Desk review on sport as a tool for the prevention of violent extremism

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime

December 2018

Acknowledgments

This Desk Review has been developed by the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) Justice Section and was written by Dr. Katja L.H. Samuel, Consultant, as food for thought for an expert group meeting on sport as a tool for the prevention of violent extremism that took place on 10 and 11 December 2018 in Vienna, Austria.

Table of Contents

Executive Summary

During the 13th United Nations Congress on Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice in 2015, there was broad consensus that education for all children and youth is fundamental to the prevention of crime and corruption and to the promotion of a culture of lawfulness that supports the rule of law and human rights while respecting cultural identities. Consequently, the Doha Declaration (2015)[1] contains a number of commitments by Member States relating to the prevention of crime, including violent extremism, emphasizing the fundamental role of youth[2] participation in prevention efforts. Similarly, since 2015 UNESCO Member States have recognized the importance of youth empowerment, through education, as vital to prevent violent extremism.

In connection the this, one area of interest among policymakers and researcher alike, and the focus of the current desk review, relates to the potential role of sport to act as an effective tool for preventing violent extremism (PVE).

The current desk review has two primary research objectives: (1) to map existing PVE through sports initiatives which target risk factors and protective factors and/or may be used as a vehicle for social development and community engagement especially for those youth most at risk of being radicalised on a path towards violent extremism; and, (2) to identify any evidence-base underpinning sports-based initiatives which substantiate claims/beliefs regarding their effectiveness and impact, notably positively influencing change in terms of youth vulnerabilities, attitudes and/or behaviours of violent extremism concern.

It draws extensively upon literature (especially academic research and project reports) developed by academics and a broad spectrum of engaged stakeholders. Drawn from different disciplinary perspectives (especially criminology, social and political science, psychology, politics and governmental, civil society, human rights and peace-keeping studies, and international relations), the selected literature examined issues relevant to countering violent extremism (CVE)/preventing violent extremism (PVE), crime/conflict prevention,

---

[1] The Doha Declaration, adopted at the 13th United Nations Congress on Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice held in Doha, Qatar.
[2] There is no universally agreed definition of 'youth'. That said, the United Nations Secretariat uses 15-24 years of age for statistical purposes, and key United Nations Security Council resolutions of especial relevance here refer to 18-29 years of age (e.g., UNSC Res 2250 (S/RES/2419 (2015)) and UNSC Res 2419 (S/RES/2419 (2018)).

intercultural dialogue, youth empowerment and education, where possible in the context of sports-based activities.

The key findings and conclusions of the desk review are summarised here. With respect to the first research objective of mapping existing PVE through sports initiatives, it was found that many programmes exist globally which use sport as a tool of crime prevention or to build social bridges, especially within Europe, Africa, Latin and North America, and, to a more limited extent, within the Middle East.

Generally, most of the sports-based activities considered were social development in nature, seeking longer term sustained impact, rather than being primarily diversion-based interventions with the objective of, e.g., preventing criminal activities in the short term. Consequently, many of the programmes considered utilized sport-based activities which were intended to facilitate other educational, vocational and mentoring activities and opportunities, as well as addressing social needs such as housing – i.e. they were 'sport plus' programmes where developmental activities complemented diversion-based ones. Indeed, there is evidence to suggest that these combined approaches were among the most effective and impactful, including in terms of their longer-term impact.

Other programmes similarly found that sports-based programmes can assist with nurturing core life skills in young at-risk people - such as confidence, self-esteem, self-discipline and self-control, teamwork, breaking down cultural stereotypes – which are transferable to other contexts such as conflict avoidance. That said, no firm conclusions could be made regarding the PVE effectiveness of sports-based programmes. This finding was reflective of much of the literature and programmes surveyed, namely that sports-based activities are likely to be more effective when associated with other activities, such as education, training, employment, volunteering, etc.

It became quickly evident that the literature available on PVE activities using sports – whether as a sports-based PVE tool, or as an entry point for other PVE orientated activities – is very limited. Most available research and resultant literature have arisen in the course of projects receiving significant governmental or intergovernmental funding, with external evaluations being carried out by the private sector or NGOs. Therein lies one important explanation for

the paucity of related literature, namely that historically there has been only limited funding for sports-based PVE and youth crime prevention programmes, a recurring theme of materials examined during this desk review.

The situation is exacerbated by the fact that sports-based activities are generally targeted at youth which has similarly been an area receiving only limited high-level attention and therefore funding, especially prior to the adoption of Security Council Resolution 2250 (2015) on Youth, Peace and Security. Furthermore, significant gaps exist more generally within PVE related scholarship, which has tended to focus on such issues as why an individual becomes radicalised rather than on the effectiveness of interventions or tools to prevent radicalisation. At least some of these gaps will be attributable to researchers understandably following available funding trails, which in turn are determined by the policies and strategies of key stakeholders which may not always be fully or accurately informed due to the paucity of accurate, quality data, thereby perpetuating existing weaknesses and challenges unless the current cycle is broken.

The second research objective was to identify any evidence-base underpinning sports-based initiatives which substantiate claims/beliefs regarding their effectiveness and impact. Though some polarization of views exists regarding the positive impactfulness (or not) of sports-based initiatives, the dominant view from the literature surveyed is that sports-based interventions are beneficial. This is in part explicable by sports' unique qualities as a peace and development tool, such as its universality, ability to act as an effective communication platform, as well as its capacity to inspire and motivate participants while promoting their physical and psychological well-being.

A consistent and recurring theme of the desk review was the general inadequacy of the existing available evidence-base, including in relation to better understanding the effectiveness of different forms of interventions, the underlying reasons for their success or failure, and so forth. There was overall consensus regarding the pressing need for more research and analysis, such as to better understand the push and pull factors paving the way to youth radicalisation.

Certainly, methodologically it can be difficult (though still possible) to accurately quantify something which has not occurred, such as a crime. Other methodological issues can arise too, such as which aspects of an intervention are measured to gauge 'success' (e.g., positive changes in intermediate variables such as attitudes, behaviours, skills, rather than any final, sustainable impact on crime/violence reduction); the methodological approach used (e.g., one selected to acquire knowledge or one that is funding driven); whether all relevant contextual variables were considered; whether factors or indicators were over-simplified or subjective in nature; the accuracy of data, and so forth. Such challenges are further compounded by the fact that it can be difficult to close the current empirical data gap in such a dynamic and evolving context as PVE.

With respect to how the existing evidence-base for effectiveness and impact has been gauged, the findings fell largely into one of two camps. The first group were those programmes with well-developed methodologies, robust theories of change and so forth, which were the exception rather than the rule. This was evident mainly in relation to governmental / intergovernmental funded programmes, implemented by governmental or larger non-governmental actors, where evidence-based outputs, such as project reports, are normally standard outcomes. Most initiatives found during the literature survey involving sports with PVE and/or crime prevention objectives, however, fell into the second group: local grassroots initiatives, often established by youth for youth, with limited resources and capacity, with only broad identifiable goals, no clearly identifiable methodologies or documented assessments of their effectiveness. Yet, the fact that often no robust evidence-base other than an anecdotal one exists for many of these projects is not necessarily synonymous with their impactful in practice, only that the true extent of this is unlikely to ever be fully known or understood.

One final observation relates to an overarching finding of the desk review regarding the degree of commonality – in terms of approaches, methodologies, sought outcomes, risk and protective factors, etc – that exists between the different sectors considered. This is the case not only between PVE and crime and violence prevention, but also between PVE and sports development programmes, with sports-based interventions offering a common platform including in terms of the universality of its language. As such, it is possible that further cross-

pollination and mutual sharing of methodologies, good practices etc could go some way towards closing the current evidence gap and further strengthening current approaches, especially within the PVE space. That said, some gaps would still remain since the conceptual and institutional differences existing between PVE and crime and violence, as well as between PVE and sports development programmes are such that they need to retain their separate and distinct identities as well as some methodologies. This further points to the necessity of dedicated and targeted efforts to further strengthen the current evidence-base regarding linkages between sports-based interventions and sought PVE outcomes.

1.   Introduction

1.1   Context

During the 13th United Nations Congress on Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice in 2015, there was broad consensus that education for all children and youth is fundamental to the prevention of crime and corruption and to the promotion of a culture of lawfulness that supports the rule of law and human rights while respecting cultural identities. Consequently, the Doha Declaration (2015)[3] contains a number of commitments by Member States relating to the prevention of crime, including violent extremism, emphasizing the fundamental role of youth[4] participation in prevention efforts. Similarly, since 2015 UNESCO Member States have recognized the importance of youth empowerment, through education, as vital to prevent violent extremism.

In connection the this, one area of interest among policymakers and researcher alike, and the focus of the current desk review, relates to the potential role of sport to act as an effective tool for preventing violent extremism (PVE). As part of its efforts to support the implementation of the Doha Declaration, UNODC has launched a global youth crime prevention initiative that builds on the power of sports as a tool for peace. The initiative aims to promote sports and related activities to prevent crime and to effectively build resilience of

---

[3] The Doha Declaration, adopted at the 13th United Nations Congress on Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice held in Doha, Qatar.

[4] There is no universally agreed definition of 'youth'. That said, the United Nations Secretariat uses 15-24 years of age for statistical purposes, and key United Nations Security Council resolutions of especial relevance here refer to 18-29 years of age (e.g., UNSC Res 2250 (S/RES/2419 (2015)) and UNSC Res 2419 (S/RES/2419 (2018)).

at-risk youth. Central to this work is the development and implementation of a sport-based life-skills training programme called 'Line Up Live Up' which acknowledges the importance of engaging youth and teaching them personal and social skills in order to empower them as agents of change to promote a culture of tolerance and respect.

One issue of especial concern is the extent to which any evidence-base exists to support the impact of sport in this context. Certainly, there is evidence to suggest, based on research conducted to date (some of which is discussed here), that sport can be a helpful tool in not only diverting young people away from crime and violence, but also as a vehicle to strengthen youth resilience. More specifically, existing research suggests that sports have the capacity to connect youth to positive adult role models and to provide positive development opportunities, as well as to promote the learning and application of life skills.[5] In that sense, sport may be used as a tool to divert young people from crime and violence, including violent extremism. However, for sports-based programmes to have an impact in terms of prevention, they are best combined with strategies that address issues of social and personal development.[6] This seems in line with criminological research, which has shown that child skills training can be effective for early prevention.[7]

Sport achieves this by enabling young people to connect with positive adult role models, whilst also providing positive development opportunities together with the facilitation of the learning and application of life skills, thus targeting important risk factors for crime and violence.

1.2   Applicable Framework

In terms of the overarching global framework and identified priorities which have informed the approach of this desk review, the Doha Declaration is reflective of broader consensus and initiatives highlighting the significance and importance of youth participation in crime

---

[5] Mulholland, E. (2008). What Sport Can Do – A True Sport Report. Canadian Centre for Ethics in Sport. See also Public Safety Canada (2017). Research Highlights - Crime Prevention, Sports-Based Crime Prevention Programs (2017-H03-CP).
[6] Public Safety Canada (2017). Research Highlights - Crime Prevention, Sports-Based Crime Prevention Programs (2017-H03-CP).
[7] Farrington, D.P. and Welsh, B.C. (2007). *Saving Children from a Life of Crime: Early Risk Factors and Effective Interventions*. New York.

prevention efforts .[8] Linked to this are the United Nations Guidelines on crime prevention that call on States to focus on risk factors of crime and encourage pro-social behaviour through social, economic, health and educational measures, with a particular emphasis on children and youth.[9]

There is broad consensus regarding the importance of "[e]mpower[ing] those who are best-placed to affect change, including youth, ….. to take ownership in the development and messaging of positive counter-narratives to the violent extremist agenda."[10] Significantly too, violent extremism disproportionately affects young people; forming more than fifty percent of the world's population, they make up the critical core of paramilitary and terrorist groups.[11] ["[Y]oung people are already – whether as targets for recruitment, victims of violence, exclusion and repression or as peacebuilders and activists – at the forefront of efforts to address and prevent violent extremism".[12]

The applicable global framework comprises a number of United Nations instruments and strategies briefly outlined here. A key instrument, marking an important paradigm shift towards Youth, Peace and Security issues, is Security Council Resolution 2250 (S/RES/2250 (2015)) which recognises the crucial role of social cohesion for the prevention of violent extremism, including support to youth from different backgrounds. Framed around the five primary pillars of participation, protection, prevention, partnerships, and disengagement and reintegration,[13] an overarching goal is to facilitate youth empowerment as a primary means of "*counteract[ing] a narrative of violent extremism*" (para. 16). The Resolution is concerned not only with violent extremism, per se, but also with *"addressing conditions and factors leading to the rise of radicalization to violence and violent extremism among youth, which can be conducive to terrorism*" (Preamble). The ultimate sought goal is to "*discourage [youth]*

---

[8] In terms of what 'youth empowerment' means see, e.g., United Nations Security Council 2250 at para. 1.
[9] ECOSOC Res 2002/13, annex - Guidelines for the Prevention of Crime.
[10] Global Counterterrorism Forum, The Hague – Marrakech Memorandum of Good Practices for a More Effective Response to the FTF Phenomenon (GCTF The Hague – Marrakech Memorandum), Good Practice No. 4.
[11] United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) (2016). *Preventing Violent Extremism through Promoting Inclusive Development, Tolerance and Respect for Diversity: A development response to addressing radicalization and violent extremism.* New York: UNDP (UNDP Report (2016)), p. 30.
[12] Upcoming UNDP Global Report (June 2018). *Frontlines – Young people at the heart of preventing violent extremism*, Executive Summary, p. 1.
[13] The creation of enabling environments for the implementation of violence-prevention activities and peacebuilding efforts is envisaged, including social development supporting social cohesion (e.g., paras. 10-13).

participation in acts of violence, terrorism, xenophobia, and all forms of discrimination" (para. 13).[14]

Since 2015, both UNESCO Member States and the United Nations through the Secretary General's Plan of Action to Prevent Violent Extremism[15] (PVE Action Plan) similarly have emphasised the importance of youth empowerment.[16] Specifically, they have identified the key role to be played by education as an integral aspect of developing better PVE related tools to address drivers of violent extremism. One identified goal, of especial relevance here, is the "develop[ment] and implement[ation of quality[17]] education programmes that *promote civic education, soft skills, critical thinking, digital literacy, tolerance and respect for diversity...... in order to promote the culture of non-violence*" (para. 58(h)).

Additionally, some initiatives, such as the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development,[18] have identified expressly the growing contribution of sports as a tool for the promotion of tolerance and respect, with accompanying potential PVE benefits. This includes as a potential vehicle for the increased empowerment of communities and individuals, especially women and young people, addressing, too, such issues as education and social inclusion.[19] A key sought goal of the 2030 Agenda is "to foster inter-cultural understanding and an ethic of global citizenship.... Education plays a key role in creating this ethic of global citizenship".[20] Significantly, Security Council Resolution 2419 (S/RES/2419 (2018)) also highlights the important role to be played by education, including its equal accessibility by all (Preamble, para. 12), expressly "*[r]ecognizing* also the growing contribution of sport and culture to the realization of development and peace in its promotion of tolerance and respect and the contributions it makes to the empowerment of youth.....' (Preamble).

---

[14] See further, e.g., United Nations Security Council Resolution 1625 (S/RES/1625 (2005)) which aims to counter incitement to terrorist acts motivated by extremism or intolerance through the promotion of political and religious tolerance, economic development and social cohesion and inclusiveness (Preamble).
[15] United Nations, General Assembly (2015). *Plan of Action to Prevent Violent Extremism: Report of the Secretary-General*. 24 December. A/70/674. (PVE Action Plan).
[16] See, e.g., PVE Action Plan paras., 44(a) and 52(a).
[17] See, e.g., VE Action Plan, para. 54.
[18] United Nations, General Assembly (2015). *Transforming our world: the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development*. 21 October. A/RES/70/1. (2030 Agenda).
[19] 2030 Agenda, para. 37.
[20] UNDP Report (2016), p. 32.

The 2030 Agenda runs in parallel with the 2030 United Nations Strategy on Youth (Youth 2030).[21] Seeking greater youth empowerment, it recognises "young people's agency, resilience and their positive contributions as agents of change",[22] including the need for their full engagement and participation in progressing global agendas and frameworks which affect them.[23] Of its five identified priorities three are of particular relevance here: supporting young people's greater access to appropriate, quality and inclusive education (formal and non-formal) (Priority 2); promoting and developing education, training and broader global citizenship among youth, including as a means of promoting "a culture of peace and non-violence among young people" (Priority 4); and "recogniz[ing] young people's important and positive contribution to peace and security, prevention of violence….and foster[ing] and protect[ing] an environment conducive to young people's actions" (Priority 5). Related activities should be gender sensitive, including to ensure the equal empowerment of girls and boys, as well as their equal access to quality education as an integral element of youth empowerment.[24] With this in mind, for example, the 2030 Youth Strategy adopts a human-rights-based, gender-transformative, -sensitive and -responsive approach.

The final aspect of the applicable framework which should be mentioned here is the latest version of the United Nations Action Plan on Sport for Development and Peace, which was updated following the establishment of the post-2015 development agenda and adopted by General Assembly Resolution 71/160 'Sport as a means to promote education, health, development and peace' (A/RES/71/160 (2016)). The Resolution recognizes the role of sport "as an important enabler for sustainable development", including in relation to realizing 2030 Agenda goals and targets (Preamble, para. 4), specifically as a vehicle through which to "foster inclusion and well-being…. promote tolerance, mutual understanding and respect and facilitate social inclusion, conflict prevention and peacebuilding (para. 9). The Resolution endorses the key principles identified in the Secretary-General's United Nations Action Plan for Sport for Development aimed at further mainstreaming sport-based activities for development and peace.[25] This includes in terms of further developing a global framework

---

[21] United Nations Youth Strategy, *Youth 2030: Working with and for Young People*. (Youth 2030).
[22] Youth 2030, para. 3.
[23] Youth 2030, para. 4.
[24] See further 2030 Agenda, Sustainable Development Goals 4, 5 and 10 especially.
[25] Report of the Secretary-General to the General Assembly on "Sport for development and peace: towards sport's enabling of sustainable development and peace", A/71/179 (21 July 2016), sect. VII.

for sport for development and peace, further policy development, and the mobilization of resources together with further programming and implementation. Especially relevant here is the principle regarding "[e]vidence of impact and follow-up: promote and facilitate monitoring and evaluation tools, including indicators, data……and geographic location and other characteristics relevant in national contexts, and benchmarks based on commonly agreed standards" (para. 4). This theme is further elaborated in the context of sport for development and peace programmes, identifying the need to ensure the existence and utilisation of appropriate "quality standards, policies and competencies", underpinned by academic research and expertise in the field (para. 5). It emphasises too the importance of the existence of "standards, indicators and benchmarks" together with "the monitoring and evaluation of such strategies, policies and programmes" (para. 6).

