Working Group on Trafficking in Persons
Vienna, 10-12 October 2011

Report on the meeting of the Working Group on Trafficking in Persons held in Vienna from 10 to 12 October 2011

I. Introduction


2. In its decision 4/4, the Conference also decided that the Chair of the working group should submit a report on the activities of the working group to the Conference and that the Conference, at its sixth session, in 2012, would review and take a decision on the effectiveness and future of the working group.


4. In that resolution, the Conference also decided that the Working Group should present its recommendations to the Conference on whether the Working Group should be extended and, if so, proposed areas for future work.
II. Recommendations

A. Recommendations adopted by the Working Group

5. The recommendations adopted by the Working Group are provided below.

1. Trafficking in persons for the purpose of removal of organs

6. Coordination among United Nations entities with regard to efforts against trafficking in persons for the purpose of removal of organs should be encouraged.

7. States parties should encourage relevant United Nations entities, including the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC), to gather evidence-based data on trafficking in persons for the purpose of organ removal, including the root causes, trends and modi operandi, with the aim of facilitating better understanding and awareness of the phenomenon, while recognizing the difference between trafficking in organs, tissues and cells.

8. States parties should make better use of the Organized Crime Convention and the Trafficking in Persons Protocol in combating trafficking in persons for the purpose of removal of organs, especially for joint investigations and intelligence gathering.

9. States parties should take measures to ensure the full and effective implementation of the applicable provisions of the Trafficking in Persons Protocol and the Organized Crime Convention relating to trafficking in persons for the purpose of removal of organs.

10. States parties should, in the course of a comprehensive approach to preventing trafficking in persons, develop measures to raise awareness in particular among vulnerable groups, including potential victims of trafficking in persons for the purpose of organ removal.

11. States parties should encourage relevant entities responsible for preventing and combating trafficking in persons to coordinate with the relevant representatives of the health sector, including health service providers, to ensure better guidance for all actors in identifying and responding to trafficking in persons for the purpose of removal of organs.

12. The use of public-private partnerships in the context of preventing trafficking in persons for the purpose of removal of organs should be encouraged.

13. UNODC should develop a training module on trafficking in persons for the purpose of removal of organs and related conduct and begin to provide technical assistance, especially with regard to investigation, the exchange of information and international legal cooperation.

2. Analysis of key concepts: focus on the concept of “abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability” in article 3 of the Trafficking in Persons Protocol

14. States parties should continue to support the work of UNODC to combat trafficking in persons by providing information to UNODC identifying examples of abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability and how those concepts are addressed and applied in domestic law or jurisprudence, recognizing that those
concepts may vary from country to country according to their legislation and jurisprudence.

15. UNODC should be requested to carry out an assessment of factors that make people vulnerable to trafficking in persons (such as age, cultural aspects, ethnicity, economic situation, academic background, gender, migration status/administrative situation, mental and physical health and humanitarian emergencies, including armed conflicts and natural disasters), taking into consideration the fact that abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability can occur at all stages of the process of trafficking in persons.

16. States parties should elaborate the various factors in their jurisdictions that can render persons subject to abuse of a position of vulnerability in order to enhance awareness of the full scope of the crime while recognizing that application of that concept may vary from country to country according to domestic legislation and criminal justice systems.

17. States parties could focus on the action of the offenders and their intention to take advantage of the situation of the victims, for example by focusing on the means by which offenders do so.

18. States parties should raise awareness among their relevant national authorities, including, where appropriate, through training to facilitate identification of situations in which there has been abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability and, on that basis, take appropriate measures for the protection of, and the provision of assistance to, victims to ensure the appropriate response to their trauma.

19. States parties should raise awareness among State and non-State victim service providers of the factors that make people vulnerable to trafficking in persons so as to better assist and support trafficked persons.

20. States parties should seek to reduce vulnerability to trafficking in persons by increasing equal opportunities for women and men, including by ensuring equal access to higher education and development for women and children and equal access for women to the labour market, as well as by increasing the opportunities for women to access decision-making positions.

