corruption, and less often in public administrations in which at least one procurement official has been investigated for corruption.

Link to the study/paper/report: <https://www.nber.org/papers/w28209>

Title: Corruption red flags in public procurement: new evidence from Italian calls for tenders

Author(s) F. Decarolis, C. Giorgiantonio

Publisher Bank of Italy, Occasional papers

Year 2020

Type of data used: Two different datasets, Main and Verification data. Main data contain 12,786 contracts awarded by counties and municipalities between January 2009 and November 2015. Contracts involved the procurement of simple roadwork jobs (mostly paving jobs and other maintenance works on roads, highways and bridges) and were held in seven regions: three in the North (Lombardy, Piedmont, Veneto), two in Center (Lazio and Umbria) and two in the South (Campania and Sicily). Verification data includes 3,553 contracts, both call for tenders and award notice documentation. The call for tenders is the document with which the PA announces publicly that a tendering procedure is ongoing, while the award notice describes the outcomes of this procedure in terms of who wins, at what price and, possibly, who else participated and with which bid. These contracts involve the same time period, type of jobs and geographical regions of the contracts in the Main data. The two datasets originate from two different sources and cover a slightly different set of contracts: the Main data are from the Italian Anticorruption Authority (ANAC), which is the public body in charge of the supervision over Italian public procurement system. The Verification data are from a private company (Telemat) that collects and resells to potential bidders detailed tender documentation.

Brief description of methodology: Data are used to measure a large set of red flags for corruption, some novel to the literature, but part of operating practices of the Italian judiciary. These red flags are then combined with detailed firm-level corruption measures allowing us to obtain a measure of corruption superior to most of the alternatives in the literature. Finally, using ML tools the usefulness of the red flags to predict contract-level corruption is explored.

Main findings: The analysis suggests that a higher standardization of call for tenders documents can contribute to reduce corruption risks. For this purpose, sector authorities or specialised public bodies can play a crucial role. In addition to diffusing best practices, these structures may contribute to the harmonization of standards, increasing the degree of certainty of interpretation in a highly complex regulatory context. Moreover, an adequate centralization and professionalisation of contracting authorities should be ensured in order to properly select private contractors, also mitigating corruption risks.

Link to the study/paper/report: <https://www.bancaditalia.it/pubblicazioni/qef/2020-0544/index.html?com.dotmarketing.htmlpage.language=1>

Title: Lost in Corruption. Evidence from EU funding to Southern Italy

Author(s) I. De Angelis, G. de Blasio, L. Rizzica

Publisher Italian Economic Journal

Year 2020

Type of data used: Dependent variable – number of white collar crimes for each municipality in the period 2017-14 taken from the archive of the Ministry of Interior. Explanatory variable – data on disbursement of EU structural funds published on OpenCoesione (online open data portal). Control variables - additional information at the municipality level referring to local population size, labor market participation, unemployment, educational attainment and political cycle, as well as regional GDP growth. Control variables are taken from the Italian National Bureau of Statistics (ISTAT) and from the Italian registry of academic enrollments (MIUR).

Brief description of methodology: Poisson regression + robustness checks

Main findings: Significant positive relationship between EU funds and the occurrence of corruption and fraudulent behaviors in the recipient municipality in the same year. While a causal interpretation should be taken with caution, the robustness analysis provided evidence that the correlation between transfers and corruption is likely not just spurious or due to confounding effects.

Link to the study/paper/report: <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s40797-020-00123-2>

Title: Predicting Corruption Crimes with Machine Learning: A Study for Italian Municipalities

Author(s) G. De Blasio, A. D'Ignazio, M. Letta

Publisher University of Rome Sapienza, Working Papers

Year 2020

Type of data used: The source of crime data is the SDI archive by the Ministry of the Interior. Our database includes crime data for almost all Italian municipalities (8,049 out of 8,092 municipalities); data on white-collar crimes, which is the main object of our study, is available for 7,794 municipalities over the years 2008-2014. The set of predictors consists of socio-economic, demographic, geographic and biophysical characteristics, available at the municipality level and taken from the National Institute of Statistics and the University of Delaware weather database.

Brief description of methodology: Machine learning algorithms

Main findings: Findings suggest that the combination of new data and data-driven machine learning techniques might provide innovative and impartial tools to help the policymaker improve ex-ante targeting and regulatory design.

Link to the study/paper/report:

[http://www.diss.uniroma1.it/sites/default/files/allegati/DiSSE\\_deBlasioetal\\_wp16\\_2020.pdf](http://www.diss.uniroma1.it/sites/default/files/allegati/DiSSE_deBlasioetal_wp16_2020.pdf)

Title: Public corruption: A study across regions in Italy

Author(s) G. Corrado, F. Rossetti

Publisher Journal of Policy Modeling

Year 2018

Type of data used: This study employs a dataset, which provides information for as many as twenty Italian regions over a span of eleven years 2000–2011. Data come predominantly from the Italian National Institute of Statistics (ISTAT) and Eurostat.

Brief description of methodology: This work explores the determinants of public corruption using a regional panel dataset on crimes perpetrated in Italy by public officials against the public administration in combination with a set of demographic and socio-economic variables.

Main findings: Number of corruption related crimes within the public administration may be associated with the size of the public sector, poorer quality of local infrastructure (quality of roads) and unequal socio-economic conditions (high rates of young people not in employment, education or training and lower levels of social capital). The estimated model also suggests that the persistence of unlawfulness for those regions that delay their firm intervention against the misbehaviours of public officials increases the risk to remain stuck in a harmful “vicious circle” which may lead to tolerate public crimes instead of counteracting it.

Link to the study/paper/report:

<https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/abs/pii/S0161893818300012>

Title: Structure and competitiveness of companies awarded public contracts.

Authors: V. Cava, A. Faramondi, R. Nardecchia, F. Sallusti.

Publisher: to be printed

Year: 2020

Type of data used: database on public tenders and official statistical registers of businesses by ISTAT: Statistical Archive of Active Companies (ASIA) and Structural Businesses Statistics (Frame SBS)

Brief description of methodology: As part of the ISTAT and Anticorruption Agency (ANAC) Agreement 2016 and 2019 on Integrity, "Transparency and Analysis of the corruption phenomenon" (<https://www.istat.it/it/files/2016/03/Protocollo-dIntesa-ANAC-ISTAT.pdf>), an exploratory analysis of the database on public tenders was carried out, integrating the information with the official statistical registers of ISTAT: ASIA and Frame SBS. In particular, the databases made available by ANAC offer an information framework, for the years 2008-2018, on the companies awarded public contracts, on the contracting authorities and on the

types of contracts.  
The results regard the cross-sectional analysis conducted for 2017 and the longitudinal analysis carried out for the years 2017 and 2012. The database available to the successful bidders was first handled through deterministic linkage procedures with the statistical archives of the active companies (Asia), in order to identify a structural and personal data characterization of the companies involved, and subsequently with the register Frame SBS to obtain their economic profiling.

Main findings: The integration of the ANAC and Istat sources allow, on the one hand, to complete the profile of the successful bidders not only from a structural point of view but also from that of performance (in its various dimensions) while, on the other, it allow compare their performance with production units unrelated to relations with public administrations. In this way it is possible to obtain a complete profile of the awarded companies, to study their positioning within the production system and to analyse whether, and to what extent, the fact of having economic relations with the Public Administrations can be related with a possible different performance compared to the rest of the production units.

Title: The measurement of corruption through the judgments of the judiciary

Authors: Maria Francesca Romano, Gaetana Morgante, Antonella Baldassarini, Giuseppe Di Vetta, Pasquale Pavone

Publisher: <https://www.federalismi.it/nv14/articolo-documento.cfm?Artid=44515>

Year: 2020

Type of data used: Judiciary Judgements

Brief description of methodology: Istat, University of Sant'Anna, Bank of Italy and others created in 2016 a Working Group on Illegal Economic Activities with the aim to study the impact of illegal economy and at the analysis of revenue estimates., in collaboration with the national accounting sector of Istat. In this context started some analysis based on final judgments regarding corruption. The used method is based on the application of text mining and statistical techniques to an objective and stable information base, represented by a significant sample of sentences handed down by the Supreme Court of Cassation, in the period between 2015 and January 2020, regarding corruption offenses (arts. 317, 318, 319, 319-quater, 321 of the penal code).

Main findings: The tool developed has vast potential application, first of all with a view to characterization of the event in a broadly corruptive sense, as it is crystallized in the judicial source. In particular, linking data of business with data from Istat it is possible to define the profile of the company involved in the corruption event, the profile of the public administration affected by the corruption event, the profile of the methods of the corruptive event.