These key themes are reflected also in the more recent Report of the Secretary-General on "Strengthening the global framework for leveraging sport for development and peace".[26] This seeks to progress the 2017 Kazan Action Plan, specifically its goal "to facilitate international and multi-stakeholder policy convergence, ease international cooperation and foster capacity-building efforts of governmental authorities and sport organisations",[27] including in the domain of "maximizing the contributions of sport to sustainable development and peace" (para. 5). As such, a key sought outcome of the Kazan Action Plan is "the effective integration of policies on sport, physical education, physical activity and sport-based initiatives within broader development policy frameworks" (para. 9) in order to develop increased coherence across national and international sports-based initiatives. Central to this – and the updated United Nations Action Plan on Sport for Development and Peace 2018-20 - is the promotion and facilitation of effective research, monitoring and evaluation (paras. 43-45). This

---

[26] Report of the Secretary-General, "Strengthening the global framework for leveraging sport for development and peace", A/73/325 (14 August 2018). For further analysis of this see, e.g., Collison, H. (2018). "Strengthening the Global Framework for Leveraging Sport for Development and Peace". Report prepared for the United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (UNDESA) and the Division for Inclusive Social Development (DISD). She discusses both the need and significant challenges accompanying the monitoring and evaluation of existing programmes (pp. 8-9), noting that "[d]onor driven [monitoring and evaluation] as opposed to producing knowledge for learning and development presents very different challenges, objectives and requirements" (p. 9). See too Cárdenas, A. (2018). "Expert Group Meeting and Interagency Dialogue on "Strengthening the Global Framework for Leveraging Sport for Development and Peace." United Nations Secretariat, New York (13-14 June 2018).

[27] Adopted during the Sixth International Conference of Ministers and Senior Officials Responsible for Physical Education and Sport (SHS/2017/5 REV) held in Kazan, Russian Federation (14-15 July 2017), Annex, para 4.

incorporates the strengthening of the current evidence-base (based on high quality, accessible, timely, reliable, etc data) "to draw good practices and other benchmarks for assessing how and how much sport-based initiatives contribute to sustainable development" (para. 43).

1.3 Research Aims and Methodology

The current desk review has two primary research objectives: (1) to map existing PVE through sports initiatives which target risk factors and protective factors and/or may be used as a vehicle for social development and community engagement especially for those youth most at risk of being radicalised on a path towards violent extremism; and, (2) to identify any evidence-base underpinning sports-based initiatives which substantiate claims/beliefs regarding their effectiveness and impact,[28] notably positively influencing change in terms of youth vulnerabilities, attitudes and/or behaviours of violent extremism concern.

With respect to methodology, as previously noted (section 1.2), this desk review is framed around the current global architecture which should inform youth, peace and security related policy and practice. In addition, in reviewing and identifying relevant materials (largely limited to those available in English) and key themes for this desk review – notably, what may constitute a robust framework for designing, monitoring, evaluating and measuring PVE programme impact and effectiveness[29] - the current author was cognisant of the existence of a number of important toolkits.[30] Particularly informative for the purpose of carrying out this

---

[28] By way of caveat from the outset, as was noted in a Canadian research paper on sports-based crime prevention, "due to research limitations and a lack of standardization in terminology within this emerging field of study, general statements and conclusions on the effectiveness of these programs are difficult to make." Public Safety Canada (2017). Research Highlights - Crime Prevention, Sports-Based Crime Prevention Programs (2017-H03-CP), p. 1.

[29] As to what may be considered to be an 'effective' intervention see, e.g., UNESCO (2017). *Preventing violent extremism through education: A guide for policy-makers.* Paris, UNESCO (UNESCO PVE Policy Guide (2017)), p. 23: "For effective impact, education policies and practices must, directly and indirectly, address the specific drivers of violent extremism….. A mix of short, medium and long-term educational measures is needed."

[30] See too the Hive's (Pakistan Youth Alliance) CVE toolkit (Hive CVE Toolkit), available at http://www.hive.org.pk/home-page/resource-centre/cve-toolkit/ (accessed 14 November 2018). A number of sport for development toolkits exist too with transferable good practices to the PVE and crime prevention domains. One such example is the 'Sport for Development Resource Toolkit' produced by the German Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) (available at https://www.giz.de/expertise/html/21522.html (accessed 14 December 2018)) which provides lots of practical information on how to implement, run, monitor and evaluate sports programmes.

desk review was International Alert/UNDP's PVE programming toolkit,[31] which is very detailed, of global applicability, and relevant to broad ranging contexts include sports-based PVE efforts.

In addition, a number of other informative toolkits were consulted which identify principles of broader applicability in terms of implementing and evaluating the effectiveness of PVE related programmes. Of particular note here is the Sport for Protection Toolkit (2018) developed by the UN Refugee Agency (UNHCR), the International Olympic Committee and Terre des hommes. Coming from a development rather than crime prevention perspective,[32] and aimed at youth programmes in forced displacement settings, it presents its evidence-based 'Sport for Protection' approach. This is framed around capacity building and asset development, meaningful engagement and leadership experience, and mentoring (p. 12). Though the toolkit focuses on the three protection outcomes of social inclusion, social cohesion, and psychological well-being (p. 7), other outcomes could be achieved also, making its key principles transferable to youth orientated, sports-based, PVE programmes.[33]

A key overarching theme of both toolkits is the importance of clearly identifying the project's objectives from the outset, including "the desired outcome and outputs, indicators of success, hypotheses, assumptions and [robust and evidenced] theory of change, to the 'how' of intervention, identification of target groups and beneficiaries and ultimately how it influences the programme's potential for achieving its stated aim and its actual impact".[34] These should be carefully contextualised,[35] underpinned by robust evidence demonstrating cognisance of such factors as gender dynamics, vulnerability factors and sources of resilience.[36] Detailed guidance for translating these elements into practice is given by the toolkits.

---

[31] International Alert/UNDP (2018). *Improving the impact of preventing violent extremism programming: A toolkit for design, monitoring and evaluation*. Oslo, UNDP. (International Alert/UNDP PVE Toolkit (2018)).

[32] UNHCR, International Olympic Committee and Terre des hommes (2018). *Sport for Protection Toolkit: Programming with Young People in Forced Displacement Settings*. (Sport for Protection Toolkit (2018)).

[33] The Toolkit notes its suitability for '+Sports' approaches, namely "organisations dealing mostly with social issues that use sport as a vehicle to engage young people in other activities such as education…. youth engagement…". Sport for Protection Toolkit (2018), p. 9.

[34] International Alert/UNDP PVE Toolkit (2018), p. 15. The Sport for Protection Toolkit (2018) describes this process in terms of situation analysis, strategic planning, implementation, monitoring, evaluation and learning (p. 32). It similarly places importance on identifying a clear theory of change (p. 33).

[35] International Alert/UNDP PVE Toolkit (2018), pp. 33 and 54; Sport for Protection Toolkit (2018), p. 61.

[36] International Alert/UNDP PVE Toolkit (2018), p. 49.

The desk review draws extensively upon literature (especially academic research and project reports) developed by academics and a broad spectrum of engaged stakeholders. Much of the available scholarship itself relates to the undertaking of some form of literature review (e.g., in support of funded projects). Due to the recurring overlap between their substantive content, academic scholarship and project outputs were considered together. Drawn from different disciplinary perspectives (especially criminology, social and political science, psychology, sports development, politics and governmental, civil society, human rights and peace-keeping studies, and international relations), the selected literature examined issues relevant to CVE/PVE, crime/conflict prevention, intercultural dialogue, youth empowerment, (sports) development and education, where possible in the context of sports-based activities. Crime prevention was extended to include 'pre-crime' conflict prevention[37] since much of the available literature on youth empowerment and crime prevention relates to conflict and post-conflict contexts. In addition to academic scholarship and policy documents, over 100 reports or weblinks of potential relevance to sports-based and youth empowerment initiatives were examined, including submissions made to the recently published (2018) Youth, Peace and Security, Missing Piece study (YPS Missing Piece study).[38] As the illustrative sports-based programmes examined below reveal, in particular in a PVE context, there remains a general paucity of evidence-based studies regarding the effectiveness of sports initiatives.

In terms of structure, the issues examined by the desk review are in priority order, namely sports-based CVE/PVE initiatives, sports-based violence/crime/conflict prevention and peacebuilding initiatives, and sports-based intercultural dialogue initiatives. In addition, some broader non-sports related literature was considered where it identified broader issues of equal applicability to sports-based contexts, primarily relating to challenges, good practices and so forth identified by such scholarship for developing robust evidence-based research. The desk review concludes by discussing key findings and recurring themes.

1.3.1 Definitional Approach

---

[37] 'Pre-crime' is a term used to denote prevention prior to the commission of a first offence. Prevention in that context is the most difficult to measure.

[38] Youth, Peace and Security, (2018). *The Missing Peace: Independent Progress Study on Youth, Peace and Security* (YPS Missing Piece Study (2018)), with submissions available at https://www.youth4peace.info/ProgressStudy (accessed 14 November 2018).

1.3.1.1 CVE, PVE, Radicalisation and Violent Extremism

With respect to key concepts explored here - notably countering violent extremism (CVE), preventing violent extremism (PVE), radicalisation and violent extremism, for which no universal definitional consensus exists – this desk review, in terms of its sought outcomes, is framed around internationally agreed approaches reflected within United Nations outputs.

Two instruments are of particular applicability here. First, is the PVE Action Plan which, though not formally adopted, articulates a global framework aimed at informing the PVE efforts of Member States. It recognises that "violent extremism encompasses a wider category of manifestations" than terrorism since it includes forms of ideologically motivated violence that fall short of constituting terrorist acts.[39] Such a broad approach recognises that violent extremist activities need to be contextualised, ultimately towards individuals.[40] Secondly, is that adopted by UNESCO, underpinning its *Preventing violent extremism through education: a guide for policy-makers* (UNESCO PVE Policy Guide (2017) document. This suggested that, most commonly, the term 'violent extremism' is used to "refe[r] to the beliefs and actions of people who support or use violence to achieve ideological, religious or political goals", which can encompass "terrorism and other forms of politically motivated violence".[41] It describes educational activities linked to PVE efforts in terms of 'soft power'.[42] What is common to both approaches is not that an individual may hold what some might determine to be 'radical' or 'extremist' views – which determination can be very subjective - but rather, that such views are or are likely to be subsequently translated into violent or terrorist activities.

Both "PVE specific" and "PVE related" (or "PVE relevant") scholarship and initiatives are relevant here. "PVE specific" policies and initiatives aim to prevent violent extremism in a direct and targeted way,[43] including by "seeking to disrupt the radicalization and recruitment process and to reintegrate individuals who have already actively joined a violent extremist

---

[39] PVE Action Plan, para. 4.
[40] See too the GCTF The Hague – Marrakech Memorandum, where contextualization is a recurring theme.
[41] UNESCO PVE Policy Guide (2017), p. 19.
[42] UNESCO PVE Policy Guide (2017), p. 2.
[43] UNESCO PVE Policy Guide (2017), p. 56.

organization"[44] (i.e., 'pull' factors). In contrast, "PVE related" activities pursue goals that further PVE objectives (addressing 'push' factors[45]), but are themselves intended to fulfil broader educational objectives, such as developing global citizenship skills.[46]

That said, it is fully recognised that some methodological difficulties can arise, e.g., when seeking to assess the effectiveness of specific programmes. Due to the lack of definitional consistency in the use of these key concepts by the United Nations system, stakeholders may use similar terminology to describe different realities.[47] As a former United Nations Special Rapporteur observed, "the lack of semantic and conceptual clarity that surrounds violent extremism remains an obstacle to any in-depth examination of the impact of strategies and policies to counter violent extremism on human rights as well as on their effectiveness in reducing the threat of terrorism".[48]

Whilst mindful of such definitional challenges, due to the relative paucity of available literature to examine specifically on sports-based initiatives in pursuit of CVE/PVE objectives, the net was cast widely in terms of examining any literature with such stated CVE/PVE objectives, however defined (if at all, which commonly was not the case).

1.3.1.2 Sports-Based Crime Prevention

It is equally important to note from the outset that no standardised definition exists as to what may constitute "sports-based crime prevention". As a 2017 Canadian Public Safety research paper observes, "there is no clear definition in the literature of what constitutes a sports-based program, other than the fact that there is a sport-related element present. In this respect, there is no terminology to differentiate between programs where sport is the

---

[44] UNDP (2017). *Journey to Extremism in Africa: Drivers, Incentives and the Tipping Point for Recruitment.* New York, UNDP (UNDP Report (2017)), p. 89.
[45] UNDP Report (2017), p. 89.
[46] UNESCO PVE Policy Guide (2017), p. 56.
[47] See, e.g., UNESCO PVE Policy Guide (2017), p. 18; International Alert/UNDP PVE Toolkit (2018), p. 1.
[48] General Assembly, Human Rights Council (2016). *Report of the Special Rapporteur on the promotion and protection of human rights and fundamental freedoms while countering terrorism.* 22 February. A/HRC/31/65, para. 55.

sole activity vs. those that combine sports with other social interventions (e.g., using sport as a break from the classroom setting)".[49]

Nor is there an agreed definition as to what physical activities may be regarded as "sports-based" ones. Therefore, a broad approach was taken here which encompassed not only more commonly used team-based games such as football, but "any physical activity with an agreed upon structure or set of rules that allows for competition against oneself or another",[50] whether it is intended primarily to be a social development or diversion-based intervention.[51] This is reflective of existing literature regarding the principal categories of identified sports-based programmes. *Social development* interventions aim to use sports-based activities "as a "hook" to attract youth into a stimulating field where additional teaching or intervention can be provided" (Ekholm, D. (2013). "Sport and crime prevention: Individuality and transferability in research." *Journal of Sport for Development*, Vol. 1, No. 2, pp. 1-12; McMahon, S., and Belur, J. (2013). "Sports-based Programmes and Reducing Youth Violence and Crime. Project." Oracle Children and Youth Evidence Hub, London); whereas *diversion-based* intervention "implements sport programs to deter youth from deviancy and antisocial activities, predominantly in times or locations where youth might otherwise commit offenses (Nichols, G. (2007). *Sport and Crime Reduction. The Role of Sports in Tackling Youth Crime*. Routledge, Great Britain).[52]

---

[49] Public Safety Canada (2017). Research Highlights - Crime Prevention, Sports-Based Crime Prevention Programs (2017-H03-CP).

[50] UNODC. (2002). Sport; using sport for drug abuse prevention. United Nations. New York. (Previously called in 2002 the United Nations Office for Drug Control and Crime Prevention (UNODCCP).

[51] Public Safety Canada (2017). Research Highlights - Crime Prevention, Sports-Based Crime Prevention Programs (2017-H03-CP).

[52] Public Safety Canada (2017). Research Highlights - Crime Prevention, Sports-Based Crime Prevention Programs (2017-H03-CP).

2.   Literature Review - CVE/PVE Programmes

2.1   Johns, A., Grossman, M. and McDonald, K. (2014). "'More Than Game': The Impact of Sport-Based Youth Mentoring Schemes on Developing Resilience toward Violent Extremism." *Social Inclusion,* **vol. 2, issue 2, pp. 57-70.**

This article is one of the most informative ones found in support of this desk review. It is one of the very few outputs found critiquing a project using sports-based tools directly for PVE purposes rather than merely including sporting activities as part of broader PVE efforts. It describes and presents the findings of an evaluation of 'More than a Game', which was a sport-focused youth-oriented mentoring programme in Melbourne, Australia. Developed by the Australian Football League as a CVE/PVE programme, the programme utilised team-based sports to develop a community-based resilience model, more specifically, resilience to ideological narratives promoting terrorism or violence. In so doing, it sought to address issues of identity, belonging, and cultural isolation amongst young Muslim men.

The project findings are directly relevant to the domain of CVE. They further contribute to a growing body of literature which considers the relationship between team-based sport, cross-cultural engagement and the development of social resilience, inclusion and belonging in other domains of youth engagement and community-building. The authors focus specifically on the under-researched elements of intense physical, emotional and social dimensions of team sport. The findings were less clear, however, regarding the precise impact that sport-based physical and emotional experiences might have in creating 'alternative pathways' for young people at risk of becoming involved in forms of violent extremism.

The research was underpinned by a robust, well developed methodology and evidence-base. In order to gather probative evidence of the effectiveness of the programme, the authors' described methodology was a mixed method, post-evaluation approach (p. 62): data collected from participants and stakeholders on completion of the programme, and researcher participant-observation conducted during its second half. The researchers undertook qualitative research (semi-structured interviews and focus groups) to collect such data from participants, stakeholders and parents regarding the participants' personal development, combined with quantitative data (anonymous exit surveys), for comparison with the qualitative responses. Researcher participant-observation was also gathered.

These findings were combined with a lesser focus on quantitative data collection (exit surveys), which were used to provide an anonymous measure to compare with qualitative responses. Thematic analysis was then used to code qualitative responses and to identify common patterns (see Hall, N. (2011). "'Give it everything you got': Resilience for young males through sport." *International Journal of Men's Health*, vol. 10, issue 1, pp. 65-81, at p. 70) in the way that participants and stakeholders described their experiences of the programme, particularly the impact that their involvement in team-based sport had on their "attitudes and behaviours in relation to sense of belonging, cross-cultural engagement, and beliefs about violence as a means of solving problems or addressing grievances" (at p. 63, quoting from their previous report: McDonald, K., et al. (2012). "More Than a Game" Evaluation Report. Melbourne: Centre for Cultural Diversity and Well-Being, Victoria University).

The authors further describe a number of key challenges encountered in seeking to measure the precise impact of the programme on participants' experiences of personal change, which are of broader applicability. For example, one limitation related to the 'social desirability' effect of participants' eagerness to please the interviewers in their responses, which could potentially skew their recollections, the effects of which the authors sought to counter through the collection of anonymous survey data. A further challenge lay in understanding what impact, if any, the personal transformations might have on community resilience, due to the difficulty of 'scaling-up' the findings of small group evaluations to a broader, community level. More specifically perhaps, in regard to the aims of CVE strategies, stakeholders also pointed to the underlying methodological problem of trying to establish a concrete or direct link between sport-based mentoring programmes, on the one hand, and the actual prevention of violent extremism, on the other, particularly given that, as one stakeholder noted, "you can't measure what hasn't happened" (at p. 68, quoting McDonald, et al., 2012, above). This limitation is similarly identified in arenas other than engagement through sport (at p. 68, citing Nasser-Eddine, M., Garnham, B., Agostino, K., and Caluya, G. (2011). "Countering Violent Extremism (CVE) Literature Review". Canberra: Department of Defense).