21. States parties should take measures to combat trafficking in persons occurring through the abuse of the vulnerability of children.

22. States parties may consider the relevant guidance provided in regional instruments and measures, including the Explanatory Report on the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings, and the recommendations contained in the official document of the Ibero-American Association of Public Prosecutors entitled the “Santiago Guidelines”, concerning the duty of such entities to facilitate access to justice for vulnerable victims, in particular its chapter devoted to victims of human trafficking.

3. Victims of trafficking in persons, with particular emphasis on identification

23. States parties should consider whether to define “victim of trafficking” in their domestic legal frameworks.

24. States parties are encouraged to develop a proactive and systematic approach to the identification of victims of trafficking in persons and the provision of
assistance, support and protection in accordance with the provisions of the Trafficking in Persons Protocol.

25. States parties should consider developing and disseminating tailor-made indicators for different practitioners, taking into consideration the need for a multi-stakeholder approach and the specific roles of potential actors in combating trafficking in persons. Such potential actors who could identify victims include law enforcement, the judiciary, victim service providers, the private sector, health and social work professionals and other relevant actors. States parties should also periodically assess the relevance of those indicators.

26. States parties should endeavour to ensure that actors who could identify victims of trafficking in persons are made aware of relevant and specific information likely to expedite the identification of victims of trafficking.

27. States parties are encouraged to raise awareness of the control methods of traffickers and their potential impact on victims, making use, as appropriate, of technical assistance tools such as the UNODC Anti-Human Trafficking Manual for Criminal Justice Practitioners.

28. States parties should create a safe environment for victims, with the full involvement of civil society, that is designed to rehabilitate victims and return to them a sense of dignity.

29. States parties should consider providing a sufficient period of time during which victims may receive appropriate assistance, to decide about their possible cooperation with law enforcement and their participation in a judicial process.

4. **International cooperation in combating trafficking in persons with respect to:**

   **addressing supply and demand; and capacity-building and awareness-raising**

   **(a) International cooperation**

   30. States parties should acknowledge the concept of shared responsibility in implementing measures to counter trafficking in persons, thus bringing together countries of origin, transit and destination in the development of evidence-based strategies and activities, including awareness-raising.

   31. States parties should consider assessing, improving, simplifying and expanding their international legal cooperation efforts in cases involving trafficking in persons, where appropriate.

   32. States parties should consider rendering criminal acts as defined in the Trafficking in Persons Protocol extraditable, irrespective of whether the laws of the requesting and requested States parties define the acts constituting the offence within the same category of offences, denominate the offence by the same terminology or define or characterize it in the same way.

   33. States parties should increase their efforts with respect to exchanging information and law enforcement intelligence, where appropriate, to determine trafficking routes regionally, subregionally and transregionally and to combat transnational organized crime.

   34. States parties should consider taking measures to contribute to the full implementation of the United Nations Global Plan of Action to Combat Trafficking
in Persons, recognizing its six objectives and expressing their view that the Global Plan of Action will promote increased ratification and implementation of the Trafficking in Persons Protocol.

(b) Awareness-raising

35. States parties that have not yet contributed to the United Nations Voluntary Trust Fund for Victims of Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, should consider doing so.

36. States parties should consider joining the Group of Friends United against Trafficking in Persons.

37. States parties should provide exhaustive and objective information for inclusion in the Global Report on Trafficking in Persons, which is being prepared by UNODC for publication in 2012.

38. States parties should use new technologies to raise awareness of trafficking in persons through activities such as virtual teaching, thus reaching a wider audience and increasing the possibility of exchanges of good practices.

39. States parties should consider making use of the signs of the Blue Heart and Blue Blindfold campaigns and include them in their awareness-raising campaigns as symbols of the fight against trafficking in persons.

40. States parties should consider mainstreaming measures to counter human trafficking when they create or amend laws, strategies, programmes and policies of general application.