## KOREA

Title: (2019) National Integrity Index Research and Development

(2020) National Integrity Index Assessment Measure Research

Authors: Choi Jin-ouk, Park Jung-hun, Choi Won-seok

Publisher : ACRC

Years: 2019 and 2020

Type of data used: two national indices and seven international indices

Link to the paper/report: 2019 report ([www.prism.go.kr](http://www.prism.go.kr))/ 2020 report (not published yet)

Main findings: The ACRC of Korea developed a nationwide integrity assessment model which was used to assess national integrity level of both the public and private sector for the past two years between 2019 and 2020 and could be applicable to other countries ( The integrity assessment was piloted for other countries to increase the validity of the assessment method)

The assessment is constructed into various criteria related to 12 areas which are divided into two sectors of corruption status and anti-corruption system. To enhance data trustworthiness and measurability, the assessment uses existing national and international assessment indices (two national indices\* and seven international indices)

\* In cases where the national indices are used in other country, if there is no index corresponding thereto in the country, the assessment is developed in ways that survey questionnaires applicable are created and the countries themselves could conduct the survey and use the results.

## BRAZIL

Title: Exposure of the federal public administration to fraud and corruption

Author(s): Supreme Audit Institution (Tribunal de Contas da União - TCU)

Publisher: Supreme Audit Institution (Tribunal de Contas da União - TCU)

Year: 2018

Type of data used: survey responded by 498 organizations of the Brazilian federal public sector

Brief description of methodology: The integrated public governance and management questionnaire evaluated organizations in relation to fraud and corruption, ethics and integrity management, risk management and internal controls, transparency and accountability, internal audit and procedures for



appointment of managers. It analysed 30 practices through 100 verification items using a multivariate statistical method.

Main findings: It generated a fraud and corruption control index for the Brazilian federal public administration.

Link to the study/paper/report: <https://meapffc.apps.tcu.gov.br/>

Title: The transparent Brazil scale (EBT)

Author(s): Office of the Comptroller General (CGU)

Publisher: Office of the Comptroller General (CGU)

Year: Since 2015

Type of data used: checklists of active and passive transparency in 2,355 Brazilian federative entities, of which 2,301 municipalities, all 27 capitals, in addition to the 26 states and the Federal District.

Brief description of methodology: The EBT is a methodology for measuring public transparency in Brazilian states and municipalities. Its metric results in a score from 0 to 10 points, where 25% of the score accounts for regulation of the Access to Information Law and 75% for the effective existence and performance of public sectors ombudsman.

Main findings: EBT generates a national ranking of Brazilian federal entities on compliance with transparency provisions and ombudsman's performance.

Link to the study/paper/report: <https://mbt.cgu.gov.br/publico/home>

## CHINA

Title : Local Experience and Policy Implications of the Turning Point of Integrity ——An Analysis on Integrity Statistics of G Province

Author(s): NI Xing, ZHANG Jun

Publisher: study of politics

Year: 2018

Type of Data used: People's perception of integrity of governments at all levels are taken as indicators to measure the turning point of integrity

Brief description of methodology: descriptive statistics, regression analysis

Main findings: Based on the survey of corruption assessment in G province from 2013 to 2017, it is found that the people's perception on public integrity at all levels declines first and then increases. Corruption is increasingly intolerable to them. Meanwhile, the general public still see corruption in their daily life, but their willingness to participate in anti-corruption fluctuates. Further empirical analysis shows that people's perception of integrity at local levels are greatly affected by their experience of corruption, tolerance to corruption and satisfaction of anti-corruption work. People's increasing sense of integrity also helps to enhance their willingness to participate in anti-corruption and their confidence in the future anti-corruption work of governments. Therefore, at present, it is necessary to maintain political determination and constantly adjust and optimize the anti-corruption policies.

Link to the paper/report:

[https://kns.cnki.net/kcms/detail/detail.aspx?dbcode=CJFD&dbname=CJFDLAST2018&filename=POLI201805009&v=W\\_rKT%25mmd2F35vJsFI%25mmd2FEAb3NqSnyj%25mmd2FeFwLmXUu3Tr%25mmd2FykbCI1VX2mJ3yOPKS%25mmd2FQJFiW5hOuF](https://kns.cnki.net/kcms/detail/detail.aspx?dbcode=CJFD&dbname=CJFDLAST2018&filename=POLI201805009&v=W_rKT%25mmd2F35vJsFI%25mmd2FEAb3NqSnyj%25mmd2FeFwLmXUu3Tr%25mmd2FykbCI1VX2mJ3yOPKS%25mmd2FQJFiW5hOuF)

Title : Corruption Measurement

Author(s): GUO Yong, SONG Wei

Publisher: Tsinghua University Press

Year: 2015

Type of Data used: the corruption measurement indicators can be categorized into 3 layers, the first layer has 3 dimensions, the second layer covers 18 aspects, and the third layer has 68 indicators.

Brief description of methodology: the combination of subjective and objective indicators, the input, mechanism, result and effect of measurement indicators, multidimensional subject of corruption measurement.

Main findings: The study proposes to measure corruption from three dimensions: corruption perception, anti-corruption performance and corruption risk. This could reflect the corruption governance in a specific region more comprehensively. Specifically, corruption perception belongs to the past as it reflects corruption that already took place. Anti-corruption performance is the evaluation of the effectiveness of the current anti-corruption work, which is ongoing. Corruption risk is the evaluation of the possibility of corruption in the future, which belongs to the future tense. In corruption measurement, the three dimensions reflect the overall level of corruption and anti-corruption work from different perspectives.

Link to the paper/report:

<https://kns.cnki.net/kcms/detail/detail.aspx?dbcode=CJFD&dbname=CJFDLAST2016&filename=>

GGXZ201603009&v=s1T2QmAMli0tNn6OwbdnywEeYU1Wjh1zc9CCCPB8iW3uw1ymHMq44  
MNRVbOx0mb

Title : Research on the Relationship between Fiscal Budget Transparency and Corruption of Local Officials in China

Author(s): LI Chungeng, XU Jianbin

Publisher: Contemporary Finance & Economics

Year: 2016

Type of Data used: to measure the level of corruption according to the number of cases of graft, bribery and dereliction of duty.

Brief description of methodology: dynamic panel regression

Main findings: At the provincial level, fiscal budget transparency has a significant negative correlation with corruption. This paper suggests to revise and improve legal framework to enhance fiscal budget transparency of governments at all levels, so that it would contribute to anti-corruption work.

Link to the paper/report:

<https://kns.cnki.net/kcms/detail/detail.aspx?dbcode=CJFD&dbname=CJFDLAST2016&filename=DDCJ201601004&v=BrueLN2cdp65%25mmd2BsNo08DPISjn7xwbg7bQ8nlQNjuNrZysOmkEXcnyfuEqGJwFDFs>

## **MEXICO**

Title: Panorama estadístico en México del ODS 16: promover sociedades justas, pacíficas e inclusivas

Author(s) Instituto Nacional de Estadística y Geografía

Publisher Oscar Jaimes Bello

Year 2020

Type of data used: Statistical

Brief description of methodology

Based on different information programs of the National Institute of Statistics and Geography (INEGI), this document offers a national statistical overview of the country's situation on issues related with Goal 16, including the goal of considerably reducing corruption and bribery in all its forms. With this, it seeks to contribute to identifying the challenges and opportunities that the Mexican State has in order to respond to the international commitment to guarantee environments free of violence and to ensure that each of the citizens can freely exercise their rights on an equal footing.

Main findings:

Due to its relevance as a precondition for sustainable development, this document focused on this SDG, in order to present, based on different statistical programs in charge of INEGI, data that indicate the magnitude of problems, such as violence; violence against women, children and adolescents; institutional uncertainty; discrimination, and limited representation in decision-making and participation spaces.

Link to the study/paper/report:

[https://www.inegi.org.mx/contenidos/productos/prod\\_serv/contenidos/espanol/bvinegi/productos/nueva\\_estruc/702825197193.pdf](https://www.inegi.org.mx/contenidos/productos/prod_serv/contenidos/espanol/bvinegi/productos/nueva_estruc/702825197193.pdf)

Title El Sistema Nacional Anticorrupción y el quehacer de los Órganos Internos de Control

Author(s) Instituto Nacional de Estadística y Geografía

Publisher Oscar Jaimes Bello

Year 2019

Type of data used: Statistical

Brief description of methodology

Using the information provided by the National Government Censuses of the National Institute of Statistics and Geography (INEGI), this document analyzes aspects related to the functions of the Internal Control Bodies in government agencies, as well as the resources they have.