Overall, the authors conclude (at p. 68) that the project findings provide strong qualitative evidence that participation in sport-based programs such as 'More than a Game' can have a

significant impact on and contribution to young people's feelings of confidence and self-esteem, particularly those youth negotiating cultural difference and cultural stereotypes whilst developing skills related to physical ability, intercultural communication, teamwork and leadership. Furthermore, participants developed self-discipline and self-control through sport-based practice, for use in situations elsewhere where conflict could otherwise arise – a finding which was particularly relevant for building community resilience, which was the focus of the programme. With the discovery of new opportunities for cross-cultural understanding, trust and knowledge-sharing, stakeholders could identify sport as a model which enabled them to build strong, sustainable and ongoing horizontal relationships with youth and each other, rather than depend on official forms of vertical contact, such as law enforcement.

2.2   Richardson, C., Cameron, P.A., and Berlouis, K.M. (Winter 17/18). "The Role of Sport in Deradicalisation and Crime Diversion." *Journal For Deradicalization,* **vol. 13, pp. 29-47.**

This article undertakes a comparative review of the literature relevant to sports interventions in the UK, and worldwide. It considers a number of perspectives and methodologies, including 'strain theory', 'learning theory', and 'Rational Choice theory', as reflected in the relevant literature (p. 30). In comparing the use of sport as an intervention to reduce youth radicalisation in the community and in prisons, and in relation to crime more generally, the article recognises the link between sport as an intervention for crime and deradicalisation, since terrorism is a crime. Potential for crossover may exist in other influencing factors that may contribute to an individual becoming radicalised or engaging in crime in the first place.

Specifically, the relevant literature reveals that sport may form but one aspect of deradicalisation and crime prevention. In other words, the use of sport in a number of environments to reduce youth radicalisation may be enhanced when combined with a number of other services, such as religious re-education and assistance with housing. Furthermore, by combining sport-based interventions with educational and vocational activities and opportunities (e.g., for employment), participant retention rates are improved, together with a better sense of their identity and group belonging.

The article's key findings highlight both positive consequences and the limitations of sports interventions. For example, with respect to positive impact, participating in sport may improve individual self-esteem, enhance social bonds and provide participants with a feeling

of purpose. The additional introduction of an education, etc., element can improve outcomes further. This is illustrated by a Somali programme that combined elements of a 'second generation' disarmament, demobilisation and reintegration (DDR) programme (referencing, at p. 34, McCandless, E. (2009). "Second Generation DDR Practices in UN Peace Operations: A Contribution to the New Horizon Agenda." Report commissioned by DPKO, DDR Unit), and by a CVE programme entitled Youth-at-Risk/Youth for Change which targeted around 6,000 young people, including former members of Al-Shabaab (referencing Schumicky-Logan, L. (2017). "Addressing Violent Extremism with a Different Approach: The Empirical Case of At-Risk and Vulnerable Youth in Somalia." *Journal of Peacebuilding & Development*, vol. 12, issue 2, pp. 66-79. The second programme worked with those deemed to be 'at risk', and/or who had committed a crime, and who often attracted social stigma. As part of this initiative, 'Sports for Peace' facilitated healthy competition and cohesion amongst the groups. The reintegration of these youth into Somalian society also entailed the establishment of Resource Centres for Peace, coupling sports facilities with other educational activities such as anger and stress management, leadership and communication skills, peace building and teaching on gender issues.[53] Though the programme was found to have reduced aggression among participants (Schumicky-Logan, 2017), the methodology for measuring 'effectiveness' was not discussed.

Among the limitations of sport-based interventions, certain financial and social implications were found. For example, less clear evidence of positive impact was reflected in a study (p. 39) by Vidino and Brandon (Vidino, L., and Brandon, J. (2012). "Countering radicalization in Europe." (London, International Centre for the Study of Radicalisation and Political Violence 2012), who studied the UK's counter-terrorism 'PREVENT' strategy. This entailed a group of programmes run by third sector organisations and regional councils, designed to tackle extremism. It funded trust-building strategies between the police and the Muslim community, as well as DVD–based lessons, drama and sports initiatives targeting extremism in schools.

---

[53] On the importance of youth acquiring such life skills, including critical thinking skills, through formal and non-formal education systems in conflict and crisis-prone environments, including as an integral part of CVE efforts, see too, e.g., Mercy Corps (2018). "'If youth are given the chance': Effects of Education and Civic Engagement on Somali Youth Support for Political Violence." Washington, DC: Mercy Corps, pp. 7 (fn. 7), 12, 13, 19, 23 and 25, available at https://www.mercycorps.org/sites/default/files/If%20Youth%20Are%20Given% 20the%20Chance_LR_FINAL.pdf (accessed 14 November 2018). Other similar reports are available at https://www.mercycorps.org/research/adolescents-and-youth (on Somalia, the Kyrgyz Republic and Mali).

Furthermore, this highly publicised, Muslim-focused, funding scheme came under scrutiny from Sikh, Hindu and other minorities, who accused the government of favouritism and of ignoring other communities. Similarly, an article (p. 32) by Douglas Weeks (Weeks, D. (2017). "Doing Derad: An Analysis of the UK System." *Studies in Conflict & Terrorism*, pp. 1-18) is illustrative. This study concerned the UK's Channel programme, which is a facet of the 'PREVENT' strategy already referred to. Channel is intended to act as a diversionary programme for individuals who are identified as being 'at-risk' of radicalisation. The programme itself provides broad assistance, including with employment, education, vocational training, housing and sports opportunities. However, as noted by Weeks (p. 32), "[a]lthough widely supported by the security services and the [British] Home Secretary, there remains a lack of transparency or publications demonstrating its effectiveness. Indeed, it is unclear how success is defined, which is a notable issue with deradicalization programmes." Challenges relating to the longer-term efficacy of at least some radicalisation and crime prevention programmes were considered also (p. 40). In Nichols, G. (2007). *Sport and crime reduction: The role of sports in tackling youth crime*. Routledge, the author contended that a lack of post programme follow-up may see effects diminish, especially if individuals return to their environments, or peer groups, that reinforce their extremist ideals.

Other initiatives included in this literature review are (at pp. 38-39) the 2015 US National Security Strategy, which noted that the long-term efforts of engaging youths and marginalised groups in sports, arts and culture "will be more important than our capacity to remove terrorists from the battlefield" (White House (February 2015). "The National Intelligence Strategy of the United States of America." Office of the Director of National Intelligence, p. 8). Similarly, a recommendation from the European Commission to the European Parliament in 2014 endorsed the inclusion of sports to increase resilience against extremism (Radicalisation Awareness Network (RAN) (2014). "Preventing Radicalisation to Terrorism and Violent Extremism: Strengthening the EU's Response." RAN collection (approaches, lessons learned and practices). A Hedayah report from 2015, detailing CVE strategies, postulated that sport underscored commonalities rather than differences between cultural groups (Zeiger, S. et al. (2015). "Countering violent extremism: Developing an evidence-base for policy and

practice*.*" Hedayah and Curtin University,[54] while the UK's Prevent Strategy is briefly mentioned for its sponsorship, inter alia, of sports initiatives targeting extremism in schools.

2.3   Barkindo, A. and Bryans, S. (2016). "De-Radicalising Prisoners in Nigeria: Developing a Basic Prison Based De-Radicalisation Programme." *Journal For Deradicalization*, vol. 7, pp. 1-25.

An ambitious Nigerian CVE programme, the deradicalisation element of which included the establishment of a prison based deradicalisation programme for sentenced and pre-trial prisoners, is the focus of this paper. The initiative was prompted by recognition in the Nigerian Counter Terrorism Strategy that force alone was not enough to combat violent extremist elements in Nigeria; instead, a multi-faceted approach was considered to be more effective in countering the threat of violent extremism. The programme itself, developed by the Nigerian Office of the National Security Advisor (ONSA), consisted of three elements: community-based counter radicalisation; strategic communications; and deradicalisation.

The paper sets out how ONSA and the Nigerian Prison Service went about establishing the programme, highlights the challenges and lessons that can be drawn from its operation during the first 18 months (of particular interest for low resource, post-conflict and fragile states), and describes the key elements, including the creation of a supportive operating environment, the ongoing assessment of risks and needs, the types of intervention considered and available, and overall programme management and staffing.

The programme was launched via a pilot in one medium security prison, which was physically upgraded to provide the basic facilities needed to run a deradicalisation programme, including an outdoor sports area. Reliance on sports, such as volleyball and football, as an intervention tool was accompanied by other group activities, including classroom teaching, with input from faith leaders, psychologists and social workers. A wide range of approaches in addition to sports were implemented, including motivational interviewing, vocational and cultural training, art therapy and faith interventions. The paper highlights that the sports activities contributed to promoting personal development and growth, encouraging pro-social thinking and behaviour, and providing a platform for engagement and rehabilitation.

---

[54] Available at http://apo.org.au/node/57458 (accessed 14 November 2018).

Football leagues were organised with teams comprising both prisoners and prison staff, which improved mutual trust and communication.

In terms of methodology, it was noted (at p. 18|) that "few jurisdictions have elaborated robust and succinct methodologies to evaluate the success, or otherwise, of de-radicalisation programmes". In this case, an 'Integrated Case Management' approach was developed, which entailed a prisoner-centred, multidisciplinary approach to working with prisoners. Local Treatment Teams were created (at p. 7), to develop deradicalisation assessment tools, to identify, appoint and train its members, to supervise and monitor programme delivery, to collate national data on risks and needs, and to ensure that the necessary materials, tools, and equipment were available for the programme.

Effectiveness was gauged individually. From the start, accurate and accessible 'dynamic intervention-related' case assessment files were kept on each violent extremist prisoner on admission, and on the impact of his intervention. In terms of evaluating the overall effectiveness of the programme, the programme's testimonials from both prisoners and staff after 18 months were largely positive, but the evidence was mainly anecdotal; the authors were not permitted to view confidential prisoner information to directly assess impact, though risk assessments did show a significant improvement across various indicators, including the number of and the level of engagement with the interventions. Furthermore, the findings were not systematically examined by an independent oversight body, and emerging patterns of prisoner change "were also not documented, collated or analysed with sufficient rigour to enable decision makers to make informed choices". (p. 24).

2.4   Götsch, K. (2017). "Austria and the Threats from Islamist Radicalisation and Terrorist Involvement: An Overview of Governmental and Non-Governmental Initiatives and Policies." *Journal For Deradicalization*, **vol. 12, pp. 169-191.**

While Austria has not generally been affected directly by terrorism, it is increasingly active in the field of deradicalisation and PVE. This article provides the first comprehensive overview and review of Austria's new and renewed initiatives, programmes, and different approaches to dealing with prevention, intervention and deradicalisation efforts, from governmental and non-governmental organisations. It includes policies and activities covering the whole range of efforts to counter radicalisation and jihadist-related extremist violence, as well as (planned)

policy and legal changes to counter radicalisation and terrorist involvement such as support of terrorist organisations, membership, plans for terrorist attacks, etc.

The article examines a number of PVE and deradicalisation programmes, including those aimed at children and young adults. Of particular relevance here, in terms of sport-based intervention tools, is the Vienna programme entitled 'Not in God's Name' (NIGN) was established in 2015 by political scientist Alexander Karakas and professional Thai boxer, and located in a martial arts training centre. It targets young people, largely consisting of Muslim migrants, and attempts to provide them with positive role models as 'testimonials' against violence and radicalisation. Its work designing sports programmes is aimed at promoting the role model function of sportspeople, to guide disaffected migrant youth in the right direction and to refute the messages of violence and involvement with radical groups.

After a year, more than 20 trainers and sportsmen, drawn from different cultural backgrounds, were active in this bottom-up sport-based prevention initiative. As a strategy, NIGN focuses completely on its 'role-model-approach', and uses methods similar to open, low-threshold youth street work. NIGN visits youth clubs and bars in addition to its training centre to start conversations with marginalised youths, to air potentially radical and extremist views and beliefs which can be countered with positive examples of successful sports role models. The article notes that, although by now attracting international attention, institutional and financial support from Austrian public agencies has arrived only very tentatively.

Methodology and measuring 'effectiveness' are not discussed directly. In terms of indirect effects, the article (p. 179) points merely to the fact "that adolescents would not listen to politicians" but would "obey their sportive idols every word" (cf. Goldmann, Nina (2016). Deradikalisierung durch Kampfsport und Religion, religion.ORF (15 July 2016)[55]). Moreover,the initiative has continued to advance its activities from its extensive social media campaign and informal street work in its training centre, to official cooperation with schools in Vienna, where information workshops in classes are held.

---

[55] Available at http://religion.orf.at/stories/2785877/ (accessed 1 December 2018).

2.5 USAID (June 2017). "Countering Violent Extremism: Kenya, Somalia and East Africa." *Fact Sheet.*[56]

USAID was engaged in a CVE project in East Africa, involving the use of development tools – such as youth empowerment, social and economic inclusion, and alternative messaging – to address factors driving violent extremism or radicalising individuals and communities.

A key focus of the project's Somalia element was supporting the restoration of the societal prominence of the arts, culture and sports in formerly Al-Shabaab controlled areas which had prohibited such activities. This included supporting the Somali Olympic Committee and the hosting of the first women's national basketball tournament in 26 years with the National Basketball Federation. Furthermore, USAID "constructed, rehabilitated and supported sports facilities and dozens of sports initiatives that serve more than 50,000 at-risk youth across Somalia". It also USAID created an estimated 13,000 employment opportunities.

USAID's interventions are typically underpinned by robust, locally-informed assessments and analysis including to ensure that all programmes are appropriately contextualised to maximise their impact. This includes the continuous collation of quantitative and qualitative data to inform the design, monitoring and evaluation of their programmes. Though no detailed end of project report could be located, an in-depth mid-term project evaluation was undertaken.[57] No in-depth analysis, however, regarding the impact and effectiveness of the Somali sports element could be found, including regarding its furtherance of the overall stated CVE objective. That said, the programme is a powerful reminder that productive engagement with a subject population in matters such as governance, education, sports and cultural activities can play a crucial, stabilising role in restoring civil society and peace.

Notably too, despite USAID's systematic approach to undertaking evidence informed projects, their adopted methodology was not unproblematic. Commentators Zhalil and Zeuthen (Khalil, J. and Zeuthen, M. (2014). "A Case Study of Counter Violent Extremism (CVE) Programming: Lessons from OTI's Kenya Transition Initiative." *Stability: International Journal*

---

[56] Available at https://www.usaid.gov/sites/default/files/documents/1860/CVE_Fact_Sheet_June_2017.pdf (accessed 14 November 2018).

[57] USAID (2013). "Mid-Term Evaluation of Three Countering Violent Extremism Projects." US: USAID, available at https://pdf.usaid.gov/pdf_docs/pdacx479.pdf (accessed 14 November 2018).

of Security and Development, vol. 3, issue 1, p. Art. 31)) have made pertinent observations in relation to the Kenyan part of this project, which are of wider significance. They argue that "programming decisions would have benefitted from a more comprehensive understanding of VE in the local context.[58] For instance, subsets of the population more narrowly 'at-risk' of being attracted to VE should have been identified and targeted ..... and a greater focus should have been placed upon comprehending the relevance of material incentives.... and other such individual-level drivers" (introduction). Additionally, more attention should have been given to distinguishing between those merely supportive of violence and those directly involved in its creation, the 'branding' risks associated with certain donors, and more neutral contexts in which to downplay the pejorative term 'extremism'. They conclude that a priority should be to ensure the accuracy and suitability of definitions in CVE concepts, to which practitioners can concretely refer. Though Zhalil and Zeuthen conclude that the Kenyan part of the project did indeed achieve positive impact – conclusions underpinned by the collation and analysis of considerable qualitative evidence –they were also of the view that such impact could have been further enhanced had a 'Theories of Change' (ToC) logic been applied to maximise the contribution of each separate grant to the project's broader goals.

Other commentators have warned similarly about the potential pitfalls of collating and relying upon misleading data to assess the effectiveness of CVE/PVE and deradicalisation programmes. For instance, the risks of subjectivity and discrimination[59] are explored in Pettinger, T. (2017). "De-radicalization and Counter-radicalization: Valuable Tools Combating Violent Extremism, or Harmful Methods of Subjugation?" *Journal For Deradicalization,* vol. 12, pp. 1-59, including the resultant potential costs to society of promoting policies having no rigorous basis for measuring or evaluating evidence. Another potential area of concern is the over-simplification of factors or indictors, themes explored in Palm, M. la (2017). "Re-Purposing the Push-Pull Model to Describe Signature Patterns of Terrorist Disengagement by Group: A Validation Study." *Journal For Deradicalization,* vol. 12, pp. 85-118. Based on

---

[58] Similarly, see the Hive CVE Toolkit which advises: "keep it local", "keep it current" and "keep it real".
[59] E.g., the selected youth for research/project participation may be biased and therefore inaccurate. Additionally, for a comprehensive picture, it is important to gain the perspectives of harder to reach, non-organized youth - Butti, E. (2017). "Involving Non-Organised 'Outcast' Youths in Peacebuilding: Existing Challenges and Lessons Learned in the Columbian Case", available at https://www.youth4peace.info/system/files/2018-04/18.%20CFR_Colombia%20-%20Outcast%20youths%20   20in%20Colombia_ElenaButti_0.pdf (accessed 14 November 2018).

aggregated data from four studies on disengagement, combined with individual testimonies or group analyses, the author argues that the push-pull model can provide a unique perspective of how terrorist groups can be dissimilar, with distinctive patterns of disengagement that align with their context. Consequently, the careful tailoring and contextualisation of CVE/PVE and deradicalisation efforts are critical to their ultimate success. Plan International, in their submission to the YPS Missing Piece Study,[60] identify a number of significant, recurring challenges and weaknesses specific to the evaluation of youth crime prevention programmes. These include: treating youth as a homogenous group;[61] not fully (or at all) overcoming barriers of gender equality and uneven power relations (commonly, youth initiatives can reinforce local contextual norms that restrict the participation of young women) (p. 1); and not fully engaging the potential of youth who are often excluded or at least not fully engaged in public and political spheres, due to such factors as poor perceptions of youth (p. 2).