41. States parties should consider the possibility of implementing measures to prohibit the dissemination, through any means of communication, of advertisements and publications that promote the exploitation of persons, in particular children, especially sexual exploitation, in order to prevent trafficking in persons and combat sociocultural patterns that sustain gender inequality and discrimination against women.

(c) Supply and demand

42. States parties should cooperate with countries of origin, including with civil society, in order to provide appropriate protection, assistance and rehabilitation for victims of trafficking in persons and assist with their reintegration upon return, where appropriate.

43. States parties should consider carrying out capacity-building activities for law enforcement, prosecutorial and judicial officials and consular staff from countries of origin, transit and destination.

44. States parties should ensure that multidimensional measures are put in place to support coordination and cooperation at both the national and international levels, taking into consideration the local specificities and needs identified on the ground, to address both supply and demand.

45. States parties should take measures to advance poverty alleviation and employment programmes, with a view to addressing the demand and supply sides of
trafficking in persons as a contribution to the implementation of the Trafficking in Persons Protocol.

5. Proposed areas for future work

46. The Working Group on Trafficking in Persons should continue its work in advising and assisting the Conference in the implementation of its mandate with regard to the Trafficking in Persons Protocol.

47. The Conference should encourage States to send experts to share experiences and good practices, as well as invite representatives from other United Nations entities to present relevant initiatives against trafficking in persons so as to integrate the work of the United Nations system into the work of the Working Group on Trafficking in Persons and UNODC.

48. The Conference should encourage States parties and UNODC to inform the Working Group on the implementation of the recommendations approved by the Working Group and endorsed by the Conference.

49. The Conference should call upon States parties to support and submit cases to the UNODC human trafficking case law database, in order to review and identify new trends and good practices from those cases.

50. The Working Group recommends to the Conference that the following topics, inter alia, be considered for future sessions of the Working Group:

(a) Continued focus on key concepts of the Protocol, including consent, abuse of power and deception, with reference also to related international instruments;

(b) Crimes connected to trafficking, especially money-laundering and corruption, as well as responses, including confiscation of assets;

(c) Different actors related to trafficking, for instance military, peacekeeping and humanitarian personnel;

(d) Different forms of labour exploitation, especially domestic servitude, with particular reference to domestic servitude involving diplomatic personnel;

(e) Forms of exploitation not specifically mentioned in the Protocol but that have arisen in national, regional or international contexts or practice;

(f) How to reduce demand, including by fostering public-private partnerships and identifying factors that drive trafficking;

(g) Liability of legal persons as described in paragraph 44 of General Assembly resolution 64/293;

(h) Links between gender-based violence and trafficking in persons, both in supply and demand;

(i) Links between trafficking in persons and other forms of organized crime;

(j) Trafficking in children, particularly the phenomenon of parents who sell or rent their children for an exploitative purpose, such as begging or forced marriage;

(k) Trafficking in persons for the removal of organs.
B. Recommendations endorsed by the Working Group

51. The Working Group endorsed, as orally amended the following recommendations that had been proposed by the Chair of the Working Group at its meeting held in Vienna on 19 October 2010:

(a) Trafficking in persons and smuggling of migrants should be recognized as different crimes that require distinct legal, operational and policy responses;

(b) States parties should clearly define trafficking in persons in their national law and policy in order to enable the full and effective implementation of the Trafficking in Persons Protocol, including its provisions on criminalization and, in particular, to ensure that victims of that crime have access to justice, including the ability to seek restitution or compensation;

(c) In accordance with article 6, paragraph 6, of the Trafficking in Persons Protocol, States parties should ensure that their domestic legal systems contain measures that offer victims of trafficking in persons the possibility of obtaining compensation for damage suffered;

(d) In accordance with article 6, paragraph 2, of the Trafficking in Persons Protocol, States parties should ensure that information on relevant court and administrative proceedings is provided, in appropriate cases, to victims of trafficking in persons, and that access to compensation is provided to victims of trafficking in persons;

(e) States parties should facilitate the provision of legal assistance and information regarding legal assistance to victims of trafficking in order to represent their interests in criminal investigations, including in order to obtain compensation;