Main findings:

According to the available data, it was identified that corruption is one of the main problems in the country, but it has different magnitudes and dynamics, based on indicators such as the percentage of people who are victims of corruption or the prevalence of corruption in procedures. Given this, the implementation of the National Anticorruption System (SNA) and the SLAs has represented a paradigm shift in the structuring and operation of anti-corruption policies in Mexico. Under this new coordination scheme, the Internal Control Bodies continue to be in charge of the prevention, investigation and punishment of acts of corruption; however, its characteristics, processes and results

are heterogeneous between states and between the different powers that have these institutional structures. In this sense, the relevance of knowing the data associated with corruption and its fight should be highlighted, in order to have a better evaluation of the strategies and instruments to combat it.

Link to the study/paper/report:

[http://internet.contenidos.inegi.org.mx/contenidos/Productos/prod\\_serv/contenidos/espanol/bvinegi/productos/nueva\\_estruc/702825194284.pdf](http://internet.contenidos.inegi.org.mx/contenidos/Productos/prod_serv/contenidos/espanol/bvinegi/productos/nueva_estruc/702825194284.pdf)

Title Corrupción. Una revisión conceptual y metodológica

Author(s) Instituto Nacional de Estadística y Geografía

Publisher Adrián Franco Barrios

Year 2016

Type of data used: Statistical

Brief description of methodology

This document briefly sets out the main definitions and the different methodologies that have been used to measure corruption, with an emphasis on surveys, due to the fact that there is no single definition and measurement at the international level, despite the various national efforts to get an overview of corruption. The text considers elements about the type of questions asked, the periodicity of the surveys, the producers, the representativeness, among others.

Main findings:

Without an adequate measurement of the phenomenon, there are various risks, for example: identifying problems in areas that are not necessarily the most challenging; allocating resources inefficiently, and hinder the evaluation and comparison of different government units. For this reason, working on the methodological strengthening of each source is a priority to generate reliable, comparable and timely information that allows influencing the design and evaluation of public policies.

Link to the study/paper/report:

[https://www.inegi.org.mx/contenidos/productos/prod\\_serv/contenidos/espanol/bvinegi/productos/nu\\_eva\\_estruc/702825090340.pdf](https://www.inegi.org.mx/contenidos/productos/prod_serv/contenidos/espanol/bvinegi/productos/nu_eva_estruc/702825090340.pdf)

Title: UK National Strategic Assessment

Author(s) The National Crime Agency

Publisher The National Crime Agency

Year Annual

Type of data used: Qualitative and Quantitative

Brief description of methodology. The NSA is an assessment that look to gauge the level of threat

Main findings: The NSA recognises that the UK's understanding of domestic corruption is very limited and that more can be done to understand the corruption threat. The NSA recognises that the scale of the threat is likely to be widely underreported.

Link to the study/paper/report: <https://www.nationalcrimeagency.gov.uk/news/nsa2020>

## SPAIN

Title: RADIOGRAFÍA DE LOS PROCEDIMIENTOS DE CONTRATACIÓN PÚBLICA EN ESPAÑA

Author(s): Comisión Nacional de los Mercados y la Competencia (CNMC)

Publisher: CNMC

Year: 2019

Type of data used: Quantitative. From the Registro de Contratos del Sector Público, the Plataforma de Contratación del Sector Público, the Portal de Contratación Centralizada del Ministerio de Hacienda and the “Tenders Electronic Daily” (TED).

Brief description of methodology: Quantitative, descriptive and econometric

Link to the study/paper/report: [https://www.cnmc.es/sites/default/files/2314114\\_2.pdf](https://www.cnmc.es/sites/default/files/2314114_2.pdf)

Title: INTEGRITY WATCH SPAIN: INFORME SOBRE LOS RESULTADOS DEL PROYECTO Y RECOMENDACIONES FINALES DE TRANSPARENCY INTERNATIONAL ESPAÑA

Author(s): MARTINEZ, D.; CERVETTI, C.

Publisher: Transparency International España

Year: 2020

Type of data used: Quantitative

Brief description of methodology: Pages 7 to 9

Link to the study/paper/report: <https://transparencia.org.es/wp-content/uploads/2021/02/Informe-Final-Integrity-Watch-Spain.pdf>

Title: INFORME ANUAL DE SUPERVISIÓN DE LA CONTRATACIÓN PÚBLICA DE ESPAÑA

Author(s): Oficina Independiente de Regulación y Supervisión de la Contratación (OIREscon)

Publisher: Ministerio de Hacienda

Year: 2019

Type of data used: Quantitative

Brief description of methodology: Pages 16 to 20

Link to the study/paper/report: <https://contrataciondelestado.es/wps/wcm/connect/27901388-df3a-434d-8a47-3356a7c11261/INFORME+SUPERVISION+OIRESCON+2019.pdf?MOD=AJPERES>

## INDONESIA

Title: Survey on Integrity Assessment

Author : Directorate of Monitoring, Corruption Eradication Commission (KPK), Indonesia

Publisher: KPK

Year: 2019

Type of data used :

The Survey on Integrity Assessment was conducted by combining the use of primary data and secondary data. Primary data is obtained through a survey conducted on employees of ministries/government agencies/regional governments, service users of these ministries/government agencies/regional governments, experts who understand the condition of integrity to monitor the risk of corruption within the agency, and efforts to prevent corruption conducted by respective agencies. This primary data then becomes a compiler for the integrity index adjusted with correction factors. These factors consist of secondary data obtained from the compliance figures of asset declaration compliance, as well as public reports / complaints on corruption offences.

#### Brief description of methodology :

This survey was conducted by KPK in cooperation with Central Agency on Statistics to measure the outputs and outcomes of anti-corruption in ministries/agencies/regional governments. Integrity Assessment may help government institutions in mapping the risk of corruption in and prevent corruption by establishing anti-corruption system and policies. Meanwhile the public can also be benefited through gaining information regarding the corruption risk in an institution.

The survey assesses budget management (corruption in public procurement), bribery cases, ostracized whistle blower and human resource management (nepotism in the recruitment). The measurement of integrity in this survey is carried out based on internal point of view (employees/officials in the institution), external point of view (external parties who obtain services or otherwise deal with the institution) and anti-corruption experts.

This survey is conducted in partnership between KPK and the ministries/agencies/regional governments with consideration that the important part of the survey is the score-based recommendations that should be followed up by ministries/agencies/regional governments that are participating in the survey. The survey is a guided self-assessment survey. In this survey, the final score of integrity takes into account the marking-down factors derived from focused group discussion/in-depth interview/corruption cases that occurred in the respective institution.

Data collection is carried out using gadgets to ensure the confidentiality of the answers from each respondent so that respondents can provide answers objectively. The survey was conducted on 60 employees, 60 service users in the past year, and 10 expert respondents for each ministry/agencies/regional government who participated in survey with a margin of error for each agency that is different and a maximum of up to 20 percent. The survey results are formed from a scale of 1 to 100, where the higher the integrity score of an agency, the better the system that runs in the ministry/agencies/regional government. Hence, they will be able to detect the risk of corruption and handle it when corruption offences occur.

#### Main findings :

A number of key findings are as follows:

- a. The results of the 2019 Integrity Assessment Survey show that the integrity index of ministry/agencies/regional government is 79.08.
- b. The integrity index of ministry/agencies/regional government in 2019 can be broken down into an internal assessment index of 87.14, an external assessment index of 75.18 and an index of expert assessment of 71.28.
- c. Several indications that point to corruption, collusion and conflict of interest in governance at the survey locus in the last 12 months are among others:



- The number of employees who use office facilities for personal gain was heard by 10.9% of internal respondents.
  - The number of employees who use office activities for personal gain was heard by 3.9% of internal respondents.
  - 19% of internal respondents had seen or heard of illegal brokers.
  - Based on the experience of internal respondents, (5.8%) respondents have seen or heard a boss who gives orders outside the rules.
  - Behaviour that leads to gratification has been seen by (6.2%) internal respondents.
  - There are (6.7%) employees who said they have never seen the perpetrators of corruption that were revealed to be processed legally.
  - Etc.
- d. Several indications that point to the practice of corruption, collusion and conflict of interest in public services in the last 12 months are:
- About 3.2% of external respondents felt that the information provided regarding service procedures, requirements and fees was not transparent.
  - There are around 16.9% of external respondents who do not believe that the ministry/agencies/regional government will provide protection to the public who reports corruption.
- e. Several indications that point to practices of corruption, collusion and conflict of interest according to experts in the last 12 months are among others:
- Approximately 19.4% of expert respondents thought that bribery occurred frequently in ministry/agencies/regional government.
  - Approximately 17.2% of expert respondents thought that officers often do extortion.
  - About 29.9% of expert respondents think that there are still many conflicts of interest committed by employees.
  - About 16% of expert respondents said there were still many brokering practices in ministry/agencies/regional government.
  - About 14.1% of expert respondents thought that the quality of budget transparency in each ministry/agencies/regional government was still poor

The survey concludes that the main challenges related on corruption offences in participating ministry/agencies/regional government are among others: illegal brokers in public service, lack of information on public service, staffs' promotion are related to gratification, nepotism (family relation) affects the staffs' recruitment, anti-corruption awareness raising that isn't effective,

reporting persons on corruption offences will receive retaliation (ostracized, sanctioned, transferred, hindered career).