2.6 TANA and CMC (2017). "Strengthening Resilience to Violent Extremism – STRIVE (Horn of Africa): Evaluation report."[62]

In terms of learning from and progressing beyond past mistakes, the Strengthening Resilience to Violent Extremism (STRIVE) programme undertaken in the Horn of Africa (2014-2017) – an area hosting a number of terrorist groups, making its populations (especially youth) vulnerable to recruitment - by the UK's Royal United Services Institute on behalf of the European Union is informative.

The programme was established to "start the EU's engagement in the field of CVE, to build up expertise, to contribute to international exchanges on best practice, and to cooperate with other relevant actors in the field of CVE which […] is often sensitive and regarding which knowledge is still developing" (p. iii). Its approach was to test out potential approaches through trialling them in pilot activities in order to gauge their effectiveness. Key lessons

---

[60] Available at https://www.youth4peace.info/system/files/2018-04/19.%20TP_YPS_Plan%20International.pdf (accessed 14 November 2018).

[61] Similarly see, e.g., Life & Peace Institute (2017). "Being and Becoming a Peacebuilder: Insights from 20,000 hours of youth-led dialogues in the Horn of Africa", available at https://www.youth4peace.info/system/files/ 2018-04/20.%20CFR_Horn%20of%20Africa-%20Being%20   And%   20Becoming%20A%20Peacebuilder_LPI_ 0.pdf, p. 3.

[62] Available at http://ct-morse.eu/wp-content/uploads/2017/04/170124-STRIVE-evaluation-Report-Final.pdf (accessed 14 November 2018).

learnt were derived in relation to designing, implementing and monitoring CVE programmes - such as how best to contextualise CVE efforts and overcome barriers, including cultural ones – and cooperating with key partners such as national authorities (p. iv). These included research and activities regarding the role of women in CVE (in Puntland and Somaliland), and reducing the risk of local and diaspora youth in Somaliland becoming radicalised (p. iii). The latter pilot used a number of activities, including sports, to faciliate various diaspora/ local youth integration activities involving around 600 youth (p. 3). These activities were run alongside other activities, such as Islamic teaching and exposure visits, "designed to develop awareness, tolerance, critical thinking and engagement" between the two groups of youth (pp. 15-16). From a CVE perspective, however, such activities were not considered to have been effective "due to the individuals involved (being not in the "at risk" category) and the questionable capacity of the local implementer to manage or refer potentially radicalised youth should they have been identified". Insufficient capacity was problematic too (p. 10).

Some of the external evaluation recommendations are of particular interest here too. One was that "CVE projects systematically adopt a theory of change approach during project design that makes assumptions explicit", clearly distinguishing CVE interventions from other activities such as peacebuilding (p. iv). Another recommendation was that "programming include baseline research and arrangements for monitoring throughout project implementation that identifies and validates change assumptions and provides data in response to CVE relevant indicators, thus helping to provide evidence of what works, and the pre-conditions involved" (p. v). A further one emphasised the importance of contextualisation for CVE efforts involving youth and women, notably "undertak[ing] rigorous research into cultural and social norms in the localities concerned so that pre-conditions for change are exposed and can be addressed during project design" (p. vi).

2.7   Stern, J. (2010). "Mind over Martyr: How to Deradicalize Islamist Extremists."
***Foreign Affairs*, Vol. 89, No. 1, pp. 95-108.**

This article concerns the deradicalisation programme implemented in Saudi Arabia. Its success was gauged only by quantitative means, i.e., by measuring the number of past militants the Saudi regime deemed to have been reintegrated into society. This was gauged mainly by official recidivism statistics (p. 104): "recidivism is 10-20 percent, far lower than

that for ordinary criminals". More than 4,000 participants, between 2004 and 2010, completed the Saudi programme combining counselling, vocational training, art therapy, sports, and religious re-education.[63] The article further claims (p. 35) that "the graduates have been reintegrated into mainstream society much more successfully than ordinary criminals", and that "Governments elsewhere in the Middle East and throughout Europe and Southeast Asia have launched similar programs for neo-Nazis, far-right militants, narco-terrorists, and Islamist terrorists, encouraging them to abandon their radical ideology or renounce their violent means or both". The programme's guiding philosophy is that jihadists are victims, not criminals or terrorists, making it a controversial model to export to other jurisdictions, such as the United States as its author proposes.

At no point is there an indication as to the precise methodology (neither for the author nor the programme) utilised to measure 'effectiveness', nor is the potential contribution of sport to the programme's overall success discussed. The article points instead to an extensive post-release programme, which involves extensive surveillance, and the wider assistance provided. For example, (p. 105) "former Guantánamo detainees who graduate from the programme are given housing, a car, money for a wedding….. and help with career placements for themselves and their families". Indeed, Stern suggests that "in order to gain a more complete understanding of what works, and what does not, in deradicalization efforts, it will be important for the Saudi government to give outsiders greater access to the program and to statistics regarding it" (p. 105).

2.8   Schmid, A.P. (March 2013). "Radicalisation, De-radicalisation, Counter-Radicalisation: A Conceptual Discussion and Literature Review." *International Centre for Counter-Terrorism (ICCT) – The Hague, Research Paper*.[64]

This paper is not aimed directly at sport and PVE, but instead critiques a number of national deradicalisation programmes, such as those conducted in prisons, in educational

---

[63] For other deradicalisation programmes, which may similarly use sports as part of its more general curriculum rather than as a PVE tool per se, see: the Sabaoon programme in Pakistan, which has 'rehabilitated' 192 out of 200 former extremists. See Khan, R.R. and Peracja, F. (2017). "Deradicalizing, Rehabilitating, and Reintegrating Violent Extremists." *USIP Peacebrief* 238, available at https://www.usip.org/sites/default/files/ 2017-11/pb238-deradicalizing-rehabilitating-and-reintegrating-violent-extremists.pdf (access 14 November 2018); and the rehabilitation and deradicalisation of former members of the Liberation Tigers of Tamil Eelam in Sri Lanka - Webber, D., et al. (2017). "Deradicalizing Detained Terrorists." *Political Psychology*, vol. 3, pp. 539-556.
[64]   Available   at   https://www.icct.nl/download/file/ICCT-Schmid-Radicalisation-De-Radicalisation-Counter-Radicalisation-March-2013.pdf (accessed 14 November 2018).

environments, and seeking to promote alliances of civilisations and inter-cultural dialogue. In regard to the contribution of sports-based initiatives to PVE and deradicalisation programmes, specifically, it only briefly considers two states' approaches to sport and deradicalisation. First, it notes that Germany considers the very fact of participation in combat sports/survival training to be a potential terrorism indicator (at p. 27), a conclusion which may be related to psychological factors. See, e.g., Lisa Wise (Wise, L. (2012). "Marketing Martial Arts: Competitive Sport versus Self-defence, Combat Sport versus Eastern Philosophy" in Christos Anagnostopoulos (Ed.), *Contextualising Research in Sport: An International Perspective*. Greece, ATINER, pp. 241-252) who notes (p. 247) that, if taught without the philosophical and moral aspects, martial arts training "resulted in increased aggression and personality attributes defining delinquency" (citing Trulson, E. (1986). "Martial arts training: a novel 'cure' for juvenile delinquency." *Human Relations*, Vol. 39, No. 12, pp. 1131-1140). Secondly, the article discusses (p. 48) the Saudi programme which combines sports with other activities as outlined previously (section 2.7 above).

Primarily, this paper is included here for its contribution to the issue of methodology and evidential research. In relation to the methodologies available for gauging programme effectiveness, the paper notes a general absence of research. In doing so, it references New York's International Peace Institute (which has examined deradicalisation initiatives in eight Muslim-majority countries), which concluded in 2011 that "[r]esearch on de-radicalisation and rehabilitation programmes is still in its infancy" (p. 42). Indeed, the paper cites a number of commentators regarding challenges associated with measuring 'success' of deradicalisation efforts which can be notoriously hard. These sentiments are aptly captured by Tore Bjørgo and John Horgan (Bjørgo, T. and Horgan, J. (2009). 'Conclusions', in Tore Bjørgo and John Horgan (Eds.), *Leaving Terrorism Behind: Individual and Collective Disengagement.* London: Routledge, p. 3 (at p. 40) in the following terms:

> With regard to existing initiatives […], there remains intense secrecy surrounding all but the most superficial details; despite, in some cases, highly publicized claims for success, there is no evidence of transparent or valid internal or external evaluation of the claimed success of these programmes; furthermore, none of the programmes under examination displayed any clear criteria for establishing effective measurement

of success or otherwise. (Schmid, A.P. at p. 43, quoting Horgan, J. at START conference of 1 September 2011, University of Maryland, College Park.)

In turn, 'the need for evaluation studies is more and more acknowledged. (Horgan, at p. 43, citing Romaniuk, P. and Cjowdhury Fink, N. (2012). "From Input to Impact: Evaluating Terrorism Preventive Programs." New York: Center for Global Counterterrorism Cooperation. A key related challenge though is that funding for such research appears to be scant or lacking entirely.

2.9 Ponsot, A.S., Autixier, C., and Madriaza, P. (2018). "Factors Facilitating the Successful Implementation of a Prevention of Violent Radicalization Intervention as Identified by Front-Line Practitioners." *Journal For Deradicalization*, Vol. 16, pp. 1-33.

Though this article does not focus on sports-based interventions, it highlights a number of important findings of equal applicability to developing an evidence-base for such interventions in furtherance of PVE objectives. The key findings of an international study, ICPC (2017). "The Prevention of Radicalization Leading to Violence: An International Study of Front-Line Workers and Intervention Issues." Montreal, Canada: International Centre for the Prevention of Crime, are discussed. Concerned with the practical experience of front-line practitioners in the prevention of radicalisation, the report is not an objective assessment of the efficacy of any particular intervention, and methodology is little discussed, as a result. The paper presented key findings regarding factors identified by front-line practitioners as facilitating the successful implementation of PVE interventions, based on interviews undertaken with 90 experts and front-line practitioners from 64 organisations in 27 countries in North America, Europe, Africa, Asia and Oceania (p. 1).

In undertaking its own extensive review of existing literature, legislation, norms and promising programmes relevant to the prevention of radicalisation, what is of especial note here is the recurring theme regarding the general lack of a sufficient evidence-base for assessing the effectiveness of PVE initiatives. Of all the scientific documents identified in this review in which intervention was discussed, only 16% used primary empirical data, and of this number almost half were evaluations (p. 2). The paper notes that the field of study concerned with interventions to prevent radicalisation remains vastly underexplored. Currently, much of the available literature concerns the factors that seek to explain why individuals become

radicalised, or that seem to accelerate the radicalisation process, not if or why the interventions were impactful. Moreover, research on intervention and prevention historically has occupied considerably less space than fundamental research on this subject (p. 2).

In particular, the paper identifies three aspects that have received little attention within existing literature: evidence-based studies, project evaluations, and the experiences of front-line practitioners. This paper thus seeks to address such gaps through presenting the perspectives of front-line practitioners in prevention at the local level, in order to highlight both the correlations and the discrepancies between CVE policies in general, and the work being done to carry out these policies. One notable finding, in terms of assessing programme effectiveness, was that the factors conducive to counter-radicalisation considered by these front-line practitioners to be effective do not correspond to objective measures but are subjective assessments.

The factors include: (a) approaches adopted during an intervention that foster its successful implementation, (b) factors that relate to the practitioner, (c) factors that relate to the organisation carrying out the intervention, (d) factors that relate to the community context, and (e) factors that relate to the socio-political context (p. 15). As regards (a), while the practitioners were not in agreement as to the 'most problematic' aspects of radicalization, many agreed on which approaches to adopt during an intervention. For example, the adoption of an 'experiential and interactive approach' (p. 16), a 'positive approach', an 'empathetic, understanding, and open-minded approach', and, most importantly, (p. 17) by creating 'an atmosphere of trust'. With respect to (b), European respondents found a multi-disciplinary team to be an intervention 'success factor' (p. 17). Additional success factors included (p. 18) the practitioner's experience and personality, working in a familiar area, affinity, and relational aspects of the work. As regards (c), organizational 'success factors' included (pp. 19-20) a knowledge of organizational limits, a multisectoral approach, organisational flexibility and adaptability, creativity, willingness to take risks, and the awareness of the need to take stock continually. In relation to (d), community-related 'success factors' included (p. 20) the importance of adopting an integrated approach, working not only with youth, but also parents, teachers, etc. The promotion of a local approach (p. 21), i.e., one adapted to local realities and issues, is also emphasized. Non-Western countries stated a

preference for a community participation approach. Finally, as regards (e), 'success factor' responses were more varied. An African respondent emphasised (p. 22) the current preoccupations around the issue of radicalization as being conducive to her intervention, not least since they facilitated funding. Somewhat in contrast, European respondents focused on societal need, particularly since intervention provided a "space for dialogue in society" (p. 22).

3. Literature Review - Violence/Crime/Conflict Prevention & Peacebuilding Programmes

3.1 Ekholt, D. (2013). "Sport and crime prevention: Individuality and transferability in research." *Journal of Sport for Development*, **Vol. 1, No. 2, pp. 1-12.**

This article undertakes a literature review of 55 research publications on sport as a means of crime prevention. The publications were chosen using database searches and a systematic review of related references. The author focuses on how and why the evidence-based methods of politically initiated, supported and financed initiatives are systematized. The article does not examine sport practices, per se, but instead, the research on sport as a means of crime prevention, utilizing two questions: first, how is the research described when sport is promoted for preventing crime; and secondly, how are the descriptions of the research object, questions and findings actually articulated?

It is noted early (p. 1) that "sport as a means to achieve social objectives is primarily a Western phenomenon", since sport programmes often are developed by Western NGOs and exported elsewhere, commenting that some researchers remain doubtful as to the efficacity of using sport for such objectives. That said, there is also much evidence to support the contribution of sport to positive social development and crime prevention. Two main prevention modes emerge from the literature review: the 'averting-mode', and the more dominant 'social-change mode'. In seeking also to analyse how descriptions and their articulation of the social-change mode can create meaningful concepts for discourses on individuality and transferability, the article considers the relevant literature from a social constructionist perspective.

The methodology employed for the literature review was 'inductive category development' (section 2), and the findings presented descriptively (section 3), including both positive and negative perspectives on sport as a means of crime prevention. The subsequent section provides a reflective, critical examination of how the literature on sport as a means of crime prevention is underpinned by certain concepts and assumptions which are inspired by a constructionist view of discourse and of social problems in order to influence policy-making and the organisation of sport initiatives with social objectives.

In terms of the averting-mode and the social change-mode highlighted above, the latter is more prevalent in the research descriptions which emphasize sport as an instrument to promote social change and for crime prevention, and in the related discourses on individuality and transferability, which discourses create order in the research field concerning framing crime as a social problem and sport as a potential solution.

In terms of overall critique, the literature review yields three findings: first, there is a lack of clear evidence on the relationship between sport and crime prevention; secondly, there is nothing inherent in sport that makes it suitable for crime prevention; and, thirdly, activities are difficult to evaluate due to poor theorization, and mediated relations. Moreover, certain findings suggest that participation in power sports, such as boxing, wrestling, weightlifting and martial arts could lead to increased antisocial activity, since those sports emphasize elements of fighting and strength. Doubts as to the suitability of sports as a crime prevention tool include the fact that sports organisations are not intended or designed as a social service, many sports do not generally attract economically and socially challenged youth, and the emphasis on competition can prove destructive of wider social values and legitimize violence, particularly among males.

In contrast, more positive findings exist inasmuch as the averting-mode seeks to avert or avoid antisocial involvement or crime, while its emphasis on changes to circumstances incorporates the potential for positive progression (i.e., more than just averting a specific behaviour or activity). A more practical consideration is that deterrence as a crime-preventive mechanism is often engaged by sport activities, since youth can be deterred from criminal or deviant behaviour under the close supervision of coaches, staff, and police in sporting environments. Other positive findings from the research on the use of sport in crime

prevention include the development of personal and social relations, community participation, a sense of empowerment, active citizenship, self-confidence, -esteem and -control, etc.

As for making individuality and transferability meaningful in sport for crime prevention, the author considers that it is the individual who learns, is socialized by and internalizes values. If the aims pursued are not intended so much to enhance performances in the sport setting, as to encourage the individual to use his or her moral and non-violent capabilities to avoid anti-social involvement or criminal activities outside the sport setting, the concept of transferability from sport to other spheres in life is made meaningful.

3.2   Laureus Sport for Good Foundation

Three relevant reports on youth, sports and crime prevention have been produced by the Laureus Sport for Good Foundation, which adopts a developmental and peaceful society approach to its work and outputs (rather than, for instance, a specifically crime prevention or PVE one).[65] They are of especial relevance here since they recognise and seek to address gaps regarding the paucity of evidence-based assessments of the effectiveness of sports-based programmes with crime prevention goals. The most recent report - Sport Scores: The Costs and Benefits of Sport for Crimes Reduction: Executive Summary (Sport Scores) – was published in 2012, highlighting again challenges associated with obtaining up-to-date evidence-based assessments on the impact of sports-based initiatives.

In its earliest report, Breaking the Cycle of Violence (2009), a key focus was on gangs, youth crime (and, topically, knife crime) and sport. As with the other Foundation reports discussed here, it highlighted the general absence of "definitive evidence of a direct causal relationship between involvement in sports, moral outlook, gang-related or other criminal and deviant behaviour" (p. 18). Although the report reflected the gathering of some data obtained through an online survey on sport positively influencing gang culture, unlike the subsequent reports, it did not seek to develop a robust methodology for evidence-based assessments of its programmes. The report though presented a number of interesting findings of broader

---

[65] Available at https://www.laureus.com/publications?field_publication_category_tid=All&page=1 (accessed 14 November 2018).

relevance to assessing the effectiveness of sports-based crime reduction projects. Notably, people from disadvantaged backgrounds are less likely to participate in sport and physical activity, even more so where sport is organised and competitive (p. 18, citing Sport England's 'Active People' data). This poses a further challenge to sports projects to reduce crime in that "young people from disadvantaged backgrounds, who are most likely to be both the perpetrators and victims of violent crime, are less likely to be active participants in sport and physical activity" (p. 18). It highlighted, too, the importance of ensuring that projects involving sport set "realistic targets which focus on long-term protection against risk factors rather than short-term impacts on offending rates" (p. 27).