(f) At the beginning of a penal investigation, States parties should endeavour to integrate a section dedicated to property and the possibility of seizing and confiscating goods obtained by criminal means. States parties should also be vigilant to protect themselves against all forms of organized insolvency;

(g) States parties should ensure that the immigration status of the victim, the return of the victim to his or her home country or the absence of the victim from the jurisdiction for other reasons does not prevent the payment of compensation;

(h) States parties should consider means of ensuring the availability of compensation, independent of a criminal case and regardless of whether the offender can be identified, sentenced and punished;

(i) In fulfilling the requirements of article 6, paragraph 6, of the Trafficking in Persons Protocol, States parties should adopt at least one of the following options offering the possibility of victims obtaining compensation:

(i) Provisions allowing victims to sue offenders or others for civil damages;

(ii) Provisions allowing criminal courts to award criminal damages (that is, to order that compensation be paid by offenders to victims) or impose orders for compensation or restitution against persons convicted of offences;
(iii) Provisions establishing dedicated funds or schemes whereby victims can claim compensation from the State for injuries or damages suffered as a result of a criminal offence;

(j) States should consider that court-ordered and/or state-funded compensation may include payment for or towards:

(i) Costs of medical, physical, psychological or psychiatric treatment required by the victim;

(ii) Costs of physical and occupational therapy or rehabilitation required by the victim;

(iii) Lost income and wages due according to national law and regulations regarding wages;

(iv) Legal fees and other costs or expenses incurred, including costs related to the participation of the victim in the criminal investigation and prosecution process;

(v) Payment for non-material damages resulting from moral, physical or psychological injury, emotional distress and pain and suffering of the victim as a result of the crime committed against him or her;

(vi) Any other costs or losses incurred by the victim as a direct result of being trafficked, as reasonably assessed by the court or state-funded compensation scheme.

III. Organization of the meeting

A. Opening of the meeting

52. The Working Group on Trafficking in Persons met in Vienna from 10 to 12 October 2011. Six meetings were held.

53. The meeting of the Working Group was chaired by Dominika Krois (Poland). Following the opening statement by the Chair, an introductory statement was made by a representative of the Secretariat and by the Special Rapporteur on trafficking in persons, especially women and children.

54. Statements were also made by the representatives of the Islamic Republic of Iran (on behalf of the States Members of the United Nations that are members of the Group of 77 and China), Indonesia, India, the Philippines, Argentina, Nicaragua and Algeria.

B. Adoption of the agenda and organization of work

55. At its 1st meeting, on 10 October 2011, the Working Group adopted by consensus its provisional agenda and organization of work:

1. Organizational matters:

   (a) Opening of the meeting;
(b) Adoption of the agenda and organization of work.

2. Trafficking in persons for the purpose of removal of organs.


4. Victims of trafficking in persons, with particular emphasis on identification.

5. International cooperation in combating trafficking in persons with respect to: addressing supply and demand; and capacity-building and awareness-raising.

6. Proposed areas for future work.

7. Other matters.

8. Adoption of the report.

C. Attendance

56. The following States parties to the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, were represented at the meeting: Albania, Algeria, Argentina, Australia, Austria, Azerbaijan, Belarus, Belgium, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Brazil, Cambodia, Canada, Chile, China, Colombia, Croatia, Dominican Republic, Ecuador, Egypt, El Salvador, Finland, France, Germany, Guatemala, India, Indonesia, Ireland, Israel, Italy, Jordan, Kenya, Kuwait, Lao People’s Democratic Republic, Lebanon, Luxembourg, Mexico, Namibia, Netherlands, Nicaragua, Nigeria, Norway, Oman, Panama, Peru, Philippines, Poland, Portugal, Qatar, Romania, Russian Federation, San Marino, Serbia, Slovakia, South Africa, Spain, Sweden, Switzerland, Syrian Arab Republic, Tunisia, Turkey, Ukraine, United Arab Emirates, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, United States of America and Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of).

57. The European Union, a regional economic integration organization that is a party to the Trafficking in Persons Protocol, was also represented.