The survey also resulted in recommendations, as follows:

1. Development/strengthening of conflict of interest management regulations and their implementation including internalization and supervision / enforcement to support the development of a culture of integrity in each agency.
2. Strengthening the whistleblowing system to increase the reporting rate from employees and to ensure protection of reporting persons.
3. To strengthen the enforcement and supervision efforts that have been carried out by the agency to employees and other stakeholders.
4. Strengthening service transparency through optimizing the use of technology.
5. Optimizing the use of technology (for example, online services or in other forms) that are currently being implemented, increasing transparency and ease of access to information, deregulating regulations and cutting bureaucracy.

Link to the study/paper/report:

<https://jaga.id/klspi/?vnk=f8b39f1b>

Title : Survey on Integrity Assessment

Author : Directorate of Monitoring, Corruption Eradication Commission (KPK), Indonesia

Publisher : KPK

Year: : 2018

Type of data used: :

The type of data used are generated from survey and in-depth interview. The survey calculates the index from three main dimensions, in which each dimension is carried out separately on internal assessment, external assessment and expert assessment. Method used to calculate the index on the three main dimensions is the Principal Component Analysis (PCA) method. In general, stages of the calculation of this index includes: 1) Determination of analysis variables; 2) Equalizing variable scales; 3) Determination of the weight of each variable; 4) Calculation of Index and Correction Factors.

Brief description of methodology :

The methodology of this survey is similar with the previous survey conducted in the previous year.

Main findings :

The results of the 2018 Integrity Assessment Survey at ministries/government agencies and regional governments in Indonesia, which was conducted at 6 Ministries/ government agencies and 20 Provincial Governments showed that the 2018 SPI Integrity Index was 68.75. The overall integrity index in 2018 can be broken down into an internal assessment index of 84.45, an external assessment index of 72.07 and an expert assessment index of 54.35. For the internal and external assessment dimensions, the lowest score is found in the anti-corruption system variable. Several main findings are among others:

1. The risk of corruption arises in all participating agencies patterns and trends. This indicates that corruption risks are mutual concerns that should be taken seriously.
2. Patterns of corruption risk that emerge from the stakeholders' point of view:
  - a. Conflict of interest in the performance of duties and services: The risk of corruption has tended to be stagnant since 2017 in the number of incidents.
  - b. Abuse of authority by superiors: The risk of corruption is increasing compared to 2017.
  - c. Bribery/gratuities/extortion: The acts of bribery/gratuities/extortion has increased in the year 2018.
  - d. Sale and Purchase in Public Positions: The incidence of bribery/gratuities /extortion has increased in the year 2018.
  - e. Misuse of State Budget: This risk of corruption tends to be stagnant since 2017
  - f. Other factors that affect the increased risks of corruption:
    - Increasing perceptual responses to the lack of transparency and accountability in public services according to stakeholders.
    - Increasing role of intermediaries in public services.
3. The anti-corruption system in participating agencies is in place and shows a trend of improvement from the point of view of service users and employees, however, its effectiveness in changing corrupt behaviour remains a paramount challenge considering that stakeholders are still experiencing acts related to corruption from public officials and civil servants in delivering public services.

The survey also resulted in recommendations, as follows:

1. Development/strengthening of conflict of interest management regulations and its implementation including internalization and supervision/enforcement to support the development of a culture of integrity in the respective institution.

2. Systemic development of anti-corruption internalization in employee education and career development programs.
3. Encouraging collaboration on the follow-up of corruption offences with law enforcement agencies and enforcement of internal sanctions for those who commit corruption.
4. Strengthening the whistleblowing system to increase the participation of reporting persons and ensure protection of whistle-blowers.
5. Encourage the Integrity Survey Assessment to be carried out periodically on a broader scale to map the risk of corruption in government agencies.
6. Development of a system or mechanism that can increase the transparency and accountability of the task implementation process employees in government agencies.
7. Enhancing the use of ICT in public services to improve transparency, accountability, good governance and improve public participation/ access to public information.

Link to the study/paper/report:

<https://www.kpk.go.id/id/publikasi/kajian-dan-penelitian/kajian-dan-penelitian-2/1268-survei-penilaian-integritas-spi-2018>

## **RUSSIA**

Title: The practice of ineffective spending of budgetary funds in the procurement contract system.

Author(s): Kikavets V.V., Vershilo T.A.

Publisher: "Financial law"

Year: 2020

Type of data used: Article

Brief description of methodology: The article reveals the problem of ineffective spending of budgetary funds on the example of the actions of officials of the customer and the Federal Antimonopoly Service of Russia, as well as its territorial offices.

Main findings: The authors propose to increase the liability of state (municipal) customers by establishing personal financial liability of officials, as well as to include in the Budget Code of the Russian Federation coercive measures against officials of customers for certain acts (refraining from acting).

Title: Assessment of corruption risks in federal executive bodies.

Author(s): Truntsevskiy Y.V., Tsirin A.M., Sevalnev V.V.

Publisher: “PROSPEKT”

Year: 2019

Type of data used: Methodological guide

Brief description of methodology: The study is based on the general scientific dialectical mode of knowledge, including the study of legal acts, the current problems of assessing corruption risks.

Main findings: The authors formulate methodological recommendations for assessing corruption risks in federal executive bodies, whose purpose is to increase the effectiveness of anti-corruption measures.

Link to the study/paper/report: <https://www.elibrary.ru/item.asp?id=37279687>

## SAUDI ARABIA

Title: A Study on the Extent of Government Bodies' Commitment while Applying the Code of Conduct and Public Service Ethics.

Author(s): Department of Research and Studies – The Oversight and Anti-Corruption Authority.

Publisher: The Oversight and Anti-Corruption Authority.

Year: 2018

Type of data used: Quantitative data.

Brief description of methodology:

This study was conducted in accordance with the scientific rules for carrying out an academic research; the study encompassed a sample of (4723) public sector employees, representing all ministries and government bodies with various functional cadres in all regions.

Main findings:

69% of the public employees did not fully read and understand the Code of Conduct and Public Service Ethics.

63% of the employees reported that the Code of conduct was not published on their employers' websites.

31% reviewed the code of conduct and Public Service Ethics of which 93% of them thought that this Code of Conduct positively influenced their works.

Title: E-GOVERNMENT ADOPTION IN SAUDI ARABIA: THE MODERATION EFFECT OF WASTTA

Author(s): Ayman Almukhlifi RMIT University, Hepu Deng RMIT University, and Booi Kam RMIT University

Publisher: <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/330871653>

Year: 2018

Type of data used: Quantitative Data

Brief description of methodology:

This study aims to investigate the moderation effect of the Wastta (nepotism) on e-government adoption in Saudi Arabia. To achieve this aim, a quantitative methodology is applied due to two reasons. Firstly, a quantitative method is able to investigate the causal relationships among variables by collecting and analysing the numerical dataset (Creswell, 2013). Secondly, the findings of the study can be generalised (Straub et al., 2004).

Data is collected through the use of survey of citizens. The questionnaire was pre-tested with academic experts for ensuring the content validity. It includes three parts. The first part explains the purpose of the survey. The second part is designed for gathering the demographic information. The third part is used to collect the information related to the identified constructs. The sample of this study is Saudi citizens who have used e-government services. A total of 477 responses are received. The number of responses is reduced to 419 after deleting 58 cases due to missing values and outliers.

A hierarchical multiple regression analysis (HMRA) is used for analysing the data. The use of such a data analysis technique allows the addition of variables sequentially to evaluate the influence of added variables on the dependent variable (Pallant, 2010). It is widely used due to (a) its ability in predicting a dependent variable through independent variables, and (b) its appropriateness to analyse the influence of a moderating variable on other variables (Fairchild and MacKinnon, 2009; Pallant, 2010).

Main findings:

Following the model evaluation, the hypotheses were tested using HMRA (Tabachnick and Fidell, 2007). The data were analysed in four steps. In step 1, demographic variables including age, gender and education level were entered as control variables. In step 2, PEOU, PU and CSE were entered to assess the main effect on e-government adoption. In step 3, Wastta were entered to investigate how much it adds to the regression model. In step 4, the interaction between PEOU and Wastta, PU and Wastta, and CSE and Wastta were considered.

The study shows that all three hypotheses of the moderation effect are significant. It reveals that the interaction between Wastta and PEOU is negatively significant (standardized path coefficient = -0.090,  $p < 0.05$ ), supporting H4. The interaction between Wastta and PU is positively significant (standardized path coefficient = 0.104,  $p < 0.01$ ), rejecting H5. The interaction between Wastta and CSE is positively significant (standardized path coefficient = 0.072,  $p < 0.05$ ), rejecting H6. Furthermore, the results show that the research framework explained around 59 per cent of the variance in e-government adoption.