In its second report, Teenage Kicks: The Value of Sport in Tackling Youth Crime (2011), the Foundation once again observes the "lack of robust research-based evidence on the outcomes of sports participation" - confirmed by several then recently government commissioned reports into the claimed benefits of such programmes, including on crime prevention – which inhibits the ability of policy makers to make informed decisions (p. 19). As the report further notes, which is a recurring theme of broader applicability, "the problem is that sports projects rarely monitor or evaluate their outcomes". Therefore, for instance, information about the outcomes of 11 UK youth crime prevention "was hard to come by". Those evaluations conducted typically fell into the categories of diversionary and rehabilitative approaches.

In seeking to close such evidential gaps, the Foundation had undertaken an innovative approach to measuring the impact of its programmes to tackle youth crime, namely an economic analysis of the cost of certain social problems compared against the cost of measures to them illustrated by three case studies (p. 45). As the report noted, "[i]t is difficult to know whether crime rates…. would have gone down anyway if Kickz had not been present." Nonetheless, based on a number of assumptions, the UK Ministry of Justice annual rates of recorded crime in England and Wales statistics were utilised as a benchmark against which to gauge what was happening nationally against what was happening more locally (p. 26). The importance of developing key relationships with all partners was emphasised, especially at the local level, to better collate data including on programme impact (p. 45).

In terms of how this approach translates into an evidence-base of programme effectiveness, the Arsenal Kickz at Elthorne Park is illustrative. The report compared Metropolitan Police data on reported youth crime from the year before the programme started (2005/2006 – 2,529 reports) with youth crime statistics in the third year of Kickz (2008/2009 – 867 reports), marking an overall reduction of 66% (p. 24). Furthermore, the report considered whether sports interventions had served merely as a diversion or as a preventative measure. Notably, the report found (p. 24) that:

> If Kickz was working just as a diversion, the reduction in youth crime would be higher on the days of the week that the scheme runs. We analysed crime reported near Elthorne Park and found that the reduction was exactly the same on scheme days and on non-scheme days, at 66%.

> This suggests that Elthorne Park Kickz is doing more than just diverting young people from crime to football. It is also improving their behaviour at other times by teaching the dangers of crime and changing attitudes and aspirations. For this reason, we use annual reported crime rates in the economic analysis, rather than crime reported only on scheme days.

The analysis was mindful that there were other targeted police interventions in place in addition to Kickz during this period and that their outcomes were based on a number of assumptions, such as an incremental decline in youth offending since Kickz began. Therefore, they took a conservative approach, estimating that 20% of the reduction in reported youth crime – a total of 579 crimes between 2005/2006 and 2008/2009 – could be attributed to the Kickz programme (p. 27).[66]

One significant substantive finding of the Teenage Kicks report was that broad agreement existed that sports activities on their own generally would be insufficient to prevent crime; rather that they needed to be combined with wider developmental educational and supports initiatives if they were to have positive impact on behaviour such as reduced offending (p. 19). The report pointed to evaluations that had been conducted for the Positive Futures and Laureus funded Midnight Basketball league, which underlined the importance of sports

---

[66] For analysis of the effectiveness of other the other two case studies, see pp. 35 - 38, 42 – 43.

activities being accompanied by parallel "training, mentoring, education, healthy lifestyle programmes and drug prevention programmes" (p. 20): i.e. 'sport plus' programmes, where such developmental activities complement sports diversional ones, with sports-based activities playing an important facilitative role in terms of creating a conducive context for such broader engagement with participants (p. 19).

In the Sport Scores report, progress is noted in terms of increasing the general evidence-base for the effectiveness of sports projects, though limitations remain. For instance, most studies draw primarily upon qualitative research methods such as questionnaires, in-depth interviews and focus groups with participants and stakeholders to identify and assess positive outcomes such as changed attitudes (p. 8), which only go part way in terms of comprehensively analysing impact. Consequently, the Foundation had developed and piloted a methodology for better assessing the impact of and value for money[67] given by sports projects (pp. 8, 31), which includes recommendations on indicators to measure social and economic impact (p. 33). Notably here, this included framing such assessments around risk and protection factors, observing that "[i]n the absence of any prior involvement in serious youth disorder, the measurement of such risk factors [such as early behavioural problems pointing towards potential future criminality] (and associated protective factors) can provide a suitable alternative measure of youth crime" (p. 11). The project not only measured reductions in re-offending, but also adopted "an innovative approach to assessing predicted reductions in crime amongst non-offenders by measuring changes in risk and protection factors" (p. 11).

Building upon and updating its previous research and evidence-base captured in Breaking the Cycle of Violence and Teenage Kicks, this latest report found that "sport can be a powerful tool for engaging disaffected young people in positive activities and promoting positive development, either as a diversionary or rehabilitative approach to tackling crime" (p. 12). This, however, is dependent upon the presence of a number of important 'success factors': that sports projects are well targeted in terms of their "location and engagement of hard-to-

---

[67] E.g., Fight for Peace, London. Across the 800 participants in the programme, an estimated 165 crimes did not occur as a result of it, equating to an estimated £1,059,471 worth of savings to society (pp. 23-24); Midnight Basketball, Milan. An estimated 24 crimes were avoided involving over 200 participants, equating to an estimated £153,191 savings to society (p. 28).

reach groups"; that they are longer term in order to develop trust and change attitudes; and that they form an integral part of a broader developmental programme of support and education (such as mentoring, training, volunteering, work experience programmes) (p. 12).

3.3   Fight for Peace (Luta pela Paz)

The Fight for Peace initiative was founded in Brazil, since when it has been rolled out in many different parts of the world.[68] Several reports were found which conducted evidence-based assessments of its impact with specific local contexts.

The most recent, and one of the most extensive, reports found was an external evaluation of Maré United, a three-year Luta pela Paz project which received UK Comic Relief funding (2011-2014). The project's overall stated objectives were to achieve a: "Reduction of anti-social, criminal or violent behaviour of young people on the project that have a history of violent and/or criminal behaviour due to taking advantage of the sporting, education and personal development opportunities provided by the project leading to their making improved life choices" (p. 4). More specifically, it sought to remove 'invisible barriers' imposed by decades of control by drug trafficking factions through bringing young people together from communities commonly 'warring' with each other (p. 4).

In order to assess the project's effectiveness, Luta pela Paz had identified a number of quantitative and qualitative indicators. In terms of quantitative indicators, it planned the opening of a principal Academy and three satellite centres to provide 1400 young people per year with access to boxing and martial arts training and competitions, in addition to other parallel support activities such as personal development classes, individual mentoring, access to formal education classes, job training and so forth (p. 27). These indicators were met.

With respect to qualitative assessment, a number of indicators were identified linked to the objective of removing 'invisible barriers'. These included: "increased circulation of non-involved young people between 'rival' communities; a decrease in persistent stereotypes of young people in 'rival' communities; less anti-social, criminal or violent behaviour amongst

---

[68] See too the work of PeacePlayers, which uses the game of basketball as a peacebuilding tool to unite divided communities, having reached more than 75,000 youth in 15 countries. Available at https://www.peaceplayers.org (accessed 14 December 2018).

young people; an increase in safer environments within the community as the result of increased cohesion amongst young people" (p. 4). Such data was collated through interviews and project data. The overall assessment, endorsed by the external evaluation, was that Maré United had made a "significant positive impact on young people's behaviour, self-esteem and way of thinking" (p. 35), but that it had had a lesser effect to break down community barriers (p. 37). It was emphasised repeatedly that "the key to Luta pela Paz's effectiveness is that it continually monitors and evaluates all aspects of the delivery of its programmes and is extremely responsive to suggestions for improvements and adaptations" (p. 2).

Similarly, an evaluation of the effectiveness of other Luta pela Paz projects in London and Rio[69] found that young people going through the programme were more likely: to resist becoming involved in crime and desist from criminality and drug trafficking;[70] to contribute to overcoming divisions and creative positive relationships in local communities; and to learn and practice conflict resolution and peace-making skills (p. 1). Methodologically, it sought to place its findings on an evidential base through adopting a problem-solving approach that tested key theories upon which the Luta pela Paz model is based, through a number of research activities (review of academic scholarship, monitoring data provided by Luta pela Paz, participants and staff self-completion questionnaires, one to one interviews with participants and staff, as well as sports sessions observations) (p. 2).

With respect to Brazil's situation specifically - described as "a systematic crisis of public security" – including, but extending beyond the Luta pela Paz initiative, a useful overview of the "rich, if understudied, ecosystem of interventions to promote youth safety and security" is given by Muggah. R. (2017). "Youth, Security and Peace: Brazil Revisited".[71] The paper examines underlying risks for youth insecurity and undertakes a review of national, state, city and civil society animated measures to prevent and reduce violence (p. 14). In referring to

---

[69] Sampson, A. and Vilella, M.R. (2012). "Fight for Peace in Rio and London – assessing their progress and impact." *Summary Report.* UEL, available at http://fightforpeace.net/xxaltxx/wp-content/ uploads/2015/06/AN-INDEPENDENT-ASSESSMENT-OF-FIGHT-FOR-PEACE-IN-LONDON-RIO-BY-UEL-2012-–-SUMMARY.pdf (accessed 14 November 2018).
[70] E.g., between 60% and 70% say they are less inclined to commit crimes, carry weapons and join a gang; about three quarters say they have stopped getting into trouble at school. According to official records, 74% in London on intensive programmes have desisted from crime, and 47% in Rio.
[71] Available at https://www.youth4peace.info/system/files/2018-04/2.%20CFR_Brazil_Robert%20Muggah0.pdf (accessed 14 November 2018).

various initiatives and studies undertaken, the paper notes that "the most effective interventions are those that promote self-esteem among young at-risk people, that promote social reinsertion programmes for at-risk youth, that prevent child labor and also that prevent inter-personal violence (including bullying) between young people" (p. 14).

The paper refers to a number of sports and recreation initiatives with crime/violence prevention in Brazil. In addition to Luta pela Paz, other programmes use football, judo and martial arts as the entry point for violence prevention (p. 18). For example, *Instituto Bola Pela Frente* (Ball in Front Institute) operates in Rio de Janeiro using football as an entry-point for youth affected by drug factions and militia groups.[72] Similarly, *Instituto Gol la Letra* (Goal and Letters Institute) utilises football together with community centre and other services to reach out to high-risk adolescents,[73] and *Instituto Reacao* (Reaction Institute) undertakes comparable work using martial arts as the entry point[74] (p. 18). No detailed analysis of these programmes could be found, at least not in English.

3.4   Generations for Peace (Sport for Peace)

Another organisation of interest here is Generations for Peace, based in Jordan,[75] which engages in "[c]arefully facilitated sport-based games, art, advocacy, dialogue, and empowerment activities [to] provide an entry point to engage children, youth, and adults, and a vehicle for integrated education and sustained behavioural change", with an overarching aim of "promot[ing] active tolerance and responsible citizenship in communities experiencing different forms of conflict and violence".[76]

Of particular relevance is the Sport for Peace programme, Generation for Peace's original, flagship peacebuilding tool. This uses "specifically designed sports-based games and activities

---

[72] See further, http://www.institutodacrianca.org.br/tag/bola-pra-frente/ (accessed 14 November 2018).

[73] Available at https://goldeletra.org.br/ (accessed 14 November 2018).

[74] Available at https://goldeletra.org.br/ (accessed 14 November 2018).

[75] See too the work of PeacePlayers which uses sport as a tool as part of its peacebuilding activities in the Middle East. See, e.g., PeacePlayers, "PeacePlayers International-Middle East Program Evaluation" (November 2017), available at https://www.peaceplayers.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/12/PeacePlayers-Middle-East-Program-Evaluation-2017-1.pdf (accessed 14 December 2018).

[76] See https://www.generationsforpeace.org/en/who-we-are/about-us/ (accessed 2 December 2018). Since the NGO was founded in 2007, it has trained 10,689 volunteer leaders of youth, from 50 countries in the Middle East, Africa, Asia and Europe, and estimates that it has touched the lives of more than 479,817 children, youth and adults.

that integrate peer-group and peacebuilding education" in order to provide a 'safe space' for opposing groups - drawn from communities where relationships have been adversely impacted by such circumstances as conflict - to meet each other in a neutral venue. It aims to assist children and youth at the grassroots level to "overcome negative images and stereotypes about those who have different abilities, religions, and backgrounds to build acceptance and tolerance".[77] As such, there is a relational, structural and cultural dimension to its activities.[78]

In terms of Generations for Peace's overarching methodology, this has been described as "includ[ing] conflict analysis and conflict transformation theory, theory-of-change methodology, programme design, participatory monitoring and evaluation processes, volunteer mobilisation, and more. Conflict sensitivity and full participation and empowerment of girls and women are also integrated in our curriculum and programming (in implementation of UN SCR 1325)", underpinned by principles of innovation, quality, impact and sustainability.[79] Its work is also founded upon rigorous interdisciplinary research which it disseminates, together with identified best practices, through a number of partnerships.

In terms of these research outputs, two are of particular relevance here. The first its Research Report, Sport & Peace: Mapping the Field (2011), by Hillyer, S.J. et al, Georgetown University M.A. Programme in Conflict Resolution. The report reflects the key findings of a one-year international mapping project conducted to identify promising practices in the design, implementation and evaluation of Sports for Peace programmes, in particular to identify an evidence-base for claims regarding the effectiveness of sports-based programmes with peacebuilding objectives.

The report was underpinned by a grounded theory methodology whereby the approach was to identify emergent themes while compiling, comparing and analysing data, rather than seeking to prove or disprove a pre-determined hypothesis from the outset. In addition to undertaking a substantial review of existing literature, the report was informed by media

---

[77] See https://blog.generationsforpeace.org/2015/05/26/sport-for-peace/ (accessed 2 December 2018).
[78] See https://blog.generationsforpeace.org/2015/05/26/sport-for-peace/ (accessed 2 December 2018).
[79] See https://www.generationsforpeace.org/en/who-we-are/about-us/ (accessed 2 December 2018).

analysis, field research (including the undertaking of 75 semi-structured interviews) and organisational mapping. (p. 12).

Amongst its key findings, the most pressing challenges faced by practitioners and organisations in the sport and peace field were funding, communicating as well as monitoring and evaluation (i.e. ensuring that programmes do no harm and achieve legitimacy) (p. 33). Additionally, the report identified a key tension in terms of polarising opinions regarding the positive effectiveness (or not) of sports-based activities: "'[s]uper-critics' have labelled sport as an inherent harbinger of conflict and violence whilst 'sport-enthusiasts' have made claims that sport can practically 'save the whole world'" (Wolff, A. (2011). "Sports saves the world." *Sports Illustrated*, Vol. 115, No. 12, pp. 62-74) (p. 43). Significantly, such polarisation can "negatively effect policies and widespread programmatic funding. On one hand, there seems to be an unfounded aversion to using sport, and on the other hand, an over-eagerness to use sport everywhere and anywhere", with neither stance generally being informed by evidence-based research (p. 43). Consequently, "[t]he 'sports evangelists' seem to be responsible for the implementation of many well-intentioned but misguided [Sport for Peace and Development].... On the other hand, cynical critics dismiss any legitimate role sport could play in building more peaceful individuals, living in more peaceful communities" (p. 43).

The report concludes, therefore, that for sport to act as an effective tool of intervention, not only must it be accompanied by "thoughtful and conflict sensitive planning and frequent adaptation to the current context within which it is operating", but it also needs to be underpinned by robust theory to avoid unintentional harm and to ensure that it is regarded as a legitimate tool of peacebuilding efforts and infrastructure (Coalter, F. (2010). "The politics of sport-for-development: Limited focus programmes and broad gauge problems." *International Review for the Sociology of Sport*, Vol. 45, No. 3, pp. 295-314; Hayhurst, L.M.C. (2009). "The power to shape policy: Charting sport for development and peace policy discourses." *International Journal of Sport Policy*, Vol. 1, No. 2, pp. 203- 227; Kidd, B. (2008). "A new social movement: Sport for development and peace." *Sport in Society*, Vol. 11, No. 4, pp. 370-380; Levermore, R. (2008). "Sport in international development: Time to treat is seriously?" *The Brown Journal of Sports Affairs*, Vol. XIV, No. 2, pp. 55- 66). "Theory legitimises the field, links us to other fields and informs systematic planning and/or creates blueprints

that can be implemented and measured over time." (p. 43). The report goes on to discuss a Sport for Development theory outline comprising the five components of impacts assessment, organisational, sports/physical activity, educational and cultural enrichment (pp. 48-49).

The other more recent report is Yusuf, S. and Voss, S.J. (2018). "The Generations for Peace Institute Compendium of Participatory Indicators of Peace" (Generations for Peace Institute). This captures the key indicators developed and used by volunteers in 27 countries (in Asia, Africa and Europe) between 2014-2017 to decide on the focus of their programme, then develop, measure and evaluate its successes and weaknesses of programming (p. 2), which may be transferable to other contexts. As the report states, this compendium of indicators is useful for three principal reasons: (1) to show that participatory indicator development is possible across a wide variety of conflict contexts; (2) to demonstrate that investments in technical capacity building with local communities yield meaningful results; and (3) to spark measurement ideas for other community members engaged in designing and evaluating their own processes of social change (p. 4).

The compendium of indicators is considered to be distinguishable from others in that it was developed through a participatory approach, are developed through a community-led process, and are practical in nature (i.e., tried and tested in relation to real issues in conflict zones). (pp. 4-5). Generally, the indicators fell into four categories: changes in conception of self; changes in knowledge, beliefs and attitudes; changes in behaviour and practices; and changes in community structures (pp. 7-8).

3.5   Ismail, O. (2018). "Youth, Peace and Security in Kenya."[80]

This paper assessed youth-led peacebuilding interventions in conflict-affected communities in Kenya, specifically "the activities, tools and instruments used by youth to engage in, and contribute to peace and security in Kenya" (p. 2). A key sought goal of the report was to demonstrate the overall positive interventions of youth in order to redress the generally inaccurate perception created by Kenya's political history which "generally portrays [youth] as the energy behind political protests, inter-group clashes, and violent extremism; however much of this overshadows or overlooks their comparatively important roles and contributions to peacebuilding" (p. 10). The little research previously undertaken about youth tended to incorrectly dichotomise them into such stereotypical roles (p.10). Such sentiments are echoed elsewhere, such as in Plan International's submission to YPS Missing Piece study, which observed that "[w]e need to recognize that youth are already addressing fragility and building peace, as well as invest in youth agency, and in understanding their existing responses to fragility in order to support and build on their actions" (p. 3).