58. The following States signatories to the Trafficking in Persons Protocol were represented by observers: Czech Republic, Japan, Republic of Korea and Thailand.

59. The following States that are not parties or signatories to the Trafficking in Persons Protocol were represented by observers: Afghanistan, Angola, Côte d’Ivoire, Cuba, Iran (Islamic Republic of), Pakistan, Singapore, Viet Nam, Yemen and Zimbabwe.

60. Palestine, an entity having received a standing invitation from the General Assembly to participate as an observer in the sessions and work of all international
conferences convened under its auspices and maintaining a permanent observer mission at Headquarters, was represented.

61. The following Secretariat units, programmes and funds and specialized agencies in the United Nations system were represented by observers: Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, United Nations Children’s Fund and International Labour Organization.


63. The Sovereign Military Order of Malta, an entity having received a standing invitation to participate as an observer in the sessions and the work of the General Assembly and maintaining a permanent office at Headquarters, was represented.

64. A list of participants is contained in document CTOC/COP/WG.4/2011/INF/1/Rev.2.

D. Documentation

65. The documents before the Working Group are listed in the annex to the present report.

IV. Summary of the deliberations

A. Trafficking in persons for the purpose of removal of organs

66. At its 1st and 2nd meetings, on 10 October 2011, the Working Group considered agenda item 2, on trafficking in persons for the purpose of removal of organs.

67. For its consideration of item 2, the Working Group had before it a background paper prepared by the Secretariat on trafficking in persons for the purpose of removal of organs (CTOC/COP/WG.4/2011/2).

68. The Chair made an introductory statement. A statement was made by the Secretariat.

69. Statements were made by representatives of the Russian Federation, Belgium, Israel, Chile, India, Norway, Portugal, Egypt, Indonesia, Spain, Ecuador, Algeria, China, Colombia, Nigeria, the Philippines, Mexico, the United States, the United Kingdom, Peru and Austria.

70. The Working Group also heard a statement by the observer for the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe.

71. Speakers highlighted various issues that they had encountered when combating trafficking in persons for the purpose of removal of organs. Some speakers, referring to, inter alia, the findings of the joint Council of Europe/United Nations study on trafficking in organs, tissues and cells and trafficking in human beings for
the purpose of the removal of organs, noted that trafficking in human beings for the purpose of organ removal was part of the problem of trafficking in organs, tissues and cells. Some speakers expressed the view that it might be reasonable to bring the issue of trafficking in organs, tissues and cells to the attention of the General Assembly.

72. The recommendations adopted by the Working Group under agenda item 2 are contained in paragraphs 6-13 above.

B. Analysis of key concepts: focus on the concept of “abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability” in article 3 of the Trafficking in Persons Protocol

73. At its 2nd and 3rd meetings, on 10 and 11 October 2011, the Working Group considered agenda item 3, on analysis of key concepts: focus on the concept of “abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability” in article 3 of the Trafficking in Persons Protocol.

74. For its consideration of item 3, the Working Group had before it a background paper prepared by the Secretariat on the analysis of key concepts: focus on the concept of “abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability” in article 3 of the Trafficking in Persons Protocol (CTOC/COP/WG.4/2011/3).

75. With the Chair presiding, the discussion under item 3 was led by the following panellists: Angélica Herrera Rivero (Mexico), Priska Landolt (Switzerland), Adel Maged (Egypt) and Zaida Gabriela Gatti (Argentina).

76. Statements were made by the representatives of Chile, Colombia, Indonesia, Canada, China, Belgium, the Russian Federation, Algeria, the United States, Ireland, the United Arab Emirates, Germany, Ecuador, India and Switzerland.

77. The recommendations adopted by the Working Group under this agenda item are contained in paragraphs 14-22 above.

C. Victims of trafficking in persons, with particular emphasis on identification

78. At its 3rd and 4th meetings, on 11 October 2011, the Working Group considered agenda item 4, on victims of trafficking in persons, with particular emphasis on identification.