Link to the study/paper/report:

[https://www.researchgate.net/publication/330871653\\_E-government\\_Adoption\\_in\\_Saudi\\_Arabia\\_The\\_Moderation\\_Effect\\_of\\_Wastta?enrichId=rgreq-8317941f66cafcd44afeb8503c7a1a29-XXX&enrichSource=Y292ZXJQYWdlOzMzMDg3MTY1MztBUzo3MzkxMjQ3NjgxNTc2OTZAMTU1MzIzMjQ4NTY2Mw%3D%3D&el=1\\_x\\_2&\\_esc=publicationCoverPdf](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/330871653_E-government_Adoption_in_Saudi_Arabia_The_Moderation_Effect_of_Wastta?enrichId=rgreq-8317941f66cafcd44afeb8503c7a1a29-XXX&enrichSource=Y292ZXJQYWdlOzMzMDg3MTY1MztBUzo3MzkxMjQ3NjgxNTc2OTZAMTU1MzIzMjQ4NTY2Mw%3D%3D&el=1_x_2&_esc=publicationCoverPdf)

Title: E-Government Adoption in Saudi Arabia: The Moderation Influence of Transparency

Author(s): Ayman Fehaid S Almukhlifi (*RMIT Staff Author*), Hepu Deng (*RMIT Staff Author*), and Booi Kam (*RMIT Staff Author*)

Publisher: Academy Publisher; Finland

Year: 2019

Type of data used: Quantitative Data

Brief description of methodology:

The aim of this study is to investigate the influence of the transparency on the adoption of e-government in Saudi Arabia from the perspective of citizens. To achieve this aim, a quantitative methodology is applied in this study due to the confirmation nature of the main research question.

Main findings:

This study uses structural equation modelling for testing and validating the relationships between the constructs proposed in the research model in Fig. 1. The use of structural equation modelling is appropriate for this study because structural equation modelling is able to simultaneously examine the multiple relationship among constructs when validating the proposed research model. Two processes in structured equation modelling analysis are followed in this study including the measurement model analysis and the structural model analysis .

Link to the study/paper/report: \_

<http://www.jait.us/uploadfile/2019/0227/20190227043552220.pdf>

## SOUTH AFRICA

Title: The influence of procurement practices on service delivery: an analysis of government legislation – service delivery relationships in south africa

Author(s): Sakhile Manyathi

Publisher: Stellenbosch University

Year: December 2019

Type of data used: Quantitative, Qualitative and hybrid research designs

Brief description of methodology:

Quantitative,

The study tested the researcher's assumption that there are negative relationships between service delivery and public procurement processes; therefore, the researcher saw fit to apply the principles of quantitative methods.

Qualitative

The research processes are the primary focus of any qualitative study researcher, other than focusing on the research outcomes or findings (Johnson & Christensen, 2010). This research adopted qualitative methods because it makes it easier to understand and capture rich and necessary data, personal experiences and perceptions that would have not been extracted while using quantitative methods alone. The researcher adopted the qualitative method, which is increasingly and widely used by researchers as confirmed by (Gray et al., 2007). While trying to test relationships between different but related variables, qualitative methods are best suited to achieve high quality results compared to quantitative methods as Johnson and Christensen (2010) argued; therefore, in this study the relationships between public procurement legislation, its implementation and service delivery were discussed.

Cavana, Delahaye and Sekaran (2000) describe mixed methods (hybrid methods) as research that applies both logical hypotheses (quantitative methods) and interview processes (qualitative methods). Therefore, as a research method, the process involves an application of specific methods of collecting data and analysing data, such methods use qualitative and quantitative procedures for the entire research study. Hence, the process collects, analyse and mixes both qualitative and quantitative data to prove or disprove the study hypothesis and get meaning from how the respondents perceive the



phenomenon under study. The reasoning behind using the hybrid research method is to mitigate possible shortfalls of either the quantitative or qualitative method and to capitalise on the strengths of each of these research methods in order to effectively address complicated research areas such as public sector service delivery mechanisms, as supported by Green (2007).

#### Main findings:

There are public procurement challenges that arise from various governance and legislative practices and still others from fragmented procurement ICT systems. Challenges also arise from the pretending, tendering and post-tendering stages. Further challenges arise from fragmented procurement legislation and some from the political environment within public procurement. T

Link to the study/paper/report:  
[https://scholar.sun.ac.za/bitstream/handle/10019.1/107179/manyathi\\_influence\\_2019.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y](https://scholar.sun.ac.za/bitstream/handle/10019.1/107179/manyathi_influence_2019.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y)

Title : A model for the prevention of corruption and corruption-related offences at Gauteng police stations

Author(s): Ronnie Gonasagaran Dayananda Rajin

Publisher: UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA

Year: May 2017

Type of data used:

Brief description of methodology:

This research study attempts to understand the reasons why police officials committed corruption and explore police officials' reasons for having committed corruption and corruption related offences. The research will seek to provide recommendations to the SAPS to improve measures and strategies to prevent corruption. To achieve the aim and objectives, as discussed in section 1.5 and 1.6, the research interviews were carried out with selected participants, utilising a carefully structured research method. The population, the selection of participants, sampling criteria, data collection and analysis will be explained below

#### Main findings:

High incidences of corruption and corruption-related crimes involve all levels of police and legal forces

- Corruption among all levels of the police
- Reservists
- Other government departments and law enforcement agencies

- Multiple factors in the policing context which contribute to corruption and corruption-related crimes
- Motivation to join the police and misuse of power.
- Fear of retaliation.
- Temptations and opportunities abound
- Greedy nature and financial constraints.
- Social and Peer pressure
- Workload and supervision: problems go unaddressed
- Role of the court
- Community involvement.
- The different forms of corruption.
- Money.
- Gifts.
- Manipulating the system.
- Coercion and intimidation: Threatening the person to give evidence against policemen.
- Dynamics resulting from corruption and corruption-related crimes.
- Providing the offender permission to commit the crime.
- Negative emotional responses leading to stigmatisation.
- Being set up.
- Corruption becomes normalised and sanctioned.

#### Anti-Corruption Mechanisms

Link to the study/paper/report:

[http://uir.unisa.ac.za/bitstream/handle/10500/22940/thesis\\_rajin\\_rgd.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y](http://uir.unisa.ac.za/bitstream/handle/10500/22940/thesis_rajin_rgd.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y)

# QUANTITATIVE METHODS TO PRODUCE INDIRECT ESTIMATES OF CORRUPTION

## ITALY

Title: Reference prices and Italian spending review, in *The Challenges of Public Procurement Reforms*, by A. Castelli, G. Piga, S. Saussier, T. Tátrai

Author(s) F.Sbicca

Publisher Routledge

Year 2020

Type of data used: prices and characteristics of public contracts related to the purchase of goods and services in the health sector relating to multiple product categories (hospital laundry, catering and cleaning services, medical devices and drugs)

Brief description of methodology: OLS and quantile regression

Main findings: the analysis of the efficiency of public contracts, made possible by econometric models allows the development of “price overspending” indices, capable of signaling potential anomalies and the identification of corruption risk indicators (red flags). The publication and application of reference prices, in addition to directly reducing economic extra income (due to higher prices), which is the main incentive for corruption, also favors transparency and accountability of public administration purchases, thus preventing inefficiency and any corrupting behaviour.

Link to the study/paper/report: <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003023470>

Title: Efficiency of public contracts and development of corruption risk indicators

Author(s) G. Marino and F. Sbicca

Publisher ANAC

Year 2018

Type of data used: public procurement data

Brief description of methodology: Composite Indicators

Main findings: the development of indicators concerning public contracts relating the contractors, the territorial context, the dimensional data of the contract, the contractor selection procedure, the use of

extensions/renewals, increases the information contained in price overspending indicators. The combined use of all the indicators, in an organic “red flags” system, considerably strengthens their effectiveness, since their simultaneous analysis makes it possible to identify situations that are even more anomalous in a more targeted way, especially in cases where the different indices converge in the same direction. In this way it is possible to direct the supervisory activity towards potentially more critical situations, in order to verify if the administrative action is really affected by situations of inefficiency and/or even corruption

Study/paper/report attached to this form: No

Link to the study/paper/report:

<http://www.anticorruzione.it/portal/rest/jcr/repository/collaboration/Digital%20Assets/anacdocs/Attivita/Pubblicazioni/RapportiStudi/ContrattiPubblici/studio.efficienza.corruzione.29.01.18.pdf>

Title: La corruzione politica al Nord e al Sud

Author(s) R. Sciarrone (editor)

Publisher Fondazione RES/Donzelli editore

Year 2016

Type of data used: Data from the rulings of the Italian Supreme Court of Appeal; Data from the requests to remove parliamentary immunity issued by Italian judiciary

Brief description of methodology: Descriptive statistics

Main findings: Political corruption in Italy is getting worse, particularly in the Southern regions like Campania and Sicilia; Corruption networks are no longer organized by political parties but they revolve around local office holders.