Ismail's research focused on creative/industry activities which include arts and culture (music, dance, and film), sports (football and athletics) and technology (p. 2).[81] In common with other African nations, in Kenya many youth policies and youth development activities are founded upon sports, volunteerism, and service to country - creating a youth-sport nexus - with sport-related activities and games often being used as a vehicle for reaching young people,

---

[80] Available at https://www.youth4peace.info/system/files/2018-04/7.%20CFR_Kenya_Wale_0.pdf (accessed 14 November 2018). Similarly see, e.g., Civil Society Platform for Peacebuilding and Statebuilding and Youth, Peace and Security (Ekpon, T.) (2017). "The Role of Young People in Preventing Violent Extremism in the Lake Chad Basin", available at https://www.youth4peace.info/system/files/2018-04/12.%20TP_The%20Role%20of%20Young%20People%20in%20Preventing%20Violent%20Extremism%20in%20the%20Lake%20Chad%20Basin_CSPPS.pdf (accessed 14 November 2018). Also, Search for Common Ground (2017). " 'Aaba Hamro Paalo' (It's Our Time Now): Youth experiences of conflict, violence and peacebuilding in Nepal", available at https://www.youth4peace.info/system/files/2018-04/9.%20CFR_Nepal_SFCG%20%28FINAL%29_0.pdf (accessed 14 November 2018), which notes that "young people are experts of their own experiences and local realities. They are motivated and able to make a positive difference" (p. 6).

[81] See too, e.g., Jennings, P. (2017). "Young People on the Move and their engagement in Peace & Security: Case Study from the North of Central America and South Sudan." (UNHCR), available at https://www.youth4peace.info/system/files/2018-04/7.%20TP_Young%20People%20on%20the%20move_UNHCR.pdf (accessed 14 December 2018). It identifies and analyses common youth 'dividers' (sources of tension for youth, e.g. peer pressure to participate in violence) and 'connectors' (potential mechanisms for peace for youth, e.g. cultural expressions such as music, dance, theatre, storytelling and poetry). The relationships between these dividers and connectors were then critiqued through the lens of youth resilience (individually, as well as in family, community and broader citizenship contexts) in order to identify "factors contributing to or inhibiting young people's ability to engage proactively on peace and security" (pp. 8-9).

especially male youth. Notably, "[a]ctivities such as football (soccer) and athletics' serve as centripetal forces for creating youth ensembles, and through which many young Kenyans access and contribute to peace and security initiatives" (p. 45).[82]

In terms of methodology, the assessment adopted a qualitative approach coupled with empirical examination of concrete case-studies based on a theme-based approach critiquing "the crucial role and contribution of young people to preventing violence, responding to violence and rebuilding peace, and informed contributions to the security and stability of communities, countries and world at large" (p. 2). It drew also upon academic scholarship, open source materials (e.g., websites, publicly available reports), and undertook interviews (pp. 1-2). Regarding grassroots programmes, including sports-related ones, the report only surveys these briefly with no in-depth discussion or analysis of their effectiveness (pp. 15-20). The report concluded overall that youth have sufficient opportunities to actively engage in peacebuilding activities, with "evidence of agency and creativity in how young people have leveraged their talents to advocate for good governance, and build social cohesion in communities" (p. 25), whilst recognising too the significant challenges that they face in this regard (pp. 25-27) including financial under-resourcing and the "dearth of research and analytical frameworks on youth, peace and security" (pp. 26-27).

With respect to the potential impact of such projects, some interesting observations are made in relation to another programme, Interpeace (2018). Youth Speak Out! Participatory analysis of their engagement for peace and security in Côte d'Ivoire.[83] Concluding that leisure activities (such as football tournaments, theatre groups) do not necessarily automatically break down barriers, a number of recommendations were made aimed at increasing the effectiveness of such programmes in terms of their contribution to peace and security. One recommendation was that specific objectives for transformation be identified through posing and answering key questions regarding the target audience (such as conflicting parties) and

---

[82] See too Inter-American Commission on Human Rights, (2016). "Violence, Children and Organised Crime", available at http://www.oas.org/en/iachr/reports/pdfs/ViolenceChildren2016.pdf, which advises that targeted youth be engaged fully in the design and implementation of programmes in order to improve their likely impact, as well as selecting entry-point intervention activities framed around the interests of the targeted youth such as sport, music, theatre and dance, citing the success of the Youth Peace Builders initiative in Columbia.
[83] Available at https://www.interpeace.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/03/2017-Cote_dIvoire-Youth_Peace__Security-Eng-WEB-v7-1.pdf (accessed 14 November 2018).

the kind of reconciliation being sought (e.g., to create a space for dialogue, create relationships). "Taking into account the answers to these questions, a football tournament or any other activity can actually be used to contribute to consolidating peace and preventing violence" (p. 60).

3.6 Mercy Corps (2018). "Reformed Warriors: A Case Study from Uganda."[84]

This report detailed Mercy Corps' research findings regarding how Uganda was making a positive transition towards peace in the Karamoja sub-region of Northern Uganda. This area had been impacted significantly by conflict, inter-ethnic and intra-ethnic divides and the Lord's Resistance Army. Part of the research focused on the role of youth in peacebuilding within their communities, in particular that of 'reformed warriors" (youth who were former perpetrators of violence, had handed in their weapons and had reintegrated into their communities) a number of whom have become ambassadors for peace (p. 1).

Of interest here, some reformed warriors participate in Sports for Peace groups with other youth, which brings them together several times per week within a community. Additionally, Sports for Peace groups from different communities (e.g., monthly) meet periodically to play sport, commencing with dialogue and information sharing between the youth drawn together, creating an "opportunity to talk and listen to each other in groups" including on issues of peace (p. 9). In terms of the impact of these activities, it has been observed that "not only do they form bonds, but some youth even bring back messages and learning opportunities from their visits with others. These build trust with the community, strengthen bonds and social groups, and ultimately reaffirm a reformed warrior's path towards peace". That said, there was no discussion in the report as to how such impact was assessed, including in terms of an identifiable methodology or indicators (p. 9).

3.7 Somali Youth Development Foundation.[85]

On a much smaller scale are grassroots initiatives aimed at peace and security building, of which the Somali Youth Development Foundation (SYDF) is illustrative. The SYDF is a local

---

[84] Available at https://www.youth4peace.info/system/files/2018-04/13.%20CFRUganda%20-%20 Reformed%20Warriors%20in%20Uganda_Mercycorps_0.pdf (accessed 14 November 2018).
[85] Available at http://sydf.org/?page_id=40 (accessed 14 November 2018).

NGO launched in 2007 by youth for youth. The largest youth alliance in Somalia, it seeks to "promot[e] social harmony between the different communities [to] lessen the incidents of fighting and create a more peaceful Somalia". It aims to contextualise its activities to local youth needs and goals. Such activities have included sports and culture with the goal of youth integration. For example, "SYDF has launched sports competitions in Balad Hawo town with the main aim of discouraging the young generation to involve violence and inter-community conflicts as well as to encourage the youth to enhance peace co-existence", such as organising one-off sporting events. Despite its stated objective of taking "measurable action" no real evidence of this could be found on its website, such as any reports assessing impact. This is unsurprising since the reality for many grassroots organisations, including those run by youth, is that they are unlikely to have the necessary capacity, funding or institutional support to carry out detailed impact analysis of their initiatives. That, however, is not synonymous with their effectiveness in practice, rather that this may be difficult to assess and understand.

4.   Inter-cultural Dialogue and Engagement Programmes

One context in which sport features prominently at present in relation to strengthening inter-cultural understanding is that of mass migration, including as a tool to integrate migrants and asylum-seekers within local communities.[86] Over 40 such programmes were looked at on the Council of Europe's sport migrant integration platform,[87] with varying levels of detail

---

[86] See further, e.g., UNHCR (2017). "Focus Group on Integration: Final Report" (UNHCR). Sport, as with cultural and other recreational activities, is regarded as a participatory activity (rather than as a sports-based intervention per se) which UNHCR recommends is run in addition to basic courses such as language learning, (p. 14); furthermore that sports, cultural and volunteer associations be more involved in policies supporting the integration of refugees as part of building social networks between refugees and local citizens (p. 28, in relation to Italy, but of wider applicability) even where their activities do not have a specific education role (p. 29). Additionally, UNHCR has been supportive of various initiatives, such as sports activities as part of UN World Refugee Day (https://sportinclusion.net/football-refugee-day/, accessed 2 December 2018), as well as other sports events (see, e.g., UNHCR Factsheet on Greece (May 2017), available at https://reliefweb.int/sites/reliefweb.int/files/resources/58264.pdf (accessed 2 December 2018).

[87] Available at https://www.coe.int/en/web/sport-migrant-integration-directory (accessed 14 November 2018). See too, e.g., OECD (2018). "Working Together for Local Integration of Migrants and Refugees" (Paris, OECD) which identifies a number of integration initiatives involving sport in several European cities. See to the European Sport Inclusion Network's Promoting Equal Opportunities of Migrants and Minorities through Volunteering in Sport Clubs and Organisations programme, including its "Handbook on Volunteering of Migrants in Sports" (2016).

including in terms of sought goals or measured impact. This is unsurprisingly, since many of the listed projects are grassroots or more local in nature.[88]

The general paucity of evidence-based research on the impact of sports-based initiatives in this context is, however, starting to reverse due to the increase in significantly funded projects in response to the recent migration crisis – such as by the European Union[89] - requiring robust evidence-bases, methodology and so forth to be developed. One such project is the ASPIRE - Activity, Sport and Play for the Inclusion of Refugees in Europe[90] - project which "seeks to find out how to best support migrants and refugees, building on the wide popularity of sports and other forms of physical activity". This is a 30-month project due to complete on 30 June 2019. Whilst it has yet to publish its overall findings, notable here is the rapid literature review that was undertaken at its outset in order to ensure that its selected project methodology was evidence-based, including on the potential of sports programmes to positively assist in the better integration of immigrants into new social contexts. Though the literature review's findings are not repeated here,[91] it is interesting to observe, in terms of recurring trends across the current desk review, that relatively few materials were found relating directly to issues of sport and youth, together with cross-cutting themes such as community integration.[92] A primary ASPIRE project objective is to increase knowledge and the evidence-base of working with vulnerable people, thereby enabling "sports organisations to offer

---

[88] E.g., the Bike Project in London, regarding which only limited qualitative data is available regarding the number of beneficiaries of bikes, https://cdn.shopify.com/s/files/1/0815/1355/files/FINAL_Impact_Report_ 2017.pdf (accessed 14 November 2018).

[89] See, e.g., Ecorys (2016), "Mapping of good practices relating to social inclusion of migrants through sport: Final report to the DG Education and Culture of the European Commission" (Luxembourg: European Union), available at https://www.sportanddev.org/sites/default/files/downloads/mapping_of_good_practices_ relating_to_social_inclusion_of_migrants_through_sport.pdf (accessed 14 December 2018).

[90] Available at www.aspiresport.eu (accessed 14 November 2018).

[91] ASPIRE Literature Review Findings (2017). ICSSPE, available at https://www.aspiresport.eu/documents/ ASPIRE% 20Findings.pdf (accessed 14 November 2018).

[92] The principal ones found were: Jeanes, R., et al. (2015). "Sport and the resettlement of young people from refugee backgrounds in Australia." *Journal of Sport and Social Issues*, vol. 39, issue 6, pp. 480-500; Amara, M., et al. (2005). "The roles of sport and education in the social inclusion of asylum seekers and refugees: An evaluation of policy and practice in the UK." Loughborough: Institute of Sport and Leisure Policy, Loughborough University and Stirling University; Whitley, M.A., et al. (2016). "Evaluation of a sport-based youth development programme for refugees." *Leisure/Loisir*, vol. 40, issue 2, pp. 175-199; Spaaij, R. (2015). "Refugee youth, belonging and community sport." *Leisure Studies*, vol. 34, issue 3, pp. 303-318; Stone, C. (2017). "Utopian community football? Sport, hope and belongingness in the lives of refugees and asylum seekers." *Leisure Studies*, 1-13. See too AISTS and UNHCR (2014), "Implementing Sports in Refugee Camps" (Lausanne), available at https://www.sportanddev.org/sites/default/files/downloads/aists_msa_tp_2013___ unhcr.pdf (accessed 14 December 2018).

suitable participation opportunities for refugees with the help of innovative educational approaches" as well as further intercultural understanding and dialogue.

Outside of the migration context, sport is often used too as a means of achieving broader goals, such as bridging cultural divides. An example is Outward Bound Peacebuilding,[93] which aims to transform participants' negative world views of difference (ideology, identity, religion, ethnicity, needs and values) - which commonly feature as root causes of violent conflict – into positive ones which may subsequently impacts communities and their engagement with other ones. In terms of its theory of change, "Outward Bound Peacebuilding pursues two strategies to build relationships across divided communities and contribute to lasting peace", namely "experiential learning" and "investing in local leaders who are best positioned to understand and solve the conflicts in their communities". One example is its Palestinian and Israeli emerging leaders programme. It refers to the existence of substantial evidence "that certain types of experience, particularly cooperative learning toward the mastery of critical life skills and sharing a peak life experience, while embedded in groups, are especially likely to promote group solidarity". Once again, no evidence-based analysis or detailed methodology could be located on its website.

5.   Gender-Sensitive Approaches

The importance of adopting a gender-sensitive approach to CVE/PVE programme design and implementation, including those initiatives that are sports-based and youth orientated, has been identified, yet is not always reflected in practice. As the UNESCO PVE Policy Guide (2017) states: "Violent extremism is indisputably a gendered phenomenon. ….. Given the prevailing specificities of women's and men's experience, all prevention efforts should integrate a gender perspective when dealing with learners at risk. This can include addressing the gendered dimensions of the drivers of violent extremism" (p. 43). In parallel, there should be ongoing efforts to promote gender equality and women's empowerment (p. 30).[94]

---

[93] See further https://outwardboundpeace.org/what-we-do/the-result (accessed 14 November 2018).
[94] Similarly see, e.g., International Alert/UNDP PVE Toolkit (2018), p. 51 regarding the importance of gender dynamics being embedded within vulnerability and resilience factors.

In Youth Women in Peace and Security, (2018). "At the Intersection of the YPS and WPS Agendas",[95] a desk review was undertaken by UN Women of available literature on the roles of young women within peace and security contexts, as well as key lessons learnt regarding the implementation of the United Nations Security Council Resolution 1325 on Women, Peace and Security (2000). In particular, the paper suggested that "[y]oung women's perspectives on and actions in support of violent extremist groups, as well as their agency in prevention and de-radicalization should be recognized and consistently considered. Moreover, there is a pressing need for states and international organisations and partners to allocate sufficient resources to ensure that gender is integrated into national policies and programmes addressing terrorism, including programmes focusing on young people" (p. 21). To this end, it makes a number of recommendations (p. 26). In particular, it argues for the implementation of a monitoring process which "establish[es] strong, well-defined, and measurable indicators of UNSCR 2250 that align with UNSCR 1325 and SDG indicators" due to the complementary aims of the Youth, Peace and Security, Women, Peace and Security, and Sustainable Development Goals. It further recommends the establishment and broadening of the existing knowledge base through further qualitative and quantitative data, and the establishment of an online repository of such data, good practices and case studies.

In terms of pursuing impactful intervention programmes, it is crucial that gender dynamics be correctly factored in and that (potentially discriminatory) counter-productive, yet prevalent, stereotypes be avoided. As the YPS Missing Piece study found, "[g]ender issues were viewed by young people as central to peace. ….. The view of gender as synonymous with young women and of youth as synonymous with young men has contributed to the victimisation of young women, and sexual and gender minorities. It has also made less visible issues related to masculinities" (p. xiii). Certainly, as was recognised in General Assembly Resolution 71/160 'Sport as a means to promote education, health, development and peace' (A/RES/71/160 (2016)), sport and physical education policies and programmes have the potential "to advance gender equality and the empowerment of women and girls" (para. 7).

---

[95] Available at https://www.youth4peace.info/system/files/2018-10/UNWOMEN_YPS.pdf (accessed 14 November 2018).

One issue of broad applicability, both within and out with PVE and sports-based contexts, relates to cultural considerations as an integral aspect of gender-sensitive approaches. Such themes are explored in Alamri, A.A. (2013). "Participation of Muslim Female Students in Sporting Activities in Australian Public High Schools: The Impact of Religion." *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs*, vol. 33, issue 3, pp. 418-429. The author used interviews and narrative analysis to examine how Muslim students perceived physical education. From a sample of young females, this paper argued that Muslims often experience feelings of alienation due to different, less stringent, modesty requirements in Western schools. Alamri noted that, for Muslim females, participation in physical activity often presented cross-cultural difficulties and created discomfort for both students and staff. The author argued that for integration to be successful more inter-cultural education was needed; particularly adjustments to meet the requirements of the Islamic Faith. Muslim visibility in sport facilitates a socially inclusive environment, as well as being beneficial for the individual's physical and mental well-being. A paper by Kuppinger (2015) (Kuppinger. P. (2015). "Pools, Piety, and Participation: A Muslim Women's Sports Club and Urban Citizenship in Germany." *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs*, vol. 35, issue 2, pp. 264-279) argued a similar point, focusing on swimming sessions at a German sports club. The author posited that by making some adjustments for female Muslims of diverse age, class and educational backgrounds, it allowed them to form friendships and, together, become visible and valued members of the club. (As summarised in Richardson, C. et al, above, p. 38).