79. For its consideration of item 4, the Working Group had before it a background paper prepared by the Secretariat on victims of trafficking in persons, with particular emphasis on identification (CTOC/COP/WG.4/2011/4).

80. With the Chair presiding, the discussion under item 4 was led by the following panellists: Rachel Gershuni (Israel) and Hany Yousif Abdel Aal (Egypt).

81. Statements were made by the representatives of Belgium, France, India, Norway, the Netherlands, Germany, Egypt, China, Chile, Indonesia, Algeria, Canada, the United Kingdom, the United States, Argentina, the Russian Federation, Mexico, Nigeria, Portugal, Lebanon, Australia, the United Arab Emirates and Israel.
82. The observers for Thailand and Japan also made statements.
83. The observer for Palestine made a statement.
84. The Special Rapporteur on trafficking in persons, especially women and children, also made a statement.
85. The recommendations adopted by the Working Group under this agenda item are contained in paragraphs 23-29 above.
86. The recommendations endorsed by the Working Group are contained in paragraph 51 above.

D. International cooperation in combating trafficking in persons with respect to: addressing supply and demand; and capacity-building and awareness-raising

87. At its 4th and 5th meetings, on 11 and 12 October 2011, the Working Group considered agenda item 5, on international cooperation in combating trafficking in persons with respect to: addressing supply and demand; and capacity-building and awareness-raising.
88. For its consideration of item 5, the Working Group had before it a background paper prepared by the Secretariat on international cooperation in combating trafficking in persons with respect to: addressing supply and demand; and capacity-building and awareness-raising (CTOC/COP/WG.4/2011/5).
89. With the Chair presiding, the discussion under item 5 was led by the following panellists: Maryam Al-Malki (Qatar), Marie-Claude Arsenault (Canada), Fernanda Alves dos Anjos (Brazil), Andreas Schloenhardt (Australia), Tran Thi Ha Phuong (Viet Nam) and Chen Shiqu (China).
90. Statements were made by the representatives of Belarus, Israel, India, Chile, Colombia, Argentina, Norway, the United States, the United Arab Emirates, Mexico, Egypt, Canada, Ireland, Nigeria, Ecuador, Indonesia and the Russian Federation.
91. The observer for Thailand also made a statement.
92. The recommendations adopted by the Working Group under this agenda item are contained in paragraphs 30-45 above.

E. Proposed areas for future work

93. At its 5th meeting, on 12 October 2011, the Working Group considered agenda item 6, on proposed areas for future work.
94. For its consideration of item 6, the Working Group had before it a background paper prepared by the Secretariat on proposed areas of future work (CTOC/COP/WG.4/2011/6).
95. Statements were made by the representatives of the Netherlands, Mexico, the United States, Switzerland, Austria, Sweden, Indonesia, Ecuador, Portugal, the Philippines, the United Kingdom, Chile, Algeria, the Russian Federation, Belgium, Germany and Peru.
96. The observer for Thailand also made a statement.

97. The recommendations adopted by the Working Group under this agenda item are contained in paragraphs 46-50.

V. Adoption of the report

Annex

List of documents before the Working Group on Trafficking in Persons at its meeting held in Vienna from 10 to 12 October 2011

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Document number</th>
<th>Agenda item</th>
<th>Title or description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CTOC/COP/WG.4/2011/1</td>
<td>1 (b)</td>
<td>Provisional agenda and annotations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTOC/COP/WG.4/2011/2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Background paper on trafficking in persons for the purpose of removal of organs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTOC/COP/WG.4/2011/4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Background paper on victims of trafficking in persons, with particular emphasis on identification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTOC/COP/WG.4/2011/5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Background paper on international cooperation in combating trafficking in persons with respect to: addressing supply and demand; and capacity-building and awareness-raising</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTOC/COP/WG.4/2011/6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Background paper on proposed areas for future work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTOC/COP/WG.4/2011/7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Note by the Secretariat on recommendations proposed by the Chair of the Working Group on Trafficking in Persons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTOC/COP/WG.4/2011/L.1 and Add.1-5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Draft report</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>