Link to the study/paper/report:

<https://www.donzelli.it/libro/9788868436551>

Title: Mappiamo la Corruzione. Un anno di casi riportati dai media

Author(s) A. Galinytè

Publisher Transparency International (Italian chapter)

Year 2019

Type of data used: Data from national newspaper reporting of corruption in the period December 2017-December 2018

Brief description of methodology: Descriptive statistics

Main findings: Higher corruption levels in Southern regions and in policy sectors like procurement and health

Link to the study/paper/report:

<https://www.transparency.it/informati/pubblicazioni/mappiamo-la-corruzione-2018>

Title: Quality of Government in EU Regions: Spatial and Temporal Patterns

Author(s) N. Charron, V. Lapuente

Publisher The GoQ Institute, Gothenburg

Year 2018

Type of data used: Data survey built upon the opinions of 78,000 citizens in 193 regions from 21 European countries on the perception and experience of corruption

Brief description of methodology: Questions pertaining to corruption are centered on the World Bank's national WGI corruption score

Main findings: In the case of Italy, the south is a consistent low performer both within Italy and throughout the EU28, while the Northern regions, in particular the smaller Alpine regions of Trento, Bolzano, Friuli and Valle d'Aosta, are consistently higher performers on all underlying items and are above or just below the EU28 mean score.

Link to the study/paper/report:

[https://nicholascharron.files.wordpress.com/2018/08/charron\\_lapuente\\_2018.pdf](https://nicholascharron.files.wordpress.com/2018/08/charron_lapuente_2018.pdf)

Title: A New Cross-National Measure of Corruption

Author(s) L. Escresa, L. Picci

Publisher: The World Bank Economic Review

Year 2017

Type of data used: Judicial statistics on cross-border corruption, which refers to corrupt transactions between firms headquartered in a particular country (hence, the "headquarters country") and public officials elsewhere (the "foreign country"), from 1998 to 2012 were collected using various sources.

Brief description of methodology: Composition of data within the Index of Public Administration Corruption (PACI), which reflects a narrow definition of corruption: the propensity of public officials to accept bribes from foreign firms.

Main findings: Italy ranks 19th out of 125 countries and performs much better if compared with other indexes (-22 rank difference with the WB CCI, -11 with the TI CPI).

Link to the study/paper/report:

<https://academic.oup.com/wber/article/31/1/196/2897284?login=true#111422271>

Title: Curiamo la corruzione: Percezioni, rischi e sprechi in sanità

Publisher A network of NGOs (Transparency International Italia, Censis, Ispe sanità, RISSC)

Year 2017

Type of data used: Data survey built opinion the opinions of 136 Responsibles for the prevention of corruption within local health authorities on the perception and experience of corruption

Brief description of methodology: Descriptive statistics

Main findings: 42,6% of Responsibles for the prevention of corruption perceived a medium to high level of corruption within local health authorities; 25,7% of local health authorities were affected by at least one case of corruption in the year 2016

Link to the study/paper/report:

<https://s3-eu-west-1.amazonaws.com/transparency-curiamo/pdf-sito-produzione/report-curiamo-la-corruzione-2017.pdf>

## CHINA

Title : The Characteristics of Pecuniary Value Involved in the Graft and Bribery cases - A Preliminary Analysis based on Judicial Judgments

Author(s): LI Hui

Publisher: Journal of Fudan University

Year: 2018

Type of Data used: the amount of corruption proceeds

Brief description of methodology: descriptive analysis, cross-over analysis

Main findings: The amounts of money involved in graft and bribery cases are quite different, with the latter far exceeding the former. The amount of money involved in cases that took place in the eastern region is much more than that in the middle or western region. The higher the rank of government official is, the larger amount of money is involved. In the financial and real estate sectors, the amount of money involved is much more than that in other sectors.

Link to the paper/report:

<https://kns.cnki.net/kcms/detail/detail.aspx?filename=FDDX201805020&dbcode=CJFQ&dbname=CJFDTEMP&v=G2UtBx9LnVxATInkqRA7Mr58w7bz4ptW%mmd2BDKrwMn1ltyV7X43uMygOJnxd3LgJl%mmd2Fv>

Title : Analysis of 8133 corruption and bribery cases in 2016 with the application of the MFT model

Author(s): JIN Honghao

Publisher: Research in Integrity

Year: 2019

Type of Data used: Large sample of judicial documents

Brief description of methodology: descriptive analysis, OLS regression analysis

Main findings: Based on the big data analysis of 8133 indictments of corruption and bribery cases (10711 persons) published in 2016, this paper explores and establishes a three-dimensional analysis model of amount, frequency and time, and conducts a cross-sectional study on the current situation of corruption and its related factors.

Link to the paper/report:

<https://kns.cnki.net/kcms/detail/detail.aspx?dbcode=CJFD&dbname=CJFDLASN2020&filename=CCGS201901004&v=0rX8wZPw3CaU7Ofn0pPEfBK4QYW0L1bFjKtszFQ72jw%25mmd2FABEgrpBw9f1tZ7zzavkz>

## MEXICO

Title: Diagnosis for the preparation of the National Anti-corruption Policy.

Author(s): Executive Secretary of the National Anti-corruption System.

Publisher: Executive Secretary of the National Anti-corruption System.

Year: 2020

Type of data used: Statistics from global and national studies.

Brief description of methodology: 1) evidence gathering process, generated the following quantitative sources of information to produce indirect estimates of corruption: Indicators containing more than 2,200 lines of information, including related statistics with the phenomenon of corruption carried out by different sources of information as the UNAM, Mexican Transparency, INEGI, SFP and SESNA. 2) On line citizen survey and 3) Experts consultation.

Main findings:

- According to a survey elaborated by the National Institute of Statistics and Geography, (INEGI), the estimated costs of corruption during the completion of administrative procedures for the citizens in Mexico was of 7,200 million pesos in 2017.
- Also, according to Mexican Transparency, Mexican families spent 14% of their incomes to pay bribes, a practice which most affects population in poverty situation. Bribery is the usual act of corruption.
- Only 5% of acts of corruption are reported to authorities, which represent a very low percentage.
- In 2017, 45% percent of the Mexican population thought that reporting was a lack of time due to an absence of trust in the authorities.
- However, another study revealed an increasing reporting acts of corruption committed by public officials, from 2012 to 2016.
- The most corrupted place according to the surveys is the public security institutions followed by the institutions related with the administrative procedures processes.
- The on-line citizen survey revealed that impunity is the main cause of corruption, according to the opinion of Mexican population.
- Lack of transparency in trusts.
- Scattered financial information.

Link to the study/paper/report: <https://www.sesna.gob.mx/wp-content/uploads/2020/02/Pol%C3%ADtica-Nacional-Anticorrupti%C3%B3n.pdf>



Title: UK Global Indicators paper

Author(s) Home Office

Publisher: Home Office

Year: annual since 2020

Type of data used: Quantitative and Qualitative survey data

Brief description of methodology. A collection of global indicators that are published independently by external organisations that aim to measure the scale and frequency of corruption in different sectors of UK society and its impact on national security, prosperity and trust in public institutions.

Main findings: pending, not yet published. The study finds that there is a varying perception of corruption in UK sectors. It finds that the current situation in the UK appears to be stable with no major changes evident, either in terms of reducing or increasing levels of corruption. However, this is a new study so more time is need before firm conclusions can be made.

link for the AC Anti-Corruption Strategy Update which includes the global indicators paper.  
[https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\\_data/file/902020/6.6451\\_Anti-Corruption\\_Strategy\\_Year\\_2\\_Update.pdf](https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/902020/6.6451_Anti-Corruption_Strategy_Year_2_Update.pdf)

## RUSSIA

Title: Criminological forecasting of corruption: problems and prospects.

Author(s): Kokunova S.D., Kokunov A.I.

Publisher: “National security”, № 5

Year: 2018

Type of data used: Article

Brief description of methodology: The authors conducted a study on criminological forecasting of anti-corruption and national security activities.

Main findings: The authors revealed the advantages and disadvantages of various methods of criminological forecasting and gave an assessment of the possibility of using a neural network for simulating and predicting corruption.

Link to the study/paper/report: [https://e-notabene.ru//pnb/article\\_27708.html](https://e-notabene.ru//pnb/article_27708.html)

## QUANTITATIVE ANALYSIS OF CORPORATE ANTI-CORRUPTION ETHICS AND COMPLIANCE PROGRAMMES WITH THE OBJECTIVE OF IDENTIFYING FACTORS FOR EFFECTIVE COMPLIANCE.