In response to the growing recognition of the need, at least in some circumstances, to take additional steps in order to better facilitate the participation of girls in sport-based activities, a number of organisations have developed some programmes aimed specifically at girls and women. For example, Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) previously ran dedicated projects in Namibia and Afghanistan. In Namibia, where girls and young women often have limited social advancement opportunities, and are commonly exposed to extreme violence,[96] the programme aimed to develop their core life skills through sports teaching

---

[96] See too the work of organisations like Saferworld which operate in such areas as Central Asia, partnering with local organisations, e.g., Women Peace Bank Foundation in Kyrgyzstan, aiming to reduce the incidences of domestic violence committed against women, together with initiatives that promote gender equality, challenge harmful stereotypes and empower youth and women. See further https://www.saferworld.org.uk/kyrgyzstan/kyrgyzstan (accessed 14 December 2018). There are transferable lessons learnt, including on gender engagement in culturally more challenging contexts.

programmes, such as teaching "measures to prevent violence, boost their self-confidence and strengthen their bodies". Furthermore, sport was used to faciliate other educational and training interventions, normally unavailable to girls, to increase their employment prospects.[97] The initiative in Afghanistan sought to increase the opportunities for women to engage in regular physical activity, especially through the development and training of more female teachers able to teach sports in schools in order to respond to local cultural sensitivities whereby girls could play certain sports, such as football and volleyball, if taught by a female coach.[98]

The need for the training of more female coaches to enable the increased participation of girls in sport (and therefore also to access other forms of interventions facilitated by them) was highlighted too in a recent Laureus Sport for Good Foundation report as an issue of broader concern. Notably, "[t]he review found that very few organizations in the Laureus grantee network, reported on gender-related outcomes. Additionally, there was limited information on how organizations create opportunities for girls in sport, achieve an equitable gender balance within their organization, and develop pathways for female leadership." Therefore, the report made a number of recommendations regarding how organisations might better prioritise the empowerment of girls and young women, including through: "creating opportunities for girls to become leaders, enabling mentorship between girls and women, and employing female leadership and role models in different ways".[99]

---

[97] GIZ, "Strengthening the position of girls and women in Namibia in and through sport (mid 2013-2015)", available at https://www.giz.de/expertise/html/9915.html (accessed 14 December 2018).

[98] GIZ, "Promoting girls and young women through sport and sports coaching in schools (Afghanistan) (end 2013-end of 2015)", available at https://www.giz.de/expertise/html/9915.html (accessed 14 December 2018).

[99] Laureus Sport for Good Foundation (2018). "Empowering Young Girls and Women through Sport for Development: Executive Summary", p. 3, available https://www.sportanddev.org/sites/default/files/downloads/ sportforgoodreport.pdf (accessed 14 December 2018).

6.   Conclusion

In concluding, the discussion here returns to the two principal research objectives identified at the outset of this desk review (section 1.3) to consider the key findings and recurring themes in relation to each of them.

The first research objective was to map existing PVE through sports initiatives. Many programmes exist globally which use sport as a tool of crime prevention or to build social bridges, especially within Europe, Africa, Latin and North America, and, to a more limited extent, within the Middle East.

Generally, most of the sports-based activities considered were social development in nature, seeking longer term sustained impact, rather than being primarily diversion-based interventions with the objective of, e.g., preventing criminal activities in the short term. Consequently, many of the programmes considered utilized sport-based activities which were intended to facilitate other educational, vocational and mentoring activities and opportunities, as well as addressing social needs such as housing – i.e. they were 'sport plus' programmes where developmental activities complemented diversion-based ones. Indeed, there is evidence to suggest that these combined approaches were among the most effective and impactful, including in terms of their longer-term impact. As the Laureus Foundation Teenage Kicks report concluded, it is most unlikely that sports activities alone would have been so impactful in terms of significant and sustained crime reduction, including on days that the programme was not running.

Other programmes, such as 'More than a Game' (Grossman, et al., 2014) which combined sport with mentoring, similarly found that sports-based programmes can assist with nurturing core life skills in young at-risk people - such as confidence, self-esteem, self-discipline and self-control, teamwork, breaking down cultural stereotypes – which are transferable to other contexts such as conflict avoidance. That said, no firm conclusions could be made regarding the PVE effectiveness of sports-based programmes.[100] Nor, as Fight for Peace's Maré United

---

[100] Another example is the energetic and innovative work of Ryu Dan Jojo which runs PVE orientated programmes in Trinidad and Tobago. It uses sports-based initiatives, especially martial arts and self-defence training, as a facilitator for other educational, life skills training and entrepreneurship interventions, with parallel engagement with the parents of participating children. Whilst positively impactful within the local community,

programme demonstrates, may other broader goals, such as breaking down community barriers, always be achievable.[101]

This finding was reflective of much of the literature and programmes surveyed, namely that sports-based activities are likely to be more effective when associated with other activities, such as education, training, employment, volunteering, etc. This finding is succinctly captured by the Public Safety Canada research report in the following terms: "Although some diversion-oriented sports-based programs have worked, programs are most likely to be successful as crime prevention initiatives when combined with strategies or mentoring that address issues of social and personal development" (Ehsani, M., et al. (2012). "The Influence of Sport and Recreation upon Crime Reduction: A Literature Review." *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, Vol. 2, No. 6, pp. 98-104; Ekholm, D. (2013). "Sport and crime prevention: Individuality and transferability in research." *Journal of Sport for Development*, Vol. 1, No. 2, pp. 1-12; Gardner, B. (2013). *Sport in Society* June 2013; Mulholland, E. (2008). "What Sport Can Do – A True Sport Report." Ottowa, Ontario: *Canadian Centre for Ethics in Sport*; Cameron, M., and MacDougall, C.J. (2000). "Crime prevention through sport and physical activity." *Trends & issues in crime and criminal justice*, No. 165, Australian Institute of Criminology (AIC); Makkai, T., et al. (2003). "Sport, physical activity and antisocial behaviour in youth." *Trends & issues in crime and criminal justice,* No. 249, Australian Institute of Criminology (AIC); McKiernan, A. (2016). "Youth Sport Programs that Address Substance Use — An Environmental Scan." Ottawa, Ontario: Canadian Centre on Substance Abuse; Nichols, G. (2007). *Sport and Crime Reduction. The Role of Sports in Tackling Youth Crime*. Routledge, Great Britain), as the beneficial links between sports and crime prevention are more apparent in programs aimed at enhancing protective factors and mitigating risk factors (Taylor et al., 2015)."[102]

It became quickly evident, however, that the literature available on PVE activities using sports – whether as a sports-based PVE tool, or as an entry point for other PVE orientated activities

---

as with other PVE orientated sports-based programmes, the exact linkages between these interventions and sought PVE outcomes is unclear.

[101] This is, however, possible, as illustrated in Mercy Corp (2018). "Reformed Warriors: A Case Study from Uganda".

[102] Public Safety Canada (2017). Research Highlights - Crime Prevention, Sports-Based Crime Prevention Programs (2017-H03-CP), p. 9.

– is very limited. Most available research and resultant literature have arisen in the course of projects receiving significant governmental or intergovernmental funding, with external evaluations being carried out by the private sector or NGOs. Therein lies one important explanation for the paucity of related literature, namely that historically there has been only limited funding for sports-based PVE and youth crime prevention programmes, a recurring theme of materials examined during this desk review.[103] The situation is exacerbated by the fact that sports-based activities are generally targeted at youth which has similarly been an area receiving only limited high-level attention and therefore funding, especially prior to the adoption of Security Council Resolution 2250 (2015). As one commentator observed, "limited data yields limited knowledge, and the existing data on youth, peace and security is indeed limited".[104]

The situation is compounded further by the fact, as was discussed in the Ponsot et al., article, that significant gaps exist more generally within PVE related scholarship, which has tended to focus on such issues as why an individual becomes radicalised rather than on the effectiveness of interventions or tools to prevent radicalisation. At least some of these gaps will be attributable to researchers understandably following available funding trails, which in turn are determined by the policies and strategies of key stakeholders which may not always be fully or accurately informed due to the paucity of accurate, quality data, thereby perpetuating existing weaknesses and challenges unless the current cycle is broken. As it was noted, there is likely to be a growing body of literature in the context of youth and mass migration, on such issues as social cohesion and integration, which is attracting more higher-level funding, though this is not expected to significantly impact the key findings made here.

The second research objective was to identify any evidence-base underpinning sports-based initiatives which substantiate claims/beliefs regarding their effectiveness and impact. Though some polarization of views exists regarding the positive impactfulness (or not) of sports-based

---

[103] See, e.g., Götsch, K. (2017). "Austria and the Threats from Islamist Radicalisation and Terrorist Involvement: An Overview of Governmental and Non-Governmental Initiatives and Policies." *Journal For Deradicalization*, vol. 12, pp. 169-191; Ismail, O. (2018). "Youth, Peace and Security in Kenya sects. 2.4 and 3.5 above. It was a recurring theme in many of the other programme related materials consulted.

[104] Institute for Economics & Peace and Youth, Peace and Security (Hagerty, T.) (2017). "Data for Youth, Peace and Security: A summary of research findings from the Institute for Economics & Peace", https://www.youth4peace.info/system/files/2018-04/16.%20TP_Youth%20affected%20by%20violent%20 conflict_IEP.pdf (accessed 14 November 2018).

initiatives,[105] the dominant view from the literature surveyed is that sports-based interventions are beneficial. This is in part explicable by sports' unique qualities as a peace and development tool, captured by Alexander Cárdenas in the following terms: "[T]he universality of sport…Sport is by definition an outstanding communication platform… its capacity to connect peoples and communities effectively….. Sport has the ability to inspire and motivate participants…. sport promotes mental and physical well-being…… Sport is also an educational tool…".[106]

Recurring themes throughout the desk review are captured in these observations by Mercy Corps in its 2018 evaluation of SYLI (see section 3.6). Its study was motivated by the continuing "dearth of evidence regarding violence-reduction approaches", observing that "questions remain about the relative effectiveness of different types of interventions and about the conditions under which some interventions may or may not succeed in reducing violence" (p. 4). There was overall consensus regarding the pressing need for more research and analysis, including to better understand "the push and pull factors that lead to radicalisation especially among youth and to pave the way for a well-informed and organised response that may effectively counter violent extremism".[107] Such evidence gaps are not confined to the PVE or crime/conflict prevention contexts, but are reflective too of similar challenges being experienced in relation to establishing the evidence-base for sports development and other forms of youth development interventions.[108]

---

[105] See especially Hillyer, S.J. et al (2011). Research Report, Sport & Peace: Mapping the Field. Georgetown University M.A. Programme in Conflict Resolution.

[106] Cárdenas, A. (2018). "Expert Group Meeting and Interagency Dialogue on "Strengthening the Global Framework for Leveraging Sport for Development and Peace." United Nations Secretariat, New York (13-14 June 2018), p. 1, illustrated by peace-building programmes in Columbia and in Northern Ireland to build bridges between Protestants and Catholics. A particular area of weakness existed in both contexts in relation to the effective monitoring and evaluation of existing programmes, e.g. which reports largely being narrative rather than evaluative in nature (p. 8).

[107] Search for Common Ground (Bala, A.) (2017). "Bottom-Up Approach to Countering Violent Extremism in Tunisia: Final Evaluation Report", p. 3, available https://www.sfcg.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/07/ Final_External_Evaluation_Report_on_Bottom-Up_Approaches_to_CVE_Project_-_SFCG_Tunisia.pdf (accessed 14 November 2018).

[108] See, e.g., Commonwealth Secretariat and Laureus Sport for Good Foundation, "Sport for Development: The Road to Evidence: A Systematic Review and Comparative Analysis" (2018), available at https://www.sportanddev.org/sites/default/files/downloads/roadtoevidence.pdf (accessed 14 December 2018). The report sought to better understand the evidence base for sport for development and non-sport youth development interventions in relation to community cohesion, education, employment, health and well-being. Finding that many similarities existed between these forms of interventions, "the research team concluded that – both in sport and non-sport interventions – the methodologies used were inadequately described or

Certainly, as was noted earlier in relation to the Laureus Foundation's Teenage Kicks report, methodologically it can be difficult (though still possible as the report demonstrates) to accurately quantify something which has not occurred, such as a crime. Other methodological issues can arise too, such as which aspects of an intervention are measured to gauge 'success' (e.g., positive changes in intermediate variables such as attitudes, behaviours, skills, rather than any final, sustainable impact on crime/violence reduction); the methodological approach used (e.g., one selected to acquire knowledge or one that is funding driven); whether all relevant contextual variables were considered; whether factors or indicators were over-simplified or subjective in nature; the accuracy of data, and so forth. As Holly Collison has observed, "[d]espite its rapid growth, we have limited knowledge of: how the [Sport for Development and Peace - SDP] sector is structured socially and organizationally; and how different kinds of SDP work are planned, implemented, and experienced in diverse cultural contexts. This knowledge is essential if robust policies and practices for the future development of SDP are to be identified."[109]

Further methodological challenges exist in seeking to close the current empirical data gap in the "dynamic and shifting nature of the PVE environment":[110] "This provides a challenge when it comes to understanding whether change has happened because of a programme intervention or because of factors outside of the programme", yet without an accurate baseline, it can be difficult to carry out effective monitoring or evaluations including in terms of identifying risk factors.[111] There is broad consensus among all engaged stakeholders that further granularity of evidence-based data is essential, especially context specific empirical as opposed to conceptual (currently dominant) analysis on such matters as the "spectrum of

developed, which limited the quality and validity of some conclusions. Nonetheless, the research team made clear recommendations to multiple stakeholders on how to work together towards strengthening the evidence base" (p. 3).
[109] Collison, H. (2018). "Strengthening the Global Framework for Leveraging Sport for Development and Peace". Report prepared for the United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (UNDESA) and the Division for Inclusive Social Development (DISD) – who discusses a number of research projects (including of the SDP sector in Kosovo, Jamaica, Sri Lanka, Rwanda and Zambia 2014-2017) aimed at addressing this knowledge deficit.
[110] International Alert/UNDP PVE Toolkit (2018), p. 61.
[111] International Alert/UNDP PVE Toolkit (2018), p. 61.

micro-, meso- and macro-level factors driving violent extremism in Africa", in order to ensure well informed, effective PVE activities in response to a complex and multifaceted threat.[112]

With respect to how the existing evidence-base for effectiveness and impact has been gauged - utilising the PVE toolkits identified earlier (section 1.3) as a benchmark for assessing programme design, implementation and the evaluation methodologies found - the findings fell largely into one of two camps. The first group were those programmes with well-developed methodologies, robust theories of change and so forth which were the exception rather than the rule. This was evident mainly in relation to governmental/intergovernmental funded programmes, implemented by governmental or larger non-governmental actors, where evidence-based outputs, such as project reports, are normally standard outcomes. Most initiatives found during the literature survey (and not discussed in any detail here) involving sports with PVE and/or crime prevention objectives, however, fell into the second group: local grassroots initiatives, often established by youth for youth, with limited resources and capacity, with only broad identifiable goals, no clearly identifiable methodologies or documented assessments of their effectiveness. Yet, the fact that often no robust evidence-base other than an anecdotal one exists for many of these projects is not necessarily synonymous with their impact in practice, only that the true extent of this is unlikely to ever be fully known or understood. It may be beneficial too, in addition to more traditional approaches to monitoring and evaluation, for other innovative evidence-gathering approaches to be developed and utilised in order to better capture the input from such grassroots programmes which form an important element of the overall evidence-base for PVE and crime/conflict reduction efforts. For example, an approach such as PeacePlayers' "Most Significant Change" which is "a monitoring and evaluation methodology that centers on the systematic collection and analysis of stories about change. It is participatory in nature,

---

[112] UNDP Report (2017), pp. 16, 89. See too Collison, H. (2018). "Strengthening the Global Framework for Leveraging Sport for Development and Peace". Report prepared for the United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (UNDESA) and the Division for Inclusive Social Development (DISD) who suggests that "[a] contextual approach to sport-based policy and practice may facilitate alternative and broader thought on the positive impact sport can have for creating relative safety, reducing violence and empowering local populations to lead peaceful lives….. Whilst at the global level the development goals in areas such as peace-building remain stable, they are differentiated, variable and changing at local and national levels." (p. 6).

with program stakeholders determining which types of changes should be discussed and analyzed".[113]

One final observation relates to an overarching finding of the desk review regarding the degree of commonality – in terms of approaches, methodologies, sought outcomes, risk and protective factors, etc – that exists between the different sectors considered. This is the case not only between PVE and crime and violence prevention, but also between PVE and sports development programmes, with sports-based interventions offering a common platform including in terms of the universality of its language. As such, it is possible that further cross-pollination and mutual sharing of methodologies, good practices, research, evaluations, etc could go some way towards closing the current evidence gap and further strengthening current approaches, especially within the PVE space. That said, some gaps would still remain since the conceptual and institutional differences existing between PVE and crime and violence, as well as between PVE and sports development programmes are such that they need to retain their separate and distinct identities as well as some methodologies. This further points to the necessity of dedicated and targeted efforts to strengthen the current evidence-base regarding linkages between sports-based interventions and sought PVE outcomes.[114]

---

[113] PeacePlayers, "The Choice of Peace: PeacePlayers International Most Significant Change Stories" (December 2017), p. 6, available at https://www.peaceplayers.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/02/PeacePlayers-Most-Significant-Change-Stories-2017-3.pdf (accessed 14 December 2018).
[114] Initiatives, such as the research focus of the recently established Swedish Center for Preventing Violent Extremism – a primary objective of which is to "[c]ollect and disseminate knowledge, based on research and proven experience, regarding prevention of violent extremism, and work towards knowledge-based practices" – will go some way to assisting here. See further https://www.cve.se/in-english.html (accessed 14 December 2018).

Bibliography

Academic Scholarship and Reports

AISTS and UNHCR. (2014). "Implementing Sports in Refugee Camps" (Lausanne: UNHCR).

Alamri, A.A. (2013). "Participation of Muslim Female Students in Sporting Activities in Australian Public High Schools: The Impact of Religion." *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs*, vol. 33, issue 3, pp. 418-429.

Amara, M., et al. (2005). "The roles of sport and education in the social inclusion of asylum seekers and refugees: An evaluation of policy and practice in the UK." Loughborough: Institute of Sport and Leisure Policy, Loughborough University and Stirling University.

ASPIRE Literature Review Findings (2017). ICSSPE.

Barkindo, A. and Bryans, S. (2016). "De-Radicalising Prisoners in Nigeria: Developing a Basic Prison Based De-Radicalisation Programme." *Journal For Deradicalization*, vol. 7, pp. 1-25.

Bjørgo, T. and Horgan, J. (2009). 'Conclusions', in Tore Bjørgo and John Horgan (Eds.), *Leaving Terrorism Behind: Individual and Collective Disengagement.* London: Routledge.

Butti, E. (2017). "Involving Non-Organised 'Outcast' Youths in Peacebuilding: Existing Challenges and Lessons Learned in the Columbian Case.

Cameron, M., and MacDougall, C.J. (2000). "Crime prevention through sport and physical activity." *Trends & issues in crime and criminal justice*, No. 165, Australian Institute of Criminology (AIC).

Cárdenas, A. (2018). "Expert Group Meeting and Interagency Dialogue on "Strengthening the Global Framework for Leveraging Sport for Development and Peace." United Nations Secretariat, New York (13-14 June 2018).

Civil Society Platform for Peacebuilding and Statebuilding and Youth, Peace and Security (Ekpon, T.) (2017). "The Role of Young People in Preventing Violent Extremism in the Lake Chad Basin".