### ITALY

Title: Does director capital influence board turnover after an incident of fraud? Evidence from Italian listed companies

Author(s) D'Onza, Rigolini

Publisher: Journal of Management and Governance

Year 2017

Type of data used: Data of corruption and other frauds published in Italian newspapers between 2003 and 2011. Data on the board of directors' members included in company's corporate governance report.

Brief description of methodology: A quantitative study based on the use of regression analysis to test the relationship between the occurrence of corruption and frauds and board of directors' turnover in Italian listed companies. A high turnover indicates the presence of poor corporate governance structure before the occurrence of corruption and other illegal acts.

Main findings: This study analyses whether there is a relationship between the probability of non-executive director turnover in Italian listed firms in which fraud (including corruption) has occurred and each director's level of: (1) general business knowledge, (2) industry knowledge, and (3) relational capital. Our results suggest that non-executive director departure can be explained as a result of decisions by companies to clean their house of directors with lower expertise, industry knowledge and relational capital.

Link to the study/paper/report: <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s10997-016-9372-2#:~:text=Studies%20in%20U.S.%20have%20found,after%20an%20incident%20of%20fraud>

Title: Corporate Corruption Prevention, Sustainable Governance and Legislation: First Exploratory Evidence from the Italian Scenario

Author(s) Lombardi, Trequattrini, Cuzzo, Rubio

Publisher Journal of Cleaner Production

Year 2019

Type of data used: Data collected through the content analysis of corruption prevention plan of a sample of Italian companies

Brief description of methodology: This paper is built upon two steps. First, the content analysis research method is applied, selecting a sample of Italian companies and analysing information from the corruption prevention plans to establish the role of the Board of Directors in the management of company's system. Second, the level of the implication of Board of Directors in drafting through the identification of the Global Indicator is investigated, measuring the degree of the Board of Directors' involvement and making use of the content analysis's results. Additionally, a linear regression between the Global Indicator, companies dimensional indicator and performance indicators is carried out with the aim to define variables affecting this process.

Main findings: The paper proposes exploratory evidence which shows a deep understanding of the governance body in the construction and application of the corporate corruption prevention plans, taking into consideration crucial information from: the anti-corruption national legislation (Law 190/2012), risk management and organization model (Legislative Decree 231/2001), corporate sustainability and compliance programs adopted by companies. The originality of the findings derives from the need to establish an integrated sustainable corporate governance model directed at preventing corruption. Thus, this paper proposes not only the analysis of the Italian companies' compliance sustainable models to prevent corruption in their corporate governance but shows the path for future research on the topic.

Link to the study/paper/report:

<https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0959652619302331>

Title: Punishing Vices or Rewarding Virtues? The Motivations for and Benefits of Ethical Ratings for Private Italian Companies

Author(s) La Rosa, Bernini

Publisher Journal of Business Ethics

Year 2021

Type of data used: Data collected through the content analysis of corruption prevention plan of a sample of Italian companies

Brief description of methodology: This study surveys a sample of 152 private companies with an ethical rating (ER) and examine their views on the economic and social motivations and benefits as well as the perceived usefulness of the ER for improving ethical behaviour. An exploratory factor analysis detects four categories of motivation (economic, competitive, social, and responsiveness)

and two categories of benefits (economic and competitive), which we use in regression models to test Dragonetti's theory.

Main findings: Overall, respondents see the ER as an effective tool, except in terms of improving economic performance. This study also finds that entrepreneurs with lower economic and higher responsiveness motivations attain higher ERs. However, in the respondents' opinions, the ER is (still) not producing any concrete benefits since we find no relationship between the ER and economic or competitive rewards. These findings have implications for the ICA as well as for private companies.

Link to the study/paper/report:

[https://www.researchgate.net/publication/348160955\\_Punishing\\_Vices\\_or\\_Rewarding\\_Virtues\\_The\\_Motivations\\_for\\_and\\_Benefits\\_of\\_Ethical\\_Ratings\\_for\\_Private\\_Italian\\_Companies](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/348160955_Punishing_Vices_or_Rewarding_Virtues_The_Motivations_for_and_Benefits_of_Ethical_Ratings_for_Private_Italian_Companies)

Title: Fattori influenti sull'efficacia del whistleblowing come strumento di controllo interno

Author(s) Rizzotti, Lombardo

Publisher Management Control (in Italian)

Year 2016

Type of data used: Data collected in an experiment carried out with Msc Students

Brief description of methodology: Experimental research

Main findings: The experiment indicates that the use of monetary rewards given to company's employee increase the likelihood to report crimes using whistleblowing system.

Link to the study/paper/report:

[https://www.francoangeli.it/riviste/Scheda\\_rivista.aspx?IDArticolo=57713](https://www.francoangeli.it/riviste/Scheda_rivista.aspx?IDArticolo=57713)

Title: Indagine modelli organizzativi 231 e anticorruzione

Author(s) Confindustria

Publisher Research Report

Year 2017

Type of data used: Survey with 100 medium and large size companies

Brief description of methodology: Questionnaire survey method

Main findings:

- 88% of surveyed companies believes anti-corruption model are useful to prevent corruption;

- Ethical training programs helps to reinforce the organization' ethical climate reducing the corruption risk;
- Anonymous and no-anonymous whistleblowing channels are widespread in anticorruption systems.

Link to the study/paper/report: <https://www.penalecontemporaneo.it/upload/Indagine231.pdf>

## AUSTRALIA

Title Corporate Anti-Corruption Measures to Support Sustainable Business, Corporate Anti-Corruption Compliance Drivers, Mechanisms and Ideas for Change

Author(s) OECD

Publisher OECD, Prepared with the support of the Government of Sweden

Year 2020

Type of data used: Qualitative.

Brief description of methodology: Desk research, results of the OECD Survey on Drivers and Models of Corporate Anti-Corruption Compliance (which were collected from business personnel from 12 November to 12 December 2019) as well as interviews with personnel from 15 international firms (refer p 8).

Main findings: Refer 'the way forward' (page 76).

Link to the study/paper/report: Refer here <http://www.oecd.org/daf/anti-bribery/Corporate-anti-corruption-compliance-drivers-mechanisms-and-ideas-for-change.pdf>

## CHINA

Title : An empirical study on the factors influencing the effectiveness of corporate internal control

Author(s): XIE Yunzhu, WEI Wei, XU Biao

Publisher: Statistics and Decision

Year: 2017

Type of Data used: data of enterprises

Brief description of methodology: regression analysis

Main findings: Taking A-share listed Chinese companies from 2012 to 2014 as research samples, this paper looks at the impact of board governance on the effectiveness of internal control. The results show that the size of the board of directors and the number of meetings of listed companies have nothing to do with the effectiveness of internal control; the proportion of independent directors, the establishment of audit committee and the shareholding proportion of directors are positively correlated with the effectiveness of internal control; the integration of chairman and CEO is negatively correlated with the effectiveness of internal control.

Link to the paper/report:

<https://kns.cnki.net/kcms/detail/detail.aspx?dbcode=CJFD&dbname=CJFDLAST2017&filename=TJJC201714045&v=CoCzNfhOowSa8ldtIE2Xctu05KpIjseMV%25mmd2F9onV4XgXDzbqMEfNrFTR7XM9BuoXtj>

Title: The impact of corruption on corporate tax evasion— An Analysis of the data of Chinese Industrial Enterprises

Author(s): LV Wei, CEHN Haiyu

Publisher: auditing research

Year: 2017

Type of Data used: the number of cases of graft, bribery and dereliction of duty investigated by people's procuratorate, statistics about Chinese enterprises

Brief description of methodology: regression analysis

Main findings: Corruption has a significant positive correlation with corporate tax evasion, especially when the corporate is of small size and the local government does not have much fiscal pressure.