Coalter, F. (2010). "The politics of sport-for-development: Limited focus programmes and broad gauge problems." *International Review for the Sociology of Sport*, Vol. 45, No. 3, pp. 295-314.

Collison, H. (2018). "Strengthening the Global Framework for Leveraging Sport for Development and Peace". Report prepared for the United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (UNDESA) and the Division for Inclusive Social Development (DISD).

Collison, H., and Marchesseault, D. (2018). "Finding the missing voices of Sport for Development and Peace (SDP): using a 'Participatory Social Interaction Research'methodology and anthropological perspectives within African developing countries." *Sport in Society*, vol. 21, issue 2, pp. 226-242.

Collison, H., et al. (Eds.) (2018). *Routledge Handbook of Sport for Development and Peace*. London: Routledge.

Commonwealth Secretariat and Laureus Sport for Good Foundation. (2018). "Sport for Development: The Road to Evidence: A Systematic Review and Comparative Analysis."

Ecorys. (2016). "Mapping of good practices relating to social inclusion of migrants through sport: Final report to the DG Education and Culture of the European Commission." (Luxembourg: European Union),

Ehsani, M., et al. (2012). "The Influence of Sport and Recreation upon Crime Reduction: A Literature Review." *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, Vol. 2, No. 6, pp. 98-104.

Ekholm, D. (2013). "Sport and crime prevention: Individuality and transferability in research." *Journal of Sport for Development*, Vol. 1, No. 2, pp. 1-12.

Ekholt, D. (2013). "Sport and crime prevention: Individuality and transferability in research." *Journal of Sport for Development*, Vol. 1, No. 2, pp. 1-12.

European Sport Inclusion Network's Promoting Equal Opportunities of Migrants and Minorities through Volunteering in Sport Clubs and Organisations programme, including its "Handbook on Volunteering of Migrants in Sports" (2016).

Farrington, D.P. and Welsh, B.C. (2007). *Saving Children from a Life of Crime: Early Risk Factors and Effective Interventions*. New York.

Feve, S. and Elshimi, M. (June 2018). "Planning for Prevention: A Framework to Develop and Evaluate National Action Plans to Prevent and Counter Violent Extremism." Washington, DC: Global Center on Cooperative Security.

Freire, P. (2009) *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. New York: Continuum.

Gardner, B. (2013). *Sport in Society* June 2013; Mulholland, E. (2008). "What Sport Can Do – A True Sport Report." Ottowa, Ontario: *Canadian Centre for Ethics in Sport*.

Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ), "Strengthening the position of girls and women in Namibia in and through sport (mid 2013-2015)."

Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ), "Promoting girls and young women through sport and sports coaching in schools (Afghanistan) (end 2013-end of 2015)."

Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ), "Sport for Development Resource Toolkit".

Goldmann, Nina (2016). Deradikalisierung durch Kampfsport und Religion, religion.ORF (15 July 2016).

Götsch, K. (2017). "Austria and the Threats from Islamist Radicalisation and Terrorist Involvement: An Overview of Governmental and Non-Governmental Initiatives and Policies." *Journal For Deradicalization*, vol. 12, pp. 169-191.

Hall, N. (2011). " "Give it everything you got": Resilience for young males through sport." *International Journal of Men's Health*, vol. 10, issue 1, pp. 65-81.

Hasselgård, A. (2015) "Norwegian Sports Aid: Exploring the Norwegian 'Sport for Development and Peace' Discourse." *Forum for Development Studies*, vol. 42, issue 1, pp. 1-25.

Hayhurst, L.M.C. (2009). "The power to shape policy: Charting sport for development and peace policy discourses." *International Journal of Sport Policy*, Vol. 1, No. 2, pp. 203- 227.

Hermens, N., et al (2017). "A Systematic Review of Life Skill Development Through Sports Programs Serving Socially Vulnerable Youth." *Research Quarterly for Exercise and Sport*, vol. 88, issue 4, pp. 408-424.

Hillyer, S.J. et al (2011). *Research Report, Sport & Peace: Mapping the Field*. Georgetown University M.A. Programme in Conflict Resolution.

Human Security Collective (2018). "Community-Based Preventive and Remedial Measures to Prevent Violent Extremism: A Human Security Approach to Help Transform Conflicts, Improve Social Cohesion and Improve Local Security." *International Annals of Criminology* Vol. 56, pp. 198–219.

Inter-American Commission on Human Rights (2015). "Violence, Children and Organised Crime." (IACHR), available at http://www.oas.org/en/iachr/reports/pdfs/ViolenceChildren 2016.pdf (accessed 14 December 2018).

Ismail, O. (2018). "Youth, Peace and Security in Kenya".

Institute for Economics & Peace and Youth, Peace and Security (Hagerty, T.) (2017). "Data for Youth, Peace and Security: A summary of research findings from the Institute for Economics & Peace".

International Centre for the Prevention of Crime (2017). "The Prevention of Radicalization Leading to Violence: An International Study of Front-Line Workers and Intervention Issues." Montreal, Canada: International Centre for the Prevention of Crime.

Interpeace (2018). "Youth Speak Out! Participatory analysis of their engagement for peace and security in Côte d'Ivoire".

Jeanes, R., et al. (2015). "Sport and the resettlement of young people from refugee backgrounds in Australia." *Journal of Sport and Social Issues*, vol. 39, issue 6, pp. 480-500.

Jennings, P. (2017). "Young People on the Move and their engagement in Peace & Security: Case Study from the North of Central America and South Sudan." (UNHCR).

Johns, A., Grossman, M. and McDonald, K. (2014). "'More Than Game': The Impact of Sport-Based Youth Mentoring Schemes on Developing Resilience toward Violent Extremism." *Social Inclusion,* vol. 2, issue 2, pp. 57-70.

Jones, G.J., et al. (2017). "An integrative review of sport-based youth development literature." *Sport in Society*, vol. 20, issue 1, pp. 161-179.

Kelly, L. (2013). "Sports-based Interventions and the Local Governance of Youth Crime and Antisocial Behavior." *Journal of Sport and Social Issues*, vol. 37, issue 3, pp. 261-283.

Khalil, J. and Zeuthen, M. (2014). "A Case Study of Counter Violent Extremism (CVE) Programming: Lessons from OTI's Kenya Transition Initiative." *Stability: International Journal of Security and Development*, vol. 3, issue 1, p. Art. 31.

Khan, R.R. and Peracja, F. (2017). "Deradicalizing, Rehabilitating, and Reintegrating Violent Extremists." *USIP Peacebrief* 238.

Kidd, B. (2008). "A new social movement: Sport for development and peace." *Sport in Society*, Vol. 11, No. 4, pp. 370-380.

Krause, M. (2014). *The Good Project: Humanitarian Relief NGOs and the Fragmentation of Reason*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Kuppinger. P. (2015). "Pools, Piety, and Participation: A Muslim Women's Sports Club and Urban Citizenship in Germany." *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs*, vol. 35, issue 2, pp. 264-279.

Laureus Sport for Good Foundation (2009). Breaking the Cycle of Violence.

Laureus Sport for Good Foundation (2011). Teenage Kicks: The Value of Sport in Tackling Youth Crime.

Laureus Sport for Good (2012). Sport Scores: The Costs and Benefits of Sport for Crimes Reduction: Executive Summary.

Laureus Sport for Good Foundation (2018). "Empowering Young Girls and Women through Sport for Development: Executive Summary."

Levermore, R. (2008). "Sport in international development: Time to treat is seriously?" *The Brown Journal of Sports Affairs*, Vol. XIV, No. 2, pp. 55- 66.

Life & Peace Institute (2017). "Being and Becoming a Peacebuilder: Insights from 20,000 hours of youth-led dialogues in the Horn of Africa".

Lubans, D.R., et al. (2012). "Review: A systematic review of the impact of physical activity programmes on social and emotional well-being in at-risk youth." *Child and Adolescent Mental Health*, vol. 17, issue 1, pp. 2–13.

Makkai, T., et al. (2003). "Sport, physical activity and antisocial behaviour in youth." *Trends & issues in crime and criminal justice,* No. 249, Australian Institute of Criminology (AIC).

McCandless, E. (2009). "Second Generation DDR Practices in UN Peace Operations: A Contribution to the New Horizon Agenda." Report commissioned by DPKO, DDR Unit.

McDonald, K., et al. (2012). "More Than a Game Evaluation Report. Melbourne: Centre for Cultural Diversity and Well-Being, Victoria University.

McKiernan, A. (2016). "Youth Sport Programs that Address Substance Use — An Environmental Scan." Ottawa, Ontario: Canadian Centre on Substance Abuse.

McMahon, S., and Belur, J. (2013). "Sports-based Programmes and Reducing Youth Violence and Crime. Project." Oracle Children and Youth Evidence Hub, London

Mercy Corps (2018). "Reformed Warriors: A Case Study from Uganda."

Mulholland, E. (2008). What Sport Can Do – A True Sport Report. Canadian Centre for Ethics in Sport.

Nasser-Eddine, M., et al. (2011). "Countering Violent Extremism (CVE) Literature Review". Canberra: Department of Defense.

Nichols, G. (2007). *Sport and crime reduction: The role of sports in tackling youth crime*. Routledge.

Nussbaum, M. (2011). *Creating Capabilities: A Human Development Approach*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

La Palm. M. la (2017). "Re-Purposing the Push-Pull Model to Describe Signature Patterns of Terrorist Disengagement by Group: A Validation Study." *Journal For Deradicalization,* vol. 12, pp. 85-118.

Pawson, R. and Tilley, N. (1997). *Realistic Evaluation*. London: Sage.

Pawson, R. (2003). "Nothing as Practical as a Good Theory." *Evaluation*, vol. 9, issue 4, pp. 471–490.

Pawson, R. (2006). *Evidence-Based Policy: A Realist Perspective*. London: Sage.

PeacePlayers. (2017). "PeacePlayers International-Middle East Program Evaluation."

PeacePlayers. (December 2017). "The Choice of Peace: PeacePlayers International Most Significant Change Stories."

Pettinger, T. (2017). "De-radicalization and Counter-radicalization: Valuable Tools Combating Violent Extremism, or Harmful Methods of Subjugation?" *Journal For Deradicalization,* vol. 12, pp. 1-59.

Ponsot, A.S., Autixier, C., and Madriaza, P. (2018). "Factors Facilitating the Successful Implementation of a Prevention of Violent Radicalization Intervention as Identified by Front-Line Practitioners." *Journal For Deradicalization*, vol. 16, pp. 1-33.

Public Safety Canada (2017). Research Highlights - Crime Prevention, Sports-Based Crime Prevention Programs (2017-H03-CP.

Radicalisation Awareness Network (RAN) (2014). "Preventing Radicalisation to Terrorism and Violent Extremism: Strengthening the EU's Response".

Richardson, C., Cameron, P.A., and Berlouis, K.M. (Winter 17/18). "The Role of Sport in Deradicalisation and Crime Diversion." *Journal For Deradicalization,* vol. 13, pp. 29-47.

Romaniuk, P. and Cjowdhury Fink, N. (2012). "From Input to Impact: Evaluating Terrorism Preventive Programs." New York: Center for Global Counterterrorism Cooperation.

Sampson, A. and Vilella, M.R. (2012). "Fight for Peace in Rio and London – assessing their progress and impact." *Summary Report.* UEL.

Saveedra, M. (2009). "Dilemmas and Opportunities in Gender and Sport in Development" in R. Levermore and A. Beacom (Eds.), *Sport and International development*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, pp. 124-155.

Schinke, R.J., et al. (2013). "Moving Toward Trust and Partnership." *Journal of Aggression, Conflict and Peace Research*, vol. 5, issue 4, pp. 201-210.

Schmid, A.P. (March 2013). "Radicalisation, De-radicalisation, Counter-Radicalisation: A Conceptual Discussion and Literature Review." *International Centre for Counter-Terrorism (ICCT) – The Hague, Research Paper*.

Schumicky-Logan, L. (2017). "Addressing Violent Extremism with a Different Approach: The Empirical Case of At-Risk and Vulnerable Youth in Somalia." *Journal of Peacebuilding & Development*, vol. 12, issue 2, pp. 66-79.

Search for Common Ground (2017). "'Aaba Hamro Paalo' (It's Our Time Now): Youth experiences of conflict, violence and peacebuilding in Nepal."

Search for Common Ground (Bala, A.) (2017). "Bottom-Up Approach to Countering Violent Extremism in Tunisia: Final Evaluation Report."

Spaaij, R. (2015). "Refugee youth, belonging and community sport." *Leisure Studies*, vol. 34, issue 3, pp. 303-318.

Stern, J. (2010). "Mind over Martyr: How to Deradicalize Islamist Extremists." *Foreign Affairs*, pp. 95-108.

Stone, C. (2017). "Utopian community football? Sport, hope and belongingness in the lives of refugees and asylum seekers." *Leisure Studies*, 1-13.

TANA and CMC (2017). "Strengthening Resilience to Violent Extremism – STRIVE (Horn of Africa): Evaluation report."

USAID (June 2017). "Countering Violent Extremism: Kenya, Somalia and East Africa." *Fact Sheet.*

USAID (2013). "Mid-Term Evaluation of Three Countering Violent Extremism Projects." US: USAID.

Vidino, L., and Brandon, J. (2012). "Countering radicalization in Europe." (London, International Centre for the Study of Radicalisation and Political Violence 2012).

Watkins, S.C., et al. (2012). "Outsourcing Social Transformation: Development NGOs as Organizations." *Annual Review of Sociology*, vol. 38, pp. 285-315.

Webber, D., et al. (2017). "Deradicalizing Detained Terrorists." *Political Psychology*, vol. 3, pp. 539-556.

Weeks, D. (2017). "Doing Derad: An Analysis of the UK System." *Studies in Conflict & Terrorism*, pp. 1-18.

Welty Peachey, et al. (2015). "Exploring social capital development among volunteers of a multinational sport-for-development event." *Journal of Sport Management*, vol. 29, pp. 27-41.

Whitley, M.A., et al. (2016). "Evaluation of a sport-based youth development programme for refugees." *Leisure/Loisir*, vol. 40, issue 2, pp. 175-199.

Whitley M.A., et al. (2018). "A systematic review of sport for development interventions across six global cities." *Sport Management Review*. Available online 23 June 2018.

Wise, L. (2012). "Marketing Martial Arts: Competitive Sport versus Self-defence, Combat Sport versus Eastern Philosophy" in Christos Anagnostopoulos (Ed.), *Contextualising Research in Sport: An International Perspective*. Greece, ATINER, pp. 241-252.

Wolff, A. (2011). "Sports saves the World." *Sports Illustrated*, Vol. 115, No. 12, pp. 62-74.

Yusuf, S. and Voss, S.J. (2018). "The Generations for Peace Institute Compendium of Participatory Indicators of Peace" (Generations for Peace Institute).

Zeiger, S. et al. (2015). "Countering violent extremism: Developing an evidence-base for policy and practice*.*" Hedayah and Curtin University.

Governmental/Intergovernmental

Global Counterterrorism Forum, The Hague – Marrakech Memorandum of Good Practices for a More Effective Response to the FTF Phenomenon (GCTF The Hague – Marrakech Memorandum).

Inter-American Commission on Human Rights, (2016). "Violence, Children and Organised Crime."

International Alert/UNDP (2018). *Improving the impact of preventing violent extremism programming: A toolkit for design, monitoring and evaluation*. Oslo, UNDP.

OECD, (2018). "Working Together for Local Integration of Migrants and Refugees" (Paris, OECD).

Report of the Secretary-General to the General Assembly on "Sport for development and peace: towards sport's enabling of sustainable development and peace", A/71/179 (21 July 2016).

Report of the Secretary-General, "Strengthening the global framework for leveraging sport for development and peace", A/73/325 (14 August 2018).

Sixth International Conference of Ministers and Senior Officials Responsible for Physical Education and Sport (SHS/2017/5 REV) held in Kazan, Russian Federation (14-15 July 2017). UNDP, (2017). *Journey to Extremism in Africa: Drivers, Incentives and the Tipping Point for Recruitment.* New York, UNDP.

Upcoming UNDP Global Report (June 2018). *Frontlines – Young people at the heart of preventing violent extremism*, Executive Summary.

UNESCO, (2017). *Preventing violent extremism through education: A guide for policy-makers.* Paris, UNESCO.

UNHCR (2017). "Focus Group on Integration: Final Report" (UNHCR).

UNHCR, International Olympic Committee and Terre des hommes (2018). *Sport for Protection Toolkit: Programming with Young People in Forced Displacement Settings*.

United Nations Action Plan on Sport for Development and Peace

United Nations, General Assembly (2015). *Plan of Action to Prevent Violent Extremism: Report of the Secretary-General*. 24 December. A/70/674.

United Nations, General Assembly (2015). *Transforming our world: the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development* . 21 October. A/RES/70/1.

United Nations General Assembly Resolution 71/160 'Sport as a means to promote education, health, development and peace' (A/RES/71/160 (2016).

United Nations General Assembly, Human Rights Council (2016). *Report of the Special Rapporteur on the promotion and protection of human rights and fundamental freedoms while countering terrorism*. 22 February. A/HRC/31/65.

United Nations Security Council Resolution 1625 (S/RES/1625 (2005)).

United Nations Security Council Resolution 2250 (S/RES/2250 (2015)).

United Nations Security Council Resolution 2419 (S/RES/2419 (2018)).

United Nations Youth Strategy, *Youth 2030: Working with and for Young People*.

Youth, Peace and Security, (2018). *The Missing Peace: Independent Progress Study on Youth, Peace and Security*.

Youth Women in Peace and Security, (2018). "At the Intersection of the YPS and WPS Agendas."

Websites

ASPIRE - Activity, Sport and Play for the Inclusion of Refugees in Europe (www.aspiresport.eu).

Bike Project, www.thebikeproject.co.uk.

Fight for Peace (Luz pela Luta), www.fightforpeace/net.

Generations for Peace, www.generationsforpeace.org.

Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ), www.giz.de/en.

Hive (Pakistan Youth Alliance), www.hive.org.pk.

Laureus Good for Sport Foundation, www.laureus.com/content/sport-for-good-foundation.

PeacePlayers, www.peaceplayers.org.

Saferworld, www.saferworld.org.uk.

Sanneh Foundation, http://thesannehfoundation.org.

Somali Youth Development Foundation, http://sydf.org.

Swedish Center for Preventing Violent Extremism, www.cve.se/in-english.html.

Outward Bound Peacebuilding, https://outwardboundpeace.org.