Link to the paper/report:

<https://kns.cnki.net/kcms/detail/detail.aspx?dbcode=CJFD&dbname=CJFDLAST2017&filename=SJYZ201701015&v=IamX2O2bqE%25mmd2Bp%25mmd2FKh4c99BB%25mmd2Fmf%25mmd2Bdpea5yqu7ukY6SZBKXBsY3dBe8l8vWpZ8O%25mmd2BGbY9>

**INDIA**

Title	Analysis of Top 100 Bank Frauds
Author(s)	CENTRAL VIGILANCE COMMISSION
Publisher	CENTRAL VIGILANCE COMMISSION
Year	2018
Type of data used:	Data related to types of Bank frauds in different sectors and their modus operandi
Brief description of methodology	<p>The analysis mainly focused on the Modus- operandi; Amount involved; Type of lending viz. Consortium/ Multiple/Individual; anomalies observed; loopholes that facilitated perpetration of concerned fraud and systemic improvements required to plug the loopholes in the system &amp; procedures, etc.</p> <p>The Top 100 Banks frauds were classified and analysed for the following sectors :- Gem &amp; Jewellery, Manufacturing/Industry, Agro, Media, Aviation, Service/project, Discounting of Cheques, Trading, Information Technology, Export Business, Fixed Deposits, Demand Loan, and Letter of Comfort</p>
Main findings:	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The banks should pay attention to the internal control systems and fraud prevention measures. The controlling offices should play a more active role.</li> <li>2. Banks should exercise proper due diligence before extending the loans</li> <li>3. The banks should be more vigilant of the existing loopholes and consequences of overlooking procedural aspects.</li> <li>4. Banks should ensure that appropriate accountability is established in terms of hierarchy, including, in the case of sanctioning authority in the event of frauds</li> <li>5. Banks should ensure proper end use of the funds, especially in the case of bank guarantees.</li> <li>6. Banks should ensure that securities proposed for bank advance is identified properly, has adequate value, is marketable and enforceable.</li> </ol>

7. Proper mortgage is created and charge registered with Central Registry of Securitisation Asset Reconstruction and Security Interest of India – (CERSAi) portal.
8. Upgradation of digital mechanism keeping in view the latest trend in frauds.
9. Adequate training to employees.

Link to the study/paper/report: [https://cvc.gov.in/sites/default/files/new1111\\_0.pdf](https://cvc.gov.in/sites/default/files/new1111_0.pdf)

## MEXICO

Title: Diagnosis for the preparation of the National Anti-corruption Policy

Author(s): Executive Secretary of the National Anti-corruption System.

Publisher: Executive Secretary of the National Anti-corruption System.

Year: 2020

Type of data used: Brief description of methodology:

Main findings: There is a need of implementation of integrity programs all around the world, since they are exposed to internal and external risks, especially when they entered in contact with governmental authorities that could promote the commission of crimes such as bribery, fraud, information access, money laundering, among others. The Diagnosis for the Preparation of the National Anti-corruption Policy states the following important data in order to understand the situation in Mexico on regarding the measures they implement to prevent and combat corruption and to promote and integrity culture:

A Study of Corporate Integrity of 500 Mexican companies presented the following findings:

- Only 60% of Mexican companies have codes of ethics for their employees.
- 50% have gift policies or prohibitions to pay bribes.
- 20% have prohibitions on money laundering or internal fraud.
- More the 60% of the companies obtained less than 50 points of score.
- According to this study the main implemented mechanism by the private sector in Mexico to prevent corruption is the code of ethics and conduct and the establishment of gift policies.
- 40% established a zero-tolerance policy.



- For 2017, 2 out of 10 analysed companies established the integrity policies also for the representatives and agents. In 2018, this % increased to 35%
- For 2017, 40% of the companies published shared definitions of conflict of interests and 14% socialized definitions of other acts of corruption. Which increased in 2018 to 60%.
- For 2017, 9 out of 10 companies did not have integrity training programs and in 2018 this% increased to 24.2%.

The Economic Crime Survey 2018, Fraud and Corruption an analysis of its impact on organizations of PwC

- The percentage of Mexican companies that experienced economic crimes between 2016 and 2018 went from 37% to 58%.
- These crimes are committed in 2/3 times by internal personal of the companies.
- 8 out of 10 business persons think that bribery and corruption are normal practices in Mexico.
- Only 31% of companies operating in Mexico had carried out a risks assessment. Which reveals a very low advance in the culture of preventing and combating corruption in the private sector.
- However, after the publication of the General Law of Administrative Liabilities there is an obligation for the companies to adopt integrity policies that include: Organization guides with clear procedures, chains of command and company leadership; adequate systems of control, auditing, to surveillance the compliance of the integrity programs; adequate internal and external reporting channels, training programs in integrity, human resources policies to reduce the risk to hire corrupt persons, mechanisms of transparency and conflict of interests.
- In Mexico it seems that the adoption of these practices is more related to the fulfilment of an obligation more than a practice to improve their ways of doing business.

Link to the study/paper/report: <https://www.sesna.gob.mx/wp-content/uploads/2020/02/Pol%C3%ADtica-Nacional-Anticorrupti%C3%B3n.pdf>

## UNITED KINGDOM

Title: committee on standards of public life – landscape review – looked at architecture of ethics

Author(s) The independent Committee on Standards in Public life

Publisher: UK Government

Year 2020

Type of data used: qualitative review

Brief description of methodology: The report provides an overview of the standards landscape effective in the central and local government and administration of the United Kingdom (UK). It provides a snapshot of the standards regime 25 years after the establishment of the Committee on Standards in Public Life in 1994 and offers a vantage point from which to view its changing shape and form.

Link to the study/paper/report: \_\_\_\_\_

[https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\\_data/file/867642/Standards Landscape Final Version 1 .pdf](https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/867642/Standards_Landscape_Final_Version_1.pdf)

## SPAIN

Title: GUÍA PRÁCTICA DE AUTODIAGNÓSTICO Y REPORTING EN CUMPLIMIENTO NORMATIVO, BUEN GOBIERNO CORPORATIVO Y PREVENCIÓN DE LA CORRUPCIÓN: HACIA UNA CULTURA EMPRESARIAL DE CUMPLIMIENTO: NUEVOS RETOS PARA LA EMPRESA DEL SIGLO XXI

Author(s): BACIGALUPO, S.; MARTÍNEZ, D.

Publisher: Transparency International España.

Year: 2017. Reprint: 2018.

Type of data used: Qualitative questionnaire for the baseline and hard law comparative analysis for indicator's construction of the self-assessment and reporting dimensions.

Brief description of methodology: For the baseline and compliance and corporate governance results for companies of IBEX-35, see pages 117 to 132. For the self-assessment and reporting, see pages 40 to 53.

Main findings: pages 117 to 132

Link to the study/paper/report: <http://integridad.org.es/wp-content/uploads/2017/07/TI-Guia-Pract-Autodiagnostico-DIGITAL-1.pdf>

## RUSSIA

Title: Guidelines for the application of compliance control in various areas of business.

Author(s): Abramov V.Y.

Publisher: “Yustitsinform”

Year: 2020

Type of data used: Practical guide

Brief description of methodology: Legal analysis of compliance control, compliance implementation methodology

Main findings: Guidance on organizing necessary and special measures of managerial and administrative nature when creating a corporate compliance control system.

Title: Legal mechanisms for combating corruption in the field of corporate procurement.

Author(s): Belyaeva O.A., Truntsevskiy Y.V., Tsin A.M.

Publisher: “Contract”

Year: 2019

Type of data used: Scientific and practical guide

Brief description of methodology: Issues of increasing the effectiveness of combating corruption in the field of corporate procurement.

Main findings: Based on the results of the analysis, conclusions are drawn about the need to synchronize the legislation on procurement and anti-corruption legislation, as well as expanding the powers of units for the prevention of corruption offenses. The authors also point out the need to consolidate a uniform set of anti-corruption organizational measures regardless of the form of ownership, for example, the introduction of Codes of Conduct, which will contain a set of prohibitions and obligations set up by companies as a result of self-regulation.

Link to the study/paper/report: <https://www.elibrary.ru/item.asp?id=427626>

## SOUTH AFRICA

Title AN EVALUATION OF THE PUBLIC SERVICE ANTI-CORRUPTION STRATEGY IN THE DEPARTMENT OF ARTS AND CULTURE

Author(s) THABO KEVIN KEKAE

Publisher UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

Year September 2017

Type of data used: qualitative

### Brief description of methodology:

The aim of the study is to assess anti-corruption strategies and policies of DAC and to be able to achieve that national legislation must be analysed first so as to get an understanding of where the process of developing strategies and policies starts; then the analysis will be narrowed to departmental level, in the case of this study it is the Department of Arts and Culture.

### Main findings:

government capacity deal with corruption in the public service, but indicated that although the public service is capacitated 169 it still finds itself with the problem of non-service delivery in all spheres of government. Reasons of non-service delivery are primarily as a result of inefficiency, unskilled personnel, poor management and political deployment of unqualified cadres. The other reason for non-service delivery and inefficiency in the public service is corruption. Corruption is a serious obstacle to the achievement of government programmes. It erodes governmental legitimacy because it hampers the effective delivery of public goods and services. It limits economic growth because it reduces the quantity of public resources, discourages foreign investments and savings, and impedes on the efficient use of government revenue.

### Link to the study/paper/report:

[https://repository.up.ac.za/bitstream/handle/2263/65832/Kekae\\_Evaluation\\_2017.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y](https://repository.up.ac.za/bitstream/handle/2263/65832/Kekae_Evaluation_2017.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y)